

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 11

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 10 December 2003 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP
The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung, JP
The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP
The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP
The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP
The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon SZETO Wah
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok, JP

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

The Hon LAU Ping-cheung

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

- No.34 - Emergency Relief Fund
Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending
31 March 2003 (published on 3.12.2003)
 - No.35 - Report by the Controller, Government Flying
Service on the Administration of the Government
Flying Service Welfare Fund for the year ended
31 March 2003 (published on 5.12.2003)
 - No.36 - Police Welfare Fund
Annual Report 2002/2003 (published on 8.12.2003)
 - No.37 - Annual Report on The Police Children's Education
Trust and The Police Education and Welfare Trust
for the period from 1 April 2002 to 31 March 2003
(published on 8.12.2003)
 - No.38 - Hong Kong Sports Development Board
Annual Report 2002-2003 (published on 9.12.2003)
- Report of the Bills Committee on Public Officers Pay
Adjustments (2004/2005) Bill (published on 5.12.2003)

Questions

1. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

2. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

3. Hon Margaret NG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Three Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Hon NG Leung-sing asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Hon Tommy CHEUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food and the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Bankruptcy (Amendment) Bill 2003 Clearing and Settlement Systems Bill

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Bankruptcy (Amendment) Bill 2003 Clearing and Settlement Systems Bill

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council on each of the above two Bills.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

Public Officers Pay Adjustments (2004/2005) Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 21 May 2003 resumed.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Public Officers Pay Adjustments (2004/2005) Bill, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Two Members spoke on the Bill.

After declaring her interest that she had given advice to the staff associations of the Police Force in their applications for judicial review against the Public Officers Pay Adjustment Ordinance 2002, Hon Margaret NG spoke on the Bill.

Another Member spoke on the Bill.

Hon Michael MAK declared his interest as the Hospital Authority's employee and spoke on the Bill.

Three more Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Michael MAK claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 47 Members were present, 39 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Public Officers Pay Adjustments (2004/2005) Bill**.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 4 to 13 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 14 and 15 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Civil Service moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 14 and 15, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 2 to 5 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 and 6 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Civil Service moved amendments to the aforesaid schedules and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 and 6, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for the Civil Service reported that

the **Public Officers Pay Adjustments (2004/2005) Bill**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon Michael MAK claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 46 Members were present, 38 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Bills

First Reading

Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission Incorporation (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Ling Liang World-Wide Evangelistic Mission Incorporation (Amendment) Bill 2003

Hon Kenneth TING moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Members' Motions

Repercussions of the Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome on employees compensation insurance

Hon Bernard CHAN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to review the possible repercussions of infectious diseases, such as the Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome, transmitted in the workplace on the employees compensation insurance market, including the affordability of such insurance in the community and other issues potentially affecting stakeholders.

While Hon Bernard CHAN was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 5:52 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Bernard CHAN's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Andrew CHENG and Hon LAU Chin-shek would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG and Hon LAU Chin-shek respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Bernard CHAN spoke on the amendments.

At 7:05 pm, while Hon Bernard CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion:

To add ", on the premise of ensuring full protection of the statutory rights and benefits of employees," after "That"; and to add "; at the same time, this Council also urges the Government to examine plans for improving workplace risk management in order to reduce the chance of transmission of infectious diseases in the workplace" after "and other issues potentially affecting stakeholders".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon LAU Chin-shek to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon LAU Chin-shek moved the following revised amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add ", and to study the desirability and feasibility of establishing a central employees compensation scheme" after "reduce the chance of transmission of infectious diseases in the workplace".

Question on Hon LAU Chin-shek's amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Bernard CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG and Hon LAU Chin-shek put and agreed to.

Supporting the middle class

Dr Hon David CHU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to expeditiously introduce a series of effective long-term policies with the objective of supporting the middle class.

Question on Dr Hon David CHU's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon MA Fung-kwok and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon MA Fung-kwok and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

15 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon David CHU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon MA Fung-kwok moved the following amendment to Dr Hon David CHU's motion:

To add ", as the Government has all along failed to sympathize with the plight of the middle class in the wake of the bursting of the bubble economy," after "That"; to add ", based on fair and reasonable principles," after "this Council urges the Government to expeditiously introduce"; to delete "long-term" after "a series of effective"; to add "in areas of taxation, housing and social policy for the middle class," after "policies"; and to delete "supporting the middle class" after "with the objective of" and substitute with "relieving the pressure and hardship they face".

Question on Hon MA Fung-kwok's amendment to Dr Hon David CHU's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon David CHU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 15 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 13 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the motion or amendments thereto on "Supporting the middle class" at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following amendment to Dr Hon David CHU's motion:

To add ", including relieving the tax burden on the middle class and providing appropriate help to the negative-equity property owners among them," after "a series of effective long-term policies".

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Dr Hon David CHU's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon David CHU replied.

Question on Dr Hon David CHU's motion as amended by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 17 December 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 10:01 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

Appendix I

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 10/12/2003
時間 TIME: 05:32:44 下午

動議 MOTION: 《公職人員薪酬調整（2004年/2005年）條例草案》 - 二讀
PUBLIC OFFICERS PAY ADJUSTMENTS (2004/2005) BILL - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 公務員事務局局長 Secretary for the Civil Service

出席 Present :47
投票 Vote :46
贊成 Yes :39
反對 No :7
棄權 Abstain :0
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN			楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
李家祥	Dr Eric LI	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	贊成	YES	羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong		
涂謹申	James TO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	贊成	YES	胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	麥國風	Michael MAK	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
黃宏發	Andrew WONG	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	馬逢國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK

Appendix II

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 10/12/2003
時間 TIME: 05:48:18 下午

動議 MOTION: 《公職人員薪酬調整 (2004 年/2005 年) 條例草案》- 三讀
PUBLIC OFFICERS PAY ADJUSTMENTS (2004/2005) BILL - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 公務員事務局局長 Secretary for the Civil Service

出席 Present :46
投票 Vote :45
贊成 Yes :38
反對 No :7
棄權 Abstain :0
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN			楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
李家祥	Dr Eric LI	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	贊成	YES	羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			Dr TANG Siu-tong			
涂謹申	James TO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	贊成	YES	胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	麥國風	Michael MAK	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
黃宏發	Andrew WONG	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			馬逢國	MA Fung kwok	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

Appendix III

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 10/12/2003
時間 TIME: 09:55:14 下午

動議 MOTION: 馬達國議員對朱幼麟議員就「支持中產」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON MA FUNG-KWOK TO DR HON DAVID CHU'S MOTION ON
"SUPPORTING THE MIDDLE CLASS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馬達國MA Fung kwok

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	15	17	
投票 Vote	15	16	
贊成 Yes	13	2	
反對 No	0	1	
棄權 Abstain	2	13	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	棄權	ABSTAIN
田北俊	James TIEN			何俊仁	Albert HO	棄權	ABSTAIN
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權	ABSTAIN
李家祥	Dr Eric LI			李柱銘	Martin LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	棄權	ABSTAIN
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	棄權	ABSTAIN	黃宏發	Andrew WONG	反對	NO
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
畢仲階	SIN Chung-kai			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			司徒華	SZETO Wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	棄權	ABSTAIN
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			選舉委員會 Election Committee			
麥國風	Michael MAK	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah			朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	棄權	ABSTAIN
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	棄權	ABSTAIN
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him			楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung			劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN
				馬達國	MA Fung kwok	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

