

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 28

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 12 May 2004 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung, JP

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok, JP

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

The Hon LAU Ping-cheung

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP

The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP

Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP

Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP

Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Education (Exemption) (Private Schools Offering Non-formal Curriculum) Order (gazetted on 7.5.2004)	76/2004
2. Application for New Identity Cards (Persons Born in 1952 to 1957 and Cross-boundary Drivers) Order (gazetted on 7.5.2004)	77/2004
3. Companies Ordinance (Amendment of Eighth Schedule) Order 2004 (gazetted on 7.5.2004)	78/2004
4. Dangerous Drugs Ordinance (Amendment of Second Schedule) Order 2004 (gazetted on 7.5.2004)	79/2004
5. Particulars Relating to Candidates on Ballot Papers (Legislative Council) Regulation (L.N. 263 of 2003) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 7.5.2004)	80/2004
6. Stamp Duty (Specification of Instruments) Notice (gazetted on 7.5.2004)	81/2004
7. Stamp Duty (Amendment) Ordinance 2003 (21 of 2003) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 7.5.2004)	82/2004

Other Papers

No.82	-	Audited Statement of Accounts of the Language Fund for the year ended 31 August 2003, together with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 5.5.2004)
No.83	-	Audited Statement of Accounts of the Quality Education Fund for the year ended 31 August 2003, together with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 5.5.2004)
No.84	-	Securities and Futures Commission Annual Report 2003-2004 (published on 12.5.2004)

Questions

1. Hon IP Kwok-him asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

2. Hon Ambrose LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Dr Hon TANG Siu-tong asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

4. Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. In accordance with Rule 26(6) of the Rules of Procedure, Dr Hon TANG Siu-tong asked Question 5 on behalf of Dr Hon David CHU, who was absent.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

6. Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Revenue Bill 2004

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 28 April 2004 resumed.

Three Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Revenue Bill 2004**.

Question that clauses 1 to 5 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Revenue Bill 2004**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

The 4 June incident

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon SZETO Wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges that: the 4 June incident be not forgotten and the 1989 pro-democracy movement be vindicated.

While Hon SZETO Wah was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 5:04 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Eight Members and Hon Martin LEE spoke on the motion.

At 6:00 pm, while Hon Martin LEE was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another seven Members spoke on the motion.

Hon SZETO Wah replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon SZETO Wah claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, five were in favour of the motion, five against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Public housing rent policy

Hon LAU Ping-cheung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to expeditiously conduct a comprehensive review on the public housing rent policy, with a view to formulating a rent policy that is socially just, caring and sustainable; the scope of the review should include the definition and levels of rent, the methodology and basis for rent calculation, the adjustment mechanism, the eligibility criteria for public rental housing, the relevant vetting, monitoring and appeal mechanisms, as well as the mechanism for dealing with individual households

with financial difficulties and for providing assistance to them, etc, so that public rental housing can develop steadily and benefit the people who are genuinely in need.

Question on Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung, Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon Albert HO would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung, Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon Albert HO spoke respectively on the motion and their amendments.

Four Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LAU Ping-cheung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion:

To add ", based on the principles of alleviating the burden on public housing tenants and enhancing their right of participation," after "with a view to formulating"; to delete ", " after "that is socially just" and substitute with "and"; to delete "and sustainable" after "caring"; and to add "the mechanisms for consultation and decision-making," after "the review should include".

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, five against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on Public housing rent policy, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion:

To delete "and" after "caring" and substitute with ","; and to delete "; the scope of the review should include the definition and levels of rent, the methodology and basis for rent calculation, the adjustment mechanism, the eligibility criteria for public rental housing, the relevant vetting, monitoring and appeal mechanisms, as well as the mechanism for dealing with individual households with financial difficulties and for providing assistance to them, etc" after "sustainable" and substitute with ", flexible and affordable to public housing tenants".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion:

To delete "," after "that is socially just" and substitute with "and"; to delete "and sustainable" after "caring"; and to add "; the Government should also consider amending the existing legislation to introduce a tier system whereby the levels of rent payable by tenants are determined according to their actual income and affordability, and to include in the new legislation a mechanism that allows for upward and downward adjustments of rents" after "providing assistance to them, etc".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, five against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 21 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LAU Ping-cheung replied.

Question on Hon LAU Ping-cheung's motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 21 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, two against it and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 19 May 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 8:31 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 12/05/2004
 時間 TIME: 06:46:29 下午

動議 MOTION: 「六四事件」議案
 MOTION "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 司徒華SZETO Wah

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	25	
投票 Vote	17	24	
贊成 Yes	5	16	
反對 No	5	8	
棄權 Abstain	7	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 12/05/2004
 時間 TIME: 08:21:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁耀忠議員對劉炳章議員就「公屋租金政策」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG YIU-CHUNG TO HON LAU PING-CHEUNG'S MOTION ON
 "PUBLIC HOUSING RENT POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	21	
投票 Vote	17	20	
贊成 Yes	5	14	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	7	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	棄權 ABSTAIN
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
勞永榮 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 12/05/2004
 時間 TIME: 08:24:15 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對劉炳章議員就「公屋租金政策」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON LAU PING-CHEUNG'S MOTION ON
 "PUBLIC HOUSING RENT POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	21	
投票 Vote	17	20	
贊成 Yes	6	14	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	棄權 ABSTAIN
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	贊成 YES	劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 12/05/2004
 時間 TIME: 08:26:35 下午

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員對劉炳章議員就「公屋租金政策」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT HO TO HON LAU PING-CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "PUBLIC HOUSING RENT POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	21	
投票 Vote	17	20	
贊成 Yes	5	13	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	7	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
李家祥	Dr Eric LI			李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching			黃宏發	Andrew WONG	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	棄權	ABSTAIN	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	棄權	ABSTAIN
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	棄權	ABSTAIN
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN
胡經昌	Henry WU	棄權	ABSTAIN	余若薇	Audrey EU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			選舉委員會 Election Committee			
麥國風	Michael MAK	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah			朱幼麟	Dr David CHU		
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	反對	NO	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	棄權	ABSTAIN
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	棄權	ABSTAIN	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	棄權	ABSTAIN	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN
				馬逢國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 12/05/2004
 時間 TIME: 08:30:25 下午

動議 MOTION: 「公屋租金政策」議案
 MOTION "PUBLIC HOUSING RENT POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	21	
投票 Vote	17	20	
贊成 Yes	13	7	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	4	11	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
李家祥 Dr Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	贊成 YES	劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	贊成 YES
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK