

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 21

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 March 2005 at 2:30 pm and
Thursday 10 March 2005 at 9:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH (absent on 10.3.2005)

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (absent on 10.3.2005)

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

On 9.3.2005

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

On 9.3.2005 and 10.3.2005

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

On 9.3.2005 and 10.3.2005

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

On 9.3.2005

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Fixed Penalty (Public Cleanliness Offences) Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) Order 2005 (gazetted on 4.3.2005)	20/2005
2. Magistrates Ordinance (Amendment of Fourth Schedule) Order 2005 (gazetted on 4.3.2005)	21/2005
3. Telecommunications (Telecommunications Apparatus) (Exemption from Licensing) (Amendment) Order 2005 (gazetted on 4.3.2005)	22/2005
4. Telecommunications (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 4.3.2005)	23/2005
5. Telecommunications (Carrier Licences) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 4.3.2005)	24/2005
6. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 4.3.2005)	25/2005
7. Interest and Surcharge on Arrears of Maintenance Ordinance 2003 (Commencement) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 4.3.2005)	26/2005

Other Papers

No.62	-	Audited Statement of Accounts of the Language Fund for the year ended 31 August 2004, together with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 2.3.2005)
No.63	-	Employees' Compensation Insurance Levies Management Board Annual Report 2003/2004 (published on 3.3.2005)
No.64	-	Employees Compensation Assistance Fund Board Annual Report 2003/2004 (published on 3.3.2005)
No.65	-	Occupational Deafness Compensation Board Annual Report 2003-2004 (published on 3.3.2005)
No.66	-	Pneumoconiosis Compensation Fund Board Annual Report 2003 (published on 3.3.2005)

- No.67 - Report of the Committee on Members' Interests on its consideration of the cases of Hon James TO's failure to register interests with the Clerk to the Legislative Council pursuant to Rule 83 of the Rules of Procedure (published on 9.3.2005)

Address

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG, Chairman of the Committee on Members' Interests, addressed the Council on the Committee's report on its consideration of the cases of Hon James TO's failure to register interests with the Clerk to the Legislative Council pursuant to Rule 83 of the Rules of Procedure.

Questions

1. Hon KWONG Chi-kin asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.
2. In accordance with Rule 26(6) of the Rules of Procedure, Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 2 on behalf of Hon CHAN Kam-lam, who was absent.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.
3. Hon Martin LEE asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.
4. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

6. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2005
Aviation Security (Amendment) Bill 2005

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2005

The Secretary for Justice moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Aviation Security (Amendment) Bill 2005

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Merchant Shipping (Limitation of Shipowners Liability) (Amendment) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 26 January 2005 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Merchant Shipping (Limitation of Shipowners Liability) (Amendment) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1 to 20 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour reported that

the Merchant Shipping (Limitation of Shipowners Liability) (Amendment) Bill 2005

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Seeking papers, books, records and documents regarding the Cyberport project

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, pursuant to section 9(1) of the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382), this Council orders the Private Secretary to the Chief Executive of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to attend before the Council on 6 April 2005 to produce any papers, books, records or documents in relation to any meeting held between the Chief Executive and Mr Richard Li Tzar-kai, Chairman of the Pacific Century Group ("PCG"), during the period from 1998 to 1999 regarding the Cyberport project, and orders the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to attend before the Council on 6 April 2005 to produce any papers, books, records or documents in relation to the following matters:

- (a) the Government's deliberations of the Cyberport project and any other similar projects before September 1998;
- (b) the negotiations between the Government and the PCG concerning the Cyberport project;
- (c) any internal discussion and follow-up action within the Government between August 1998 and May 1999 regarding the Cyberport project, including but not limited to the internal discussions and follow-up actions of the working group referred to by the then Secretary for Information Technology and Broadcasting in his letter dated 14 January 1999 to the PCG; and
- (d) the Government's decision to drop the take-up guarantee proposed by the PCG, which was originally stated in the Letter of Intent.

While Hon LEE Wing-tat was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 5:17 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Six Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert HO drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 6:19 pm, the President resumed the chair. A quorum was then present.

Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:23 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another four Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion.

At 7:16 pm, while Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three further Members and the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology spoke on the motion.

Three more Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology spoke again.

Hon LEE Wing-tat replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 18 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the motion and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Hon Albert HO rose to request to move, without notice a motion for adjournment of the Council under Rule 16(2) of the Rules of Procedure for the purpose of debating "the rumoured resignation of the Chief Executive and the proposed relevant by-election arrangements and the corresponding measures", and explained his request.

The President stated that Hon Albert HO had in advance informed her of his intention to raise the request. She did not stop him from explaining his request, as she had allowed Hon LEE Wing-tat to do so at the last Council meeting when he made the same request. The President stated that as she had already ruled on Hon Albert HO's request, which had been copied to Members, she did not want to use the Council's time to discuss the matter. She appreciated that Hon Albert HO and others considered the subject matter of the rumour important. Members and the public might wish to express their views on this. However, as the President, she must rule in accordance with the Rules of Procedure and, in particular, whether the matter proposed for debate was of urgent public importance.

As the subject matter of the proposed motion was based on a rumour rather than fact, she could not approve the request.

Shortcomings of functional constituencies

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council considers that any constitutional reform proposal which involves an increase in the numbers of functional constituency seats in the Legislative Council and of the members representing functional constituencies in the Election Committee violates Articles 45 and 68 of the Basic Law, which stipulate that the principles of "gradual and orderly progress" and "actual situation" should be followed in achieving the aim of universal suffrage; and requests the Government to state clearly in the Fifth Report of the Constitutional Development Task Force that any so-called "mainstream proposal" which will be put forward in the future will not include proposals to increase the numbers of functional constituency seats in the Legislative Council and of the members representing functional constituencies in the Election Committee.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion proposed.

The President stated that Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion and addressed the Council:

To add "; furthermore, to achieve the aim of universal suffrage, the Report should also, on the basis of no increase in the number of functional constituency seats, stipulate the specific proposal to increase the number of geographical constituency seats" after "will not include proposals to increase the numbers of functional constituency seats in the Legislative Council and of the members representing functional constituencies in the Election Committee".

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion proposed.

Four Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and another five Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

The President suspended the meeting at 10:00 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 10 March 2005 to continue to debate the motion on Shortcomings of functional constituencies moved by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and the amendment to the motion moved by Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Another 23 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion put.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, one was in favour of the amendment and 26 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 19 were against the amendment and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah replied.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion put.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 29 were present, seven were in favour of the motion and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 17 were in favour of the motion and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two

groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG rose to request to move, without notice, a motion for adjournment of the Council under Rule 16(2) of the Rules of Procedure for the purpose of debating "the rumoured resignation of the Chief Executive and the proposed relevant by-election arrangements and the corresponding measures".

The President suspended the meeting at 12:10 pm to consider the request.

The Council resumed at 12:40 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The President stated that she had explained to Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG that she would not approve his request to move the motion under Rule 16(2) of the Rules of Procedure, and Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG had then indicated to her that he would like to move the motion on adjournment in accordance with Rule 16(4) of the Rules of Procedure. Under the subrule, a motion might only be moved at the conclusion of all the business on the agenda, and the mover had to give notice in writing no less than 7 clear days before the meeting, provided that the President might waive the notice requirement. She would, in accordance with past practice, approve the request for waiver if it was supported by the House Committee. As there would be no House Committee meeting before the Council meeting was adjourned, she would follow a precedent at the Council meeting held on 3 July 2003, in which she had waived the notice requirement for Dr Hon YEUNG Sum to move a motion under Rule 16(4) of the Rules of Procedure after he had got the support of more than 30 Members. The President stated that Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG had indicated that he would solicit Members' support for him to move the motion.

Defending sovereignty over the Diaoyutai Islands

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council strongly protests against the Japanese Government's unlawful occupation of the Diaoyutai Islands which are within the territory of our country, and urges our Government and people to defend our sovereignty over the Diaoyutai Islands.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Federick FUNG spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:50 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Another three Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 1:28 pm, the President resumed the chair.

Next Meeting

As a quorum was not present 15 minutes after Members had been summoned, in accordance with Rule 17(2) of the Rules of Procedure, the President adjourned the Council until 2.30 p.m. on 16 March 2005.

The Council was adjourned at 1:30 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 09/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 08:30:35 下午

動議 MOTION: 「索取有關數碼港計劃的文據、簿冊、紀錄及文件」議案
 MOTION "SEEKING PAPERS, BOOKS, RECORDS AND DOCUMENTS REGARDING THE CYBERPORT PROJECT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達 LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	25	
投票 Vote	28	24	
贊成 Yes	8	18	
反對 No	18	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 10/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 12:00:11 下午

動議 MOTION: 郭家麒議員對湯家驊議員就「功能界別的弊端」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON KWOK KA-KI TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON
 "SHORTCOMINGS OF FUNCTIONAL CONSTITUENCIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	21	
投票 Vote	27	20	
贊成 Yes	1	0	
反對 No	26	19	
棄權 Abstain	0	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: X 3
 日期 DATE: 10/03/2005
 時間 TIME: 12:06:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 「功能界別的弊端」議案
 MOTION "SHORTCOMINGS OF FUNCTIONAL CONSTITUENCIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	29	24	
投票 Vote	29	23	
贊成 Yes	7	17	
反對 No	22	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK