

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 25

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 28 April 2004 at 2:30 pm

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung, JP

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP  
The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok, JP  
The Hon WONG Sing-chi  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee  
The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP  
The Hon LAU Ping-cheung  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

**Members absent:**

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration  
  
The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Financial Secretary  
  
The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP  
The Secretary for Justice  
  
The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands  
  
Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Shipping and Port Control (Ferry Terminals) (Amendment) Regulation 2004 (gazetted on 23.4.2004)	57/2004
2. Boundaries of Ferry Terminals (Repeal) Order (gazetted on 23.4.2004)	58/2004
3. Boundaries of Restricted Areas of Ferry Terminals (Repeal) Notice (gazetted on 23.4.2004)	59/2004
4. Immigration (Places of Detention) (Amendment) Order 2004 (gazetted on 23.4.2004)	60/2004
5. Immigration Service (Designated Places) (Amendment) Order 2004 (gazetted on 23.4.2004)	61/2004
6. Chemical Weapons (Convention) Ordinance (26 of 2003) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 23.4.2004)	62/2004

### **Other Papers**

- No.78 - Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Fund  
Annual Report for the year  
from 1 April 2002 to 31 March 2003  
(published on 21.4.2004)
- No.79 - Summary and Revenue Analysis by Head,  
General Revenue Account,  
Estimates for the year ending 31 March 2005  
(published on 26.4.2004)
- No.80 - Annual Report 2003  
Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation  
(published on 28.4.2004)

### **Questions**

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **First Reading**

#### **Revenue Bill 2004**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### **Second Reading**

#### **Revenue Bill 2004**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

#### **Appropriation Bill 2004**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 10 March 2004 resumed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration, the Secretary for Security, the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands, the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 52 Members were present, 43 were in favour of the motion, five against it and three abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

**Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Appropriation Bill 2004**.

In accordance with Rule 68 of the Rules of Procedure, the Committee first considered the schedule to the Bill.

Question that the sums for heads 22 to 28, 30, 31, 35, 37, 39, 42 to 49, 51, 53, 55, 59, 60, 62, 63, 70, 72, 74, 76, 78, 79, 80, 82, 90, 91, 92, 94, 95, 96, 100, 106, 110, 112, 114, 116, 118, 120, 121, 136, 138, 142, 143, 145, 147, 148, 149, 151, 152, 155, 156, 158, 159, 160, 162, 163, 166, 168, 170, 173, 174, 180, 181, 184, 186, 188, 190 and 194 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that head 21 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved that head 21 be reduced by \$1,900,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

Two Members and the Financial Secretary spoke on the amendment.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 27 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 21 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon James TO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$55,500,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

Four Members spoke on the amendment.

Two Members who had spoken spoke again.

Another Member and the Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 27 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the clauses, the schedule or remaining amendments to the schedule of the Appropriation Bill 2004, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed.

One Member spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 22 were in favour of the motion and five against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 27 were present, 12 were in favour of the motion and 14 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Hon James TO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$80,000,000 in respect of subhead 103 and addressed the Committee.



One Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO elucidated on some points he had made earlier which had been misunderstood.

Another Member and the Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that head 144 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved that head 144 be reduced by \$3,232,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

While Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong was addressing the Committee, the Chairman left the chair at 6:05 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendment.

At 6:28 pm, while Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Another nine Members and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Justice spoke in response to the remarks made earlier by some Members in their speeches.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 22 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 27 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 144 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Financial Secretary reported that

#### **the Appropriation Bill 2004**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Motions**

#### **Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance**

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that -

- (a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment) Regulation 2004; and

(b) the Poisons List (Amendment) Regulation 2004,  
made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 8 March 2004, be  
approved.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

### **Members' Bills**

#### **Standard Chartered Bank (Hong Kong) Limited (Merger) Bill**

##### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on  
24 March 2004 resumed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on  
the Bill.

Dr Hon David LI replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the  
whole Council.

##### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Standard  
Chartered Bank (Hong Kong) Limited (Merger) Bill**.

Question that clauses 1 to 20 stand part of the Bill proposed,  
put and agreed to.

Question about the preamble to the Bill proposed, put and  
agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

##### **Third Reading**

Dr Hon David LI reported that

the **Standard Chartered Bank (Hong Kong) Limited  
(Merger) Bill**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved  
that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 5 May 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 8:20 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

# Appendix I

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2004  
時間 TIME: 04:09:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2004年撥款條例草案》 - 二讀  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2004 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :52  
投票 Vote :51  
贊成 Yes :43  
反對 No :5  
棄權 Abstain :3  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	劉健儀	Miriam LAU		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
李家祥	Dr Eric LI	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	贊成	YES	羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching			胡經昌	Henry WU	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	麥國風	Michael MAK	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
黃宏發	Andrew WONG	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES
黃谷根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU		
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	馬逢國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK

## Appendix II

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2004  
時間 TIME: 04:28:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2004年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目21削減1,900,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2004 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 21 BE REDUCED BY \$1,900,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	5	13	
反對 No	21	13	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
李家祥	Dr Eric LI	反對	NO	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	徐謙中	James TO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching			黃宏發	Andrew WONG	反對	NO
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對	NO
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
胡經昌	Henry WU	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee			
蔡國鳳	Michael MAK	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	反對	NO	朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	反對	NO
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	反對	NO	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	反對	NO
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	反對	NO	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	反對	NO
				馬達國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK

# Appendix III

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2004  
時間 TIME: 05:18:18 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2004年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目122削減\$5,500,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2004 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$55,500,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	22	13	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

# Appendix IV

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2004  
時間 TIME: 05:23:39 下午

動議 MOTION : 按照《議事規則》第 49 條第(4)款提出的議案  
MOTION UNDER RULE 49(4) OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 MIRIAM LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	22	12	
反對 No	5	14	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO
李家祥	Dr Eric LI	反對	NO	李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching			黃宏發	Andrew WONG	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	司徒華	SZETO Wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成	YES
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee			
麥國風	Michael MAK	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES	朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
				馬達國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK



## Appendix V

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 28/04/2004  
 時間 TIME: 06:02:31 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2004年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目103而將總目122削減80,000,000元  
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2004 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$80,000,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 103

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	28	
投票 Vote	25	27	
贊成 Yes	4	14	
反對 No	21	13	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	<b>選舉委員會 Election Committee</b>	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

# Appendix VI

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2004  
時間 TIME: 08:06:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2004年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目144削減3,232,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2004 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 144 BE REDUCED BY \$3,232,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	3	14	
反對 No	22	12	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	徐謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK