

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 10

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 1 December 2004,
Thursday 2 December 2004 at 2:30 pm respectively

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP (absent on 2.12.2004)

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP (absent on 1.12.2004)

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip (absent on 2.12.2004)

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP (absent on 2.12.2004)

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung
The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin
The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

The Hon MA Lik, JP

Public officers attending:

On 1.12.2004 and 2.12.2004

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

On 1.12.2004

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration, and
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

On 2.12.2004

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Clerks in attendance:

On 1.12.2004 and 2.12.2004

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 1.12.2004

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

Other Papers

- No.31 - Emergency Relief Fund
Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending
31 March 2004 (published on 26.11.2004)

Questions

1. Hon KWONG Chi-kin asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

2. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

3. Hon CHAN Yuen-han asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

4. Hon Tommy CHEUNG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Hon James TIEN asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 6 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that Schedule 1 to the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance be amended, in paragraph 1A of Part III -

- (a) in subparagraph (a), by repealing "31 December 2004" and substituting "31 December 2005";
- (b) in subparagraph (b), by repealing "1 January 2005" and substituting "1 January 2006".

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam spoke on the motion as Chairman of the Subcommittee on the proposed resolution under section 4(2) of the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance (Cap. 109), and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

Seven Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that in relation to the -

- (a) Waste Disposal (Designated Waste Disposal Facility) (Amendment) Regulation 2004, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 165 of 2004; and
- (b) Waste Disposal (Charges for Disposal of Construction Waste) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 166 of 2004,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 3 November 2004, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 5 January 2005.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

That the Council do now adjourn

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of enabling Members, having regard to the Administration's and the Housing Authority's disregard for the motion passed by the Panel on Housing of this Council at its special meeting on 22 November this year that the Housing Authority should put the listing arrangements for The Real Estate Investment Trust ("The Link REIT") on hold until a consensus has been reached between The Link Management and the commercial tenants, to debate and express opinions on the listing and public offering arrangements, evaluation of assets and all matters relating to the divestment of retail and car-parking facilities in public rental housing estates in respect of The Link REIT.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and three Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG declared his interest as a member of Hong Kong Housing Authority and spoke on the motion.

A Member and Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke on the motion.

While Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another three Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

One more Member and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion.

At 7:53 pm, while Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three other Members and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion.

While Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, Hon CHIM Pui-chung drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung continued to speak.

Seven more Members spoke on the motion. After declaring his interest as a member of Hong Kong Housing Authority, Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the motion.

One more Member and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG replied.

Question on the motion put and negatived.

The President suspended the meeting at 11:13 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 2:30 pm on 2 December 2004.

Members' Motions

Implementing small class teaching

Hon Audrey EU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to progressively implement small class teaching in primary schools, and then in secondary schools, to enable teachers to tailor their teaching to students' varied abilities, so as to realize and achieve the goal of quality education, promote education reform and fulfil the expectations of parents, teachers and students.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Mrs Selina CHOW would move an amendment to the motion and that Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong would also move an amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion and addressed the Council:

To add "prudently assess the additional resources required for implementing small class teaching, weigh the commitments of both the Government and parents and, by ensuring that complementing training for teachers is available," after "urges the Government to"; and to delete ", and then in secondary schools," after "primary schools".

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion proposed.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment and addressed the Council:

To delete "prudently assess" after "the Government to" and substitute with "make optimal use of"; to delete "additional" before "resources"; to delete "required for implementing" after "resources" and substitute with "saved due to the drop in the primary and secondary school student population to provide training for teachers on"; to delete ", weigh the commitments of both the Government and parents and, by ensuring that complementing training for teachers is available" before ", progressively implement small class teaching" and substitute with "and, through a 'by district and by grade' mode of transition"; to delete "in" after "progressively implement small class teaching" and substitute with ", starting with"; and to add "and junior secondary forms," after "primary schools".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment proposed.

24 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Audrey EU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Audrey EU replied.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon Mrs Selina CHOW and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong put and agreed to.

Overall development of Chinese medicine practitioners

Hon LI Kwok-ying moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, whereas the professional status of Chinese medicine practitioners ("CMPs") has been established for quite a long time, the development of CMPs has been handicapped because the Government does not have a long-term development strategy for Chinese medicine, is not adequately involved in this regard, and fails to establish avenues for CMPs to receive professional training, this Council urges the Government to formulate a long-term policy on the development of CMPs, which should include:

- (a) expediting the expansion of the scope of services provided by CMPs in the public medical system, implementing the outstanding plan to set up 15 public Chinese medicine out-patient clinics, establishing a mechanism for public hospitals whereby their in-patients can seek joint consultation and treatment by CMPs, setting up a Chinese medicine in-patient department in public hospitals, and studying the establishment of a Chinese medicine hospital;
- (b) establishing a committee on the development of Chinese medicine, and formulating strategies and policies to facilitate the development of Chinese medicine, such as giving statutory status to the sick leave certificates issued by CMPs, and reviewing the medical equipment that CMPs are allowed to use; and
- (c) formulating a mechanism and avenues for CMPs to receive professional training.

While Hon LI Kwok-ying was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 6:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon LI Kwok-ying's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung, Hon Andrew CHENG and Hon Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung, Hon Andrew CHENG and Hon Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments. The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food was speaking, Hon James TIEN drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 7:20 pm, the President resumed the chair.

A quorum was then present and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food continued to speak.

A Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring his interest as the Honorary Consultant of Hong Kong Acupuncture and Moxibustion Association, Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Another eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LI Kwok-ying spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon LI Kwok-ying's motion:

To add "or provide proper registration avenues that cater for the CMPs' tradition of acquiring practice skills through apprenticeship or family succession, resulting in some 3 000 listed CMPs still not being able to become registered CMPs" after "to establish avenues for CMPs to receive professional training"; to delete "and" after "CMPs are allowed to use;"; and to add "; (d) having regard to the unique circumstances of CMPs and bone-setters who acquire their practice skills through apprenticeship or family succession, devising a more suitable examination system and syllabus for them, and arranging for the listed CMPs concerned to receive training before taking the examination, in order to enable them to become registered CMPs smoothly; and (e) reforming the compositions of the Chinese Medicine Council of Hong Kong and its various boards and committees, and enhancing their transparency and the representativeness of their members, so as to enable them to reflect a wide spectrum of opinions in

the sector" after "(c) formulating a mechanism and avenues for CMPs to receive professional training".

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon LI Kwok-ying's motion proposed and put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

After the division bell had stopped ringing, the Clerk drew the President's attention to the absence of a quorum. The President then directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present and the Council proceeded to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 14 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and five against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 16 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Overall development of Chinese medicine practitioners", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment if Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment was agreed. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

The President stated that as Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon Andrew CHENG to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following further amendment to Hon LI Kwok-ying motion as amended by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:
To delete "and" after "become registered CMPs smoothly;"; and to add "; (f) reviewing the levels of fees as well as the fee subsidy and waiver systems in respect of public Chinese medicine out-patient clinics, and considering subsidizing elderly recipients of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance payments who use the services of non-public Chinese medicine out-patient clinics; and (g) giving statutory status to the insurance claim forms, receipts and other documents issued by CMPs, and reviewing CMPs' rights and responsibilities in the referral of patients" after "opinions in the sector".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon LI Kwok-ying's motion as amended by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LI Kwok-ying replied.

Question on Hon LI Kwok-ying's motion as amended by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon Andrew CHENG put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 8 December 2004 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 9:11 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 02/12/2004
時間 TIME: 06:20:30 下午

動議 MOTION: 張文光議員就周梁淑怡議員對余若薇議員的「落實小班教學」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG'S AMENDMENT TO HON MRS SELINA CHOW'S AMENDMENT TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "IMPLEMENTING SMALL CLASS TEACHING"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	25	
投票 Vote	21	24	
贊成 Yes	12	17	
反對 No	7	2	
棄權 Abstain	2	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 02/12/2004
時間 TIME: 06:24:55 下午

動議 MOTION: 周梁淑怡議員就余若薇議員的「落實小班教學」議案，提出經張文光議員修正的修正案
HON MRS SELINA CHOW'S AMENDMENT, AS AMENDED BY HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG, TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "IMPLEMENTING SMALL CLASS TEACHING"

動議人 MOVED BY: 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	25	
投票 Vote	21	24	
贊成 Yes	13	16	
反對 No	1	1	
棄權 Abstain	7	7	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 02/12/2004
時間 TIME: 09:07:05 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁耀忠議員對李國英議員就「中醫的整體發展」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG YIU-CHUNG TO HON LI KWOK-YING'S MOTION ON
"OVERALL DEVELOPMENT OF CHINESE MEDICINE PRACTITIONERS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	14	16	
投票 Vote	14	15	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	5	1	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES