

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 10

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 3 December 2003 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok, JP

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

The Hon LAU Ping-cheung

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP

The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Education and Manpower

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP

Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Seventh Schedule) (No. 9) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 28.11.2003)	254/2003
2. Registration of Persons (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (L.N. 165 of 2003) (Commencement) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 28.11.2003)	255/2003
3. Matrimonial Causes (Amendment) Rules 2003 (L.N. 209 of 2003) (Commencement) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 28.11.2003)	256/2003

Other Papers

- No.32 - Hong Kong Science and Technology Parks Corporation Annual Report 2002/2003 (published on 28.11.2003)
- No.33 - Hong Kong Productivity Council Annual Report 2002/2003 (published on 28.11.2003)

Questions

1. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.
2. Hon Fred LI asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Three Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.
3. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

4. Hon Michael MAK asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

After declaring his interest as having acted as chairman of seminars on managing work pressure conducted by various government departments and provided free counseling service to some civil servants, Hon Michael MAK asked a supplementary and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Another six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

5. Hon Abraham SHEK asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Three Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Written replies to Questions 6 to 19 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Employees Compensation Assistance (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2003

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Employees Compensation Assistance (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2003

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Members' Motions

Education policy

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council opposes the Government's reduction in spending on education, and urges the Government to implement small-class teaching in primary and secondary schools by phases, adopt the four-year normative undergraduate structure as early as possible, and provide funding support for existing associate degree programmes run by universities, so as to provide students with quality education and nurture future talents for Hong Kong.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon Tommy CHEUNG would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon Tommy CHEUNG respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Four Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring his interest that he was working in the education field in Hong Kong, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Another 10 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke on the amendments.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW sought elucidation of the remarks made by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong in his speech and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, with the President's permission, elucidated.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's motion:

To add "expresses dissatisfaction with the Government for its failure to honour its pledge made in the past Policy Addresses in regard to investment in education and" after "That this Council"; and to add "at the same time" after "opposes the Government's reduction in spending on education, and".

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 26 were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment and four against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the motion or amendments thereto on "Education policy" at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's motion:

To add "unreasonable" after "That this Council opposes the Government's"; to delete "implement small-class teaching in primary and secondary schools by phases, adopt the four-year normative undergraduate structure as early as possible, and provide funding support for existing" after "and urges the Government to" and substitute with "comprehensively review the use of educational resources on condition that tuition will not be raised, and to actively assist the institutions in developing their education-related businesses with a view to increasing income and reducing expenditure, in order that the subsidized"; and to add "can switch smoothly to a self-financing basis; furthermore, the Government should examine the implementation of small-class teaching in primary and secondary schools, and adoption of the six-year secondary education structure and four-year normative undergraduate structure under the principle of appropriate deployment of resources" after "associate degree programmes run by universities".

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's motion proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and six against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 26 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong replied.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's motion put.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 12 were in favour of the motion and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 26 were present, 22 were in favour of the motion and three against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Improving the competitiveness of Hong Kong's container freight industry

Hon Kenneth TING moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to promptly address the problem of Hong Kong's container terminals rapidly losing their competitive edge, seriously examine the reasons for the decline in the competitiveness of the local container freight industry, and expeditiously take corresponding measures to reclaim Hong Kong's leading position as a maritime and logistics centre.

Question on Hon Kenneth TING's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon SIN Chung-kai would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon Kenneth TING's motion and addressed the Council:

To add ", including conducting feasibility studies on the selection of site for and the planning of Container Terminal 10 in view of the construction of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge, so as" after "and expeditiously take corresponding measures".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon Kenneth TING's motion proposed.

One Member and Hon HUI Cheung-ching spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon HUI Cheung-ching was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:18 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another five Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Kenneth TING spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:58 pm, while the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon Kenneth TING's motion put and agreed to.

Hon Kenneth TING replied.

Question on Hon Kenneth TING's motion as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai put and agreed to.

Appointing least number of District Council members

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as more than one million voters cast their votes in the District Council elections on 23 November, the appointment of District Council members by the Chief Executive will be tantamount to changing the results of voting by the public, this Council urges the Chief Executive to appoint the least number of District Council members in accordance with the law and respect the choices made by more than one million voters who cast their votes in the District Council elections.

Question on the motion proposed.

11 Members spoke on the motion.

After declaring his interest as being an appointed member of Eastern District Council, Hon Henry WU spoke on the motion.

Another two Members and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke on the motion.

While Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong was speaking, Hon Andrew WONG interrupted and raised a point of order on whether Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's speech contained offensive language about him as a Member of the Council. The President suspended the meeting at 9:36 pm.

The Council resumed at 9:44 pm.

The President stated that she had reviewed the speech of Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong. She ruled that Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's statement was not offensive to Members of the Council and asked Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong to continue with his speech.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong continued to speak on the motion.

Two other Members spoke on the motion.

After declaring his interest as being a member of North District Council, Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke on the motion.

13 more Members, the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum replied.

With the President's permission, Hon NG Leung-sing elucidated some points he had made earlier which had been misunderstood by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum.

Question on the motion put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 16 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 17 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 December 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:51 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 03/12/2003
 時間 TIME: 06:41:26 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁耀忠議員對張文光議員就「教育政策」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG YU-CHUNG TO HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG'S MOTION
 ON "EDUCATION POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	9	21	
反對 No	16	4	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-chung	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 03/12/2003
 時間 TIME: 06:44:34 下午

動議 MOTION: 張宇人議員對張文光議員就「教育政策」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON TOMMY CHEUNG TO HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG'S MOTION ON
 "EDUCATION POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張宇人Tommy CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	26	25	
贊成 Yes	20	9	
反對 No	6	16	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO
李家祥	Dr Eric LI	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	贊成	YES	黃宏發	Andrew WONG	反對	NO
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	司徒華	SZETO Wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong		
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee			
麥國風	Michael MAK	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES	朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung			劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
				馬逢國	MA Fung kwok	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 03/12/2003
 時間 TIME: 06:48:53 下午

動議 MOTION: 「教育政策」議案
 MOTION "EDUCATION POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	26	
投票 Vote	27	25	
贊成 Yes	12	22	
反對 No	15	3	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 03/12/2003
 時間 TIME: 11:50:38 下午

動議 MOTION: 「委任最少的區議員」議案
 MOTION "APPOINTING LEAST NUMBER OF DISTRICT COUNCIL MEMBERS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	28	
投票 Vote	26	27	
贊成 Yes	8	17	
反對 No	16	10	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG			
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK