

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 32

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 8 June 2005 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH

The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP

Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>No.</u>
1. Application for New Identity Cards (Persons Born in 1974 to 1985) Order (gazetted on 3.6.2005)	L.N. 85/2005
2. Clubs (Safety of Premises) (Exclusion) (Amendment) Order 2005 (gazetted on 3.6.2005)	L.N. 86/2005
3. Declaration of Increase in Pensions Notice 2005 (gazetted on 3.6.2005)	L.N. 87/2005
4. Widows and Orphans Pension (Increase) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 3.6.2005)	L.N. 88/2005
5. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 4) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 3.6.2005)	L.N. 89/2005
6. Road Traffic (Registration and Licensing of Vehicles) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 3.6.2005)	L.N. 90/2005
7. Technical Memorandum for Supervision Plans 2005 (gazetted on 3.6.2005)	S. S. No. 5 to Gazette No. 22/2005

Other Papers

Report of the Bills Committee on Revenue (Allowances for Tax) Bill 2005 (published on 3.6.2005)

Report of the Bills Committee on Trade Descriptions (Amendment) Bill 2004 (published on 2.6.2005)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Questions

1. Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon CHAN Kam-lam asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

3. In accordance with Rule 26(6) of the Rules of Procedure, Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 3 on behalf of Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, who was absent.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Two Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

After declaring that he was a teaching staff member of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University and an elected member of its Council, Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked a supplementary. The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Another three Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

5. Hon Abraham SHEK asked Question 5.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries. The Financial Secretary and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

6. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Supplementary Appropriation (2004-2005) Bill

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Supplementary Appropriation (2004-2005) Bill

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Revenue (Allowances for Tax) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 27 April 2005 resumed.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Revenue (Allowances for Tax) Bill 2005, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill.

Four Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Revenue (Allowances for Tax) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1 to 7 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Revenue (Allowances for Tax) Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Trade Descriptions (Amendment) Bill 2004

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 10 November 2004 resumed.

Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Trade Descriptions (Amendment) Bill 2004, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Trade Descriptions (Amendment) Bill 2004**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 4 and 5 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved an amendment to clause 3 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 3, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New headings before new clauses 6 and 8 and new clauses 6 to 9 read the first time.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid headings and clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid headings and clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New headings before new clauses 6 and 8 and new clauses 6 to 9 read the second time.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the addition of the aforesaid headings and clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the long title stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved an amendment to the long title and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology reported that

the **Trade Descriptions (Amendment) Bill 2004**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Labelling Scheme on Nutrition Information for pre-packaged food

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Government's proposal to legislate on the Labelling Scheme on Nutrition Information for pre-packaged food by phases fails to effectively assist the public and people with chronic diseases in properly obtaining food nutrition information, and also fails to fully consider and assess the impact on and the disruption to the industry after enactment of the legislation, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) expedite the legislation on a mandatory labelling scheme, and allow a grace period of three years after enactment of the legislation for full implementation of the "1+9" option, which covers energy and nine core nutrients, in one go;
- (b) work out a long-term plan and timetable for bringing into the regulatory ambit another four nutrients which have a bearing on the level of healthiness, namely potassium, monounsaturated fatty acid, trans fatty acid and soluble fibre;
- (c) formulate concrete proposals and guidelines to provide targeted technical support and ancillary facilities to small and medium enterprises engaging in the relevant food businesses, so as to assist the industry in achieving a successful transition;
- (d) establish an ad hoc group to draw up concrete proposals and an implementation timetable to help promote and educate the public on the importance of a nutrition information labelling scheme and the ways to comprehend the labels, as well as to co-ordinate professional bodies and voluntary organizations in the provision of relevant consultation and education services to the public; and
- (e) set up a nutrition information analysis database that is applicable to Hong Kong, so as to address the difficulties encountered by the public, the industry and stakeholders in gathering, comprehending and analyzing nutrition information.

While Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:32 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Vincent FANG Kang and Hon WONG Yung-kan would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang and Hon WONG Yung-kan consecutively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long spoke on the amendments.

At 3:00 pm, while Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion:

To delete "effectively assist the public and people with chronic diseases in properly obtaining food nutrition information, and also fails to fully consider and assess" after "phases fails to" and substitute with "take into full account"; to add "consumers and" after "the disruption to"; to delete "expedite the legislation on a mandatory labelling scheme, and allow a grace period of three years after enactment of the legislation for full implementation of the '1+9' option, which covers energy and nine core nutrients, in one go" after "(a)" and substitute with "in introducing the nutrition labelling scheme, set an appropriate grace period for implementation of the '1+5' option, i.e. energy plus five core nutrients, namely protein, carbohydrate, total fat, saturated fat and sodium"; to delete "work out" after "(b)" and substitute with "conduct a comprehensive review after completing the implementation of the first phase of the above nutrition labelling scheme, and study the formulation of"; to delete "which have a bearing on the level of healthiness, namely potassium, monounsaturated fatty acid, trans fatty acid and soluble fibre" after "another four nutrients" and substitute with ", namely cholesterol, sugars, dietary fibre and calcium"; to delete "establish an ad hoc group" after "(d)" and substitute with "consult the public and the industry extensively"; to delete "to help promote and educate the public" after "implementation timetable" and substitute with ", and enhance publicity and promotional efforts as well as public education"; and to delete "as well as to co-ordinate professional bodies and voluntary organizations in the

provision of relevant consultation and education services to the public" after "comprehend the labels," and substitute with "so as to enable consumers to make informed choices".

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment to Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion proposed and put.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, one was in favour of the amendment and 22 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Labelling Scheme on Nutrition Information for pre-packaged food", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion:

To add "(b) expeditiously conduct a feasibility study on the regulation of labelling of food for infants and pre-packaged food for people with special dietary needs;" after "in one go;"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(e)"; and to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(f)".

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's amendment to Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion proposed and put.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 14 were in favour

of the amendment, six against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Question on Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion as amended by Hon WONG Yung-kan put and agreed to.

Actively improving the business environment for small and medium enterprises

Hon Vincent FANG Kang moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, although the Government has all along followed the policy of positive non-intervention in economic development, the laws, policies and measures implemented by the Government in recent years have however created hurdles and restrictions in the business environment which adversely affect the small and medium enterprises particularly and pose serious threats to the reviving employment market; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to immediately review all the laws and regulations as well as administrative measures that are detrimental to the business environment and, in the light of the outcomes of the relevant reviews, adopt policies and measures that are conducive to socio-economic development, with a view to achieving the objective of benefiting the people, facilitating businesses, and creating wealth together.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Fred LI would move an amendment to the motion and that Hon CHAN Kam-lam would also move an amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Fred LI moved the following amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "which adversely affect the" after "restriction in business environment" and substitute with "and, so far, the Government has not introduced a comprehensive fair competition law, resulting in unfair competition in the market, such as the monopolies in energy supplies and operations in the form of bundled services, adversely affecting the development of"; to delete "pose" after "particularly and" and substitute with

"posing"; to add "and to consider introducing a comprehensive fair competition law" after "socio-economic development,"; and to add "safeguarding the principle of fair competition on which Hong Kong's previous successes relied, and" after "with a view to".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion proposed.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment and addressed the Council:

To delete "and, so far, the Government has not introduced a comprehensive fair competition law, resulting in unfair competition in the market" after "restrictions in the business environment" and substitute with ", and unfair competition even exists in some industries"; to delete "introducing a comprehensive" after "and to consider" and substitute with "the feasibility of enacting legislation on"; to delete "law" after "fair competition" and substitute with "on the premise of safeguarding Hong Kong's free economy system and enhancing its market competitiveness,"; and to delete "safeguarding the principle of fair competition on which Hong Kong's previous successes relied, and" after "with a view to".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment proposed.

17 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment, as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam, to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion put and agreed to.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang replied.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI and Hon CHAN Kam-lam put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 15 June 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:18 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 08/06/2005
時間 TIME: 03:34:22 下午

動議 MOTION: 方剛議員對李國麟議員就「預先包裝食物營養資料標籤制度」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON VINCENT FANG TO DR HON JOSEPH LEE'S MOTION ON
"LABELLING SCHEME ON NUTRITION INFORMATION FOR PRE-PACKAGED FOOD"

動議人 MOVED BY: 方剛 Vincent FANG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	24	
投票 Vote	20	23	
贊成 Yes	6	1	
反對 No	12	22	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李柱銘	Martin LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	反對	NO
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
林偉強	Daniel LAM			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying		
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO	馬力	MA Lik	反對	NO
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
劉秀成	Patrick LAU	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO



投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 08/06/2005
時間 TIME: 03:37:41 下午

動議 MOTION: 黃容根議員對李國麟議員就「預先包裝食物營養資料標籤制度」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG YUNG-KAN TO DR HON JOSEPH LEE'S MOTION ON
"LABELLING SCHEME ON NUTRITION INFORMATION FOR PRE-PACKAGED FOOD"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	24	
投票 Vote	21	23	
贊成 Yes	14	22	
反對 No	6	1	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK