

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 31

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 1 June 2005 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long  
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration, and  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

### Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

#### Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments

#### L.N. No.

Road Traffic (Public Service Vehicles) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 27.5.2005) 83/2005

#### Other Papers

No.91 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the fourth quarter of 2004-05 (Public Finance Ordinance : Section 8) (published on 25.5.2005)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### Questions

1. Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon Vincent FANG Kang asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

3. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

4. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Three Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

6. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **First Reading**

#### **Civil Aviation (Amendment) Bill 2005**

#### **Marriage (Introduction of Civil Celebrants of Marriages and General Amendments) Bill**

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### **Second Reading**

#### **Civil Aviation (Amendment) Bill 2005**

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

**Marriage (Introduction of Civil Celebrants of Marriages and General Amendments) Bill**

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

**Immigration (Amendment) Bill 2005**

**Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 27 April 2005 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

**Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Immigration (Amendment) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1 to 4 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

**Third Reading**

The Secretary for Security reported that

the **Immigration (Amendment) Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

## Members' Bills

### First Reading

#### **The Methodist Church, Hong Kong, Incorporation (Amendment) Bill 2005**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

#### **The Methodist Church, Hong Kong, Incorporation (Amendment) Bill 2005**

Hon LAU Chin-shek moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

#### **Federation of Hong Kong Industries (Amendment) Bill 2005**

### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 4 May 2005 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Federation of Hong Kong Industries (Amendment) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.



### Third Reading

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen reported that

the **Federation of Hong Kong Industries (Amendment)  
Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### Members' Motions

#### Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that in relation to the -

- (a) Road Traffic (Safety Equipment) (Amendment) Regulation 2005, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 65 of 2005;
- (b) Road Traffic (Traffic Control) (Amendment) Regulation 2005, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 66 of 2005;
- (c) Road Traffic (Registration and Licensing of Vehicles) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulation 2005, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 67 of 2005; and
- (d) Road Traffic (Construction and Maintenance of Vehicles) (Amendment) Regulation 2005, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 68 of 2005,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 11 May 2005, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 29 June 2005.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

**Demanding the suspension of privatization**

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Government's recent public asset privatization plans, such as the listing of The Link Real Estate Investment Trust, the privatization of the Airport Authority Hong Kong, and the proposed merger of the two railway corporations, have aroused public concerns, and such plans involve issues of whether the implementation of privatization is beneficial to the community as a whole and whether it will affect people's livelihood and widen the disparity between the rich and the poor, etc, this Council demands that the Government should act prudently and suspend the privatization plans concerned and that, before the implementation of any public asset privatization plans, ad hoc committees comprising representatives from various sectors of the community should be set up to comprehensively and thoroughly assess and study their cost-effectiveness, return, legality and impact on the general public, etc and, based on the findings of such assessments and studies, conduct full and extensive consultations; furthermore, the Government should ensure that any privatization plan which involves the public interest is for the benefit of the general public and must be subject to public scrutiny.

While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:16 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai consecutively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eight Members and Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:36 pm, while Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 14 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion:

To add "as well as anxieties among employees" after "public concerns"; to add ", employees' rights and benefits, labour relations," after "people's livelihood"; to add ", including trade unions," after "various sectors of the community"; and to add "and employees" after "general public".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Demanding the suspension of privatization", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion:

To add "of varying forms and in different areas, including transportation, water supply, social welfare, health care financing, etc" after "before the implementation of any public asset privatization plans"; to delete "their" after "assess and study" and substitute with "the"; to delete "," after "return" and substitute with "and"; to delete "and" after "legality" and substitute with "of the different forms of privatization plans as well as their"; and to add "acceptance and" after "subject to public".

Question on Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai's amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed and put.

Hon Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, six were in favour of the motion, 18 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 15 against it and three abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

#### **Investment income of the Exchange Fund**

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to review the existing agreement between the Government and the Hong Kong Monetary Authority on the methodology for sharing the Exchange Fund's investment income, and allocate more investment income of the Exchange Fund to the Government, so as to increase government revenue.

While Hon SIN Chung-kai was speaking, several persons in the Public Gallery yelled noisily. The President ordered them to leave quietly. Security staff escorted them away from the Chamber accordingly.

Hon SIN Chung-kai continued to address the Council.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHAN Kam-lam would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "agreement" after "review the existing" and substitute with "methodology for sharing the Exchange Fund's investment income"; to delete "on the methodology for sharing the Exchange Fund's investment income, and" after "Hong Kong Monetary Authority" and substitute with ","; and to delete "so as to increase government revenue" after "to the Government," and substitute with "and ensure that there is stable government revenue from the investment income; in determining the level of the Exchange Fund's investment income to be allocated to the Government, the principle of keeping expenditure within the limits of revenues in drawing up the budget, striving to achieve a fiscal balance, avoiding deficits and keeping the budget commensurate with the growth rate of the gross domestic product must be strictly followed".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed.

12 Members and Hon TAM Heung-man spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon TAM Heung-man was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:13 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another three Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the amendment.

The Financial Secretary spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 6:37 pm, while the Financial Secretary was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion put and agreed to.

Hon SIN Chung-kai replied.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present and 21 were in favour of the motion; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion and three against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam was carried.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 8 June 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:57 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 01/06/2005  
 時間 TIME: 04:25:40 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對陳偉業議員就「要求擱置私有化」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON  
 "DEMANDING THE SUSPENSION OF PRIVATIZATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	6	7	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	4	11	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 01/06/2005  
時間 TIME: 04:29:02 下午

動議 MOTION: 何鍾泰議員對陳偉業議員就「要求擱置私有化」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY DR HON RAYMOND HO TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON  
"DEMANDING THE SUSPENSION OF PRIVATIZATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	26	
投票 Vote	24	25	
贊成 Yes	6	6	
反對 No	13	8	
棄權 Abstain	5	11	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES



投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 01/06/2005  
時間 TIME: 04:37:14 下午

動議 MOTION: 「要求擱置私有化」議案  
MOTION "DEMANDING THE SUSPENSION OF PRIVATIZATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	27	
投票 Vote	25	26	
贊成 Yes	6	8	
反對 No	18	15	
棄權 Abstain	1	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	否決 Negated	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	棄權	ABSTAIN	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	反對	NO
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	棄權	ABSTAIN
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
劉秀成	Patrick LAU	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	棄權	ABSTAIN
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 01/06/2005  
時間 TIME: 06:56:52 下午

動議 MOTION: 由單仲偕議員動議，經陳鑑林議員修正的「外匯基金投資收益」議案  
MOTION MOVED BY HON SIN CHUNG-KAI ON "INVESTMENT INCOME OF THE EXCHANGE FUND" AS AMENDED BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM

動議人 MOVED BY: 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	23	
投票 Vote	21	22	
贊成 Yes	21	19	
反對 No	0	3	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO