

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 7

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 10 November 2004 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP

Secretary for Economic Development and Labour
Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

| <u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u> | <u>L.N. No.</u> |
|--|-----------------|
| 1. Buildings (Amendment) Ordinance 2004 (15 of 2004) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 5.11.2004) | 171/2004 |
| 2. United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) Ordinance (Cap. 575) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 5.11.2004) | 172/2004 |
| 3. United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) (Amendment) Ordinance 2004 (21 of 2004) (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 5.11.2004) | 173/2004 |

Questions

1. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Two Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked another supplementary. The President stated that he might only follow up on the part of the supplementary which had not been answered. While the President was explaining the rules in asking supplementaries, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung rose and interrupted four times.

The President advised Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that he should familiarize himself with the relevant rules of the Rules of Procedure, namely, he should stand up while speaking, and he should not speak while another Member was speaking. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung rebutted that the President's remarks were unfair, wasting everybody's time and inappropriate. The President reiterated that Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung should abide by the Rules of Procedure, irrespective of whether he liked them or not. She warned him that if he continued to conduct himself in such a disorderly manner, she had to order him to withdraw from the Council meeting.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung protested to the President that she was prejudiced against him and she was not consistent in enforcing the Rules of Procedure. He asked the President to refrain from doing this in the future.

The President stated that she had been explaining patiently to Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung about observing the Rules of Procedure and that she had no prejudice against him, but he did not pay heed to it and kept doing things his own way. She would suspend the meeting so as to explain the rules to Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung in her office. The President then suspended the meeting at 3:15 pm.

The Council resumed at 3:41 pm.

The President stated that during the break, she had explained to Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that she was only enforcing the Rules of Procedure and had no prejudice against him. The President asked Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung if he would withdraw his accusations that the President was unfair, biased and had made prejudiced comments. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung refused. The President then ordered Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung to withdraw from the Council for the remainder of the meeting immediately. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung withdrew from the Council.

Another three Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

3. Hon James TIEN asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Hon Audrey EU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

6. Hon Fred LI asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Statements

The Chief Secretary for Administration made a statement on West Kowloon Cultural District project.

13 Members sought elucidation on the statement and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs made a statement on Electoral Affairs Commission Interim Report on the 2004 Legislative Council Election.

Nine Members sought elucidation on the statement and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Bills

First Reading

Trade Descriptions (Amendment) Bill 2004

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Trade Descriptions (Amendment) Bill 2004

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Members' Motions

Constitutional reform

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the HKSAR Government to immediately arrange, with regard to constitutional reform, for all Members of the Legislative Council to meet relevant officials of the Central People's Government, so that Members can directly reflect to the Central People's Government the views of all the people of Hong Kong on the implementation of universal suffrage in 2007 and 2008.

While Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 6:45 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon TAM Yiu-chung would move an amendment to the motion and that Hon Margaret NG would also move an amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "immediately" after "the HKSAR Government to"; to add "as soon as possible" after "arrange"; to delete ", so that Members can directly reflect to the Central People's Government the views of all the people of Hong Kong on the implementation of universal suffrage in" after "the Central People's Government" and substitute with "to discuss the constitutional arrangements for"; and to add "and the ways to achieve universal suffrage thereafter" after "2007 and 2008".

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment and addressed the Council:

To delete "thereafter" after "to achieve universal suffrage".

Question on Hon Margaret NG's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment proposed.

22 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 9:30 pm, while the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon Margaret NG's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Constitutional reform", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion put.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and six against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah replied.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, six were in favour of the motion and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Conserving the Central Police Station Compound and formulating a comprehensive policy on antiquities and monuments

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Central Police Station, Victoria Prison and the former Central Magistracy Compound is of great historic and cultural value, this Council urges the Government to adopt the following measures to review afresh the direction for its development:

- (a) to preserve the historic character and features of the Compound, since monuments form part of the collective memory of the people of Hong Kong;
- (b) to actively work out a sustainable mode of operation of the Compound, subject to the principle of allowing public access and enjoyment of the Compound;
- (c) to consult the public widely on the use of the Compound before conducting an open tender exercise for the heritage tourism project at the Compound, and to establish a monitoring body with public participation to monitor the tendering work and the development of the project; and
- (d) to put proper conservation of the Compound as an overriding factor for assessing the tender proposals for the project;

furthermore, the Government should also expeditiously formulate, in an open and highly transparent manner, a comprehensive policy on the preservation of antiquities and monuments to ensure that buildings which have been declared as monuments are duly maintained and conserved, and the original environment and atmosphere of their surroundings are preserved; at the same time, the Government should, through publicity and education, actively enhance the public's knowledge and awareness of antiquities and monuments and their preservation, and should study the feasibility of developing heritage tourism with a view to promoting a local community economy that has cultural characteristics, and to creating job opportunities.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion proposed.

The President stated that Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW and Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing would move amendments to the motion and that Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki would also move an amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the three amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW respectively spoke on the motion and the amendments. Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing declared his interest as a member of Antiquities Advisory Board and spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki and 14 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion:

To add "as well as the integrity" after "the historic character and features"; to add "and must retain all the 18 buildings and their enclosing walls," before "since monuments"; to add "including the conservation of the Compound on a non-profit making basis," after "operation of the Compound,"; to delete "a monitoring body with public participation to monitor the tendering work and the development of the project" after "and to establish" and substitute with "an independent committee for vetting the tender proposals and monitoring their implementation"; to add "to attach a higher weighting to the qualitative aspects and" after "(d)"; and to add "and set up as soon as possible an independent antiquities and monuments authority that has credibility," after "the preservation of antiquities and monuments".

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion proposed.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment:

To add "and ensuring that the operations at the Compound are not incompatible with its historic value, and that parts of the Compound are retained for the provision of a police, prison and judicial museum," after "non-profit making basis,"; and to add ", refrain from taking land premium or economic interests as a primary consideration" after "the qualitative aspects".

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment proposed and put.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Conserving the Central Police Station Compound and formulating a comprehensive policy on antiquities and monuments", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed and put and agreed to.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion:

To delete "(b) to actively work out a sustainable mode of operation of the Compound, subject to the principle of allowing public access and enjoyment of the Compound"; to delete "(c)" and substitute with "(b)"; to delete "consult the public widely on the use of the Compound before conducting" before "an open tender exercise" and substitute with "expeditiously conduct"; to delete ", and to establish a monitoring body with public participation to monitor the tendering work and the development of the project" after "at the Compound"; to delete "(d)" and substitute with "(c)"; to delete "put proper conservation of the Compound as an overriding factor for" before "assessing" and substitute with "consider the following principles when"; to add ": allowing public access and enjoyment of the Compound, working out a mode of operation that allows for sustainable development of the Compound, and proper conservation of the Compound" after "assessing the tender proposals for the project"; to add "as far as possible" after "their surroundings are preserved"; to delete "knowledge and" after "the public's"; to add "the preservation of" after "awareness of"; to delete "and their preservation, and should study the feasibility of developing heritage tourism" before "with a view to"; to delete "a local community economy that has cultural characteristics," after "promoting" and substitute with "heritage tourism"; and to delete "to" before "creating job opportunities".

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 19 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing moved the following amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion:

To delete ", and to establish a monitoring body with public participation to monitor the tendering work and the development of the project" after "the heritage tourism project at the Compound".

Question on Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHOY So-yuk replied.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix VIII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 17 November 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 1:00 am on 11 November 2004.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 10/11/2004
時間 TIME: 09:38:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 吳靄儀議員就譚耀宗議員對湯家驊議員的「政制改革」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON MARGARET NG'S AMENDMENT TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON "CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀Margaret NG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26 | 27 | |
| 投票 Vote | 26 | 26 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 6 | 16 | |
| 反對 No | 20 | 10 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 反對 NO |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 反對 NO | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 贊成 YES |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 反對 NO | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | 反對 NO | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 反對 NO | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 10/11/2004
時間 TIME: 09:41:20 下午

動議 MOTION: 譚耀宗議員對湯家驊議員就「政制改革」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON TAM YIU-CHUNG TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON
"CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26 | 27 | |
| 投票 Vote | 26 | 26 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 20 | 10 | |
| 反對 No | 6 | 16 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 YES | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 贊成 YES |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 贊成 YES | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 反對 NO |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 反對 NO | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 NO |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 NO | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 贊成 YES | 李華明 Fred LI | 反對 NO |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 贊成 YES |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 反對 NO |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 贊成 YES | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 YES |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 YES | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 贊成 YES | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 YES |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 贊成 YES | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 NO |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 贊成 YES | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 反對 NO |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 贊成 YES | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 YES |
| 李鳳英 Li Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 反對 NO |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 贊成 YES | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 反對 NO |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 反對 NO |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 贊成 YES | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 反對 NO |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 YES | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 反對 NO |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 反對 NO |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 反對 NO | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 YES |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 反對 NO |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pai-chung | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 贊成 YES | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 YES |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 YES | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 反對 NO |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 反對 NO | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 反對 NO |

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 10/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 09:48:21 下午

動議 MOTION: 「政制改革」議案
 MOTION "CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26 | 27 | |
| 投票 Vote | 26 | 26 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 6 | 16 | |
| 反對 No | 20 | 10 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 反對 NO |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 反對 NO | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | 贊成 YES |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 反對 NO | TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | 反對 NO | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 反對 NO | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 11/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 12:48:24 上午

動議 MOTION: 郭家麒議員就楊森議員對蔡素玉議員的「保護中區警署建築群和制訂全面的古物古蹟政策」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
 DR HON KWOK KA-KI'S AMENDMENT TO DR HON YEUNG SUM'S AMENDMENT TO HON CHOY SO-YUK'S MOTION ON "CONSERVING THE CENTRAL POLICE STATION COMPOUND AND FORMULATING A COMPREHENSIVE POLICY ON ANTIQUITIES AND MONUMENTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 25 | 22 | |
| 投票 Vote | 25 | 21 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 5 | 12 | |
| 反對 No | 16 | 2 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 4 | 7 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 反對 NO | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 11/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 12:51:36 上午

動議 MOTION: 楊森議員對蔡素玉議員就「保護中區警署建築群和制訂全面的古物古蹟政策」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON YEUNG SUM TO HON CHOY SO-YUK'S MOTION ON
 "CONSERVING THE CENTRAL POLICE STATION COMPOUND AND FORMULATING A
 COMPREHENSIVE POLICY ON ANTIQUITIES AND MONUMENTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 25 | 22 | |
| 投票 Vote | 25 | 21 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 5 | 12 | |
| 反對 No | 16 | 2 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 4 | 7 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 反對 NO | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 11/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 12:53:56 上午

動議 MOTION: 周梁淑怡議員對蔡素玉議員就「保護中區警署建築群和制訂全面的古物古蹟政策」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON MRS SELINA CHOW TO HON CHOY SO-YUK'S MOTION ON "CONSERVING THE CENTRAL POLICE STATION COMPOUND AND FORMULATING A COMPREHENSIVE POLICY ON ANTIQUITIES AND MONUMENTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 25 | 22 | |
| 投票 Vote | 25 | 21 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 9 | 2 | |
| 反對 No | 15 | 19 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 1 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 贊成 YES |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 反對 NO |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 反對 NO | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 NO |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 NO | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 反對 NO |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 贊成 YES |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 反對 NO |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 贊成 YES | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 贊成 YES | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 NO |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 贊成 YES | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 反對 NO | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 反對 NO |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 贊成 YES | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 反對 NO |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 YES | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 反對 NO |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 反對 NO |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 反對 NO | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 反對 NO |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 反對 NO | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 反對 NO | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 反對 NO |

投票 VOTE: 7
日期 DATE: 11/11/2004
時間 TIME: 12:56:23 上午

動議 MOTION: 劉秀成議員對蔡素玉議員就「保護中區警署建築群和制訂全面的古物古蹟政策」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON PATRICK LAU TO HON CHOY SO-YUK'S MOTION ON "CONSERVING THE CENTRAL POLICE STATION COMPOUND AND FORMULATING A COMPREHENSIVE POLICY ON ANTIQUITIES AND MONUMENTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉秀成Patrick LAU

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 25 | 22 | |
| 投票 Vote | 25 | 21 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 11 | 7 | |
| 反對 No | 14 | 14 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 YES | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 贊成 YES | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 反對 NO |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 反對 NO | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 NO |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 NO | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 贊成 YES | 李華明 Fred LI | 反對 NO |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 反對 NO |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 YES | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 YES |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 NO |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 贊成 YES | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 贊成 YES | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 YES |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 反對 NO |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 反對 NO |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 反對 NO |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 反對 NO |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 反對 NO | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 YES |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 反對 NO |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 贊成 YES | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 YES |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 YES | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 反對 NO | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 反對 NO |

投票 VOTE: 8
 日期 DATE: 11/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 12:59:42 上午

動議 MOTION: 「保護中區警署建築群和制訂全面的古物古蹟政策」議案
 MOTION "CONSERVING THE CENTRAL POLICE STATION COMPOUND AND
 FORMULATING A COMPREHENSIVE POLICY ON ANTIQUITIES AND MONUMENTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 25 | 22 | |
| 投票 Vote | 25 | 21 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 11 | 19 | |
| 反對 No | 14 | 2 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | 反對 NO | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 YES | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 YES |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | 贊成 YES | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 YES |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 YES |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 YES |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 YES |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 YES | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | 贊成 YES |