

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. ESC16/03-04  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/3/2

**Establishment Subcommittee of the Finance Committee**

**Minutes of the 3rd meeting  
held at the Legislative Council Chamber  
on Wednesday, 7 January 2004, at 10:45 am**

**Members present:**

Hon CHAN Kwok-keung, JP (Chairman)  
Hon NG Leung-sing, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP  
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Dr Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP  
Hon Margaret NG  
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong  
Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP  
Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP  
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon SZETO Wah  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
Hon LI Fung-ying, JP  
Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP  
Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP  
Dr Hon LO Wing-lok, JP  
Hon LAU Ping-cheung  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

**Public Officers attending:**

Miss Elizabeth TSE, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Miss Jennifer MAK, JP	Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service
Mr K K LAM	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (Treasury)
Ms Maggie WONG	Assistant Director of Administration
Ms Wanda LUK	Executive Officer (Personnel), Office of The Ombudsman
Mrs Rebecca LAI, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service
Mr Christopher WONG	Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service

**Clerk in attendance:**

Miss Becky YU	Chief Council Secretary (1)1
---------------	------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr S C TSANG	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Ms Caris CHAN	Senior Legislative Assistant 1
Mr Frankie WOO	Legislative Assistant 2

Action

---

At the appointed time, the Chairman called the meeting to order. He advised members that the Finance Committee (FC) was examining the funding proposal on “Total recurrent grant for the University Grants Committee-funded institutions for the 2004/05 academic year” at its meeting immediately before the Establishment Subcommittee (ESC) meeting. As FC was about to complete its deliberation, the Chairman of FC had requested that it be allowed to use the Chamber to continue its meeting which might last for more than 15 minutes. In order that the ESC meeting could be held as scheduled, he had asked the Chairman of FC to suspend the FC meeting so as to seek ESC members’ agreement for FC to continue discussion on the proposal in the Chamber. The Chairman proposed and members agreed to adjourn the ESC meeting. The ESC meeting would resume right after the FC meeting.

2. The meeting resumed at 11:30 am.

**EC(2003-04)14 Proposed deletion of three permanent posts of one Deputy Ombudsman (D3) and two Assistant Ombudsmen (D2) in the Office of The Ombudsman and the ranks of Deputy Ombudsman (D3) and Assistant Ombudsman (D2)**

3. The Chairman informed members that an information paper on the proposal was circulated to the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services on 16 December 2003.

4. Ms Emily LAU noted that the proposal was to delete three civil service directorate posts, including one Deputy Ombudsman at D3 and two Assistant Ombudsmen at D2, as contract staff had been appointed to fill these positions. Ms LAU pointed out that the Office of The Ombudsman (Ombudsman Office) was financially independent and hence had the autonomy to determine its own staff remuneration packages. She enquired whether any savings had been achieved as a result of the replacement of the civil service secondees by contract staff. The Assistant Director of Administration (AD of Adm) advised that the remuneration packages of the contract staff were comparable to that of civil servants at equivalent ranks. She said that the Ombudsman Office had reviewed its staffing structure and remuneration package upon its delinking from the Government in December 2001. Having regard to the increase in both volume and complexity of caseload handled by the Ombudsman Office, it was considered justified to retain the salary of the three directorate posts at the D3 and D2 levels. However, suitable downward adjustment to fringe benefits such as leave and other allowances had been made. Contract-end gratuity would also be offered upon satisfactory completion of service.

5. Ms Emily LAU reiterated that the operating cost of the Ombudsman Office would still come from the public purse. While ensuring that its remuneration package was competitive enough to attract qualified candidates on the one hand, it should also make every effort to achieve savings on the other given the substantial fiscal deficit. AD of Adm explained that consequent upon the review, the Ombudsman Office had taken measures to streamline its staffing structure. These included employment of temporary staff in the event of sudden surge in caseload. As a result, the total number of establishment in the Ombudsman Office had been reduced. She also confirmed that the salary package of non-directorate staff was reduced, but she did not have the details of the reduction in hand.

6. Ms Emily LAU noted with grave concern that there was no change at the directorate level. She was dissatisfied that the Ombudsman Office was trying to cut cost at the expense of non-directorate grade staff while retaining high salaries for its top management staff. She also found it difficult to ascertain the financial implications of the proposal in the absence of actual figures such as staff costs. Her views were shared by Mr James TIEN. In this connection, the Administration was requested to provide a comparison on the changes in establishment and remuneration package with figures in monetary terms to illustrate benefits, such as

leave and other allowances, of all ranks of staff of the Ombudsman Office before and after its delinking from the Government in 2001. Such information should be provided before the proposal was submitted to FC. Ms Emily LAU also requested that the proposal be discussed and voted separately at the FC meeting.

7. Mr Albert CHAN opined that directorate posts in statutory bodies had become asylums for retired senior civil servants. He also pointed out that the salary of directorate posts in these bodies was much higher than that in the private sector. It had always been the practice in the Government to cut the salaries of junior staff while retaining the high salaries of senior officers. Mr Andrew WONG echoed that consideration should be given to setting up a top-level salary commission to review the salaries of directorate posts in the Civil Service as well as statutory bodies to ensure impartiality as in the case of the United Kingdom.

8. The item was voted on and endorsed. Ms Emily LAU requested to record her objection to the item.

**EC(2003-04)15 Proposed incorporation of the Civil Service Training and Development Institute (CSTDI) into the Civil Service Bureau (CSB) of Government Secretariat with effect from 1 April 2004 and consequential deletion of the post, grade and rank of Director, CSTDI (D3) and redeployment of the remaining directorate posts in CSTDI and redistribution of duties among the directorate posts in CSB**

9. Members noted that the Panel on Public Service was consulted on the proposal on 15 December 2003.

10. On national studies programmes, NG Leung-sing asked whether experts from the Mainland would be invited to deliver these programmes. The Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service (PSCS) confirmed that these programmes were conducted by qualified instructors from both Hong Kong and the Mainland who were familiar with national affairs. A list of course instructors had been provided for reference of the Panel on Public Service (LC Paper No. CB(1)1937/02-03(01)). Apart from local studies programmes and staff exchange programmes with Mainland authorities, residential courses at Mainland institutions such as the Tsinghua University, Peking University, Zhongshan University and National School of Administration, were also organized for civil servants. Seminars would also be held to facilitate exchange of views between local civil servants and Mainland officials/academics visiting Hong Kong.

11. As to whether specific training and development (T&D) programme on enhancement of the relationship between the Executive and the Legislature would be organized for civil servants, PSCS confirmed that this had been provided as part of senior executive development programmes, the content of which included sharing

sessions by senior officials as well as Members and senior staff of the Legislative Council. In response to Mr HUI Cheung-ching's enquiry about the T&D programmes for senior directorate officers, PSCS advised that the senior executive development programmes were in general applicable to all directorate grade officers regardless of their ranks. Nevertheless, special T&D programmes would be organized for directorate staff at different levels. For instance, the T&D programme conducted by visiting professors from the Harvard University was designed for officers at D3 or above. A new T&D programme would be provided through a local university for officers at D1 to D2 levels in 2004.

12. The item was voted on and endorsed.
13. The Subcommittee was adjourned at 11:50 am.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
6 February 2004