

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1) 470/02-03
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/PLW/1

**Panel on Planning, Lands and Works
and Panel on Housing**

**Minutes of joint meeting
held on Tuesday, 16 April 2002 at 8:30 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Members of Panel on Planning, Lands and Works

- Dr Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP (Chairman)
- * Hon LAU Ping-cheung (Deputy Chairman)
- Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP
- * Hon James TO Kun-sun
- Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
- * Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
- * Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

Members of Panel on Housing

- Hon Albert HO Chun-yan (Chairman)
- Hon CHAN Kam-lam (Deputy Chairman)
- Dr Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP
- Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP
- Hon NG Leung-sing, JP
- Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
- Hon Howard YOUNG, JP
- Dr Hon LO Wing-lok
- Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

Members absent : Members of Panel on Planning, Lands and Works

Hon WONG Yung-kan
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP
* Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
* Hon WONG Sing-chi

Members of Panel on Housing

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon SIN Chung-kai
Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr Hon YEUNG Sum
Hon SZETO Wah

(*Also members of the LegCo Panel on Housing)

Public officers attending : Ms LAM Lit-kwan
Chief Assistant Secretary (Research and Planning)
Housing Bureau

Mrs Connie LAI FAN Siu-wah
Chief Planning Officer
Housing Department

Mr Harry CHAN
Senior Planning Officer
Housing Department

Mr Michael CHAN Chun-fung
Chief Town Planner
Planning Department

Attendance by invitation : Mr Joe MA
Study Manager (Ngau Tau Kok)
LD Asia Limited

Ms Iris TAM
Study Manager (Ho Man Tin)
City Planning Consultants Limited

Mr Keith PERRY
Study Manager (Shek Kip Mei)
Townland Consultants Limited

Mr Julio FIGUIRAS
Study Manager (Cheung Sha Wan)
Shankland Cox Asia Limited

Clerk in attendance : Miss Salumi CHAN
Chief Assistant Secretary (1)5

Staff in attendance : Mrs Queenie YU
Senior Assistant Secretary (1)6

Action

I. Election of Chairman

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan was elected Chairman of the joint meeting.

II. Restructuring studies on Ngau Tau Kok, Shek Kip Mei, Cheung Sha Wan and Ho Man Tin areas

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/01-02(01) — Paper provided by the Administration)

2. The Chairman briefed members that the Administration had commissioned four consultants in 1999 to carry out the restructuring studies on four areas in Kowloon, namely, Ngau Tau Kok, Shek Kip Mei, Cheung Sha Wan and Ho Man Tin. The objective of the studies was to examine the opportunities for comprehensive planning of old public housing sites and adjoining Government land to bring about wider community benefits. The four studies were conducted in two stages. The purpose of the joint meeting was for the Administration to brief the Panel on Housing and Panel on Planning, Lands and Works on the findings and proposals of Stage 1 of the studies.

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Chief Assistant Secretary (Research and Planning) of Housing Bureau (CAS/HB) and the Chief Planning Officer of Housing Department (CPO/HD) briefed members on the background and objectives of the restructuring studies as well as the community benefits to be brought about by the proposed land use concepts, as detailed in the paper provided by the Administration.

They pointed out that it would take about 15 to 20 years to complete the whole process of land use restructuring for the four study areas. If all the restructuring proposals were implemented, there would be a net increase of 34 800 flats and 79 000 persons within the four districts. Public consultation on the findings and proposals of Stage 1 of the studies would last until mid-June 2002. Apart from consulting Legislative Council Members, the Administration would consult the relevant District Councils, Town Planning Board, and the Planning Subcommittee under the Land and Building Advisory Committee. Public consultation fora would also be conducted in the four study areas. The views sought would then be taken into consideration in finalizing the land use proposal in Stage 2 of the studies where detailed planning would be carried out.

4. The Administration then gave a power-point presentation on "Long-term Land Use Restructuring Studies".

(Post-meeting note: The presentation material on "Long-term Land Use Restructuring Studies" was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1515/01-02 on 17 April 2002.)

Policy considerations

Scope of the restructuring studies

5. Pointing out that studies on land use planning were normally conducted by the Planning Department (PD) and that the scope of the current restructuring studies covered non-public housing sites, Mr IP Kwok-him asked for the reason why the Housing Bureau (HB) took the lead in the current restructuring studies. CAS/HB explained that the restructuring of individual public housing estates had all along been considered by HB and included in the Comprehensive Redevelopment Programme (CRP). The conventional approach was confined to the immediate boundaries of individual public housing estates and had limited scope of rationalizing the land uses and improving the living environment of the district concerned. To improve the situation, a new approach was adopted in the current restructuring studies to enable inputs from relevant bureaux and departments at an early stage for a better redevelopment plan for the districts concerned.

6. Mr James TO Kun-sun considered it more appropriate for Planning and Lands Bureau (PLB) to take the lead in the current restructuring studies, as the focus of the studies was on long-term land use planning for the four districts concerned. Miss CHAN Yuen-han shared his view. Mr TO also said that he supported the Administration's thinking that restructuring studies should not be confined to the immediate boundaries of individual public housing estates. In this connection, he was of the view that the old buildings across the street of So Uk Estate should be covered by the restructuring study on Cheung Sha Wan district, and that the old private buildings and Government quarters in the vicinity of Ma Tau Wai Estate should be

covered by the restructuring study on Ho Man Tin district. Moreover, he considered it more meaningful for the Administration to put forward not only the proposed land use concepts for public consultation, but also various planning options to achieve the visions planned for the four study areas. CAS/HB explained that the restructuring studies were conducted in two stages. Stage 1 focused on the development of land use concepts and preliminary technical acceptability of the land use proposals. Public consultation was being conducted to solicit views of the public on the findings and proposals under Stage 1. Their views would be taken into account in finalizing the land use proposals and in the detailed planning for the Stage 2 studies.

7. Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip considered that the proposals were not set out in detail in the consultation digest on the studies. To facilitate members' consideration of the proposals, he requested the Administration to provide the full reports on the restructuring studies of the four study areas. CAS/HB agreed to consider the request.

(Post-meeting note: The four reports on the restructuring studies on the four study areas provided by the Administration were issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)2166/01-02 on 2 July 2002.)

Impact on policy changes and allocation of land uses

8. Dr TANG Siu-tong welcomed the Administration's new approach to examine the opportunities for comprehensive planning of old public housing sites beyond the boundary of individual housing estates. He asked whether the new approach implied a policy change. Whilst supporting the Administration's new approach, Mr Albert CHAN was concerned whether the restructuring exercise would effectively address the problems identified in the four study areas and make improvements. CAS/HB responded that the new approach aimed to optimize the long-term land use so as to bring about more social benefits and environmental improvements to the community, such as the provision of more schools, open space and pedestrian walkway. Under Stage 1 of the studies, the consultants were required to evaluate the best development option for each of the four study areas. The Administration would keep an open mind on the need for policy changes to support the development proposals recommended in the restructuring studies.

9. Citing the redevelopment of North Point Estate as an example, Mr Albert CHAN was concerned whether the Administration would take the opportunity of conducting the restructuring exercise to reduce substantially the quantity of land allocated for public housing and re-allocate the land for private housing, in particular, the quality sites. Mr IP Kwok-him shared Mr CHAN's concern. CAS/HB reassured members that the Administration had no such intention.

10. Mr CHAN Kam-lam and Dr TANG Siu-tong asked for the criteria for determining the allocation of land use for public housing and private housing. CAS/HB advised that the net number of flats available for non-public housing after

redevelopment in each of the study areas would depend on the number of flats used for rehousing the affected tenants in the respective areas after redevelopment. The Administration would consider allocating the remaining land for other uses, such as community facilities and private housing. The subject would be examined under Stage 2 of the studies. At the request of Mr IP Kwok-him, CAS/HB undertook to provide information on the respective percentages of land allocated for public housing, private housing and non-housing purposes in each of the four study areas before and after restructuring.

(Post-meeting note: The table on land allocation for public housing, private housing, undetermined public/private housing and non-residential uses in the four study areas provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1713/01-02 on 10 May 2002.)

Rehousing arrangements

11. Miss CHAN Yuen-han was concerned whether the tenants affected by the redevelopment of the four study areas would be rehoused in the same district. CPO/HD advised that implementation details of the restructuring sites, including timing for clearance of the public housing estates and rehousing arrangements, would be considered in Stage 2 of the studies. CAS/HB advised that as a general policy, priority would be given to the re-provisioning of the tenants of public housing units affected by redevelopment for rehousing in the same district as far as possible. She assured members that this general policy would also apply to the current restructuring exercise. Responding to Dr TANG Siu-tong, CAS/HB committed that the tenants affected by the current restructuring exercise would be offered rehousing in the same district as far as possible.

12. Responding to Mr Howard YOUNG's enquiry, CAS/HB advised that in general, tenants affected by redevelopment would be rehoused in the same district or a nearby district. It was not the prevailing practice for the affected tenants to be rehoused to interim housing units first and then moved back to the redeveloped area upon completion of the redevelopment project. As regards the meaning of "rehousing in the same district (原區安置)", CAS/HB explained that rehousing the tenants might not be confined to the estates within the same district. For example, tenants in Pak Tin Estate might be offered rehousing to Nam Cheong Estate and tenants in Tze Wan Shan to Wong Tai Sin. Nevertheless, the affected tenants would normally be offered some options.

Facilities for the elderly people

13. Responding to Dr LO Wing-lok, CAS/HB advised that there would be about 1 million persons aged 60 or above by 2016, representing about 15% to 20% of the total population. A majority of them were living in the public housing estates in the four study areas. Dr LO was concerned whether the provision of elderly centres, medical and other community facilities for the aged had been included in the restructuring plan. CAS/HB and CPO/HD advised that this crucial factor of planning for improved supporting services for the elderly would be considered in Stage 2 of the Studies where detailed planning would be carried out. Nevertheless, the consultants would take into account this crucial factor in planning improved supporting services for the elderly people in the four study areas. Mr James TO appreciated the Administration's efforts in taking forward the planning of the restructuring studies to cater for the needs of the community. Miss CHAN Yuen-han stressed that the whole restructuring exercise must be people-oriented.

Involvement of the Urban Renewal Authority

Admin

14. Mr Fred LI Wah-ming asked whether the Administration had considered involving the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) in the restructuring exercise to achieve more comprehensive planning and redevelopment for the four study areas. CAS/HB undertook to look into Mr LI's suggestion with the relevant Bureaux. Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee was of the view that PD should take a more proactive role in coordinating the restructuring plans of the Administration and URA. CTP/PD pointed out that PD was making conscious effort to coordinate the work of the authorities concerned in undertaking redevelopment projects in the same area for better overall planning and smooth implementation. In this connection, Mr James TO reiterated his view that PLB should take a leading role in restructuring exercises.

Four study areas*Ngau Tau Kok district*

15. Pointing out that the redevelopment of public housing estates in Ngau Tau Kok district had not been completed, Mr Fred LI was concerned whether the last phase of the redevelopment programme involving Blocks 8 to 14 of Lower Ngau Tau Kok Estate would be affected by the current restructuring study. Mr Frederick FUNG said that as far as he knew, redevelopment of Lower Ngau Tau Kok Estate would be postponed due to the delay of the completion of the reception estates at Blocks 1 to 5 of the Upper Ngau Tau Kok Estate. CPO/HD advised that both Upper and Lower Ngau Tau Kok Estates had been included in CRP and would not be affected by the current restructuring study.

16. Mr Fred LI considered that as the restructuring study on Ngau Tau Kok district covered Ping Shek Estate, it should also cover Choi Hung Estate. CPO/HD explained that the boundary of the study areas was drawn according to the Outline Zoning Plans for the district concerned and the major transport network. Mr LI considered that the Administration should not adhere strictly to the district boundary for administrative convenience and should take into account the actual need of the local community. Mr Joe MA, Study Manager (Ngau Tau Kok) of LD Asia Limited said that redevelopment of Choi Hung Estate could be dealt with as an independent project by HD. CPO/HD assured members that the Administration would consider redevelopment of individual public housing estate on a need basis.

17. Mr Fred LI also considered that as the restructuring study on Ngau Tau Kok district covered Shun On Estate, it should also cover Shun Lee Estate, Shun Tin Estate and Garden Estate. The Administration should take the opportunity to give the whole district a face-lift, instead of undertaking redevelopment projects on a piece-meal basis. Mr Joe MA, Study Manager (Ngau Tau Kok) of LD Asia Limited responded that under the current proposal, a new and vibrant district centre would be developed in Lower Ngau Tau Kok Estate while a secondary retail centre be developed in Shun On/Shun Lee/Shun Tin area. Mr LI was of the view that Shun On/Shun Lee/Shun Tin area should be developed into a major residential area rather than a secondary retail centre, as it was located at the highest level in Kwun Tong with good landscape and sea view. He suggested the Administration to link up the area with the new district centre in Lower Ngau Tau Kok Estate. Mr MA clarified that the majority of the land in Shun On/Shun Lee/Shun Tin area would still be retained for residential use. As there was a lack of commercial facilities in the area, it was proposed that the area be developed into a secondary retail centre. Mr LI stressed that the Administration should ensure that the development of the whole area would be compatible with other new development in the vicinity. Miss CHAN Yuen-han added that the development of Ping Shek Estate should be compatible with the South East Kowloon development.

18. Pointing out that redevelopment programmes for Upper and Lower Ngau Tau Kok Estates were in place and that the conditions of other estates in Ngau Tau Kok district such as Ping Shek Estate and Shun On Estate were not too bad, Mr CHAN Kam-lam queried the need for the redevelopment of the district at the present stage. CAS/HB responded that as Ping Shek Estate was built in the late 1960s, it was time to commence the planning for the restructuring of the district, which would take 15 to 20 years to complete.

19. Mr CHAN Kam-lam pointed out that the announcement of redevelopment of Ngau Tau Kok district had aroused anxiety and worries among the residents concerned especially the elderly ones, as they did not know the purpose and scope of the restructuring study. They were very concerned whether they would be rehoused in the same district or not. Whilst appreciating the residents' concern, CAS/HB pointed out that the restructuring study aimed to bring about more community benefits. The

residents would be able to enjoy the benefits after the completion of the restructuring exercise, such as the new and improved pedestrian linkages between the Shun On/Shun Lee/Shun Tin area and the new district centre in Lower Ngau Tau Kok Estate. To ease the residents' concern, the Administration would explain to them the details of the restructuring study. Mr CHAN considered that the provision of new and improved pedestrian linkages would still be viable without conducting such a large-scale restructuring study. Mr Fred LI urged the Administration to study the safety aspect of the proposed pedestrian linkages, as the users would include a number of elderly people.

20. Mr CHAN Kam-lam noted from the consultation digest that the proposed land use concepts identified in the restructuring study on Ngau Tau Kok district could potentially increase the local population from 234 000 to 250 000. He was concerned that the addition of 16 000 residents after redevelopment would substantially increase the population density of the already overcrowded Ngau Tau Kok district and aggravate the traffic problems in the district.

Ho Man Tin district

21. Referring to the Administration's claim that the purpose of the restructuring studies was to bring about an improvement to the living environment for the four study areas, Ir Dr Raymond HO asked whether there were any concrete measures proposed under the studies to achieve a green living environment, for example, any concrete measures proposed to achieve the vision of the restructuring study on Ho Man Tin district, i.e. "to preserve and enhance Ho Man Tin as a residential oasis in the heart of Kowloon". Ms Iris TAM, the Study Manager (Ho Man Tin) of City Planning Consultants Limited (CPC) pointed out that a number of measures had been proposed for achieving the vision, including the planning for better housing layout and incorporating appropriate noise mitigation measures upon redevelopment in anticipation of the opening of the Shatin to Central Link, the planning for more direct pedestrian linkages to connect the higher level residential areas with the new railway station, and landscaping the barren slopes, open spaces and streets to improve the district identity.

22. Ir Dr Raymond HO supported the planting of more trees to improve the air quality and reduce noise pollution, and urged the Administration to expedite the implementation of the relevant proposals. As far as he knew, planting a tree on a roadside involved tedious procedures and a number of bureaux and departments. CTP/PD advised that the Territory Development Department would coordinate Stage 2 of the studies where detailed implementation plan would be formulated. Streamlined procedures for the planting of trees would be considered as far as practicable.

23. Pointing out that the new developments at the Waterloo Road had blocked the ridgeline of the Lion Rock, Ir Dr Raymond HO asked whether height restriction would be imposed on new buildings. CTP/PD advised that the subject, among others, was being studied in the context of the drafting of the Urban Design Guidelines for Hong Kong. The Administration was consulting the public whether height restriction should be applied to new development for all sites, or whether certain sites should be exempted from such restriction.

Cheung Sha Wan district

24. Responding to the Chairman, Mr Julio FIGUIRAS, Study Manager (Cheung Sha Wan) of Shankland Cox Asia Limited (SCAL) briefed members that Cheung Sha Wan district was characterized by public housing estates with sub-standard facilities. There were several under-utilized and obsolete industrial land uses located close to existing and proposed housing areas. The restructuring study aimed to revive the whole district by making better use of strategically located sites, identifying new potential development areas and providing improved transport facilities.

Admin

25. Mr Howard YOUNG enquired whether the obsolete industrial buildings in Cheung Sha Wan district would be converted for housing the singletons as in the case of some overseas countries. CAS/HB agreed to consider Mr YOUNG's proposal as a development option under the current restructuring study. She also pointed out that the usage of obsolete industrial buildings was one of the areas being considered by PD under the "Hong Kong 2030 — Planning Vision and Strategy Study".

26. Mr Frederick FUNG was concerned that the restructuring study on the Cheung Sha Wan district would slow down the urban renewal programme for So Uk Estate, which was proposed three years ago. According to HD, the redevelopment plan was put on hold pending the outcome of the current restructuring study. CTP/PD clarified that the future redevelopment of So Uk Estate might also be affected by the URA's redevelopment plan for its proposed projects at Hing Wah Street. They would be further considered by the Administration after URA had made a decision in this regard.

Shek Kip Mei district

27. Responding to Ir Dr Raymond HO, Mr Keith PERRY, Study Manager (Shek Kip Mei) of Townland Consultants Limited (TCL) advised that the restructuring study on Shek Kip Mei district aimed to introduce new planning, design and building concepts for urban redevelopment, to provide better pedestrian and public transport facilities, such as the provision of improved access to the Northern Knoll and Southern Knoll with fitness trail, to improve open space and community facilities, and to enhance the district's heritage potential.

Admin

28. Miss CHAN Yuen-han supported heritage preservation. Mr Keith PERRY, Study Manager (Shek Kip Mei) of TCL said that the conservation of the North Kowloon Magistracy and one of the Mark 1 housing blocks in Shek Kip Mei were recommended in the restructuring study. In this connection, Mr Albert CHAN considered that development plans should feature local landmark. He also suggested that different designs should be adopted for streetscape and public housing estates for different districts. CAS/HB shared this view and said that it was one of the purposes for setting out a redevelopment theme for each of the four study areas. The Chairman suggested the Administration to seek the views of the relevant District Councils in this aspect.

Way forward

29. Responding to the Chairman, CAS/HB advised that after the public consultation on Stage 1 of the studies ended in mid June 2002, the Administration would prepare an Executive Summary of the Restructuring Studies, taking into account the views collected during the consultation period. The Administration aimed to commence Stage 2 of the studies by the end of 2002 or early 2003.

III. Any other business

30. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:45 am.

Legislative Council Secretariat
8 November 2002