

LegCo Panel on Transport

Summary of views on Shenzhen Western Corridor (SWC), Deep Bay Link (DBL) and Route 10

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
1. Tuen Mun District Council (TMDC)	8/11/2001 (CB(1)212/01-02(01)) 11/1/2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - TMDC supported the projects in principle. - The whole of Route 10 should be synchronized with SWC/DBL to provide relief on Tuen Mun Road (TMR). - A more direct road link should be provided from DBL to Yuen Long Highway and Route 3. - Other concerns included the acquisition of land, compensation and rehousing arrangements, and grave removal. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - TMDC passed a motion at its special meeting held on 19 November 2001 expressing support for the project in principle and requested the Administration to consider: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) not imposing any toll charges on Route 10; and (ii) providing a toll free connection point at Tsing Lung Bridge linking Kap Shui Mun Bridge.
2. Yuen Long District Council (YLDC)	8/11/2001 (CB(1)212/01-02(02)) Written submission for 17/12/2001 (CB(1)655/01-02(04))	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - YLDC supported the projects in principle. - A direct road link from Ngau Hom Shek to Route 3 via Tin Shui Wai should be provided to meet the additional traffic generated. - Access roads should be provided to local areas. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - YLDC supported the project. - Proper connections should be provided for the local road network to benefit the residents of Tin Shui Wai and Yuen Long. - Suitable rehousing and compensation arrangements should be made for the affected residents.

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
3. Miss YUNG Wing-sheung, Islands District Council Member	8/11/2001 (CB(1)225/01-02(01))		- Miss YUNG supported the strategic need of the project for providing an alternative access to cater for the developments on Lantau.
4. The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers	17/12/2001 (CB(1)655/01-02(02)) 11/1/2002 (CB(1)776/01-02(03))		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The need of Route 10 to meet the expected traffic demand up to 2007 and beyond was supported. - Funding approval should be given for the detailed design of the southern and northern sections of Route 10. - The use of toll at the northern section of Route 10 (i.e. Lam Tei Tunnel) to regulate traffic flow among Route 3, Route 10 and TMR and achieve maximum utilization of transport facilities was supported.
5. The Association of Consulting Engineers of Hong Kong (ACEHK)	17/12/2001 (CB(1)618/01-02(02)) 11/1/2002 (CB(1)776/01-02(04))	- ACEHK supported the projects because the infrastructure link between Hong Kong and the Mainland would be strengthened.	- ACEHK supported the project as it would help relieve traffic congestion along TMR, in Tuen Mun and all of North West New Territories (NW NT).

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
6. The Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport in Hong Kong (CILTHK)	17/12/2001 (CB(1)655/01-02(03)) 11/1/2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Administration should provide comparable cost-benefit data for DBL and Route 10. - CILTHK was concerned about the gap between the completion of SWC/DBL and Route 10 causing congestion on TMR. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - CILTHK were cognizant of the need for the three projects and were supportive of them. However, it was concerned about the likely traffic snarls arising from the already congested TMR upon completion of the SWC and DBL in 2005/2006, a couple of years before Route 10 and Tsing Lung Bridge were completed. It hoped Government would find ways to deal with this problem as soon as possible before the SWC was completed.
7. Ha Tsuen Rural Committee (HTRC)	8/11/2001 (CB(1)235/01-02(01))	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - HTRC supported SWC and DBL in principle. - Strong objection for the proposed tunnel section of DBL at Hung Shui Kiu to be built under Permitted Burial Ground YL/55 on fung-shui grounds. - Access roads should be provided to local areas and improvements be made to existing local roads. 	

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
8. The Advisory Council on the Environment	Written submission for 8/11/2001 (CB(1)212/01-02(06))	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - General concerns were expressed regarding the joint environmental monitoring programme between the Mainland and Hong Kong, the scale of reclamation in Shekou, the visual design of the bridge, and the overall ecological well-being of Deep Bay. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Construction of the southern section would not commence until the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report of the northern section was completed and endorsed. - When the EIA report for the northern section was submitted under the EIA Ordinance, the cumulative environmental impact of both the southern and northern sections of Route 10 and all relevant findings and recommendations in both EIA studies could be subject to review.
9. Sir Gordon WU, Chairman of Port and Maritime Board	17/12/2001 (CB(1)618/01-02(01)) 11/1/2002 (CB(1)792/01-02(02))		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Tsing Lung Bridge was not an effective solution for connecting NW NT to the Hong Kong International Airport (HKIA) as a much longer and circuitous route was involved. - A direct tunnel-bridge link between Tuen Mun and Chep Lap Kok should be built instead. - The Government should purchase road capacity from Route 3 to achieve traffic diversion from TMR and benefit the logistics industry.

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
10. Professor Richard WONG	17/12/2001 (CB(1)655/01-02(01))	- The gap between the completion of SWC/DBL and Route 10 would result in traffic congestion on the already over-utilized TMR.	- Route 10 did not provide a satisfactory solution for connecting cross-boundary traffic into the urban areas. - Tsing Lung Bridge could be constructed as a stand-alone project. - Route 10 represented poor planning in view of the correct current emphasis on developing Hong Kong's role as the logistics hub in southern China. - With the adoption of "shadow tolls", Route 3 with its low utilization rate could be a more cost-effective short-term solution for connecting DBL and relieving congestion at TMR.

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
11. The Hong Kong Institute of Planners (HKIP)	Written submission for 17/12/2001 (CB(1)600/01-02(01))		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The purpose of and need for Route 10 was not clearly identified or justified. A very narrow process of assessment had been adopted with no apparent consideration of its environmental impacts, its relationship with land use planning, and other sustainable development criteria. - If Route 10 was tolled, it would also be subject to under-utilization. - The best use of existing transport infrastructure should be assured before further expenditure was committed.
12. Hong Kong Logistics Association Ltd. (HKLA)	11/1/2002 (CB(1)776/01-02(02))	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - HKLA supported the projects as they would facilitate cargo flow. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - HKLA objected to the proposed construction of Route 10 as it could not render assistance to the logistics business in the next seven years. - Instead, Government should immediately subsidize users of Route 3 to achieve traffic diversion. - Further infrastructural development to facilitate logistics business should be referred to LOGSCOUNCIL for discussion.

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
13. Route 3 (CPS) Company Limited	<p>8/11/2001 (CB(1)144/01-02(01) & CB(1)235/01-02(03))</p> <p>17/12/2001</p> <p>11/1/2002 (CB(1)792/01-02(03))</p>	<p>- The present southerly alignment of DBL would discharge traffic onto the already saturated TMR and hence, a more northerly alignment with a more direct connection between DBL and Yuen Long Highway and between Yuen Long Highway and Route 3 should be provided.</p>	<p>- The strongest objection was expressed to the Government's proposal to proceed immediately with the whole of Route 10 which would be in direct competition with Route 3.</p> <p>- The Government should make good use of the spare capacity of Route 3 to achieve traffic diversion from TMR.</p> <p>- An alternative Western Highway proposal for connecting DBL to Route 3 was proposed with completion in 2005 to tie in with the opening of SWC/DBL at an estimated cost of about \$3 billion.</p> <p>- Route 10 should be planned in the context of Hong Kong's need for future container terminal facilities and a direct all-weather alternative link to HKIA, as well as the requirements for the proper development of Hong Kong's logistics industry.</p>

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
14. Action Group Against Siu Lam Works (Route 10)	<p>8/11/2001 (CB(1)139/01-02(01) & CB(1)225/01-02(02))</p> <p>Written submission for 11/1/2002 (CB(1)792/01-02(04))</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Group was concerned about the gap between the completion of SWC/DBL and Route 10 aggravating the congestion on TMR. - A direct road link from DBL to Route 3 through Tin Shui Wai should be built. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Group was strongly opposed to Route 10. - The Administration should review the overall planning for Route 10 to take into account its strategic function of serving new container terminal facilities in Hong Kong, and its tolling strategy to achieve traffic diversion. - A direct road link should instead be built from Tuen Mun to Chep Lap Kok in tunnel form to provide an alternative access to HKIA.
15. Mr Richard YU, Planning Consultant	<p>Written submission for 17/12/2001 (CB(1)655/01-02(06))</p> <p>11/1/2002 (CB(1)776/01-02(01))</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Given their similar functions, Route 10 was not justified with the presence of TMR and Route 3. - The alignment of Route 10 was not conducive to logistics development. A tunnel linking Tuen Mun to Chek Lap Kok would be a more efficient option based on a simple comparison of the "time-distance differences" among different routes.

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
16. 屯門掃管笏老青山村居民聯會	8/11/2001 (CB(1)212/01-02(03))		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Strong opposition was raised on Route 10 because of the serious livelihood problems, fung-shui implications and environmental impact arising out of the project. - The section along So Kwun Wat should be built in tunnel form and the alignment be shifted to the northern valley to minimize disturbance if the project was to go ahead.
17. Save Our Shorelines Society (SOSS)	8/11/2001 (CB(1)212/01-02(05)) 17/12/2001 11/1/2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SOSS was generally concerned about the planning, process and policy perspectives of the projects. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The whole concept of Route 10 should be reviewed due to major changes in planning - The project as currently designed was not justified on both economic and environmental grounds. - The under-utilized Route 3 should be maximized through pecuniary measures. - The Government should conduct more in-depth multi-disciplinary analysis on the future demand of freight capacity.

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
18. World Wide Fund for Nature Hong Kong (WWF)	8/11/2001 (CB(1)212/01-02(04))	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The total impacts arising from the construction and operation of SWC and the cumulative impacts from the whole SWC project on the Deep Bay ecology might not be properly assessed as only the section of SWC in Hong Kong was subject to EIA study. - WWF was generally concerned about the environmental and ecological impacts of the projects. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The cumulative impacts from both the northern and southern sections of Route 10 should be properly assessed. - Partial endorsement of the EIA of the southern section should not be used to justify the construction of the northern section and other connecting links in the future.
19. Friends of the Earth (FoE)	<p>Written submission for 8/11/2001 (CB(1)247/01-02(01))</p> <p>Written submission for 17/12/2001 (CB(1)655/01-02(05))</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - FoE was gravely concerned about the lack of holistic transport planning and the environmental impacts of SWC and its related projects. - Failure to relieve the traffic generated by SWC would aggravate the problem of traffic congestion on TMR which would in turn create serious noise and air pollution. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - FoE was concerned about the lack of convincing traffic data to justify the project. - A tolled Route 10 might defeat its function of regulating the traffic flow between SWC and Hong Kong.
20. The Hong Kong Bird Watching Society	8/11/2001 (CB(1)271/01-02(02))		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Due to poor funding and execution of EIA work, insufficient survey had been conducted to establish the types of birds which were using the site, as well as the potential impact of both the construction and operational phases of the project on these birds.

Name of organizations/individuals	Date of meeting(s)	Major views on SWC/DBL	Major views on Route 10
21. Tuen Mun Rural Committee (TMRC)	8/11/2001 (CB(1)235/01-02(02))		<ul style="list-style-type: none">- TMRC was seriously concerned about the adverse impact caused by the passing of Route 10 through So Kwun Wat Tsuen.- General concerns were expressed about compensation and rehousing arrangements.
22. 屯門鄉郊區	8/11/2001	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- General concerns were expressed about the acquisition of land, compensation and rehousing arrangements.	