

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. ESC11/04-05  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/3/2

**Establishment Subcommittee of the Finance Committee**

**Minutes of the 3rd meeting**  
**held at the Legislative Council Chamber**  
**on Wednesday, 8 December 2004, at 10:45 am**

**Members present:**

Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon KWONG Chi-kin (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP  
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon Margaret NG  
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong  
Hon Bernard CHAN, JP  
Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Hon MA Lik, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS  
Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

**Members absent:**

Dr Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP  
Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

**Public Officers attending:**

Miss Elizabeth TSE, JP

Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the  
Treasury (Treasury)

Miss Jennifer MAK, JP Mr Alfred FOK	Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Ms Eva CHENG, JP Mr Andy CHAN	Commissioner for Tourism Assistant Commissioner for Tourism

**Clerk in attendance:**

Miss Becky YU	Chief Council Secretary (1)1
---------------	------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG	Assistant Secretary General 1
Ms Rosalind MA	Senior Council Secretary (1)8
Miss Edith CHAN	Council Secretary (1)1
Mr Anthony CHU	Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Caris CHAN	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1
Mr Frankie WOO	Legislative Assistant (1)2

---

Action

Noting that there was only one discussion item on the agenda, Mr James TIEN opined that it was not an effective use of time to hold a meeting to discuss one non-urgent single item given the tight meeting schedule of members. The Chairman advised that meetings of the Establishment Subcommittee (ESC) were decided at the start of the legislative session. She nevertheless took note of Mr TIEN's view and agreed to liaise with the Clerk and the Administration to arrange for the discussion of more than one proposal at an ESC meeting as far as practicable.

**EC(2004-05)11 Proposed retention of one supernumerary post of Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (D2) in the Tourism Commission of the Government Secretariat: Economic Development and Labour Bureau (Economic Development Branch) from 1 April 2005 to 31 December 2005 to oversee the completion of the Hong Kong Disneyland project**

2. The Chairman informed members that an information paper on the proposal was circulated to the Panel on Economic Services on 15 November 2004.

Action

3. Mr James TIEN noted that the duration of the supernumerary Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (AOSGC) (D2) post, from 1 December 1999 to 31 March 2005, was assessed based on the target opening date of the Hong Kong Disneyland (HKD). Given that HKD was progressing smoothly and that no delay was anticipated, Mr TIEN questioned the need for the proposed retention of the post for a period of nine months, from 1 April 2005 to 31 December 2005. He wondered whether the Administration had deliberately shortened the duration of the AOSGC post when it was created in 1999 with a view to securing the support of the Finance Committee (FC). Ms Margaret NG shared Mr TIEN's concern. To prevent recurrences, she requested that as a general practice, the Administration should set out clearly in its future staffing proposals on creation of supernumerary posts the duration of the posts concerned and the circumstances under which these posts would be retained.

4. In response, the Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) explained the current practice where bureaux/departments were requested to provide justifications for the creation and retention of supernumerary posts in the funding proposals. She said that the Administration would continue to adhere to such a practice in future submission of staffing proposals for supernumerary posts.

5. On the duration of the supernumerary AOSGC post, the Commissioner for Tourism (C for Tourism) said that the original duration of the post was set in 1999 at the early stage of the project. It was then not possible to predict the exact opening date and the need for retention of the post could not have been anticipated. She explained that the HKD project was designed in such a way that it progressed based on a milestone mechanism and accordingly the opening date could not be decided until after certain milestones had been achieved. With the decision that the target opening date of HKD would be 12 September 2005, the Administration was now in a position to review the further need of the post and propose that the post should be retained for nine months to help oversee the completion of the project and to co-ordinate Government's efforts during the initial opening period to ensure smooth operation of HKD.

6. While not opposing to the proposed retention, Mr James TIEN remained of the view the Administration should have provided a more realistic estimation on the duration of the post back in 1999. C for Tourism reiterated that as the exact opening date for the theme park could not be fixed until recently under the milestone mechanism, the need for a longer duration of the post could not have been anticipated at the initial planning stage in 1999. Responding to Mr MA Lik's enquiry, C for Tourism confirmed that the Administration would not seek further retention of the post.

7. Dr KWOK Ka-ki appreciated the difficulty in ascertaining the exact duration of the post at the early planning stage of HKD in 1999 and considered it reasonable for the Administration to seek approval for extending the post when the need was clear. He then enquired about the work of AOSGC in relation to the

opening of HKD. In response, C for Tourism said that AOSGC led a special project team to help co-ordinate, monitor and oversee the work of various government bureaux and departments in implementing HKD, in particular to oversee the completion of the project to ensure operational readiness of HKD for its timely opening. The work covered transport, site management and security, emergency response, permits and licences, communications and promotion as well as opening events and arrangements.

8. Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr WONG Kwok-hing were concerned how the Administration could ensure smooth operation of HKD after the lapse of the supernumerary AOSGC post and the disbandment of the project team on 31 December 2005. C for Tourism responded that the Tourism Commission (TC) would oversee smooth operation of the theme park in the long run. As HKD should have been operating smoothly three months after opening, it would be possible for the existing staff in TC to absorb the workload of AOSGC. Under the permanent establishment of TC, C for Tourism was assisted by a Deputy Commissioner and three Assistant Commissioners. The four officers were responsible for formulating tourism policy and strategy, implementing other tourism projects and initiatives, as well as liaising with the Mainland and other tourism authorities. After the lapse of the supernumerary AOSGC post, she envisaged that the workload of AOSGC would be shared out among them. In response to Mr WONG Kwok-hing's enquiry about the future postings of AOSGC and other non-directorate staff in the project team after 31 December 2005, C for Tourism said that this would have to be arranged by the Civil Service Bureau and relevant Heads of Grade.

9. The item was voted on and endorsed.

10. The Subcommittee was adjourned at 11:00 am.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
3 January 2005