

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 6

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 5 November 2003 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP
The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung, JP
The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP
The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP
The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai
The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP
The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon SZETO Wah
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP
The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP
Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok, JP
The Hon WONG Sing-chi
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP
The Hon LAU Ping-cheung
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Member absent:

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Admission and Registration (Amendment) (No. 2) Rules 2002 (Amendment) Rules 2003 (gazetted on 31.10.2003)	237/2003
2. Legal Practitioners (Risk Management Education) (Amendment) Rules 2003 (gazetted on 31.10.2003)	238/2003
3. Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Seventh Schedule) (No. 8) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 31.10.2003)	239/2003
4. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 5) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 31.10.2003)	240/2003

Other Papers

- No.20 - Annual Report of the Protection of Wages on Insolvency Fund Board 2002-03 (published on 29.10.2003)
- No.21 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the first quarter of 2003-04 (Public Finance Ordinance : Section 8) (published on 4.11.2003)

Questions

1. Hon Abraham SHEK asked Question 1.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

2. Hon HUI Cheung-ching asked Question 2.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

3. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 3.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

4. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 4.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

5. Hon Fred LI asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

6. Hon WONG Yung-kan asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Second Reading

Revenue (No. 3) Bill 2003

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 9 July 2003 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Revenue (No. 3) Bill 2003**.

Question that clauses 1 to 8 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Revenue (No. 3) Bill 2003**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for the Civil Service moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Statutes of the University of Hong Kong (Amendment) (No. 2) Statutes 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 186 of 2003 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 9 July 2003, be amended in section 7(a) by repealing everything after "repealing" and substituting "everything from "to entertain" to "therein" and substituting "to appoint any person or committee to entertain and, if appropriate, adjudicate upon, on its behalf, complaints from members of the University and persons employed in it and to redress their grievances";".

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Chairman of the Subcommittee on the Statutes of the University of Hong Kong (Amendment) (No.2) Statutes 2003, spoke on the motion.

Hon James TO declared his interest as a Member of the Court of the University of Hong Kong.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Combating the problem of Mainlanders engaging in illegal employment and prostitution in Hong Kong

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as information indicates an upward trend in the number of Mainlanders arrested for engaging in illegal employment and prostitution in Hong Kong in recent years, which not only affects the employment of local workers, but also causes serious nuisances to the public, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) increase manpower and step up inspections to combat such illegal activities;
- (b) review the relevant legislation and introduce heavier penalties; and
- (c) strengthen its communication with the public security and border control authorities of the Mainland and exchange relevant information in a timely manner, in order to enhance the collaborative efforts in combating illegal employment and prostitution.

While Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 5:00 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon James TO and Hon Frederick FUNG would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke respectively on the motion and their amendments.

10 Members and Hon Henry WU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 6:17 pm, while Hon Henry WU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's motion:

To add "; they work in construction sites, licensed food premises, guesthouses and places of public entertainment" after "That, as information indicates an upward trend in the number of Mainlanders arrested for engaging in illegal employment and prostitution in Hong Kong in recent years"; to delete "and" after "(a) increase manpower" and substitute with ","; to add ", and gather intelligence" after "step up inspections"; to delete "and" after "(b) review the relevant legislation and introduce heavier penalties;" and substitute with "(c) review the Government's outsourcing and licensing systems, and study the introduction of a point system and more stringent licensing requirements to penalize those employers who employ illegal workers, with a view to deterring them from employing illegal workers; and"; and to delete "(c)" and substitute with "(d)".

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's motion proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 20 were present and 19 were in favour of the amendment. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the remaining motions to be moved to the motion on Combating the problem of Mainlanders engaging in illegal employment and prostitution in Hong Kong at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon James TO's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon Frederick FUNG to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following revised amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon James TO and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add ", and suggest to the relevant Mainland authorities that effective measures be adopted to prevent those Mainlanders who have committed crimes in Hong Kong from re-entering the territory with other identities" after "in order to enhance the collaborative efforts in combating illegal employment and prostitution".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's further amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon James TO proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 20 were present and 19 were in favour of the amendment. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung replied.

Question on Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon James TO and Hon Frederick FUNG put and agreed to.

Regulating health foods

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, whereas it has become increasingly common for the public to purchase health foods, there are still quite a number of loopholes in existing legislation which regulates such foods, this Council urges the Government to devise a comprehensive regulatory mechanism for health foods, so as to safeguard the rights and interests of consumers and facilitate the development of the health food market.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Mrs Selina CHOW and Hon Fred LI would move amendments to the motion and that Hon CHAN Kwok-keung would also move an amendment to Hon Fred LI's proposed amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the two amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon Fred LI and Hon CHAN Kwok-keung spoke respectively on the motion and the amendments.

Eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion:

To delete "whereas" after "That," and substitute with "as"; to delete "there are still quite a number of loopholes in existing legislation which regulates such foods," after "it has become increasingly common for the public to purchase health foods,"; to delete "devise a comprehensive regulatory mechanism for health foods" and substitute with "actively encourage the relevant trades and industries, including the manufacturers, importers, retailers and wholesalers, to provide information on their products, provided that it would not increase the burden on consumers or reduce their choices"; and to delete "safeguard the rights and interests of consumers and facilitate the development of the health food market" after "so as to" and substitute with "facilitate their making informed choices when purchasing health foods".

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 15 were present and 14 were against the amendment. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the remaining motions to be moved to the motion on Regulating health foods at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Fred LI moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion:

To add ", including studying the introduction of a vetting and approval system as well as stepping up control over claims made in the advertisements concerned" after "this Council urges the Government to devise a comprehensive regulatory mechanism for health foods".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

Hon CHAN Kwok-keung moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment:

To add "and formulating a code of practice on quality production," after "including studying the introduction of a vetting and approval system"; and to add "and the contents of the labels" after "as well as stepping up control over claims made in the advertisements".

Question on Hon CHAN Kwok-keung's amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 15 were present and 14 were in favour of the amendment. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 15 were present and 14 were in favour of the amendment. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Yung-kan replied.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, nine were in favour of the motion, six against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 15 were present and 14 were in favour of the motion. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 12 November 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 9:30 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 05/11/2003
 時間 TIME: 07:33:31 下午

動議 MOTION: 涂謹申議員對楊耀忠議員就「打擊內地人士來港非法工作及從事賣淫活動」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TO TO HON YEUNG YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON
 "COMBATING THE PROBLEM OF MAINLANDERS ENGAGING IN ILLEGAL
 EMPLOYMENT AND PROSTITUTION IN HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	20	
投票 Vote	23	19	
贊成 Yes	12	19	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	11	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 05/11/2003
 時間 TIME: 07:38:17 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對楊耀忠議員就「打擊內地人士來港非法工作及從事賣淫活動」所提，經涂謹申議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON YEUNG YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON "COMBATING THE PROBLEM OF MAINLANDERS ENGAGING IN ILLEGAL EMPLOYMENT AND PROSTITUTION IN HONG KONG" AS AMENDED BY HON JAMES TO

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	20	
投票 Vote	23	19	
贊成 Yes	20	19	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	3	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 05/11/2003
 時間 TIME: 09:22:03 下午

動議 MOTION: 周梁淑怡議員對黃容根議員就「監管健康食品」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON MRS SELINA CHOW TO HON WONG YUNG-KAN'S MOTION ON
 "REGULATING HEALTH FOODS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	15	
投票 Vote	17	14	
贊成 Yes	7	0	
反對 No	9	14	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	否決 Negated	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
胡經昌 Henry WU		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES		
麥國風 Michael MAK	反對 NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 05/11/2003
 時間 TIME: 09:25:32 下午

動議 MOTION: 陳國強議員就李華明議員對黃容根議員的「監管健康食品」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
 HON CHAN KWOK-KEUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON FRED LI'S AMENDMENT TO HON WONG YUNG-KAN'S MOTION ON "REGULATING HEALTH FOODS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳國強CHAN Kwok-keung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	15	
投票 Vote	18	14	
贊成 Yes	8	14	
反對 No	8	0	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 05/11/2003
 時間 TIME: 09:27:39 下午

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員對黃容根議員就「監管健康食品」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON FRED LI TO HON WONG YUNG-KAN'S MOTION ON
 "REGULATING HEALTH FOODS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	15	
投票 Vote	18	14	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	7	0	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若微 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 05/11/2003
 時間 TIME: 09:30:57 下午

動議 MOTION: 「監管健康食品」議案
 MOTION "REGULATING HEALTH FOODS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	15	
投票 Vote	18	14	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	6	0	
棄權 Abstain	3	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
胡經昌 Henry WU	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	