

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 20

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 2 March 2005 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon MA Lik, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP

The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP

Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP

Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP

Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Declaration of Markets Notice (Amendment) Declaration 2005 (gazetted on 25.2.2005)	18/2005
2. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Designation of Public Markets) (Amendment of Tenth Schedule) Order 2005 (gazetted on 25.2.2005)	19/2005

Questions

1. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

3. Hon LI Kwok-ying asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

6. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 18 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Expectations for the Commission on Poverty

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Chief Executive announced in his Policy Address delivered early this year the establishment of the Commission on Poverty ("the Commission"), and the Commission, from its incubation to its present inception, lacks a clear positioning and specific plans in regard to the direction for alleviating poverty as well as its mode of operation, this Council urges the Government to vigorously adopt the following proposals regarding the Commission's direction, operation and efforts to promote community engagement:

- (a) setting a clear and definite direction for alleviating poverty, and defining the Commission's role and the values behind it;
- (b) establishing a benchmark for measuring poverty so as to accurately analyze and assess the problem of poverty in the community, and clearly defining the target

recipients of assistance so as to enable a more effective use of resources;

- (c) studying the causes of poverty in Hong Kong, examining the overall social structure and existing systems, and identifying the areas of poverty that need to be studied, such as poverty among children and the elderly, working poverty, secondary safety net and the review of the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme, etc;
- (d) as the coverage of the Commission's present membership is inadequate, appointing to the Commission such additional members as representatives from policy bureaux and relevant executive departments responsible for the housing and transport portfolios, etc, as well as from public transport operators, so as to take account of the various aspects of the daily life of the poor;
- (e) co-ordinating various policy bureaux and their departments in formulating specific plans for alleviating poverty, establishing feasible and clear objectives for alleviating poverty and setting specific implementation timetables, as well as requiring various departments to submit reports to the Commission on a regular basis, with the latter reporting to the public on the progress of its work and briefing the public after each of its meetings;
- (f) setting up an evaluation mechanism for assessing the implications of individual policies on the disparity between the rich and the poor in the community, whereby all new policies and initiatives launched by policy bureaux and departments must be subject to such assessment and be adjusted as appropriate before implementation, and all existing relevant legislation and policies must also undergo this assessment; and
- (g) promoting community engagement and the building of partnerships, encouraging the business sector to give support and fulfil their corporate social responsibility, and devolving powers and allocating resources to district organizations and, by making effective use of their flexibility, responding appropriately to the needs of various districts having regard to their different poverty situations, as well as holding regular public forums to enable public

participation in the course of formulating the policies on poverty alleviation.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Mrs Selina CHOW would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "the Commission, from its incubation to its present inception, lacks a clear positioning and specific plans in regard to the direction for alleviating poverty as well as its mode of operation" after "(the Commission'), and" and substitute with "in order that the work of the Commission can better meet the public's expectations"; to delete "establishing a benchmark for measuring poverty so as to accurately analyze and assess the problem of poverty in the community, and clearly" after "(b)" and substitute with "endeavouring to help those who are most in need when"; to delete "and relevant executive departments" after "representatives from policy bureaux"; to delete "and" after "responsible for the housing" and substitute with ","; to add ", and commerce and industry" after "transport"; to delete "as well as from public transport operators," after "portfolios, etc,"; to delete "community" after "(g) promoting" and substitute with "community-wide"; to delete "encouraging" after "building of partnerships," and substitute with "creating conditions for"; and to delete "give support and fulfil their corporate social responsibility, and devolving powers and allocating resources to district organizations and, by making effective use of their flexibility," after "the business sector to" and substitute with "actively participate in alleviating poverty and".

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

Three Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Having declared her interest as the member of the Commission on Poverty, Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Another two Members and Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon WONG Ting-kwong was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

17 more Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendment.

The Financial Secretary spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:39 pm, while the Financial Secretary was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion put and agreed to.

Hon LEE Wing-tat rose and requested to move a motion for adjournment of the Council under Rule 16(2) of the Rules of Procedure for the purpose of debating "the rumoured resignation of the Chief Executive and the clarification to be made and measures to be taken by the Government."

The President stated that Hon LEE Wing-tat and four other Members had gone to her office some minutes ago, when she was taking a rest, to seek her permission to move the motion for adjournment. After careful consideration of the terms of the motion, she was of the view that as the subject of the motion was based on rumours rather than facts, she was not satisfied that the adjournment was for the purpose of discussing an issue of public urgent importance. Therefore, she ruled out the request.

Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon Margaret NG sought clarifications on the President's ruling and the President replied.

Scheme of Control Agreements of the two power companies and the long-term energy policy

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Scheme of Control Agreements of the two power companies will expire in 2008, this Council requests the Government to seriously consider the following principles in order to decide on the way forward for the future development of the electricity market:

- (a) tariffs charged by the power companies should be reasonable;
- (b) the mechanism for tariff adjustments should be more transparent;
- (c) any new scheme of control agreements should have adequate flexibility and should allow for a review within a reasonable number of years;
- (d) more considerations should be taken into account in determining the rate of return; and
- (e) the stability and safety in the supply of electricity should be maintained;

furthermore, the Government should also study the feasibility of establishing an energy authority with the responsibility of formulating a long-term and comprehensive energy policy.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move amendments to the motion and that Hon Fred LI would also move an amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the three amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing respectively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI and nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion:

To add ", and a study should be conducted on the introduction of a mechanism that allows both upward and downward tariff adjustments" after "should be more transparent"; to add "permitted" after "should be taken into account in determining the"; to delete "; and" after "rate of return" and substitute with ", and the rate should be reduced; (e) effective measures should be adopted to minimize the emissions of pollutants in the generation of electricity; (f) the power companies should be encouraged to develop and introduce the use of renewable energy; and"; and to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(g)".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Tommy CHEUNG, who was to move the next amendment, was not in the Chamber, the President suspended the meeting at 9:59 pm.

The Council resumed at 10:03 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The President stated that as Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon Tommy CHEUNG to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "renewable energy;"; and to add "(h) the full implementation of power interconnection should be actively studied; and (i) the power companies should use more environmentally friendly energy sources;" after "should be maintained;".

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam proposed.

Hon Fred LI moved the following revised amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "the full implementation of" after "(h)"; and to delete "actively studied" after "power interconnection should be" and substitute with "fully implemented so as to introduce competition".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 16 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, four against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Scheme of Control Agreements of the two power companies and the long-term energy policy", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion which had been amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam put.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 16 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies

through direct elections, 19 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and four abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The President stated that as Hon CHAN Kam-lam's and Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendments had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Tommy CHEUNG and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "should be actively studied;"; and to add "and (j) the power companies must allow greater participation of staff unions in formulating their operation and development strategies, so as to tap the professional input from their staff;" after "environmentally friendly energy sources;".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion which had been amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Tommy CHEUNG proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 16 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, five against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEE Wing-tat replied.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Tommy CHEUNG put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 16 were present, 12 were in favour of the motion and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Tommy CHEUNG was carried.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 9 March 2005 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 10:25 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 21 
 日期 DATE: 02/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 07:44:01 下午

動議 MOTION: 周梁淑怡議員對馮檢基議員就「對扶貧委員會的期望」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON MRS SELINA CHOW TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON
 "EXPECTATIONS FOR THE COMMISSION ON POVERTY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	20	
投票 Vote	24	19	
贊成 Yes	14	4	
反對 No	9	15	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK 

投票 VOTE: 82
 日期 DATE: 02/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 10:13:52 下午

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員就張宇人議員(經陳鑑林議員修正)對李永達議員的「兩電管制計劃協議及長遠能源政策」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
 HON FRED LI'S AMENDMENT TO HON TOMMY CHEUNG'S AMENDMENT (AS AMENDED BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM) TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON "SCHEME OF CONTROL AGREEMENTS OF THE TWO POWER COMPANIES AND THE LONG-TERM ENERGY POLICY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	16	19	
投票 Vote	16	18	
贊成 Yes	7	12	
反對 No	4	0	
棄權 Abstain	5	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: ³
 日期 DATE: 02/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 10:17:04 下午

動議 MOTION: 張宇人議員對李永達議員就「兩電管制計劃協議及長遠能源政策」所提，經陳鑑林議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON TOMMY CHEUNG TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON "SCHEME OF CONTROL AGREEMENTS OF THE TWO POWER COMPANIES AND THE LONG-TERM ENERGY POLICY" AS AMENDED BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM

動議人 MOVED BY: 張宇人Tommy CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	16	19	
投票 Vote	16	18	
贊成 Yes	11	12	
反對 No	4	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	4	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK 

投票 VOTE: 5/4
 日期 DATE: 02/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 10:20:42 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對李永達議員就「兩電管制計劃協議及長遠能源政策」所提，經陳鑑林議員、／及／張宇人議員／及李華明議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON "SCHEME OF CONTROL AGREEMENTS OF THE TWO POWER COMPANIES AND THE LONG-TERM ENERGY POLICY" AS AMENDED BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM, /AND/ HON TOMMY CHEUNG /AND/ HON FRED LI

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	16	19	
投票 Vote	16	18	
贊成 Yes	7	17	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	4	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鐘泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國賢	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kyong			李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權	ABSTAIN
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai			涂謹申	James TO		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
黃容琪	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES
楊幸華	Howard YOUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
劉健榮	Miriam LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEN	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
李國尉	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
林達強	Daniel LAM			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林建鋒	Jeffrey LAM	棄權	ABSTAIN	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁智彥	Andrew LEUNG			李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying		
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
黃楚九	WONG Ting-kyong			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
曾培志	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
劉秀英	Patrick LAU	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES

投票 VOTE: 6 5
 日期 DATE: 02/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 10:24:02 下午

動議 MOTION: 由李永達議員動議，經陳鑑林議員、及張宇人議員、及李華明議員及王國興議員修正的「兩電管制計劃協議及長遠能源政策」議案
 MOTION MOVED BY HON LEE WING-TAT ON "SCHEME OF CONTROL AGREEMENTS OF THE TWO POWER COMPANIES AND THE LONG-TERM ENERGY POLICY" AS AMENDED BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM, /AND/ HON TOMMY CHEUNG, /AND HON FRED LI /AND/ HON WONG KWOK-HING

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	16	19	
投票 Vote	16	18	
贊成 Yes	12	16	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	4	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
曾培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO