

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 6

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 3 November 2004 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration, and
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Waste Disposal (Designated Waste Disposal Facility) (Amendment) Regulation 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004)	165/2004
2. Waste Disposal (Charges for Disposal of Construction Waste) Regulation (gazetted on 29.10.2004)	166/2004
3. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Public Markets) (Designation and Amendment of Tenth Schedule) (No. 3) Order 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004)	167/2004
4. Declaration of Markets Notice (Amendment) (No. 3) Declaration 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004)	168/2004
5. Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Portugal) Order (Cap. 525 Sub. Leg. L) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004)	169/2004
6. Fugitive Offenders (Portugal) Order (Cap. 503 Sub. Leg. U) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004)	170/2004

Questions

1. Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Two Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Hon Audrey EU asked a supplementary and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied. While he was replying, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung interrupted by speaking aloud in his seat. The President told Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that he must not interrupt while others were speaking. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak aloud without the President's permission. The President warned him that if he repeated doing so during the meeting, she would exercise her power under the Rules of Procedure.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands continued to answer the supplementary.

Another Member asked supplementary and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

2. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury and the Secretary for Security replied.

3. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

4. Hon Albert HO asked Question 4.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

5. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Reducing the duty on ultra low sulphur diesel

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to reduce the rate of duty on ultra low sulphur diesel to \$0.55 per litre until 31 December 2005, and to conduct a further review before that date.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and Hon WONG Kwok-hing respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

18 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To delete "reduce the" after "the Government to" and substitute with "expeditiously review the current"; and to delete "to \$0.55 per litre until 31 December 2005, and to conduct a further review before that date" after "ultra low sulphur diesel" and substitute with "with a view to easing the hardship caused by the high cost of ultra low sulphur diesel to the affected industries, especially the transport industry which is the hardest hit, and to ensure that end-users of ultra low sulphur diesel can really benefit from any reduction of the duty rate".

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and five against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Fred LI rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Reducing the duty on ultra low sulphur diesel", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; this Council also urges the Government to study the phasing-out of the duty" after "reduction of the duty rate".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah proposed and put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 21 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 18 were in favour of the motion, three against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion and four against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah was carried.

Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Hong Kong economy has entered an inflation period, yet the unemployment rate remains high, with wages not showing an evident rebound and the disparity between the rich and the poor becoming more serious, this Council urges the Government to set up an interdepartmental committee on aiding the poor to comprehensively examine the disparity between the rich and the poor in Hong Kong and establish a poverty line, so as to enable a more effective allocation of social resources and safeguard the basic needs of the grass-roots people; at the same time, the Government should co-ordinate the efforts of various departments in formulating corresponding policies as well as measures to help get rid of poverty, with a view to narrowing the gap between the rich and the poor, reducing social conflicts in the long run and promoting harmonious social development.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 7:24 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon James TIEN would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon James TIEN respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Nine Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:52 pm, while Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 19 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To add "the general public has not yet been able to benefit from the economic recovery and" after "yet"; to delete "an interdepartmental" after "urges the Government to set up" and substitute with "a"; and to add ", which should consist of representatives from relevant government departments, community organizations and academic institutions," after "aiding the poor".

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon James TIEN moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To delete "an" after "to set up" and substitute with "a governmental"; to delete "and establish a poverty line" after "the rich and the poor in Hong Kong"; to add "enhance the self-help capability of the socially disadvantaged groups and" after "so as to"; and to add ", thereby helping those who are most in need" after "allocation of social resources"; to delete "safeguard" after "and" and substitute with "safeguarding"; and to delete "in the long run" after "reducing social conflicts".

Question on Hon James TIEN's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon James TIEN put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 November 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:27 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 07:08:06 下午

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對劉健儀議員就「調低超低含硫量柴油稅」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION ON "REDUCING THE DUTY ON ULTRA LOW SULPHUR DIESEL"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 TONG Ka-wah

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	26	25	
贊成 Yes	23	20	
反對 No	2	5	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 07:14:53 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對劉健儀議員就「調低超低含硫量柴油稅」所提，經湯家驊議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION ON "REDUCING THE DUTY ON ULTRA LOW SULPHUR DIESEL" AS AMENDED BY HON RONNY TONG

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	26	25	
贊成 Yes	3	5	
反對 No	21	14	
棄權 Abstain	2	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
時間 TIME: 07:20:17 下午

動議 MOTION: 由劉健儀議員動議，經湯家驊議員及王國興議員修正的「調低超低含硫量柴油稅」議案
MOTION MOVED BY HON MIRIAM LAU ON "REDUCING THE DUTY ON ULTRA LOW SULPHUR DIESEL" AS AMENDED BY HON RONNY TONG AND HON WONG KWOK-HING

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	18	20	
反對 No	3	4	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 11:18:49 下午

動議 MOTION: 張超雄議員對馮檢基議員就「改善貧富懸殊的情況」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION
 ON "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 CHEUNG Chiu-hung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	12	24	
反對 No	14	2	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
時間 TIME: 11:22:11 下午

動議 MOTION: 田北俊議員對馮檢基議員就「改善貧富懸殊的情況」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TIEN TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON
"ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR"

動議人 MOVED BY: 田北俊 James TIEN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	23	22	
反對 No	0	3	
棄權 Abstain	3	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO