

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 25

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 27 April 2005 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Education and Manpower

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (United Kingdom) Order (gazetted on 22.4.2005)	51/2005
2. Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (United States of America) Order (gazetted on 22.4.2005)	52/2005
3. Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2005 (gazetted on 22.4.2005)	53/2005
4. Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) Order 2005 (gazetted on 22.4.2005)	54/2005
5. Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (Vietnam) Order (gazetted on 22.4.2005)	55/2005
6. Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) (No. 2) Order 2005 (gazetted on 22.4.2005)	56/2005
7. Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) (No. 2) Order 2005 (gazetted on 22.4.2005)	57/2005

Other Papers

- No.83 - Annual Report 2003-2004 of the Hospital Authority, which contains Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report (published on 25.4.2005)
- No.84 - Report and Statement of Accounts of the Samaritan Fund, together with the Director of Audit's Report, for the year ended 31 March 2004 (published on 25.4.2005)
- No.85 - Approved Estimates of Income and Expenditure for the financial year 2005/2006, Securities and Futures Commission (published on 25.4.2005)
- No.86 - Annual Report 2004 Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation (published on 27.4.2005)

Questions

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Bills

First Reading

Building Management (Amendment) Bill 2005
Protection of Endangered Species of Animals and Plants Bill
Revenue (Allowances for Tax) Bill 2005
Immigration (Amendment) Bill 2005
Child Care Services (Amendment) Bill 2005

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Building Management (Amendment) Bill 2005

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Protection of Endangered Species of Animals and Plants Bill

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Revenue (Allowances for Tax) Bill 2005

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Immigration (Amendment) Bill 2005

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Child Care Services (Amendment) Bill 2005

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Appropriation Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 16 March 2005 resumed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration, the Secretary for Justice, the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food, the Secretary for Education and Manpower and the Secretary for the Civil Service spoke on the motion.

While the Secretary for the Civil Service was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:16 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Security, the Secretary for Home Affairs, the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs, the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the motion.

At 1:15 pm, while the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour, the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 53 Members were present, 46 were in favour of the motion and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Appropriation Bill 2005**.

In accordance with Rule 68 of the Rules of Procedure, the Committee first considered the schedule to the Bill.

Question that the sums for heads 21 to 28, 30, 31, 33, 35, 37, 39, 42, 44 to 49, 51, 53, 55, 59, 60, 62, 63, 70, 72, 74, 76, 78, 79, 80, 82, 90, 91, 92, 94, 95, 96, 100, 106, 112, 114, 116, 118, 120, 121, 136, 138, 142, 143, 145, 147, 148, 149, 151, 152, 155, 156, 158, 159, 160, 162, 163, 166, 168, 170, 173, 174, 180, 181, 184, 186, 188, 190 and 194 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon Albert HO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$45,530,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

Five Members and the Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon Albert HO spoke again.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung requested to speak.

The Chairman reminded Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that the Committee was debating the amendment to Head 122 of the schedule. Hon

LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed his wish to protest against the interpretation of the Basic Law by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress. The Chairman reminded Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that it was not the appropriate time for him to make the protest as the Committee was debating an amendment to a bill. She warned him that if he insisted on doing so, she would treat it as "grossly disorderly conduct" and order him to withdraw from the meeting.

Ignoring the Chairman's warning, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to protest against the interpretation of the Basic Law. The Chairman then ordered him to withdraw from the meeting immediately.

As Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung made no move to withdraw from the Committee, but continued to speak, the Chairman suspended the meeting at 3:06 pm. During the suspension, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung withdrew from the Chamber.

The Committee resumed at 3:12 pm.

The Chairman stated that Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung had intentionally disregarded and contravened the Rules of Procedure by behaving in an improper manner. She expressed regrets that, as a Legislative Council Member, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung had insisted on behaving as he liked. She hoped that the public would understand that it was the behaviour of a single Member and it had nothing to do with other Members. She stated that she could at the most order a Member contravening the Rules of Procedure and behaving in a grossly disorderly manner to withdraw from the Council for the remainder of the meeting.

Another Member spoke on the amendment.

One Member who had spoken and the Secretary for Security spoke again.

One more Member spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security spoke another time.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the

two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the clauses, the schedule or remaining amendments to the schedule of the Appropriation Bill 2005, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Albert HO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$80,000,000 in respect of subhead 103 and addressed the Committee.

Three Members spoke on the amendment.

Two Members who had spoken spoke again.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon Albert HO spoke again.

One Member who had spoken spoke again.

Hon Albert HO spoke another time.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 21 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the sum for head 144 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved that head 144 be reduced by \$3,232,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

Three Members and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke again.

Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke on the amendment. After he had spoken, Hon Albert CHAN sought elucidation on a remark made by him, and he elucidated.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 22 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 144 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Financial Secretary reported that

the Appropriation Bill 2005

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 55 Members were present, 48 were in favour of the motion and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 28 April 2005 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 5:36 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 27/04/2005
 時間 TIME: 02:16:45 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年撥款條例草案》- 二讀
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2005 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :53
 投票 Vote :52
 贊成 Yes :46
 反對 No :6
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	JAMES TO			李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 27/04/2005
時間 TIME: 03:23:36 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目122削減45,530,000元
APPROPRIATION BILL 2005 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$45,530,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	19	
投票 Vote	27	18	
贊成 Yes	5	6	
反對 No	22	12	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 27/04/2005
時間 TIME: 04:24:44 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目103而將總目122削減80,000,000元
APPROPRIATION BILL 2005 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$80,000,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 103

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	20	
投票 Vote	26	19	
贊成 Yes	3	9	
反對 No	21	10	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 27/04/2005
時間 TIME: 05:27:01 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目144削減3,232,000元
APPROPRIATION BILL 2005 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 144 BE REDUCED BY \$3,232,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	25	
投票 Vote	28	24	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	22	11	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 27/04/2005
 時間 TIME: 05:33:40 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年撥款條例草案》- 三讀
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2005 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :55
 投票 Vote :54
 贊成 Yes :48
 反對 No :6
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO			李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES