

For Information

Legislative Council Panel on Transport

**Supplementary Note on
Response to Submissions on Route 10**

PURPOSE

This supplementary note provides our further response to the three submissions on Route 10 which we received after the issue of LC Paper No. CB(1)55/02-03(04) for the special panel meeting on 18 October 2002.

ADVICE SOUGHT

2. Members are invited to note the content of this paper.

Environment, Transport and Works Bureau
October 2002

Sir Gordon Wu's Submission

Sir Gordon Wu's Views	The Administration's Response
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Tsing Lung Bridge is not an effective alternative link to the airport due to its location and structural design. The bridge will have to be closed during typhoons and the airport would remain inaccessible in case of closure of the North Lantau Highway. A direct and all-weather-proof trestle bridge cum tunnel link between Tuen Mun and Chek Lap Kok (TM-CLK Link) should be built instead. A railway link connecting Tuen Mun and Chek Lap Kok is also needed in the longer run. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The Tsing Lung Bridge will provide a third link to Lantau (besides the Lantau Crossing and TM-CLK Link). Its catchment is wider and hence will provide a more direct relief to Lantau Crossing than the TM-CLK Link. It will also serve as a more convenient alternative access to the planned and future developments in east Lantau. ■ The existing Lantau Link including Tsing Ma Bridge is already an all-weather-proof link to Lantau. Besides, low-level trestle bridge crossings may not provide all-weather access under typhoon conditions. In any case, the key concern is not typhoons but traffic accidents or other emergencies which are less predictable. ■ In case of emergency closure on the North Lantau Highway, the existing Cheung Tung Road and the proposed Road P1 which run parallel to the North Lantau Highway will serve as alternative road links to the airport. ■ Railway Development Strategy 2000 identified the Chek Lap Kok Link between the Airport and Tuen Mun areas as a possible long term railway, but this would not command priority as traffic demand had yet to warrant a mass carrier. If planning parameters change significantly, we would review its justification and the way forward.

Civic Exchange Limited's Submission

Civic Exchange's Views	The Administration's Response
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Route 10 is outdated due to the change in planning parameters, including the cancellation of Green Island Link and a new container port at Lantau as well as the under-utilization of Route 3. ■ No urgency for Route 10, pending decisions on a new container port and a link between Hong Kong and the Pearl River Delta, as well as the impact of West Rail upon commissioning. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The need for Route 10 has been reviewed taking into account the latest planning parameters in respect of road, rail (including West Rail to start operation in 2003) and other developments up to 2016, which excluded the Green Island Link or a new container port at southeast Lantau. The utilization of Route 3 (Country Park Section) has no direct bearing on Route 10 Southern Section.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Budget deficit cautions the need for Route 10. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The Government remains committed to planning ahead and constructing the necessary infrastructure to cater for future developments.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Comparative study of alternatives, e.g. a TM-CLK Link, should be conducted before committing to Route 10 which will cost over \$30 billion. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ We have updated the project costs for Route 10 taking into account the revised scope and the latest market condition. The Southern Section is estimated to cost \$11.3 billion, whereas the Northern Section will cost \$4 billion, all at September 2002 price level.

Civic Exchange's Views	The Administration's Response
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li data-bbox="790 264 2040 525">■ A TM-CLK Link will be needed to tie in with further development of the logistics industry in Lantau, a possible fifth land crossing to the western shore of the Pearl River Delta and the future location of the new container port in Lantau. A TM-CLK Link however does not obviate the need for Route 10 Southern Section.

Tai Lam Chung Tsuen's Submission on Route 10

Tai Lam Chung Tsuen's Views	The Administration's Response
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Concerned about environmental impacts of Route 10. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ An Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) has been carried out for the Route 10 Southern Section. The EIA Report contains detailed assessment of all environmental impacts arising from the construction and operation of the Route 10 project. It is concluded that with appropriate mitigation measures, the environmental impacts could be minimised to meet statutory requirements. The Report was approved by the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) under the EIA Ordinance on 2 February 2000. Highways Department will seek agreement from DEP on the changes to the original scheme that would affect the findings and recommendations of the approved EIA Report and will demonstrate to the satisfaction of DEP that the environmental impacts of the revised scheme shall not be worse than that described in the approved EIA report.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Building the Southern Section alone will not help relieve traffic; rather it would cause more congestion on Tuen Mun Road. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The section from So Kwun Wat to Tsing Lung Tau will provide additional capacity to relieve Tuen Mun Road by directing traffic southbound from Tuen Mun to Lantau away from Tuen Mun Road, while providing a fast and efficient route to serve visitors going to Lantau. One important function of the Route 10 Southern Section (together with the proposed Sham Tseng Tunnel Link Road) is to provide a bypass to Tuen Mun Road between So Kwun Tan and Ting Kau, thus relieving traffic congestion on Tuen Mun Road. In any case the Southern Section will not cause congestion on Tuen Mun Road.

