

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 19

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 23 February 2005 at 2:30 pm

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long  
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP  
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP  
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS  
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung  
The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG  
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin  
The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP  
The Hon MA Lik, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration  
  
The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP  
The Secretary for Justice  
  
The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands  
  
The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour  
  
Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP

Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
Air Transport (Licensing of Air Services) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulation 2004 (Commencement) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 18.2.2004)	17/2005

### **Other Papers**

- No.56 - Hong Kong Arts Development Council  
Annual Report 2003-2004 (published on 16.2.2005)
- No.57 - The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts Annual  
Report 2003-2004 and the Financial Statements and  
Auditor's Report for the year ended 30 June 2004  
(published on 16.2.2005)
- No.58 - Li Po Chun Charitable Trust Fund  
Annual Report for the period from 1 September 2003  
to 31 August 2004 (published on 17.2.2005)
- No.59 - Equal Opportunities Commission  
Annual Report 2003/04 (published on 18.2.2005)
- No.60 - Audited Statement of Accounts together with the  
Director of Audit's Report and Trustee's Report on  
the Administration of the Education Scholarships  
Fund for the year ending 31 August 2004 (published  
on 18.2.2005)
- No.61 - Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the  
Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts  
of the Government of the Hong Kong Special  
Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March  
2004 and the Results of Value for Money Audits  
(Report No. 43) (February 2005 - P.A.C. Report No. 41)  
(published on 23.2.2005)

### **Address**

Dr Hon Philip WONG, Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's report on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2004 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 43).

**Questions**

1. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

3. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

6. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 19 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Taking forward the issues of concern to the elderly**

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the ageing of the population in Hong Kong, this Council urges the Government, in response to the recommendations made by nine major elderly and social service organizations and elderly groups, to formulate a sustainable policy on care for the elderly and pursue vigorous measures to take forward the "six issues of most concern to the elderly", that are identified by the elders in various districts after discussion and from polling, which include:

- (a) Long-term care: reinforcing the continuum of community and residential care services, and rendering support to carers of the elderly;
- (b) Medical services: alleviating the burden of medical expenses on the elderly, and enhancing the efficiency of medical services;
- (c) Disease prevention: introducing health care schemes for the elderly, and improving environmental hygiene;
- (d) Mental health: promoting activities which foster a sense of health and worthiness among the elderly, and strengthening the rehabilitation and outreaching services for the elderly;
- (e) Retirement protection: studying the establishment of a community-wide retirement protection scheme, and providing support for the elderly who opt for returning to their hometowns in the Mainland to spend their twilight years; and
- (f) Prevention of elderly abuse: enacting legislation to protect the elderly, providing shelter support for the elderly, and advocating the culture of respect for the elderly and filial piety,

with a view to continuously improving the quality of life of the elderly and building a society with concern and care for the elderly.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed.

The President stated that Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Two Members and Hon Daniel LAM spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Daniel LAM was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another 13 Members and Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 6:57 pm, while Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Six more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion:

To delete "'six" after "to take forward the" and substitute with "seven"; to delete "'", that are identified by the elders in various districts after discussion and from polling" after "concern to the elderly"; to delete "and" after "retirement protection scheme,"; to add ", and allowing the elderly who live with their families to apply independently for Comprehensive Social Security Assistance" after "their twilight years" and delete "and" after the subsequent ";"; and to add "; and (g) Accommodation for the elderly: helping the elderly with financial difficulties to solve their accommodation problems, including the introduction of a grading system for residential care homes for the elderly (RCHEs) in Hong Kong so as to give the elderly greater confidence in living in RCHEs; building more small public rental housing (PRH) units with suitable supporting social services to accommodate them; studying the relaxation of the eligibility criteria for PRH of the elderly who live in their self-owned old properties, and allowing them to put their properties under the trusteeship of non-governmental organizations and to use the rental income to pay for their living expenses, so that they can enjoy a peaceful life" after "filial piety".



Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The President stated that Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG had indicated that she would withdraw her amendment if Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment was agreed. Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG had therefore withdrawn her amendment.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung replied.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put and agreed to.

### **Policy on the recycling industry**

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to implement as early as possible a sustainable development plan, which includes formulating a long-term policy on the recycling industry, implementing the development plan of the "Recovery Park", considering the imposition of a reasonable green tax, and establishing a high-level inter-departmental industries facilitation council to co-ordinate the communication and co-operation among various departments in a highly efficient manner so as to enhance public awareness of environmental protection and instill in them the correct attitude to handling wastes, with a view to solving the aggravating environmental pollution problem in Hong Kong as early as possible, as well as creating business opportunities and increasing job opportunities.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LEE Wing-tat, Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon CHAN Yuen-han would move amendments to the motion. In

accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEE Wing-tat, Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon Hon CHAN Yuen-han respectively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

12 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion:

To delete "a" after "as early as possible" and substitute with "principles on"; to delete "plan" after "sustainable development"; to delete "includes" after "which" and substitute with "include"; to add "on recycling" after "facilitation council"; and to add "; furthermore, this Council proposes that the Government should: (a) provide additional recycling bins for various types of wastes in public places, major shopping malls, schools and government organizations, etc. to increase recovery quantities, and designate spaces at large refuse collection depots and other major locations as waste recovery points where recyclable waste collectors can collect and transport the waste away; as regards the refuse collection depots where waste recovery points cannot be designated, the Government should consider setting up waste transit centres to facilitate the collection and delivery of wastes by cleaning companies and waste collectors; (b) include in its contracts for outsourcing cleaning services terms of recovery work, and stipulate a waste recovery rate in these contracts; (c) set down a specific target recovery rate as an indicator for recyclable wastes such as paper, tyres, plastic products, and study the imposition of a green tax on manufacturers of certain specified recyclable wastes; (d) for the purposes of creating a local green market and bringing about steady users of green products, encourage public organizations, subvented organizations and schools, etc. to take the lead in promoting the use of recycled products and to specify a ratio for the procurement of recycled products, as well as encourage them to purchase local or foreign recycled products in order to promote the development of waste recovery and recycling industries; and (e) enact local eco-labelling legislation to step up the monitoring of eco-labelling, so as to protect consumer rights and encourage green purchasing" after "job opportunities".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHOY So-yuk claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 14 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Policy on the recycling industry", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion:

To add "that adheres to the waste disposal strategy premised on the reduction, recovery and reuse of wastes" after "development plan"; to add "implementing the polluters pay principle," after "which includes"; to add "devising respective schemes on waste separation at source for various trades and communities," after "the recycling industry,"; and to add "priority should be given by government departments to using locally manufactured recycled products," after "reasonable green tax,".

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon CHOY so-yuk's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon CHAN Yuen-han to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han moved the following further amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; furthermore, the Government should also implement measures in order that the waste recycling and export industries can be retained and developed, and should set up large regional recyclable collection centres outside the 'Recovery Park' as well as establish a network for collecting

recyclable waste in various districts across the territory, so as to increase the opportunities for grass-roots workers and operators of small-scale enterprises to join the recycling industry" after "increasing job opportunities".

Question on Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen replied.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon CHAN Yuen-han put and agreed to.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 2 March 2005 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:08 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 23/02/2005  
時間 TIME: 08:22:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊森議員對譚耀宗議員就「落實長者關注議題」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY DR HON YEUNG SUM TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON  
"TAKING FORWARD THE ISSUES OF CONCERN TO THE ELDERLY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	27	
投票 Vote	22	26	
贊成 Yes	14	19	
反對 No	6	2	
棄權 Abstain	2	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
曾培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 23/02/2005  
 時間 TIME: 10:59:51 下午

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員對梁君彥議員就「環保回收工業政策」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE WING-TAT TO HON ANDREW LEUNG'S MOTION ON  
 "POLICY ON THE RECYCLING INDUSTRY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	20	
投票 Vote	22	19	
贊成 Yes	8	14	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	14	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	