

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CROP 25/01-02

Ref: CB(3)/CROP/3

**Paper for the House Committee meeting
on 14 June 2002**

**Review of new arrangements for preparation of
minutes of proceedings of committees**

Purpose

This paper reports on the outcome of a review by the Committee on Rules of Procedure (the Committee) of the new arrangements for the preparation of minutes of proceedings of committees, which were introduced in November 2001, and invites Members to endorse the proposed adjustments to the arrangements arising from the review.

Background

2. At its meeting held on 5 October 2001, the House Committee (HC) endorsed the following arrangements proposed by the Committee for the preparation of minutes of meetings of committees:

Types of minutes

- (a) where no report will normally be published to record the deliberations and views of a committee upon the completion of the study of a specific subject, a detailed form of minutes as adopted for Panels should be used;
- (b) where a report will be published upon the completion of the study of a specific subject, the minutes of the meetings should be presented in a condensed form, recording the decisions of a committee, outstanding matters to be followed up at future meetings, undertakings by the Administration, decision of members to move Committee Stage Amendments, etc. All proceedings should be audio-recorded and the audio record indexed to facilitate easy retrieval. Where considered necessary by the committee, verbatim transcripts of the relevant parts of the proceedings of a committee meeting may be produced;

- (c) the current practice of preparing the minutes of meetings of HC, Finance Committee and its subcommittees, Committee on Members' Interests, Public Accounts Committee, the Committee and select committees should be maintained; and

Target time for producing draft minutes of meetings

- (d) Subject to factors which may affect the timely production of minutes, the following target times for the production of minutes should be set -
 - (i) the draft minutes of a two-hour regular Panel meeting should be available for the Administration's comments within two weeks of the meeting; and
 - (ii) the draft minutes of a two-hour bills committee or subcommittee meeting should be available for the Administration's comments within three working days of the meeting.

Target time for the Administration to comment on draft minutes of meetings

3. Commensurate with the new arrangements, the Administration agreed to provide comments on the draft minutes in detailed form within one week and those in condensed form within three working days.

4. In putting forward its proposals to HC, the Committee undertook to review the new arrangements after they had been tried out for a period of four months which ended on 28 February 2002.

Review of new arrangements for preparation of minutes

5. The Secretariat has collected statistics on the time taken by the clerks concerned to prepare the draft minutes of meetings of Panels/committees held during the four-month period and that taken by the Administration to provide comments thereon, and the reasons for not meeting the target times in some cases. These statistics are in **Appendix I**.

6. The clerks concerned were generally able to meet the target time for the preparation of minutes of meetings held during the trial period (the respective target times were met in 72.2% of meetings using detailed form of minutes and in 84.8% of meetings using condensed form of minutes). The main reasons for the clerks' not meeting the target times include: other urgent work commitments, staff on leave, public holidays which fell within the target time and the duration of some meetings being substantially longer than a normal 2-hour meeting slot.

7. The Administration was generally able to meet the target time for providing comments on the draft minutes of meetings in detailed form (the target time was met in 65.5% of the meetings concerned), but took longer time for providing comments on the draft minutes in condensed form (the target time was met in only 40.5% of the meetings concerned). According to the Administration, the delay was attributable to a number of factors. In most cases, the longer time is attributable to the need for the Administration to co-ordinate a joint reply where more than one bureau, department or outside body were involved in a particular meeting.

8. **Appendix II** sets out the respective comments by the Administration and the committee clerks concerned on the new arrangements. In brief, the Administration supports the continuation of the new arrangements, but suggests that the target response time for draft minutes in the condensed form be extended to three clear days. Committee clerks have no difficulty with the Administration's suggestion and, taking into account the operational experience in producing these draft minutes, suggest that the target time for the production of these draft minutes should likewise be extended to three clear days. As regards a Bills Committee's suggestion to adopt an alternative format for indexing the proceedings of a meeting by subject (Annex II to Appendix II), committee clerks have no strong views either way.

Deliberation of the Committee on Rules of Procedure

9. The Committee on Rules of Procedure notes that the new arrangements have generally worked satisfactorily, and recommends that they should continue, with the following adjustments:

- (a) the target time for the production of draft minutes in the condensed form be extended to three clear days;
- (b) the target time for the Administration to offer comments on these draft minutes be extended to three clear days; and
- (c) the alternative format suggested by a Bills Committee for indexing the proceedings of a meeting the minutes of which are prepared in the condensed form (Annex II to Appendix II) be adopted.

Advice sought

10. Members are invited to endorse the Committee's recommendations in paragraph 9 above. If these are agreed, the adjusted arrangements will be implemented with effect from the next Legislative Council session.

Statistics on the time taken by clerks to prepare draft minutes of committee meetings held from November 2001 to February 2002 and that taken by the Administration to comment thereon

Appendix I

Type of minutes of committee meetings	No. of meetings* where the minutes have been seen by the Administration	No. of meetings (%) where the draft minutes were available for the Administration's comments				Reasons for not meeting the target time for producing draft minutes	No. of meetings (%) where the Administration's comments were received			Reason for not meeting the target time for providing comments on draft minutes
		within two weeks of the meeting△	two to three weeks after the meeting	three to four weeks after the meeting	four weeks or more after the meeting		within one week▲	one to two weeks	after two weeks or more	
detailed form	81	58½ (72.2%)	14 (17.3%)	3½ (4.3%)	5 (6.2%)	- clerk on leave - several committee meetings held in the same week - special meetings and informal meetings held in the same period - several days of public holidays fell within the target time - sudden influx of workload - priority accorded to preparing minutes of meetings which have a shorter target time - drafting of minutes undertaken by temporary SAS - duration of regular meetings substantially beyond the normal 2-hour period - backlog of meetings held before the trial period - heavy workload of the CAS and SAS servicing the same committee	53 (65.5%)	24 (29.6%)	4 (4.9%)	lead time is required in co-ordination comments from different bureaux, departments and non-government bodies
		within three working days☺ of the meeting□	four working days to one week after the meeting	one to two weeks after the meeting	two weeks or more after the meeting		within three working days■	four working days to one week	after one week or more	
condensed form	79	67 (84.8%)	8 (10.1%)	3 (3.8%)	1 (1.3%)	- other work commitments - substantial input by CAS in vetting draft minutes prepared by SAS - clerk on leave - heavy workload of the CAS and SAS servicing the same committee	32 (40.5%)	30 (38%)	17 (21.5%)	same as above

- * (i) Special/joint panel meetings are excluded.
(ii) Meetings of HC, FC, PWSC, ESC, CRoP, PAC, CMI, Parliamentary Liaison Subcommittee and the Select Committee are excluded.
(iii) Number of meetings is counted on meeting basis.
- △ Target time for producing draft minutes in detailed form for a 2-hour regular meeting.
▲ Target time for the Administration to provide its comments on draft minutes in detailed form.
□ Target time for producing draft minutes in condensed form for a 2-hour meeting.
■ Target time for the Administration to provide its comments on draft minutes in condensed form.
☺ “Working day” means any day other than a public holiday, or a gale warning day or black rainstorm warning day as defined in section 71(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap.1).

	Comments by	
	the Administration	committee clerks concerned
Target times for production of draft minutes and for providing comments on them	<p><u>Detailed form of minutes</u> The Administration has no difficulty with the current one-week target time for providing comments on draft minutes in detailed form and shall continue to ensure that the deadline is adhered to in future.</p> <p><u>Condensed form of minutes</u> In the light of the operational experience, particularly the lead time required in coordinating comments from different departments and non-government bodies, the Administration suggests that the current target time of three working days for providing comments on draft minutes in condensed form be changed to three clear days (i.e. the day of receiving the draft minutes from the LegCo Secretariat and the day of Bureaux sending the comments be excluded).</p>	<p>Committee clerks will continue to make every effort to comply with the two-week target time for drafting detailed minutes of a two-hour regular Panel meeting, and hence, the target time should remain unchanged.</p> <p>Committee clerks have no difficulty with the Administration's suggestion to extend to three clear days the target time for providing comments on the draft minutes in condensed form. Taking into account the operational experience in producing these draft minutes, they consider it helpful if the target production time could also be extended to three clear days.</p>
Format of condensed form of minutes	<p>The Administration is in general content with the existing format of minutes in condensed form and sees merits in continuing with the arrangement which serves to ensure that a self-explanatory record of proceedings is prepared within a short time frame to facilitate follow up action.</p>	<p>The Bills Committee on Boilers and Pressure Vessels (Amendment) Bill 2001 has suggested that the Index of Proceedings (sample in Annex I) should be condensed by placing the parts of proceedings on the same subject in the same row. A Sample Index of Proceedings so condensed is in Annex II. Committee clerks have no strong views in using this alternative form of indexing.</p>

**Proceedings of the meeting of the Bills Committee on
Hong Kong Science & Technology Parks Corporation Bill
on Thursday, 8 February 2001, at 11:15 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Index	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
0001-0010	Mr James TIEN	Operating principle of the new corporation	
0011-0020	Admin.	Operating principle of the new corporation	
0021-0030	Mr James TIEN	Operating principle of the existing corporations	
0031-0040	Admin	Operating principle of the existing corporations	
0041-0050	Mr HUI Cheung-ching	Clause 6	
0051-0060	Admin	Clause 6	
0061-0084	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 27	
0085-0100	Admin	Clause 27	
0101-0120	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 27	
0121-0126	Admin	Clause 27	
0127-0133	ALA	Clause 27	
0134-0145	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 4	
0146-0155	Admin	Clause 4	
0156-0161	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 4	
0162-0186	Admin	Clause 4	√
0187-0198	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 8	
0199-0200	Admin	Clause 8	
0201-0209	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 8	
0210-0221	Admin	Clause 8	
0222-0232	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 10	
0233-0243	Admin	Clause 10	
0244-0254	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 10	
0255-0265	Admin	Clause 10	
0266-0276	Chairman	Clause 10	
0277-0298	Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Clause 10	
0299-0309	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 10	
0310-0319	Admin	Clause 10	
0320-0329	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 10	
0330-0339	Admin	Clause 10	
0340-0359	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 10	√

0360-0389	Admin	Clause 10	
0390-0399	Ms CHAN Yuen-han	Schedule 2	
0400-0419	Admin	Schedule 2	
0420-0439	Ms CHAN Yuen-han	Schedule 2	
0440-0477	Admin	Schedule 2	
0478-0499	Ms CHAN Yuen-han	Schedule 2	
0500-0509	Admin	Schedule 2	√
0510-0529	Ms CHAN Yuen-han	Clauses 6 & 12	
0530-0540	Admin	Clauses 6 & 12	
0541-0569	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clauses 6 & 12	
0570-0589	Admin	Clauses 6 & 12	√
0590-0609	Mr SIN Chung-kai	Clause 14	
0610-0629	Ms CHAN Yuen-han	Clause 14	
0630-0649	Admin	Clause 14	
0650-0689	Ms CHAN Yuen-han	Clause 14	
0690-0710	Admin	Clause 14	√

Note : The audio tapes of the above proceedings are kept at the LegCo Library

Legislative Council Secretariat

16 August 2001

**Proceedings of the meeting of the Bills Committee on
Boilers and Pressure Vessels (Amendment) Bill 2001
on Wednesday, 27 February 2002, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room B of the Legislative Council Building**

Index	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
0001-0337	Chairman Clerk	Confirmation of the minutes of the last meeting on 22 January 2002 & the format of the Annex to the minutes of the Committee	Clerk to convey to CRoP the Chairman's suggestion on the format of condensed form of minutes
0338-1902	Admin	Briefing on the operation of the various types of boilers and pressure vessels	
1903-3034	Chairman Hon Margaret NG SALA2 Admin	Policy and principles for declaring what kinds of rules made by the authorities under powers conferred by Ordinances should or should not be subsidiary legislation	Admin & SALA2 to provide written views
3035-3332	Admin Chairman	The Administration's response on members' concern about the intended meaning and criteria of "fit and proper" person under the proposed sections 6(1)(b)(i) and 6(3A)(b)(i) [Paragraph 3 of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	
3333-3439	Admin Chairman	Objective standards of qualification, experience and knowledge required for applicants of certificates, with or without passing examinations [Paragraphs 4 to 7 and Appendices II(a)&(b) of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	
3440-4007	Admin Chairman Hon LI Fung-ying	"Deemed revocation" of Certificate of Competence due to insufficient length of continuous service in operating a particular class of equipment, and appeal mechanism against revocation of certificate under section 6(4)(b) [Paragraphs 8 to 10 of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	
4008-4737	Hon Albert CHAN Admin Chairman	Recognition of relevant qualifications obtained overseas	
4738-5225	Hon Margaret NG Chairman Admin SALA2	Appeal mechanism against revocation of certificate under section 6(4)(b) [Paragraph 10 of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	

5226-5354	SALA2 Admin Chairman	SALA2 advised that the operation of boilers on ships was not covered by this Ordinance	
5355-5629	Hon Margaret NG Chairman Admin SALA2	Appeal mechanism against revocation of certificate under section 6(4)(b) [Paragraph 10 of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	
5630-5909	Admin Chairman	Availability of sufficient certificate-holders to operate boilers and steam receivers [Paragraphs 14 and 15 of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	
5910-5953	Admin Chairman	Measures to ensure operation of boilers under the direct supervision of certificate holders [Paragraph 16 of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	
5954-010004	Admin, Chairman	Reduction of fees for endorsement of certificates [Paragraphs 17 and 18 of LC Paper No. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01)]	
010005-010647	Chairman SALA2 Admin Hon TSANG Yok-sing	Committee Stage Amendments (CSAs) proposed by the Administration - deleting the proposed section 6(1) and substituting with proposed new section 6(1) [Appendix I of LC Papers Nos. CB(2) 1183/01-02(01) & CB(2)1222/01-02(01)]	
010648-011243	Chairman Admin SALA2	CSAs proposed by the Administration - deleting the proposed section 6(3A) and substituting with proposed new section 6(3A) [LC Paper No. CB(2) 1222/01-02(01)]	
011244-013629	Chairman SALA2 Admin Hon LEUNG Fu-wah Hon TSANG Yok-sing, Hon LI Fung-ying	CSAs proposed by the Administration - repealing the existing section 6(4) and substituting with proposed new section 6(4) [LC Paper No. CB(2) 1222/01-02(01)]	Admin to consider SALA2's suggestion
013630-014623	Hon TSANG Yok-sing Chairman Admin SALA2	Chinese translation of "substantial" in the context of the new proposed sections 6(1)(a) and 6(4)(a)	Admin to consider Mr TSANG's suggestion
014624-014708	Chairman Admin	The proposed new section 7(5) [LC Paper No. CB(2) 1222/01-02(01)]	
014709-014911	SALA2 Admin	Appeal mechanism in relation to endorsement of certificate	
014912-015027	Chairman Admin	Consequential amendments - sections 6(9), 6(10) and 7(5)	
015028-015134	SALA2	Marked-up copy of the Bill - section 18 on "Fees" [LC Paper No. CB(2) 929/01-02(03)]	

015135-015510	Chairman	Date of next meeting	
---------------	----------	----------------------	--

Note : The audio records of the above proceedings are kept at the LegCo Library

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
14 March 2002