

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 6

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 3 November 2004 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration, and
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

| <u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u> | <u>L.N. No.</u> |
|--|-----------------|
| 1. Waste Disposal (Designated Waste Disposal Facility) (Amendment) Regulation 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004) | 165/2004 |
| 2. Waste Disposal (Charges for Disposal of Construction Waste) Regulation (gazetted on 29.10.2004) | 166/2004 |
| 3. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Public Markets) (Designation and Amendment of Tenth Schedule) (No. 3) Order 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004) | 167/2004 |
| 4. Declaration of Markets Notice (Amendment) (No. 3) Declaration 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004) | 168/2004 |
| 5. Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Portugal) Order (Cap. 525 Sub. Leg. L) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004) | 169/2004 |
| 6. Fugitive Offenders (Portugal) Order (Cap. 503 Sub. Leg. U) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 29.10.2004) | 170/2004 |

Questions

1. Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Two Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Hon Audrey EU asked a supplementary and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied. While he was replying, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung interrupted by speaking aloud in his seat. The President told Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that he must not interrupt while others were speaking. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak aloud without the President's permission. The President warned him that if he repeated doing so during the meeting, she would exercise her power under the Rules of Procedure.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands continued to answer the supplementary.

Another Member asked supplementary and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

2. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury and the Secretary for Security replied.

3. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

4. Hon Albert HO asked Question 4.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

5. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Reducing the duty on ultra low sulphur diesel

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to reduce the rate of duty on ultra low sulphur diesel to \$0.55 per litre until 31 December 2005, and to conduct a further review before that date.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and Hon WONG Kwok-hing respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

18 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To delete "reduce the" after "the Government to" and substitute with "expeditiously review the current"; and to delete "to \$0.55 per litre until 31 December 2005, and to conduct a further review before that date" after "ultra low sulphur diesel" and substitute with "with a view to easing the hardship caused by the high cost of ultra low sulphur diesel to the affected industries, especially the transport industry which is the hardest hit, and to ensure that end-users of ultra low sulphur diesel can really benefit from any reduction of the duty rate".

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and five against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Fred LI rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Reducing the duty on ultra low sulphur diesel", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; this Council also urges the Government to study the phasing-out of the duty" after "reduction of the duty rate".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah proposed and put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 21 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 18 were in favour of the motion, three against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion and four against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Hon Miriam LAU's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah was carried.

Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Hong Kong economy has entered an inflation period, yet the unemployment rate remains high, with wages not showing an evident rebound and the disparity between the rich and the poor becoming more serious, this Council urges the Government to set up an interdepartmental committee on aiding the poor to comprehensively examine the disparity between the rich and the poor in Hong Kong and establish a poverty line, so as to enable a more effective allocation of social resources and safeguard the basic needs of the grass-roots people; at the same time, the Government should co-ordinate the efforts of various departments in formulating corresponding policies as well as measures to help get rid of poverty, with a view to narrowing the gap between the rich and the poor, reducing social conflicts in the long run and promoting harmonious social development.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 7:24 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon James TIEN would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon James TIEN respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Nine Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:52 pm, while Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 19 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To add "the general public has not yet been able to benefit from the economic recovery and" after "yet"; to delete "an interdepartmental" after "urges the Government to set up" and substitute with "a"; and to add ", which should consist of representatives from relevant government departments, community organizations and academic institutions," after "aiding the poor".

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon James TIEN moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To delete "an" after "to set up" and substitute with "a governmental"; to delete "and establish a poverty line" after "the rich and the poor in Hong Kong"; to add "enhance the self-help capability of the socially disadvantaged groups and" after "so as to"; and to add ", thereby helping those who are most in need" after "allocation of social resources"; to delete "safeguard" after "and" and substitute with "safeguarding"; and to delete "in the long run" after "reducing social conflicts".

Question on Hon James TIEN's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon James TIEN put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 November 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:27 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
時間 TIME: 07:08:06 下午

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對劉健儀議員就「調低超低含硫量柴油稅」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION ON "REDUCING
THE DUTY ON ULTRA LOW SULPHUR DIESEL"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 TONG Ka-wah

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26 | 26 | |
| 投票 Vote | 26 | 25 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 23 | 20 | |
| 反對 No | 2 | 5 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 1 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 YES | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 贊成 YES |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 贊成 YES | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 NO |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 贊成 YES | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 贊成 YES | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 反對 NO |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 YES | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 贊成 YES | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 YES |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 贊成 YES | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 反對 NO |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 贊成 YES | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 YES |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 反對 NO | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 贊成 YES | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 反對 NO | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 贊成 YES | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 反對 NO |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 YES | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 YES |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 贊成 YES | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 YES |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 07:14:53 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對劉健儀議員就「調低超低含硫量柴油稅」所提，經湯家驊議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION ON "REDUCING THE DUTY ON ULTRA LOW SULPHUR DIESEL" AS AMENDED BY HON RONNY TONG

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26 | 26 | |
| 投票 Vote | 26 | 25 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 3 | 5 | |
| 反對 No | 21 | 14 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 2 | 6 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 反對 NO |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 反對 NO | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 NO | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 反對 NO |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 反對 NO | 涂謹申 James TO | 反對 NO |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 YES |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 贊成 YES | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 NO |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 反對 NO | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 贊成 YES |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 反對 NO |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 反對 NO |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 反對 NO |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 反對 NO |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 反對 NO |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 反對 NO |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 反對 NO | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 反對 NO |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 反對 NO |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 反對 NO | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 反對 NO |

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 07:20:17 下午

動議 MOTION: 由劉健儀議員動議，經湯家驊議員及王國興議員修正的「調低超低含硫量柴油稅」議案
 MOTION MOVED BY HON MIRIAM LAU ON "REDUCING THE DUTY ON ULTRA LOW SULPHUR DIESEL" AS AMENDED BY HON RONNY TONG AND HON WONG KWOK-HING

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 25 | |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 24 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 18 | 20 | |
| 反對 No | 3 | 4 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 2 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 YES | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 贊成 YES |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 贊成 YES | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 NO |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 贊成 YES | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 YES | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 贊成 YES | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 YES |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 贊成 YES | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 反對 NO |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 贊成 YES | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 YES |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 反對 NO | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 贊成 YES | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | | TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 反對 NO |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 YES | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 反對 NO | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 YES |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 贊成 YES | CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 YES |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 反對 NO | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 11:18:49 下午

動議 MOTION: 張超雄議員對馮檢基議員就「改善貧富懸殊的情況」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION
 ON "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 CHEUNG Chiu-hung

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26 | 27 | |
| 投票 Vote | 26 | 26 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 12 | 24 | |
| 反對 No | 14 | 2 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 YES |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 YES | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 贊成 YES |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 YES |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 YES |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 YES |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 YES | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 11:22:11 下午

動議 MOTION: 田北俊議員對馮檢基議員就「改善貧富懸殊的情況」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TIEN TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON
 "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR"

動議人 MOVED BY: 田北俊 James TIEN

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26 | 27 | |
| 投票 Vote | 26 | 26 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 23 | 22 | |
| 反對 No | 0 | 3 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 3 | 1 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 YES | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 贊成 YES |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 贊成 YES | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 贊成 YES | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 贊成 YES |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 YES | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 贊成 YES | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 贊成 YES | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 贊成 YES |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 贊成 YES | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 YES |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 贊成 YES | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 反對 NO |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 贊成 YES | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 YES | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 YES |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 反對 NO |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 贊成 YES | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 YES |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 反對 NO |