

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 9

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 26 November 2003 at 2:30 pm

---

#### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung, JP

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok, JP

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

The Hon LAU Ping-cheung

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
The Financial Secretary, and  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Amusement Game Centres (Fees) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 21.11.2003)	250/2003
2. Summary Disposal of Complaints (Solicitors) Rules (gazetted on 21.11.2003)	251/2003
3. Tung Chung Cable Car Ordinance (20 of 2003) (Commencement) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 21.11.2003)	252/2003

### **Other Papers**

- No.25 - Report on the Administration of the Immigration Service Welfare Fund prepared by the Director of Immigration Incorporated in accordance with Regulation 12(b) of the Immigration Service (Welfare Fund) Regulation (published on 18.11.2003)
- No.26 - Queen Elizabeth Foundation for the Mentally Handicapped  
Report and Accounts 2002-2003  
(published on 18.11.2003)
- No.27 - Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2003 (published on 26.11.2003)
- No.28 - Report No. 41 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits - October 2003 (published on 26.11.2003)
- No.29 - Accounts of the Government for the year ended 31 March 2003 (published on 26.11.2003)
- No.30 - Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data, Hong Kong  
Annual Report 2002-2003 (published on 21.11.2003)
- No.31 - Ocean Park Corporation  
Annual Report 2002-2003 (published on 26.11.2003)
- Report of the Bills Committee on Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (Amendment) Bill 2003 (published on 24.11.2003)

### **Address**

Hon Henry WU, a Board Member of Ocean Park Corporation, addressed the Council on the Ocean Park Corporation Annual Report 2002-2003.

### **Questions**

1. Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Three Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

After declaring his interest, Hon TSANG Yok-sing asked a supplementary and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Hon WONG Sing-chi asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

3. Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

4. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

5. Hon WONG Yung-kan asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

6. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Two Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 9 and 11 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **First Reading**

#### **Hong Kong Sports Development Board (Repeal) Bill**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### **Second Reading**

#### **Hong Kong Sports Development Board (Repeal) Bill**

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

#### **Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (Amendment) Bill 2003**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 30 April 2003 resumed.

Hon Cyd HO, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (Amendment) Bill 2003, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (Amendment) Bill 2003**.

Question that clauses 1, 3 and 4 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower moved an amendment to clause 2 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Education and Manpower reported that

**the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority  
(Amendment) Bill 2003**

had passed through the Committee with an amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Motions**

**Proposed resolution under the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance and the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the motion in Appendix I and addressed the Council.



Question on the motion proposed.

As Hon Cyd HO, Chairman of the Subcommittee on proposed resolution under section 7 of the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance, who was to speak on the motion was not ready, she requested the President to suspend the meeting.

The President acceded to the request and suspended the meeting at 4:40 pm.

At 4:47 pm, the Council resumed.

Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Proposed resolution under the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance**

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that -

- (a) the Factories and Industrial Undertakings (Lifting Appliances and Lifting Gear)(Amendment) Regulation 2003;
- (b) the Factories and Industrial Undertakings (Suspended Working Platforms) (Amendment) Regulation 2003; and
- (c) the Factories and Industrial Undertakings (Loadshifting Machinery) (Amendment) Regulation 2003,

made by the Commissioner for Labour on 28 May 2003, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Cyd HO, Chairman of the Subcommittee on proposed resolution under section 7 of the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance, spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Members' Motions**

**West Kowloon Cultural District development project**

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to comprehensively review the West Kowloon Cultural District development project, extend the deadline for submission of development proposals, and openly and thoroughly consult the cultural sector, professional bodies, the real estate sector, the Legislative Council, the public and relevant organizations, so as to formulate a development and operation plan that is open, fair and proper.

While Hon WONG Sing-chi was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 4:58 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Albert HO and Hon MA Fung-kwok would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Albert HO and Hon MA Fung-kwok respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Eight Members and Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 6:22 pm, while Hon Audrey EU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another four Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring his interest that the company he served might be involved in the development project, Hon LAU Ping-cheung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Six more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke on the amendments.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion:

To delete "comprehensively review" after "That this Council urges the Government to" and substitute with "temporarily shelve"; to delete "extend the deadline for submission of development proposals," after "the West Kowloon Cultural District development project,"; to add "afresh" after "and openly and thoroughly consult"; and to add "; the Government should also consider setting up a statutory body to co-ordinate and implement the relevant plan" after "so as to

formulate a development and operation plan that is open, fair and proper".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 26 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the motion or amendments thereto on "West Kowloon Cultural District development project" at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon MA Fung-kwok moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion:

To add "consider the 'software' contents before planning the cultural facilities," after "That this Council urges the Government to comprehensively review the West Kowloon Cultural District development project,"; to delete "and" after "extend the deadline for submission of development proposals,"; to delete "so as to formulate" after "the public and relevant organizations," and substitute with "and uphold the 'people-oriented', 'partnership' and 'community-driven' principles put forward by the Culture and Heritage Commission for the West Kowloon development in formulating"; and to add "; and in the process of development, the Government should also facilitate a partnership between developers and the cultural sector, so as to allow the latter to participate in the planning and future operation of the facilities in the district" after "a development and operation plan that is open, fair and proper".

Question on Hon MA Fung-kwok's amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Sing-chi replied.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion as amended by Hon MA Fung-kwok put and agreed to.

**Credibility of the Equal Opportunities Commission**

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Chief Executive and the HKSAR Government to learn the lesson from the "Michael WONG Kin-chow incident" and take expeditious measures to restore public confidence in the Equal Opportunities Commission.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Andrew CHENG, Hon LEE Cheuk-yan and Hon Emily LAU would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG, Hon LEE Cheuk-yan and Hon Emily LAU respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Six Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LI Fung-ying declared her interest as a member of Equal Opportunities Commission and spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Another 11 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To add "regrets that the Secretary for Home Affairs, Dr Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, has mishandled the 'Michael WONG Kin-chow incident', and" after "That this Council"; and to delete "from the 'Michael WONG Kin-chow incident' " after "urges the Chief Executive and the HKSAR Government to learn the lesson" and substitute with "therefrom".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed and put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 19 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the motion or amendments thereto on "Credibility of the Equal Opportunities Commission" at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To add "and, before appointing the Chairperson of the Equal Opportunities Commission in future, to arrange for the proposed appointee to attend hearings of the Legislative Council and answer questions from Members" after "That this Council urges the Chief Executive and the HKSAR Government to learn the lesson from the 'Michael WONG Kin-chow incident' ".

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Emily LAU moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To add "remove all those Equal Opportunities Commission members whose behaviour has impaired the credibility of the Commission, so as to" after "and take expeditious measures to".

Question on Hon Emily LAU's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed and put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, 17 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment and five against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Fred LI replied.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion put and agreed to.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 3 December 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:07 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

FACTORIES AND INDUSTRIAL UNDERTAKINGS ORDINANCE

AND

INTERPRETATION AND GENERAL CLAUSES ORDINANCE

---

**RESOLUTION**

(Under section 7 of the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance (Cap. 59) and section 35 of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1))

---

CONSTRUCTION SITES (SAFETY)(AMENDMENT) REGULATION 2003

RESOLVED that the Construction Sites (Safety) (Amendment)

Regulation 2003, made by the Commissioner for Labour on 28 May 2003, be approved, subject to the following amendments -

(a) in section 15 -

(i) in paragraph (a), by deleting the proposed regulation 38A(1A);

(ii) by adding -

"(aa) in paragraph (3), by repealing "unsafe place on the site" and substituting "place on the site where any hazardous conditions are present";";

(iii) by deleting paragraph (b) and  
substituting -

"(b) in paragraph (4), by repealing  
"making any place safe if all"  
and substituting "rectifying  
any hazardous conditions if  
all reasonably";";

(iv) by adding -

"(ba) by adding -

"(4A) For the  
purpose of this  
regulation, "hazardous  
conditions" (危險狀況)  
includes the following  
conditions that may give  
rise to a risk of persons  
falling from a height -

- (a) unprotected  
edge or  
opening at a  
place of work;
- (b) improper design  
and  
construction of  
a place of work;
- (c) inadequate or



insecure

support or

anchoring of a

place of work;

(d) improper

maintenance of a

place of work;

(e) any working

platform (other

than a suspended

working

platform) that

fails to comply

with the

provisions of

the Third

Schedule

applicable to

it."";

(v) in paragraph (c), in the proposed  
regulation 38A(5) -

(A) in paragraph (a) -

(I) by deleting "(1A)" and  
substituting "(4A)";

(II) by deleting "paragraph  
(1)" and substituting

"paragraphs (1), (3) and  
(4)";

(B) in paragraph (b), by deleting

"(1A)" and substituting "(4A)";

(b) in section 16, in the proposed regulation 38AA -

(i) by deleting paragraph (2);

(ii) by renumbering paragraphs (3), (4) and  
(5) as paragraphs (2), (3) and (4)  
respectively;

(iii) by deleting paragraph (3) and  
substituting -

"(3) Subject to paragraph (4),  
any contractor who has direct  
control over any construction work  
shall take suitable and adequate  
steps to ensure that, so far as is  
reasonably practicable, no person  
gains access to any place which is  
within the place of work where the  
construction work is being carried  
out and where any hazardous  
conditions are present.";

(iv) in paragraph (4) -

(A) by deleting "Paragraph (4)" and  
substituting "Paragraph (3)";

(B) by deleting "making any place safe"

and substituting "rectifying any  
hazardous conditions";

(v) by adding -

"(5) For the purpose of this  
regulation, "hazardous  
conditions" (危險狀況) includes the  
following conditions that may give  
rise to a risk of persons falling  
from a height -

- (a) unprotected edge  
or opening at a  
place of work;
- (b) improper design  
and construction  
of a place of work;
- (c) inadequate or  
insecure support  
or anchoring of a  
place of work;
- (d) improper  
maintenance of a  
place of work;
- (e) any working  
platform (other  
than a suspended  
working platform)  
that fails to

comply with the  
provisions of the  
Third Schedule  
applicable to  
it.";

(vi) in paragraph (6) -

(A) in paragraph (a) -

(I) by deleting "(2)" and  
substituting "(5)";

(II) by deleting "paragraph  
(1)" and substituting  
"paragraphs (1), (3) and  
(4)";

(B) in paragraph (b), by deleting  
"(2)" and substituting "(5)";

(c) by deleting section 21(b) and substituting -

"(b) in paragraph (3), by adding "and the  
contractor who employs him to carry out  
the inspection" after "the scaffold";";

(d) by deleting section 24(c) and substituting -

"(c) in paragraph (3)(b), by repealing  
"concerned" and substituting  
"responsible for the construction site  
concerned and the contractor who employs  
that person to carry out the  
examination".";

- (e) in section 34, in the proposed regulation 48(1A)(b),  
by deleting "remains on the site to carry out the  
construction work" and substituting "employed to  
carry out the construction work remains on the  
site";
- (f) in section 43 -
  - (i) in paragraph (a), by deleting "38AA(1),  
(3) or (4)" and substituting "38AA(1),  
(2) or (3)";
  - (ii) in paragraph (b)(v), by deleting "38AA(3)  
or (4)" and substituting "38AA(2) or  
(3)";
- (g) in section 44, by deleting "regs. 38A(1A), 38AA(2)"  
and substituting "regs. 38A(4A), 38AA(5)".



投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 26/11/2003  
 時間 TIME: 08:06:17 下午

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員對黃成智議員就「西九龍文娛藝術區發展計劃」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT HO TO HON WONG SING-CHI'S MOTION ON "WEST KOWLOON CULTURAL DISTRICT DEVELOPMENT PROJECT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	11	13	
反對 No	14	12	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		<b>選舉委員會 Election Committee</b>	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 26/11/2003  
 時間 TIME: 10:52:25 下午

動議 MOTION: 鄭家富議員對李華明議員就「平等機會委員會公信力問題」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON ANDREW CHENG TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "CREDIBILITY OF THE EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES COMMISSION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	28	
投票 Vote	26	27	
贊成 Yes	7	16	
反對 No	19	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	<b>選舉委員會 Election Committee</b>	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 26/11/2003  
 時間 TIME: 10:55:37 下午

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對李華明議員就「平等機會委員會公信力問題」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "CREDIBILITY OF THE EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES COMMISSION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	28	
投票 Vote	26	27	
贊成 Yes	6	17	
反對 No	20	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 26/11/2003  
 時間 TIME: 10:58:08 下午

動議 MOTION: 劉慧卿議員對李華明議員就「平等機會委員會公信力問題」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON EMILY LAU TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "CREDIBILITY OF THE EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES COMMISSION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	28	
投票 Vote	28	27	
贊成 Yes	10	22	
反對 No	17	5	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	<b>選舉委員會 Election Committee</b>	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

