

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. PWSC65/00-01

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee  
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 7th meeting  
held in the Chamber of Legislative Council Building  
on Wednesday, 10 January 2001, at 10:45 am**

**Members present :**

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP (Chairman)

Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip (Deputy Chairman)

Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Yuen-han

Hon CHAN Kam-lam

Hon SIN Chung-kai

Hon WONG Yung-kan

Hon LAU Kong-wah

Hon Mrs Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

Hon LAU Ping-cheung

**Members absent:**

Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

Prof Hon NG Ching-fai

Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Dr Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS  
Hon WONG Sing-chi

**Public officers attending:**

Miss Elizabeth TSE	Deputy Secretary for the Treasury
Mr S S LEE, JP	Secretary for Works
Mr Gordon SIU, JP	Secretary for Planning and Lands
Mr Rob LAW, JP	Director of Environmental Protection
Mr James HERD	Principal Assistant Secretary of the Treasury (Works)
Mr WOO Sai-cheong	Chief Estate Surveyor/Acquisition, Lands Department
Dr LAU Ching-kwong, JP	Director of Civil Engineering
Mr H K WONG, JP	Director of Territory Development
Mr Hugh PHILLIPSON, JP	Director of Water Supplies
Mr LEUNG Mang-chiu	Assistant Director of Water Supplies (New Works)
Mr P L KWAN, JP	Deputy Director of Architectural Services
Mr K K NG	Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services)
Mr K K MOK	Deputy Government Property Administrator
Mr W H KO	Assistant Director/Projects and Development, Drainage Services Department
Mr Benny WONG	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Waste and Water Division)
Mr Y C LO, JP	Director of Highways
Mr C D B WILLIAMS, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs
Mr Jack CHAN	Deputy Secretary-General, University Grants Committee
Mr M Y CHENG	Assistant Director of Education (Education Services)
Mr Alan SIU	Deputy Secretary for Information Technology and Broadcasting
Mr M L WAN	Principal Assistant Secretary for Housing (Project Management)
Miss Joanna CHOI	Principal Assistant Secretary for Health and Welfare
Dr FUNG Hong	Deputy Director (Hospital Planning and Development), Hospital Authority
Mr SHUM Kung-sher	Chief Technical Advisor/Subvented Projects, Architectural Services Department
Ms Michelle LI	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education and Manpower
Mr TONG Nai-piu	Chief Engineer/Development Civil Engineering Department
Mr Eric YUE	District Planning Officer/Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon, Planning Department
Ms Shirley LAM	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport
Mr C W CHOW	Chief Engineer/Major Works 3-2, Highways Department
Mr Y M LEE	Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories West, Transport Department

**Clerk in attendance:**

Miss Polly YEUNG                      Chief Assistant Secretary (1)3

**Staff in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG                          Assistant Secretary General 1  
Ms Anita SIT                              Senior Assistant Secretary (1)8

---

**PWSC(2000-01)81                      New Item                      Block Allocations for Heads 701 to 711  
under the Capital Works Reserve Fund**

Members noted that the proposed block vote funding for computerization under Head 710 had been discussed by the Panel on Information Technology and Broadcasting on 17 November 2000 and a paper on the entire block vote funding proposal had been circulated to the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works on 5 January 2001.

2. Mr Albert CHAN expressed his general concern about the policy on the rehousing and compensation arising from the land resumption and clearance for public works projects. In reply to his enquiry, the Chief Estate Surveyor/Acquisition, Lands Department (CES/A, LD) advised that the Administration did not envisage that there would be significant problems with the land resumption for the construction of the international theme park on Lantau Island and the related facilities since only some agricultural land and an existing shipyard would be affected. There was no resident on site. The Administration had started negotiating with the shipyard on compensation matters.

3. In reply to Mr LAU Ping-cheung's enquiries about the estimates under Subhead 1100CA "Compensation and ex-gratia allowances in respect of projects in the Public Works Programme", CES/A, LD advised that the compensation and ex-gratia allowances under this Subhead were determined by professional valuation and according to prescribed rates respectively. He confirmed that the same policy was applied in determining the compensation and ex-gratia allowances in each case of land resumption for public works projects, and that the Administration could not vary the prescribed rates in the calculation of ex-gratia allowances. The rates for ex-gratia allowances were reviewed every six months and gazetted thereafter. The affected persons could appeal to the Lands Tribunal if they did not agree with the compensation offered by the Government.

4. At Mr LAU Ping-cheung's request, the Secretary for Planning and Lands agreed to provide a paper setting out separately the estimates for the compensation and ex-gratia allowances under Subhead 1100CA.

5. On Head 710 - "computerization", Mr Albert CHAN enquired whether appropriate measures were in place to ensure that despite the lead time required for conducting tendering exercises, the computer systems procured by the Government would not become outdated at the time of actual delivery.

6. The Deputy Secretary for Information Technology and Broadcasting advised that for all Government computer projects, a technology substitution provision was included in the relevant tender documents and contracts to require the supplier concerned to provide the state-of-the-art products available in the market at the time of delivery, including both computer hardware and software. Disputes between the Government and the suppliers on the said contract provision would be dealt with according to the normal procedures for handling contractual disputes arising from Government projects. Legal advice from the Secretary for Justice would be sought where necessary.

7. Mr James TO considered the estimate of \$14.5 million for each of the proposed three public toilets under Subhead 3101GX on the high side and enquired about the basis for the estimate. In reply, the Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services) advised that the construction cost of a public toilet mainly depended on the size and location of the toilet. Normally, higher costs would be required for constructing a public toilet if associated infrastructure facilities such as sewage treatment facilities had to be provided at the location in question. He would provide after the meeting further explanation on the estimates for the public toilet at Lo Wai Road, Tsuen Wan.

Admin

8. Referring to the estimate of \$2.01 million for consultants' fees and site investigation for unusual settlement at Tseung Kwan O Town Centre under Subhead 7100CX, Mr LAU Kong-wah enquired about the scope and duration of the investigation works. In reply, the Director of Territory Development (DTD) advised that the investigation works covered the town centre and the newly reclaimed area in Tseung Kwan O. The investigation project had commenced in November 1999 and a report on the investigation results had been released recently. Although the settlement situation had stabilized, the Administration would need to continue to monitor the situation for one year or so to ensure that the settlement was fully stabilized. The Administration would review the need for further investigation works in the light of the monitoring results.

9. Mr LAU Ping-cheung enquired about the estimate of \$6.5 million under Subhead 7100CX for a design competition for the development of an integrated arts, cultural and entertainment district at the southern tip of West Kowloon Reclamation. In reply, DTD advised that the estimate covered the prizes for the winner(s) in the competition and other incidental costs.

10. In reply to Mr James TO's enquiry about the estimate of \$3 million for the project "ICAC Headquarters at Tong Shui Road, North Point" under Subhead 3100GX, the Deputy Director of Architectural Services (DDArchS) advised that the estimate covered mainly the consultants' fees for certain preliminary studies for the project. Since the project site was adjacent to an existing pump house of the Water Supplies

Department (WSD), a study on the interface of the project with the pump house and related underground facilities was therefore required. Moreover, as in the case of other major government buildings, a hazard assessment both on environmental and security implication for the proposed ICAC headquarters building was also required.

11. Mr James TO queried the need to commission consultants for the said studies, in particular the hazard assessment which, in his view, could be undertaken by in-house staff of the Security Bureau (SB) and the Hong Kong Police Force. In response, DDArchS advised that as he understood, SB normally engaged expert consultants for carrying out security assessment for the development of all important major public buildings. However, SB had not yet decided whether the hazard assessment for the project in question would be conducted in-house or by consultants. Mr James TO urged the Administration to critically review the need for commissioning consultants in this case and the Administration took note of his comment for consideration.

Admin

12. The item was voted on and endorsed.

## **HEAD 708 - CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND EQUIPMENT**

**PWSC(2000-01)82                      3MG                      Relocation of the Accident and Emergency Department of Tang Shiu Kin Hospital to Ruttonjee Hospital**

13. Members noted that a paper on the present proposal had been circulated to the Panel on Health Services on 14 December 2000.

14. On the planned use(s) of the vacated space in Tang Shiu Kin Hospital (TSKH), the Deputy Director (Hospital Planning and Development), Hospital Authority (DD/HA) advised that the current plan was to remodel TSKH into an ambulatory care centre by consolidating the existing ambulatory care services at various hospitals and clinics in the Wanchai District.

15. Mr MAK Kwok-fung considered that for the convenience of patients, it was preferable to locate related services within the same hospital. He thus queried whether it would be more desirable to locate the planned ambulatory care centre at Ruttonjee Hospital (RH) rather than at TSKH and suggested that the vacated staff quarters at RH could be used for this purpose. In response, DD/HA advised that as ambulatory care services had all along been provided at TSKH, the opportunity should be taken to strengthen the focus of ambulatory care at TSKH. Another consideration was that co-locating too many services at RH might give rise to traffic problems. Moreover, substantial conversion works would be required to convert the staff quarters at RH to an ambulatory care centre. He added that currently, the staff quarters at RH were quite well utilized with some quarters being rented out and some used as accommodation for staff on night shift.

16. Mr LAU Ping-cheung and Mr MAK Kwok-fung expressed concern about the traffic impact of the proposed relocation of the Accident and Emergency (A&E) Department of TSKH to RH and that ambulances transporting patients to RH via Queen's Road East might be held up by frequent traffic jams. Pointing out that at present, traffic jams frequently occurred on the westbound lanes of Queen's Road East, particularly at the road junction near RH, they suggested that alternative routings other than Queen's Road East be explored for access to RH.

17. In response, DD/HA advised that a traffic assessment had been conducted in the consultancy study for the project and the conclusion was that the proposed relocation would have little effect on the future ambulance access to RH and on the traffic in the vicinity. DD/HA further said that the said consultancy study had explored alternative routings but found them not viable.

18. Mr MAK Kwok-fung did not agree with DD/HA and pointed out that the number of patients transported to the A&E Department of RH direct by ambulance after the relocation should be much greater than the number of patients transferred from TSKH to RH at present. DD/HA reiterated that according to the consultancy study, the proposed relocation itself would have minimal effect on the traffic on Queen's Road East as only a small proportion of the patients using the A&E services at RH would be transported to the hospital by ambulance.

19. Miss Cyd HO said that she agreed with the need to consolidate facilities and services currently scattered at different hospitals for more efficient use of resources and therefore would support the present proposal. In view that more funding proposals to rationalize hospital services would be forthcoming, she requested the Administration/Hospital Authority (HA) to provide further information on the general principles to be applied in implementing the rationalization programme. In reply to the Chairman's enquiry, DD/HA confirmed that HA had not provided specific information on the rationalization programme of hospital services to the Panel on Health Services but the subject had been discussed by the HA board. He pointed out that basically, the programme aimed at consolidating services to improve cost-effectiveness and the development of specialist services, with due regard to the accessibility of the relevant services to the general public.

XX  
Admin/HA

20. The Chairman suggested that the policy issue of rationalization of hospital services should be further discussed at the Panel on Health Services. He requested and DD/HA agreed to provide a paper on the subject for the Panel on Health Services and copy the paper to this Subcommittee for information. Miss Cyd HO requested that information on the demographic structure of different districts and the quantitative standards for relevant hospital services be included in the aforesaid paper.

21. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**HEAD 708 - CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND EQUIPMENT**

<b>PWSC(2000-01)79</b>	<b>39EF</b>	<b>Major renovation and upgrading works at the Postgraduate Hall Complex, The Chinese University of Hong Kong</b>
	<b>49EG</b>	<b>900-place student hostel at the Flora Ho Sports Centre Complex, The University of Hong Kong</b>

22. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**HEAD 705 - CIVIL ENGINEERING**

<b>PWSC(2000-01)80</b>	<b>22CG</b>	<b>Wo Yi Hop Village improvement, Package 21, Tsuen Wan</b>
------------------------	-------------	---

23. Noting that the land resumption and clearance for the project would affect 129 structures involving 48 households and 11 business undertakings, Mr Albert CHAN reiterated his concern about the problems relating to land resumption and clearance for public works projects, in particular the rehousing arrangements for affected residents. He cautioned that if the relevant policy was not properly revised, further incidents of escalated disputes arising from the land resumption and clearance would recur. The Chairman asked the Administration to take note of Mr CHAN's concern for consideration and follow-up actions as appropriate.

Admin

24. Mr IP Kwok-him enquired about the type of developments at Wo Yi Hop Village at present and the type of structures affected by the land resumption and clearance for the proposed project. In reply, the District Planning Officer/Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon, Planning Department and the Chief Engineer/Development, Civil Engineering Department advised that the Wo Yi Hop Village was mainly inhabited by indigenous inhabitants. The current population of the village was about 1 000 and there were about 100 village houses. The 129 structures that would need to be cleared for the project were all temporary structures and not village houses.

25. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**HEAD 706 - HIGHWAYS**

<b>PWSC(2000-01)76</b>	<b>246TH</b>	<b>Kam Tin Bypass</b>
------------------------	--------------	-----------------------

26. Members noted that the Panel on Transport had taken note of this proposal at its meeting on 15 December 2000.

27. Mr LAU Ping-cheung expressed support for the proposal. However, he sought explanation for not pursuing the option of widening the existing section of Kam Tin Road (KTR) running through the Kam Tin town centre, and enquired about the cost difference between the road widening option and the bypass option currently proposed. The Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport explained that the existing KTR section running through the town centre was a narrow carriageway with various types of developments located on both sides. Widening this road section would require clearance of a substantial number of these developments which would cause serious disruption to the existing community, residential and commercial uses in the Kam Tin town centre. To avoid such disruption and to keep the town centre intact, the Administration considered that the provision of a new Kam Tin Bypass to the north of the town centre was the preferred option. The Director of Highways (DHy) advised that the Administration had not made a detailed cost assessment on the option of widening the KTR section at the Kam Tin town centre. However, taking into account the land resumption and clearance required and the engineering problems entailed, it could reasonably be expected that the total cost of widening the KTR section at the Kam Tin town centre would be higher than the currently estimated cost of \$290.8 million for the proposed bypass project.

28. Mr Albert CHAN expressed concern about the environmental impact of the proposed Kam Tin Bypass on the residential developments nearby. In response, DHy advised that the bypass would be quite distant from most of the existing residential developments and the sections facing Kam Tin Shi and Wing Lung Wai would be provided with noise barriers as shown on the layout plan attached to the discussion paper. The noise barriers would be about 1 to 5.5 metres in height erected on earth mounds of 1.5 to 2.5 metres high.

29. Mr IP Kwok-him sought elaboration on the planned reprovisioning of a marshland under this project. DHy advised that the western roundabout of the proposed Kam Tin Bypass would affect existing marshland of about 0.8 hectares. A total area of 1.3 hectares of marshland would be reprovisioned along the bypass facing the Kam Tin River to compensate for the loss of habitat of the Painted Snipe. The compensating habitat would replicate as far as possible the existing habitat and the Environmental Protection Department had agreed to the proposed reprovisioning arrangement. Moreover, the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department had agreed to manage the compensating habitat while the Lands Department had agreed to conduct regular inspections to ensure that the habitat would not be used for unauthorized purposes. He added that another 10 hectares of compensating wetland would be provided in the Kam Tin area under the West Rail project.

30. The Chairman, Mr WONG Yung-kan, Mr Albert CHAN and Mr IP Kwok-him were of the view that wherever feasible, trees and various types of plants should be provided along the proposed bypass. Noting that trees and shrubs were provided abundantly along many new roads in Shenzhen, they enquired about the feasibility of planting trees or shrubs along the central reserve of the proposed bypass.



31. In response, the Secretary for Works confirmed that the existing policy was to provide landscaping, including the planting of trees and shrubs, along new roads as far as practicable. As far as the present project was concerned, DHy informed members that trees would be provided along the proposed bypass at about 5-metre intervals. Shrubs, creeping plants and grass would also be planted on the earth mounds to be constructed at some sections of the bypass. On members' suggestion of planting trees at the central reserve, DHy said that planting trees at close intervals would not be practicable as the trees might block the view of road users. He however assured members that the Administration would further examine the viability of various types of landscaping works at the central reserve.

Admin

32. In view of members' concern about the provision of landscaping along new roads, the Chairman suggested that the relevant policy be further discussed at the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works. Mr LAU Ping-cheung informed members that he had proposed the subject for inclusion into the Panel's list of items for future discussion.

XX

33. The item was voted on and endorsed.

#### **HEAD 709 - WATERWORKS**

##### **PWSC(2000-01)77                      236WF                      Mainlaying between Kam Tin Shi and Route Twisk Roundabout**

34. Mr Albert Chan said that according to his understanding, the Administration had undertaken a development study covering the Kam Tin area. He enquired whether the population projections set out in the discussion paper had taken into account the land use changes arising from the study. In reply, the Director of Water Supplies (DWS) advised that WSD had drawn up the present proposal based on the population projections provided by the Planning Department. The Secretary for Planning and Lands undertook to provide further information in response to Mr Albert CHAN's concern after the meeting.

Admin

35. Regarding the materials to be used for the proposed water mains, DWS and the Assistant Director of Water Supplies (New Works) advised that mild steel pipes with cement mortar and concrete protective lining would be used under this project. This kind of water pipes was very strong, flexible and highly corrosion-resistant. They were commonly used for large water mains in many countries including the Mainland and the United Kingdom. They also confirmed that the lining materials would not pose any risk to human health.

36. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**HEAD 709 - WATERWORKS**

**PWSC(2000-01)78                      38WS                      Extension of North Point low level salt  
water supply system**

37. Members noted that an information paper on the present proposal had been circulated to the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works on 28 November 2000.

38. Mr IP Kwok-him expressed support for the proposal. He enquired whether the Administration had any plan to require or promote the use of modern flushing systems which had two different discharge volumes for users to choose with a view to conserving water. In response, DWS and AD/WS(NW) agreed that with modern designs, the effectiveness of flushing could be maintained with a reduced discharge. They advised that currently, the relevant legislation required flushing cisterns of watercloset fitments to have a discharge of between nine and 15 litres. In this regard, the Administration was undertaking relevant studies on the use of flushing systems with differential discharge volumes at public toilets and was considering necessary legislative amendments to reduce the statutory limit on the discharge volume of sanitary watercloset fitments in buildings.

39. In reply to Mr Albert CHAN's enquiry, AD/NW,WSD confirmed that some commercial buildings located near the harbour had their own salt water supply systems for air-conditioning and other uses. However, flushing supplies to residential developments in the territory were provided by the water supply systems of WSD.

40. The item was voted on and endorsed.

41. The Chairman reminded members that an additional meeting of the Subcommittee would be held on 17 January 2001 at 8:30 am.

42. The meeting ended at 12:15 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat  
8 January 2001