

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 27

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 4 May 2005 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP  
The Hon MA Lik, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP  
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP  
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS  
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung  
The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG  
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin  
The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Member absent:**

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP

Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

### Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Road Traffic (Registration and Licensing of Vehicles) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 29.4.2005)	58/2005
2. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 3) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 29.4.2005)	59/2005
3. Legal Practitioners (Amendment) Ordinance 1998 (Commencement) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 29.4.2005)	60/2005

### Other Paper

Report of the Subcommittee to Study the Eastern Harbour Crossing Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2005 (published on 4.5.2005)

### Addresses

With the prior consent of the President, Hon LAU Kong-wah, Chairman of the Subcommittee to Study the Eastern Harbour Crossing Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2005, addressed the Council on the Subcommittee's Report on the Eastern Harbour Crossing Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2005, which was subsidiary legislation laid on the table of the Council on 6 April 2005.

Also with the prior consent of the President, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Andrew CHENG consecutively addressed the Council on the aforesaid Notice.

While addressing the Council, Hon Andrew CHENG stated that his speech had deviated from the contents of the address he had submitted to the President earlier. The President stated that she had noted but had allowed this as she considered that Hon Andrew CHENG's address was not provoking a debate. However, she reminded him that, if a Member's address contained accusations which the accused Member/public officer felt obliged to respond, she would have to allow the latter to do so in order to be fair, but this would lead to a breach of the Rules of Procedure, which stipulated that no debate should arise on Members' addresses on subsidiary legislation. For this reason, Members' addresses should stick to the addresses submitted to her when seeking her approval to address the Council.

Hon LEE Wing-tat raised two points of order regarding whether Members were required to submit their addresses on subsidiary legislation to the President in advance, and whether the absence of the designated public officer concerned would have an impact on whether Members would be allowed to address the Council on subsidiary legislation.

The President stated that the attendance of any public officer had never been a factor for considering whether to allow Members to make addresses on subsidiary legislation. Designated public officers were also required to submit their addresses to the President. There had been precedents in which she had asked public officers to strike out parts of their addresses which might provoke debates. Although Hon Andrew CHENG's address had deviated from that submitted in advance, she had not intervened because the viewpoints in his address had been raised at meetings of the Subcommittee. The President also drew Hon LEE Wing-tat's attention to Rule 2 of the House Rules, which stipulated that a Member seeking the President's consent to address the Council on subsidiary legislation should provide an advance copy of the intended address, to enable the President to decide whether the address might provoke a debate.

Hon Miriam LAU then addressed the Council on the aforesaid Notice.

### Questions

1. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

2. Hon TAM Heung-man asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury and the Secretary for Justice replied.

3. Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

4. Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

5. Hon Abraham SHEK asked Question 5.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Three Members asked supplementaries. The Financial Secretary and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

After declaring her interest as a member of Economic and Employment Council, Hon Emily LAU asked a supplementary and the Financial Secretary replied.

6. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **First Reading**

**Revenue (Personalized Vehicle Registration Marks) Bill 2005**  
**Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2005**

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

## **Second Reading**

### **Revenue (Personalized Vehicle Registration Marks) Bill 2005**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

### **Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2005**

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## **Motions**

### **Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance**

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the following Regulations, made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 9 April 2005, be approved -

- (a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment) Regulation 2005;  
and
- (b) the Poisons List (Amendment) Regulation 2005.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

## **Members' Bills**

### **First Reading**

#### **Federation of Hong Kong Industries (Amendment) Bill 2005**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.



## **Second Reading**

### **Federation of Hong Kong Industries (Amendment) Bill 2005**

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## **Members' Motions**

### **Proposed resolution under the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China**

Hon TSANG Yok-sing moved the motion in Appendix I and addressed the Council.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

### **Reviewing the protection of wages on insolvency system**

Hon TSANG Yok-sing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to expeditiously review the protection of wages on insolvency system and related legislation, so as to safeguard employees' rights and benefits and prevent abuse of the Protection of Wages on Insolvency Fund by employers.

While Hon TSANG Yok-sing was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 2:06 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Andrew CHENG, Hon LEE Cheuk-yan and Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG, Hon LEE Cheuk-yan and Hon WONG Kwok-hing consecutively spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Seven Members and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:30 pm, while Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 13 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion:

To add "streamline the application procedures for the Protection of Wages on Insolvency Fund, and step up prosecution against those employers who deliberately default on payment of wages to their employees," after "related legislation,".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon LEE Cheuk-yan to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following further amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "Protection of Wages on Insolvency Fund,"; and to add "study the establishment of a security deposit system, and require employers to reserve funds for severance payments and long service payments payable to their employees in future," after "payment of wages to their employees,".

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG proposed and put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 25 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two

groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The President stated that as Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "Protection of Wages on Insolvency Fund,"; and to add "and step up enforcement, as well as to study the imposition of a security deposit system targeted at employers who repeatedly evade their responsibilities for the legal interests of their employees or on industries with more cases of abuse" after "payment of wages to their employees".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG proposed and put.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 27 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing replied.

Question on Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG put and agreed to.

### **Opposing Japan's textbooks distorting history**

Hon LAU Kong-wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council strongly condemns the recent approval by Japan's Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology of the history textbooks for secondary schools written by a right-wing group, which brazenly distort the historical facts of Japan's invasion of its neighbouring countries during the Second World War and embellish Japan's acts of aggression, and also strongly demands the Japanese

Government to totally abandon militarism, face up to the historical facts, and offer its sincere apologies and reasonable compensation to the countries and people who were subjected to its invasion during the Second World War.

Question on Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Albert HO and Hon James TIEN would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Albert HO and Hon James TIEN consecutively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:10 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another four Members and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:41 pm, while Hon Mrs Selina CHOW was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another three Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LAU Kong-wah spoke on the amendments.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion:

To add "fulfil its post-war responsibilities, i.e." after "strongly demands the Japanese Government to"; to delete "abandon" after "totally" and substitute with "abandoning"; to delete "face" after "militarism," and substitute with "facing"; to delete "and offer" after "up to the historical facts," and substitute with "disclosing all the information on the war crimes it committed when invading its neighbouring countries during the Second World War, compiling history textbooks that are faithful to historical facts, ceasing to pay official homage to the Yasukuni Shrine, making"; to add "confession and" after "its sincere"; to delete "and reasonable compensation" after "apologies"; and to add ", and offering reasonable compensation to the war crimes victims; and, until the Japanese Government has fulfilled the above responsibilities, this Council resolutely opposes Japan becoming a permanent member of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC), and urges the Government of the SAR to request the Central Government to exercise its right of veto to

forestall Japan becoming a permanent member of the UNSC" after "during the Second World War".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon Albert HO's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon James TIEN to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon James TIEN moved the following further amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Albert HO and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; furthermore, this Council also strongly demands that, to totally abandon militarism, the Japanese Government should cease the unlawful occupation of the Diaoyutai Islands and the oil and natural gas fields in the East China Sea which are within the territory of our country" after "becoming a permanent member of the UNSC".

Question on Hon James TIEN's amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Albert HO proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LAU Kong-wah replied.

Question on Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Albert HO and Hon James TIEN put and agreed to.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 11 May 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:06 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong



BASIC LAW OF THE HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION OF THE  
PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA

---

**RESOLUTION**

(Under Article 75 of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of  
the People's Republic of China)

---

RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL OF THE  
HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION

RESOLVED that the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong  
Special Administrative Region be amended —

- (a) in Rule 21 —
- (i) in subrule (3), by repealing “subrule (4)” and substituting “subrules (4) and (4A)”;
  - (ii) in subrule (4), by repealing “Whenever” and substituting “Subject to subrule (4A), whenever”;
  - (iii) by adding —

“(4A) Where the purpose of the resumption of the second reading debate on a bill is for making an announcement for the withdrawal of the bill in accordance with Rule 64 (Withdrawal or Postponement of Bills), the Member presenting a report of the Bills Committee on the bill at the meeting of the Council at which such an announcement is to be made may, with the permission of the President, address the Council thereon at the time when the report is laid on the Table of the Council.”;
  - (iv) in subrule (6), by adding “, (4A)” after “(3)”;

- (b) in Rule 54(7), by adding “(other than resumption for the purpose of making an announcement for the withdrawal of a bill in accordance with Rule 64 (Withdrawal or Postponement of Bills))” after “At the resumption of the second reading debate on a bill”;
- (c) in Rule 64 —
  - (i) by renumbering it as Rule 64(1);
  - (ii) in subrule (1), by repealing “by announcement in Council” and substituting “by an announcement made in Council”;
  - (iii) by adding —

“(2) The Member or public officer in charge of a bill may, by an announcement made in Council at the beginning of proceedings for the resumption of the second reading debate on the bill, withdraw the bill if -

- (a) the purpose of the resumption is for making such an announcement; and
- (b) such purpose has been so stated in the notice of the resumption of debate given under Rule 54(5) (Second Reading).

(3) The Member or public officer in charge of a bill may, in making an announcement for the withdrawal of the bill under subrule (2), address the Council on matters relevant to the withdrawal but no debate may arise on such an address.”.



投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 04/05/2005  
時間 TIME: 05:30:51 下午

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對曾鈺成議員就「檢討破產欠薪保障制度」所提，經鄭家富議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN TO HON TSANG YOK-SING'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE PROTECTION OF WAGES ON INSOLVENCY SYSTEM" AS AMENDED BY HON ANDREW CHENG

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	28	
投票 Vote	23	27	
贊成 Yes	9	25	
反對 No	14	2	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK \_\_\_\_\_

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 04/05/2005  
 時間 TIME: 05:38:18 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對曾鈺成議員就「檢討破產欠薪保障制度」所提，經鄭家富議員及李卓人議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON TSANG YOK-SING'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE PROTECTION OF WAGES ON INSOLVENCY SYSTEM" AS AMENDED BY HON ANDREW CHENG /AND/ HON LEE CHEUK-YAN

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	30	
投票 Vote	24	29	
贊成 Yes	10	27	
反對 No	14	2	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁鑑忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK