

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)2659/01-02

Ref : CB2/HS/1/01

**Legislative Council
Subcommittee to Study the Proposed
Accountability System for Principal Officials and Related Issues**

**Minutes of the sixth meeting
held on Saturday, 11 May 2002 at 9:00 am to 1:00 pm
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Members Present : Hon IP Kwok-him, JP (Chairman)
Dr Hon YEUNG Sum (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon NG Leung-sing, JP
Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP
Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong
Hon Howard YOUNG, JP
Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS
Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, JP
Dr Hon LO Wing-lok
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon MA Fung-kwok
Hon Margaret NG
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP
Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

Members Attending : Hon SIN Chung-kai
Hon LAU Ping-cheung

Members Absent : Dr Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
Hon CHAN Kam-lam
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, JP
Hon SZETO Wah
Dr Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Public Officers Attending : Mr Clement C H MAK
Deputy Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Miss Agnes T Y WONG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Civil Service

By invitation : 9:00 am - 11:00 am

Hong Kong Federation of Civil Service Unions

Mr LEUNG Chau-ting
Chairman

Mr CHU Wai-hung
Vice-Chairman

Disciplined Services Consultative Council (Staff Side)

Mr MAN Sai-kit
Staff Side Chairman

Mr KWAN Leung-wah
Staff Side Representative

Government Mod 1 Staff General Union

Mr WONG Ping-yiu
Committee member

Mr LAU Pak-wing
Committee member

Senior Non-Expatriate Officers Association

Mr KWOK Chi-tak
Senior Vice-Chairman

Mr CHAN Pak-fong
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association

Mr WONG Hyo
Vice President

Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers

Mr HO King-on
Honorary President

The Hong Kong Executive, Administrative & Clerical Staff Association

Mr KAN Kim-shing
Vice-Chairman

Ms YEUNG Lai-shang
Secretary

The Association of Hong Kong Health Care Professionals

Mr Peter CHUA
President

The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong

Mr CHAN Wing-kee
President

Mr Francis LAU
Executive Director

The Hong Kong Chinese Enterprises Association

Mr LAM Chun-wing
General Manager

Mr YU Hok-chung
Deputy General Manager

Federation of Hong Kong Kowloon New Territories Hawker
Association

Mr LAM Kwei-cheong
Chairman

Miss CHAN Hing-yi
Secretary

Hong Kong Foshan Trader Association Ltd

Mr TEO Kong-lap
Secretary General

New Territories General Chamber of Commerce

Mr HO Kang-por, Alex
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong General Chamber of Commerce

Mr Eden WOON
Director

New Territories Fishermen Fraternity Association

Mr TUNG Wai-ming
Communication Department Head

11:00 am - 1:00 pm

Heung Yee Kuk, New Territories

Mr LAM Wai-keung
Vice-Chairman

Mr LAM Kwok-cheong
Co-opted Councillor

The Hong Kong Island Federation

Mr TSANG Heung-kwan
Vice-Chairman

The Hong Kong Southern District Alliance

Mr CHAN Sze-chung
Chairman

The Hong Kong Wan Chai District Association

Mrs LAI IP Po-ping, Fanny
Vice-Chairman

Community Activities Centre

Ms WAN Kwai-fong
Committee Member

Wah Fu Service Center Limited

Mr CHENG Shing-lam
Secretary

Hong Kong Chinese Reform Association Ltd

Mr CHUNG Shu-wing
Vice General-Secretary

Mr MAN Moon-lam
Vice General-Secretary

Fukien Chamber of Commerce

Mr LI Yueh-chin
Committee Member

Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Vice Secretary-General

Fukien Athletic Club Ltd

Mr CHOI Sai Chuen
Youth Department Vice-Director

The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce - Central
Western District Liaison Group

Mr LAU Mak-leong
Representative

Motor Transport Workers General Union

Mr LI Wing-sang
Chairman

Union Fencing Club

Mr Jason CHAN
Chairman

New Youth Forum

Ms Regina YEUNG
Convenor

Mr CHAN Kam-wan
Secretary General

Individual person

Mr HONG Tsang-yi

Mr NG Yat-cheung

Mr YIP Fong-keung, Christ

Ms YU Kwei-chun
Member, The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce

Mr NG Man-kwong

Mr TSE Ping-kin
Member, Kwun Tong District Council

Mr CHAN Yan-chong
Member, Sham Shui Po District Council

Mr HIEW-Chin
Member, Sai Kung District Council

Ms LEE Ming-pui
Member, Wong Tai Sin District Council

Clerk in Attendance : Mr Paul WOO
Chief Assistant Secretary (2)6

Staff in Attendance : Miss Monna LAI
Assistant Legal Adviser 7

Miss Lolita SHEK
Senior Assistant Secretary (2)7

Action
Column

I. Meeting with deputations

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1857/01-02 and CB(2)1895/01-02]

The Chairman welcomed the representatives of the organisations and individual persons to the meeting to exchange views with members of the Subcommittee on the proposed accountability system for principal officials. He said that the written submissions received by the Subcommittee had been circulated to members before the meeting. He invited each of the deputations to make a brief oral representation on the proposed accountability system.

2. A summary of the views of the deputations was attached in the **Appendix**. Representatives of the Government Mod 1 Staff General Union and New Territories General Chamber of Commerce indicated that they did not have any comments on the proposed accountability system.

3. The Chairman invited questions from members of the Subcommittee.

4. Ms Emily LAU thanked the deputations for expressing their views on the proposed accountability system. Referring to the submissions made by the deputations attending the meeting session from 11:00 am to 1:00 pm, Ms LAU said that the majority of the views expressed in support of the proposed system were very similar as if they were the views of the same person.

5. Mr CHAN Sze-chung said that he was disappointed at Ms LAU's remark. He said that the Subcommittee should appreciate and respect the efforts made by the deputations in preparing their submissions and presenting their views to the Subcommittee. Ms LAU said that she had every respect for the deputations and had listened to their views carefully throughout the meeting. Mr NG Leung-sing said that the Subcommittee respected every view submitted by the public for the Subcommittee's consideration.

Powers of the Chief Executive (CE)

6. In response to the question from Mr TAM Yiu-chung on whether the accountability system would centralise powers in the hands of CE, both Mr TSANG Heung-kwan and Mrs LAI IP Po-ping opined that such a situation would not arise. Mr TSANG said that the accountability system would not increase the powers of CE which had clearly been specified in the Basic Law. Mrs LAI added that the proposed system would increase the transparency of policy making as the principal officials were required to explain government policies clearly to the public.

Principal officials under the proposed system

7. Mr Andrew WONG said that he supported the suggestion from Mr CHAN Yan-chong that each Director of Bureau should be assisted by a Deputy Director. He requested the Administration to consider this proposal.

8. Referring to the concerns expressed by the Senior Non-Expatriate Officers Association that the appointment of principal officials from outside the civil service might give rise to a situation of "non-professionals leading the professionals", Mr James TIEN said that under the existing structure, many government departments were already headed by "non-professional" Administrative Officers. In his view, recruiting able persons from outside the civil service who possessed the required experience and expertise in the respective policy portfolios as principal officials under the accountability system might not lead to a scenario as depicted by the Association. On the contrary, it could improve the governance of Hong Kong.

9. Mr KWOK Chi-tak responded that the stance of the Association was that it would be in the public interest to appoint as Directors of Bureau or Heads of Departments persons with professional knowledge and expertise in the relevant fields to enhance the Government's ability in formulating long-term policies and handling policy blunders if they occurred. Mr WONG Hyo pointed out that while non-professional officers might be handicapped with insufficient professional knowledge in overseeing the operation of the departments in the execution of policies, professional officers might also lack the management skills necessary for the effective supervision of departments. He said that to address the problems, the Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association had all along been urging the Government to enhance training for civil servants at all levels.

10. Regarding the question from Mr James TIEN on whether or not the principal officials should have the power to deploy and dismiss civil servants (including the Permanent Secretaries) working under them, Mr KWOK Chi-tak opined that the existing system worked well and should continue to be adopted under the new accountability system.

11. Ms Emily LAU referred to the statement made by Ms YU Kwei-chun that many people she knew of were in support of the accountability system. Ms LAU asked whether they knew that the principal officials under the proposed system would in practice be accountable to CE alone, but CE did not have a popular mandate of the people of Hong Kong because he was not elected by universal suffrage. Ms YU Kwei-chun responded that as the principal officials would need to take into consideration public opinions in formulating policies and they would also be required to explain the policies to the public clearly, Government's accountability to the public would be greatly enhanced under the new system. Mr TSANG Heung-kwan said that the principal officials under the new system would be people dedicated to serving the people of Hong Kong. In his opinion, the principal officials would be accountable to the public through CE, who had a decisive role to play in their appointment.

Secretary for the Civil Service (SCS) and the civil service

12. Ms Emily LAU expressed concern about the worries of members of the disciplined forces that the civil service would be politicised under the accountability system and the disciplined forces would not be able to continue to maintain law and order in an impartial manner. Mr MAN Sai-kit said that members of the disciplined forces had to abide by the specific rules and regulations in carrying out instructions from their superiors. They were worried that politicisation might force them to compromise their integrity, probity or impartiality in the discharge of their duties in a way which might prejudice the public interest.

13. Mr Michael MAK Kwok-fung asked whether the Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association supported the proposal to have the post of SCS filled by a political appointee, in view of the concern expressed that it would affect the political neutrality of the civil service. Mr WONG Hyo responded that the Association had no objection to the proposal. He said that civil servants needed not be too concerned about the office of SCS being filled by a political appointee, provided that the Government could enhance communication and establish a good partnership relationship with civil servants at all levels so as to win their cooperation and support.

14. Mr Andrew WONG considered that the concern about the impact on the political neutrality of the civil service was a genuine one. He suggested that the Administration could draw reference from the system in the United Kingdom (UK). He pointed out that the UK Prime Minister (PM), as Minister for the Civil Service, was responsible for central coordination and management of the civil service. The PM was supported by the Head of Home Civil Service who was a senior career civil servant. There was also the system of the independent Civil Service Commissioners responsible for appointment matters. These served as institutional safeguards to protect the interests and political neutrality of the civil

service. Mr Andrew WONG also drew members' attention to a written submission from Dr Eliza LEE of the Chinese University of Hong Kong (LC Paper No. CB(2)1854/01-02(20)) in which Dr LEE had suggested measures to safeguard the political neutrality of the civil service.

15. Mr LEUNG Chau-ting said that members of the Hong Kong Federation of Civil Service Unions shared the concern that the political inclinations of SCS under the accountability system would affect the interests and political neutrality of civil servants. They were also worried about the possible shrinking of the civil service establishments at lower levels as a result of the restructuring of bureaux and departments under the new accountability system.

16. In response to Mr YEUNG Yiu-chung, Mr Eden WOON and Mr TUNG Wai-ming said that the proposed system would not encourage a culture of "shoe-shining" in the civil service. Mr WOON opined that the civil service would remain meritocratic under the existing reward and disciplinary system.

17. Ms Emily LAU requested Ms WAN Kwai-fong to clarify her remarks that the civil servants had not cooperated well with CE and failed to provide the latter with the necessary support for the execution of government policies. Ms WAN said that her remarks were evidenced by the serious blunders in the past few years which were caused by the failure on the part of the civil servants in implementing policies faithfully. She believed that with the principal officials being held accountable for their success or failure of their policies under the accountability system, policy formulation and implementation would be much improved.

18. Ms Emily LAU opined that confused and inconsistent policy instructions from the highest echelon of Government were also a cause for past policy blunders.

Permanent Secretaries

19. Mr MA Fung-kwok sought the views of the Senior Non-Expatriate Officers Association on whether the Permanent Secretaries should assist the principal officials to "sell" government policies to the Legislative Council (LegCo) and the public. Mr KWOK Chi-tak commented that this would be an acceptable arrangement. He said that policy Secretaries under the existing system were performing this duty. However, he stressed that with the implementation of the new accountability system, the duties and responsibilities of the principal officials and Permanent Secretaries should be clearly defined.

20. Mr Andrew WONG requested the Administration to clarify the following writing -

- (a) whether there would be a Permanent Secretary working to the politically appointed SCS under the accountability system; and

- (b) whether the Permanent Secretaries would be required to "sell" government policies and how they were to carry out such duties.

The role of LegCo in the proposed system

21. In response to the questions from Ms Emily LAU and Mr Michael MAK Kwok-fung on whether LegCo should play a role in the appointment and removal of principal officials, Mr Eden WOON said that Hong Kong should not simply copy the systems of other countries. He added that the mechanism for the appointment and removal of principal officials had been clearly stipulated in the Basic Law and should be strictly adhered to. He considered that LegCo and the media would continue to play an important role in monitoring the Government and the performance of the principal officials.

II. Date of next meeting

22. The next meeting of the Subcommittee would be held on Tuesday, 14 May 2002 from 8:30 am to 12:45 pm.
23. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
31 July 2002

Subcommittee to Study the Proposed Accountability System for Principal Officials and Related Issues

Meeting on 11 May 2002

Summary of views expressed by organisations/individuals on the proposed system

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
1.	Hong Kong Federation of Civil Service Unions (No written submission provided)	(a) The necessity to implement the accountability system by 1 July 2002 is in doubt. It is desirable to allow sufficient time to assess the impact on the civil service, which has already undergone reformatory changes since the reunification.	(b) Not in support of the political appointment of the Secretary for the Civil Service (SCS) for fear that the interests and political neutrality of civil servants will not be adequately protected.
2.	Disciplined Services Consultative Council (Staff Side) CB(2)1895/01-02(01)		(a) The political neutrality of the civil service may not be maintained under a politically appointed SCS with political inclinations; and (b) As civil servants strive to safeguard their interests, the civil service may be forced to become politicised. In the end, the interests of civil servants may be sacrificed as a result of the political "tussle".

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
3.	Senior Non-Expatriate Officers Association CB(2)1917/01-02(01)	<p>(a) In support of the proposed system;</p> <p>(b) There is concern about the impact on the operation and coordination of the various bureaux, with the proposed reduction of the number of bureaux from 16 to 11;</p> <p>(c) There is also concern that the reduction of the number of bureaux under the proposed system will pave the way for further amalgamation of bureaux with departments and merging of departments.</p>	<p>(d) In support of separating political accountability from execution of policies in order to maintain the political neutrality of the civil service;</p> <p>(e) SCS should not be politically appointed;</p> <p>(f) SCS should be a civil servant appointed on civil service terms and be appointed to the ExCo and enjoy equal status as the other politically appointed principal officials;</p> <p>(g) Principal officials should have a full understanding of the core values of the civil service. They should have regard to the need to uphold such values in formulating policies and taking policy decisions;</p> <p>(h) Principal officials should have good knowledge of matters within their respective policy portfolios to avoid a situation of "non-professionals leading the professionals";</p>

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			<p>(i) The duties and responsibilities of principal officials and Permanent Secretaries and their relationship should be clearly defined; and</p> <p>(j) Civil servants should be further consulted when more details of the accountability system are available.</p>
4.	Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association (CB(2)1931/01-02(01))	(a) There is concern about the impact of the restructuring of bureaux, and the re-distribution of responsibilities among bureaux, on the services provided to the public, as well as the work, rights and benefits of civil servants.	<p>(b) Civil servants need not be too concerned about the office of SCS being filled by a political appointee. The Government should enhance communication and establish a partnership relationship with civil servants at all levels. This partnership relationship will enable principal officials to win the cooperation and support of civil servants, which is crucial to the success of the proposed system.</p> <p>(c) Whether principal officials can bring in practical and innovative ideas and formulate long term policies within their term of office; and</p>

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			(d) Policy decision making under the proposed system should be free from abuse of power, and responsive to the views of the community and the civil servants.
5.	Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers CB(2)1857/01-02(01)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and (b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
6.	Hong Kong Executive, Administrative & Clerical Staff Association CB(2)1857/01-02(02)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; (b) The proposed system complies with BL; (c) In support of the proposed re-organisation of bureaux and reduction of the number of bureaux; and (d) The proposed system will enhance the operation of ExCo.	

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
7.	The Association of Hong Kong Health Care Professionals CB(2)1857/01-02(03)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
8.	The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong (No written submission provided)	(a) The proposed system will improve the operation of the Government and pave the way for democratic development.	(b) In support of the proposed relationship between the principal officials and Permanent Secretaries; (c) Restrictions on principal officials taking up post-office employment should not have the effect of deterring able persons from joining the Government; and (d) Civil servants should support the accountability system and fully cooperate with the principal officials.
9.	The Hong Kong Chinese Enterprises Association CB(2)1895/01-02(02)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
10.	Federation of Hong Kong Kowloon New Territories Hawker Associations CB(2)1857/01-02(04)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
11.	Hong Kong Foshan Trader Association CB(2)1857/01-02(05)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	
12.	Hong Kong General Chamber of Commerce CB(2)1857/01-02(06)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) The proposed system will complement and benefit the civil service; (c) Principal officials should improve communication with civil servants; and (d) Restrictions on post-office employment should not deter able persons from accepting appointment as principal officials.

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
13.	New Territories Fishermen Fraternity Association CB(2)1895/01-02(03)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
14.	Heung Yee Kuk New Territories CB(2)1917/01-02(02)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and (b) The remuneration for the Chief Executive (CE) should not be less favourable than that of the principal officials.	
15.	The Hong Kong Island Federation CB(2)1895/01-02(04)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; and (b) The Legislative Council (LegCo) should expedite funding approval for the early implementation of the accountability system.	
16.	The Hong Kong Southern District Alliance CB(2)1917/01-02(03)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
17.	The Hong Kong Wan Chai District Association CB(2)1857/01-02(07)	(a) In support of the proposed system; (b) Principal officials should be appointed to ExCo.	(c) SCS should be appointed from within the civil service.
18.	Community Activities Centre CB(2)1857/01-02(08)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
19.	Wah Fu Service Centre Limited CB(2)1895/01-02(05)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and (b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
20.	Hong Kong Chinese Reform Association Ltd CB(2)1857/01-02(09)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) More senior officials can be appointed by CE and included in the accountability system.
21.	Fukien Chamber of Commerce CB(2)1895/01-02(06)	(a) In support of the proposed system; (b) The proposed system complies with BL; and (c) Principal officials should be appointed to ExCo.	

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
22.	Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations CB(2)1895/01-02(07)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and (b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
23.	Fukien Athletic Club Ltd (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
24.	The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce Central and Western District Liaison Group CB(2)1857/01-02(13)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	
25.	Motor Transport Workers General Union CB(2)1857/01-02(10)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002;and (b) The proposed system complies with BL.	

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
26.	Union Fencing Club CB(2)1857/01-02(11)	(a) Election of CE by universal suffrage and party politics, though conducive to enhancing accountability, need time to develop. The proposed accountability system is a desirable step forward.	
27.	New Youth Forum CB(2)1895/01-02(08)	<p>(a) The public should be consulted on the details of the accountability system and any future changes to the system to ensure there is transparency;</p> <p>(b) In support of transferring the ExCo Secretariat to the CE's Office;</p> <p>(c) The duties and responsibilities of the bureaux after re-organisation have to be appropriately defined;</p> <p>(d) The merge of the Manpower portfolio with Commerce and Industry may cause continuing education to become too business-oriented.</p>	<p>(e) Political accountability of principal officials should be separated from policy implementation by civil servants;</p> <p>(f) Some principal officials may be overloaded with responsibilities that they may not be able to maintain close contact with LegCo;</p> <p>(g) There may be difficulty in finding suitable candidates to fill the offices of politically appointed principal officials; and</p> <p>(h) The relationship between principal officials and advisory/statutory bodies should be reviewed.</p>

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
28.	Mr HONG Tsang-yi CB(2)1857/01-02(12)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; and (b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
29.	Mr NG Yat-cheung (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; and (b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
30.	Mr YIP Fong-keung, Christ (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) All civil servants should eventually be included in the accountability system.

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
31.	Ms YU Kwei-chun Member, The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce CB(2)1857/01-02(14)	(a) The majority of the people of Hong Kong support the proposed system; (b) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; (c) The proposed system will enhance coordination between bureaux and cooperation with ExCo in policy implementation.	(d) Principal officials should share the same policy visions as the CE.
32.	Mr NG Man-kwong CB(2)1857/01-02(15)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and (b) The system complies with BL.	
33.	Mr TSE Ping-kin Member, Kwun Tong District Council (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) The Government should consider appointing advisers from a wider spectrum of the community, and review the functions and the number of existing advisory bodies.

LC Paper No. of written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the proposed system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
34.	Mr CHAN Yan-chong Member, Sham Shui Po District Council (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) Each principal official should be assisted by a Deputy Director of Bureau whose duties may include that of a press secretary.
35.	Mr HIEW Chin Member, Sai Kung District Council CB(2)1895/01-02(09)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
36.	Ms LEE Ming-pui Member, Wong Tai Sin District Council (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) Principal officials should enhance communication with the District Councils, and the latter should have a greater role to play in assisting with the formulation and implementation of government policies.