

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 5

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 27 October 2004 at 2:30 pm

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH  
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon MA Lik, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration, and  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Macao Special Administrative Region) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income from Aircraft Operation) Order (gazetted on 21.10.2004)	162/2004
2. Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Ordinance 2002 (23 of 2002) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 21.10.2004)	163/2004
3. Merchant Shipping (Prevention and Control of Pollution) (Specification of Substances) (Amendment) Order 2004 (L.N. 128 of 2004) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 21.10.2004)	164/2004

### **Other Papers**

- No.18 - Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Fund Annual Report for the year from 1 April 2003 to 31 March 2004 (published on 20.10.2004)
- No.19 - Office of the Telecommunications Authority Trading Fund Report 2003/04 (published on 26.10.2004)
- No.20 - Hongkong Post Annual Report 2003/04 (published on 26.10.2004)

### **Questions**

1. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Two Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Education and Manpower and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

2. Hon Albert HO asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

3. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 4.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Three Members asked supplementaries and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

5. Hon TSANG Yok-sing asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

6. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

**Members' Motions**

**Public inquiry on irregularities in the 2004 Legislative Council Election**

Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Chief Executive to appoint an independent Commission of Inquiry to investigate the irregularities and general confusion on the polling day of the 2004 Legislative Council Election and make such recommendations as appropriate on improvement and disciplinary measures.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion.

While the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs was speaking, the President left the chair at 4:40 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

17 Members and Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the motion.

At 6:35 pm, while Hon Abraham SHEK was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another two Members and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion.

Hon Margaret NG replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, nine against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion, seven against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

**Civil service policy**

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government, on the basis of full consultation with civil servants, to formulate a policy to stabilize the confidence of civil servants so as to boost their morale, and that the Government should, before formulating such a policy:

- (a) cease the corporatization of departments, contractization of staff employment and indiscriminate outsourcing of services;
- (b) cease employing temporary staff in place of permanent staff; and
- (c) review the policy of imposing operating expenditure envelopes across the board and the practice of reducing civil service pay, benefits and establishment,

so as to consolidate public confidence, give impetus to healthy social interactions, promote social prosperity and help build up the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong and Hon Howard YOUNG would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong and Hon Howard YOUNG spoke respectively on the motion and their amendments.

24 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Civil Service spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:



To add "that, subject to compliance with the requirements of the International Labour Convention Nos. 98 and 151," after "That this Council urges"; to delete ", on the basis of full consultation with civil servants, to formulate" after "the Government" and substitute with "discuss with civil service unions the formulation of"; to delete "cease employing temporary staff in place of permanent staff; and" after "(b)" and substitute with "resume the recruitment of civil servants; (c) abort the target of reducing the civil service establishment to 160 000 by 2006-07, and determine the civil service establishment according to actual needs; and"; to delete "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete "," after "civil service pay" and substitute with "and"; and to delete "and establishment" after "benefits".

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Civil service policy", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add "and the public" after "consultation with civil servants"; to delete "a policy" after "to formulate" and substitute with "policies"; to add "and ensure that all employees of the Government are under reasonable labour protection" after "to boost their morale"; to delete "before formulating such a policy" after "and that the Government should," and substitute with "at the same time as it formulates such policies"; and to delete ", contractization of staff employment and indiscriminate outsourcing of services; (b) cease employing temporary staff in place of permanent staff; and (c) review the policy of imposing operating expenditure envelopes across the board and the practice of reducing civil service pay, benefits and establishment, so as to consolidate public confidence, give impetus to healthy social interactions, promote social prosperity and help build up the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region" after "(a) cease the corporatization of departments" and substitute with "; (b) ensure that the employment of persons outside the pensionable establishment, including those employed on contract terms as well as under outsourced service contract, is not done indiscriminately to replace staff on the pensionable establishment, and enhance the protection for staff employed on non-civil service terms in regard to their posts, pay and benefits; (c) formulate a policy, with restrictions and time limits, on the employment of temporary staff to prevent exploitation by the Government in the name of flexibility; (d) review the policy on civil service pay and benefits; and (e) draw up a reasonable and appropriate establishment of public servants".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add "and the public" after "full consultation with civil servants"; to add "civil service" after "to formulate a"; to add "that fits present-day circumstances while, at the same time, taking into account the need" after "policy"; to delete "so as to" after "confidence of civil servants" and substitute with ","; to delete ", and that" after "boost their morale" and substitute with "and balance public interests, hence"; to delete ", before formulating such a policy" after "the Government should" and substitute with "carefully examine the effectiveness of the following policies"; to delete "cease" after "(a)"; to delete "indiscriminate" after "staff employment and"; to delete "cease employing" after "(b)" and substitute with "the employment of"; to delete "review" after "(c)"; to delete "across the board and the practice of reducing" after "operating expenditure envelopes" and substitute with "and the arrangements in respect of"; and to delete "consolidate public confidence" after "so as to" and substitute with "optimize the use of public funds, enhance the efficiency of the civil service".

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing replied.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion put.

Hon Howard YOUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, 16 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion, nine against it and four abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 3 November 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:07 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 27/10/2004  
時間 TIME: 07:12:27 下午

動議 MOTION: 「對2004年立法會選舉的不當情況進行公開研訊」議案  
MOTION "PUBLIC INQUIRY ON IRREGULARITIES IN THE 2004 LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ELECTION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	8	16	
反對 No	9	7	
棄權 Abstain	6	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 TONG Ka-wah	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 27/10/2004  
時間 TIME: 10:52:43 下午

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對王國興議員就「公務員政策」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
"CIVIL SERVICE POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	27	
投票 Vote	24	26	
贊成 Yes	5	7	
反對 No	15	8	
棄權 Abstain	4	11	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 TONG Ka-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 27/10/2004  
 時間 TIME: 10:56:00 下午

動議 MOTION: 張文光議員對王國興議員就「公務員政策」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION  
 ON "CIVIL SERVICE POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	27	
投票 Vote	24	26	
贊成 Yes	12	24	
反對 No	11	1	
棄權 Abstain	1	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 TONG Ka-wah	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 27/10/2004  
時間 TIME: 10:58:42 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊孝華議員對王國興議員就「公務員政策」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON HOWARD YOUNG TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
"CIVIL SERVICE POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	27	
投票 Vote	25	26	
贊成 Yes	17	11	
反對 No	6	14	
棄權 Abstain	2	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳盞林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權	ABSTAIN	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO	馬力	MA Lik		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO	湯家驊	TONG Ka-wah	贊成	YES
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	棄權	ABSTAIN	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO



投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 27/10/2004  
時間 TIME: 11:05:58 下午

動議 MOTION: 「公務員政策」議案  
MOTION "CIVIL SERVICE POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	27	
投票 Vote	25	26	
贊成 Yes	7	13	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	2	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	徐謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 TONG Ka-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES