

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 9

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 24 November 2004 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung
The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin
The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP
The Hon MA Lik, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Federal Republic of Germany) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Shipping Income) Order (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	182/2004
2. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Kingdom of Norway) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income from Shipping Operation) Order (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	183/2004
3. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Republic of Singapore) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income from Shipping or Aircraft Operations) Order (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	184/2004
4. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income from Shipping and Air Transport) Order (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	185/2004
5. Trade Descriptions (Country of Manufacture) (Textile Made-up Articles) Order (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	186/2004
6. Trade Descriptions (Place of Manufacture) (Textile Made-up Articles) Notice (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	187/2004
7. Deposit Protection Scheme Ordinance (Cap. 581) (Commencement) (No. 2) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	188/2004
8. Rules of the District Court (Amendment) Rules 2004 (Commencement) Notice 2004 (gazetted on 19.11.2004)	189/2004

Other Papers

- No.25 - Report on the Administration of the Immigration Service Welfare Fund prepared by the Director of Immigration Incorporated in accordance with Regulation 12(b) of the Immigration Service (Welfare Fund) Regulation (published on 17.11.2004)
- No.26 - Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data, Hong Kong
Annual Report 2003-2004 (published on 18.11.2004)
- No.27 - Ocean Park Corporation
Annual Report 2003-2004 (published on 24.11.2004)
- No.28 - Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2004 (published on 24.11.2004)
- No.29 - Report No. 43 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits - October 2004 (published on 24.11.2004)
- No.30 - Accounts of the Government for the year ended 31 March 2004 (published on 24.11.2004)

Questions

1. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Hon WONG Yung-kan asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

3. Hon Howard YOUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Two Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

After declaring her interest as the Chairman of Hong Kong Tourism Board, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked a supplementary and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Another four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

4. Hon Vincent FANG Kang asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Hon James TO asked Question 5.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Written replies to Questions 6 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the following Regulations, made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 24 September 2004, be approved -

- (a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment) (No. 3) Regulation 2004; and
- (b) the Poisons List (Amendment) (No. 3) Regulation 2004.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Audrey EU, Chairman of the Subcommittee on the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment) (No.3) Regulation 2004 and the Poisons List (Amendment) (No.3) Regulation 2004, spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Restoring Comprehensive Social Security Assistance rates to the level prior to 1 June 2003

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") Scheme is the only safety net in Hong Kong, and with the worsening disparity between the rich and the poor, the reduction of CSSA rates has caused greater hardship to all the socially disadvantaged groups in receipt of CSSA payments, including the elderly, the disabled, single families, low-income groups and the unemployed, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) restore the CSSA rates to the level prior to 1 June 2003; and
- (b) immediately conduct a study on basic and essential needs, and re-determine the CSSA rates based on the findings of the study, so as to ensure that the basic livelihood of the general public is safeguarded.

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG, Hon TAM Yiu-chung and Hon Fred LI would move amendments to the motion and that Hon CHAN Yuen-han would also move an amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the three amendments and the amendment to amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG and Hon TAM Yiu-chung respectively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:00 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Fred LI and Hon CHAN Yuen-han respectively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

A Member and Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon LI Fung-ying was speaking, Hon CHIM Pui-chung drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present and Hon LI Fung-ying continued to speak.

12 Members and Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 6:57 pm, while Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another six Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion:

To delete "and with the worsening disparity between the rich and the poor," after "the only safety net in Hong Kong," and substitute with "aiding the poor is an issue of concern, and"; to add "since 1 June 2003" after "the reduction of CSSA rates"; to delete "all the socially disadvantaged groups in receipt of CSSA payments" after "has caused greater hardship to" and substitute with "the very poor"; to delete ", single families, low-income groups and the unemployed" after "the disabled" and substitute with "and children"; to delete ": (a) restore the CSSA rates to the level prior to 1 June 2003; and (b)" after "this Council urges the Government to"; to delete "conduct a study on basic and essential needs" after "immediately" and substitute with "review the existing system of CSSA"; to delete "study" after "the findings of the" and substitute with "review"; to add "the purchasing power and" after "so as to ensure that"; to delete "the general public is" after "the basic livelihood of" and substitute with "CSSA recipients are"; and to add ", and that more support is provided to those who are most in need" after "safeguarded".

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 19 against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Restoring Comprehensive Social Security Assistance rates to the level prior to 1 June 2003", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion:

To add "payable to the elderly and people with disabilities" after "(a) restore the CSSA rates".

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 14 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and 12 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Fred LI moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion:

To delete "and" after "(a) restore the CSSA rates to the level prior to 1 June 2003;"; and to add "; (c) strengthen the existing employment assistance programmes by providing skills training for CSSA recipients and assisting them in grasping up-to-date and most accurate market information, so as to enable them to join the workforce again as early as possible; and (d) expand the Government's 'Support for Self-reliance Scheme' so that, in addition to participating in community work, arrangements can also be made for employable CSSA recipients to work in government or subvented organizations, so as to enhance their self-confidence and skills, develop work habits and increase employment opportunities; at the same time, the Government should set up a more effective monitoring mechanism to guard against abuse of CSSA" after "the basic livelihood of the general public is safeguarded".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion proposed.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment:

To add "and" after "the basic livelihood of the general public is safeguarded;"; to delete "strengthen the existing employment assistance programmes by providing skills training for CSSA recipients and assisting them in grasping up-to-date and most accurate market information, so as to enable them to join the workforce again as early as possible; and" after "(c)" and substitute with "consider the public's views on setting up a re-employment support scheme to provide employment, financial, training and counselling supports for the unemployed so as to enable them to re-enter the employment market;"; and to delete "(d) expand the Government's 'Support for Self-reliance Scheme' so that, in addition to participating in community work, arrangements can also be made for employable CSSA recipients to work in government or subvented organizations, so as to enhance their self-confidence and skills, develop work habits and increase employment opportunities;".

Question on Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the motion, 12 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion, two against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Developing town planning and urban designs featuring local characteristics for the 18 districts

Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG") currently adopted by the Planning Department was first compiled in the 1960s and have since been in use with substantial revisions made only in 1974, most of the guidelines have become out of step with present-day circumstances, and despite the addition of the part on Urban Design Guidelines at the end of last year, the limitations on district planning still remain unchanged, this Council urges the Government to thoroughly review the existing planning policy, which takes no account of the local characteristics of various districts, expeditiously revise the HKPSG, and set up an inter-departmental task group comprising representatives from the Home Affairs Bureau and District Councils to undertake the co-ordination work, so as to facilitate the 18 districts in the territory to flexibly develop district-specific town planning and urban designs, having regard to their respective local characteristics.

Question on Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

20 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion:

To delete "as" after "That," and substitute with "although"; to delete "was" after "Planning Department" and substitute with ","; to delete "and have since been in use with substantial revisions made only in 1974, most of the guidelines have become out of step with present-day circumstances, and despite the addition of the part on Urban Design Guidelines at the end of last year, the limitations on district planning still remain unchanged" after "in the 1960s" and substitute with ", have been revised a number of times, as the community develops, many other practice notes and guidelines are now available, some of which have superseded the functions of the HKPSG; on the other hand, planning guidelines that cater for district characteristics are still inadequate"; to add "and consolidate the related documents, enhance public participation in the town planning process" after "revise the HKPSG"; to delete "inter-departmental task group" after "and set up an" and substitute with "organization"; to delete "the Home Affairs Bureau and" after "comprising representatives from"; to add ", members of the public and the cultural sector as well as professionals" after "District Councils"; and to add "and monitoring" after "the co-ordination".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Yung-kan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, five against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and four abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Developing town planning and urban designs featuring local characteristics for the 18 districts", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following amendment to Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion:

To delete "and despite the addition of the part on Urban Design Guidelines at the end of last year, the limitations on district planning still remain unchanged," after "present-day circumstances,"; and to delete ", which takes no account of the local characteristics of various districts, expeditiously revise the HKPSG, and set up an inter-departmental task group comprising representatives from the Home Affairs Bureau and District Councils to undertake the co-ordination work, so as to facilitate the 18 districts in the territory to flexibly develop district-specific town planning and urban designs, having regard to their respective local characteristics" after "the existing planning policy" and substitute with "in partnership with civil society and under the primary principle of promoting public participation, and carry out long-term planning for Hong Kong in accordance with the concept of sustainable development, so as to break away from the present situation in which the use of land is dominated by private developers".

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix VII.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing replied.

Question on Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 1 December 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:26 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 24/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 08:14:52 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁劉柔芬議員對張超雄議員就「回復綜援金額至2003年6月1日之前的水平」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON MRS SOPHIE LEUNG TO DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "RESTORING COMPREHENSIVE SOCIAL SECURITY ASSISTANCE RATES TO THE LEVEL PRIOR TO 1 JUNE 2003"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	12	2	
反對 No	9	19	
棄權 Abstain	3	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉焯發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 24/11/2004
時間 TIME: 08:18:33 下午

動議 MOTION: 譚耀宗議員對張超雄議員就「回復綜援金額至2003年6月1日之前的水平」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON TAM YIU-CHUNG TO DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "RESTORING COMPREHENSIVE SOCIAL SECURITY ASSISTANCE RATES TO THE LEVEL PRIOR TO 1 JUNE 2003"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	9	10	
反對 No	1	6	
棄權 Abstain	14	12	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 24/11/2004
時間 TIME: 08:21:19 下午

動議 MOTION: 陳婉嫻議員就李華明議員對張超雄議員的「回復綜援金額至2003年6月1日之前的水平」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON CHAN YUEN-HAN'S AMENDMENT TO HON FRED LI'S AMENDMENT TO DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "RESTORING COMPREHENSIVE SOCIAL SECURITY ASSISTANCE RATES TO THE LEVEL PRIOR TO 1 JUNE 2003"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	7	10	
反對 No	14	9	
棄權 Abstain	3	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 24/11/2004
時間 TIME: 08:23:28 下午

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員對張超雄議員就「回復綜援金額至2003年6月1日之前的水平」動議 (~~經譚耀宗議員修正~~) 的議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON FRED LI TO DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "RESTORING COMPREHENSIVE SOCIAL SECURITY ASSISTANCE RATES TO THE LEVEL PRIOR TO 1 JUNE 2003" (~~AS AMENDED BY HON TAM YIU CHUNG~~)

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	6	18	
反對 No	14	3	
棄權 Abstain	4	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 24/11/2004
 時間 TIME: 08:26:54 下午

動議 MOTION: 「回復綜援金額至2003年6月1日之前的水平」議案
 MOTION "RESTORING COMPREHENSIVE SOCIAL SECURITY ASSISTANCE RATES TO THE LEVEL PRIOR TO 1 JUNE 2003"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	9	19	
反對 No	12	2	
棄權 Abstain	3	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 6
日期 DATE: 24/11/2004
時間 TIME: 11:19:58 下午

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員對劉秀成議員就「發展18區各具特色的都市規劃方案」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON LEE WING-TAT TO HON PATRICK LAU'S MOTION ON
"DEVELOPING TOWN PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGNS FEATURING LOCAL
CHARACTERISTICS FOR THE 18 DISTRICTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	9	12	
反對 No	5	6	
棄權 Abstain	10	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉卓發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 7
日期 DATE: 24/11/2004
時間 TIME: 11:23:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對劉秀成議員就「發展18區各具特色的都市規劃方案」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON PATRICK LAU'S MOTION ON
"DEVELOPING TOWN PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGNS FEATURING LOCAL
CHARACTERISTICS FOR THE 18 DISTRICTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	16	16	
反對 No	6	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES