

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC38/04-05
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 4th meeting
held in the Chamber of Legislative Council Building
on Wednesday, 15 December 2004, at 10:45 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Margaret NG
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Public officers attending:

Miss Amy TSE, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Mr Y C LO	Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works)
Mr Thomas TSO	Deputy Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Planning and Lands)
Mr Mike CHIU	Deputy Director of Environmental Protection
Miss Janice TSE	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Mr Patrick FAN	Chief Estate Surveyor/Acquisition Lands Department
Mr C H YUE, JP	Director of Architectural Services
Mr K K NG	Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services)
Mr Raymond CHEUNG	Director of Drainage Services
Mr TSAO Tak-kiang, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Dr Ellen CHAN	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Waste Facilities)
Mr MAK Chai-kwong, JP	Director of Highways
Mr Patrick LI, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Mr C H YUE	Director of Architectural Services
Mr K K NG	Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services)
Miss Mary TSANG	Deputy Secretary-General (1), University Grants Committee
Mrs Ingrid YEUNG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Health, Welfare & Food (Health) ²
Dr CHENG Man-yung	Deputy Director of Hospital Authority (Professional Services and Facilities Management)
Mr LEE Kwok-sung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education and Manpower (School Development)
Ms Maisie CHAN	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education and Manpower (Infrastructure and Research Support)
Mr William KO, JP	Director of Water Supplies

Mr NG Chi-ho	Assistant Director of Water Supplies (New Works)
Ms Joyce TAM	Assistant Government Chief Information Officer (E-Government Policy and Development)
Mr Martin CHEUNG	Chief Civil Engineer, Housing, Planning and Lands Bureau
Ms Ernestina WONG	Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Transport) 5
Mr CHOW Ying-shun, JP	Assistant Director of Highways (Development)
Mr LEE Yan-ming	Chief Traffic engineer/New Territories West Transport Department
Mr Raistlin LAU	Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Environment)1
Mr K W MAK	Chief Engineer/Consultants Management Drainage Services Department
Mr David WONG	Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Sewage Infrastructure Planning)
Mr Alex NG	Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Facilities Development)
Mr S Gary CROW	Chief Technical Advisor/Subvented Projects Architectural Services Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Alice AU	Senior Council Secretary (1)5
-------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr Anthony CHU	Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Caris CHAN	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1
Mr Frankie WOO	Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

Capital Works Reserve Fund Block Allocation

PWSC(2004-05)46 — Block Allocations for Heads 701 to 711 under the Capital Works Reserve Fund

Members noted that the proposed block allocation under *Head 710 - Computerization* had been discussed by the Panel on Information Technology and

Broadcasting on 8 November 2004, and a paper covering all the proposed block allocations had been circulated to the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works in late November 2004.

Head 701 Land Acquisition

Subhead 1004CA – Compensation for surrenders and resumptions: miscellaneous

2. Mr CHAN Kam-lam enquired about the estimated provision of \$1.9 million sought for item 4 "Hong Kong Housing Society's Urban Improvement Scheme at Ma Tau Kok Road, Pak Tai Street, Pau Chung Street, San Shan Road, Sui Lun Street and Wang Cheung Street" in 2005-06.

3. The Chief Estate Surveyor/Acquisition of the Lands Department explained that the Government was responsible for acquiring the land and properties for the relevant housing development project undertaken by the Hong Kong Housing Society (HKHS). The land was then granted to HKHS with land premium charged at full market value. He further said that the land acquisition for the project had been completed back in 1992 but part of the compensation payments was still outstanding. At Mr CHAN Kam-lam's request, the Administration would provide supplementary information on the following after the meeting:

Admin

- (a) number of outstanding compensation claims arising from the acquisition of land for the Urban Improvement Scheme;
- (b) amount of compensation incurred so far; and
- (c) estimated total cost for settlement of all relevant compensation claims.

Head 703 Buildings

Subhead 3004GX – Refurbishment of government buildings for items in Category D of the Public Works Programme

4. Mr CHAN Kam-lam enquired about the justification for the provision sought for item 1 "Refurbishment, maintenance and fire services upgrading works to former clubhouse of the Royal Yacht Club at North Point". The Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services) replied that the former clubhouse of the Royal Yacht Club had been declared a monument under the Antiquities and Monuments Ordinance (Cap. 53). The provision sought was to undertake refurbishment, maintenance and fire services upgrading works.

Allocations

5. Referring to the 1.6% increase in the proposed block allocations when compared to the approved allocations in 2004-2005, Mr Abraham SHEK remarked that in view of the serious unemployment situation in the construction industry, the Administration should undertake more capital works projects and expedite the progress of preparatory works.

6. The Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works) explained that the proposed block allocations for works-related Heads in 2005-06 had amounted to \$5,251 million. This represented 8.1% increase against the approved allocations for these Heads in 2004-05. The funds were mainly used to establish the technical feasibility and prepare the detailed design and tender documents of major capital works projects prior to seeking funding approval from the Public Works Subcommittee (PWSC)/Finance Committee to the construction works; and to carry out standalone minor improvement items at district level. The actual value of the capital works projects, which reflected the Government's commitment on the capital works programme, would be shown in the individual papers to be submitted to PWSC.

7. The Chairman remarked that when the relevant paper on the forecast of potential submissions was discussed at the last meeting, members had noted that a total of 76 items would be submitted to PWSC in 2004-05, i.e. four items less than the forecast in the 2003-04 legislative session.

8. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 706 – Highways

PWSC(2004-05)47 777TH Improvements to San Tin Interchange

9. Members noted that an information paper on the item had been circulated to the Transport Panel on 18 November 2004.

10. Ms Miriam LAU stated support for the item. She referred to the existing busy traffic conditions at the San Tin Interchange (the Interchange), and expressed concern about potential disruption to the existing traffic flow, especially at peak periods before long holidays, during the construction stage.

11. The Director of Highways (DHy) said that under the project, a pair of elevated roads from San Tin Highway and Fanling Highway approaches of the Interchange would be constructed as bypasses to the vehicle holding area. As most of the construction works would be carried out outside the Interchange, the existing traffic was not expected to be affected to a large extent. Assuring members that the Administration would take extra care in the matter, DHy said that construction works would be undertaken in phases to further minimize impact on the existing traffic flow. The contractor was also required to put up temporary traffic management measures subject to the approval of the Police and the Transport Department before the commencement of works.

12. Mr Abraham SHEK pointed out that the estimated costs of \$15.3 million for landscaping works and \$67.6 million for consultants' fees were relatively high. DHy responded that the site covered a relatively large area with the construction of new road infrastructure. After the construction of the proposed new roads, extensive landscaping works would have to be carried out on both sides of the

roads. Against the total estimated project cost of \$486.3 million, \$15.3 million earmarked for landscaping was considered reasonable.

13. As regards consultants' fees, DHy explained that a large proportion of the fees was for the resident site staff. As part of the works would involve the construction of elevated highway structures across the busy Fanling Highway, it was prudent to ensure proper site supervision. He added that the number of resident site staff required was commensurate with the scope of the proposed project.

14. Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming stated support for the item, and enquired about the handling of objections from various parties affected by land acquisition and clearance for the proposed project. Referring to the nature of objections as set out in the paper, DHy said that the Administration had carefully reviewed the land proposed for resumption in the light of the objections. In the present proposal, only the land required for the project would be acquired and cleared according to the relevant provisions under the Road (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap. 370). Having considered the proposed modifications and the circumstances of other unresolved objections, the Chief Executive-in-Council had authorized the proposed works under the Ordinance on 2 November 2004.

15. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 704 – Drainage

**PWSC(2004-05)48 211DS Outlying Islands sewerage, stage 1 phase
2 – upgrading of Peng Chau sewage
treatment works**

16. Members noted that the item had been discussed by the Panel on Environmental Affairs on 22 November 2004.

17. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 705 – Civil Engineering

**PWSC(2004-05)45 166DR Restoration of Tseung Kwan O Landfills –
post-completion environmental monitoring
work**

18. Members noted that the item had been discussed by the Panel on Environmental Affairs on 25 October 2004.

19. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 708 – Capital Subventions and Major Systems and Equipment**PWSC(2004-05)49 87EB A private independent secondary school at Norfolk Road, Kowloon Tong**

20. The Chairman invited members to note that on 10 December 2004, the Administration suggested to include the present funding proposal as an urgent item on the agenda for the meeting. An information paper on the proposal was circulated to the Education Panel on the same day. Panel members therefore did not have the opportunity to consider the policy issues involved in the proposal. As the notice given on the item was short of the required notice of six clear days as stipulated in the Public Works Subcommittee Procedure, he, as the Chairman of the Subcommittee, had agreed to include the item on the agenda but subject to provision of written justification by the Administration for the urgency of the proposal. He however was disappointed that the Administration's written justification did not reach the Secretariat until about noon on 14 December 2004, one day before the meeting. As a result, he was not able to circulate the Administration's reasons for the urgency until that day. In line with the practice on late submission of papers, he invited members to advise if they were prepared to proceed with the consideration of the item.

21. The Principal Assistant Secretary for Education and Manpower (Infrastructure and Research Support) thanked the Chairman for agreeing to include the proposal on the agenda. She said that the item was originally included in the draft agenda of the present PWSC meeting. When the Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB) forwarded an information paper to the Legislative Council Secretariat on 6 December 2004 for circulation to the Education Panel, it was informed that some members of the Education Panel would like to discuss the item at the Panel meeting on 13 December 2004 before submission to PWSC. As such, EMB withdrew the PWSC item and made arrangements for Panel consultation. However, it was subsequently clarified that Panel members were not concerned about the actual funding proposal. EMB then requested the inclusion of the proposal as an urgent item on the agenda for the present PWSC meeting and to circulate the relevant paper to the Education Panel on 10 December 2004. She was only aware of the Chairman's request for written justification for the urgency of the proposal the morning of 14 December 2004. Therefore, EMB had immediately arranged to send the written justification to the Secretariat by fax at noon on the same day.

(Post-meeting note: EMB subsequently submitted a written apology to the Subcommittee clarifying that the Bureau had in fact received the said request from the Secretariat via FSTB on 10 December 2004. EMB's letter was issued to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC30/04-05.)

22. Mr Abraham SHEK considered that the Administration should learn from this experience and ensure that the requisite notice was given for including items on the agenda for PWSC meetings.

23. Mrs Selina CHOW recalled that a number of policy issues in relation to the provision of school places had been raised at the last PWSC meeting on 24 November 2004. While such matters should be dealt with by the Education Panel, she agreed that this was an exceptional case and the Subcommittee should proceed with the item.

24. Ms Margaret NG remarked that in the present situation, the Administration could have requested to keep the item on the agenda pending the outcome of Panel consultation. Nonetheless, she considered that the reasons for the Chairman to exercise his discretion in this exceptional case should be recorded.

25. Mr CHAN Kam-lam called on the Administration to learn from this experience and make early arrangement to consult the Education Panel on future funding proposals for school projects. Nonetheless, he said that the present proposal should not be unduly delayed, and agreed that the Subcommittee should proceed with the item.

26. The Assistant Secretary General 1 advised that the misunderstanding could have been avoided if the Administration had made early arrangement to consult the Education Panel so that the Panel could decide in a timely manner whether the item would require discussion at a forthcoming meeting before submission to PWSC.

27. The Chairman stated that having considered the circumstances, he agreed that this was an exceptional case and hence, had given his consent to include the proposal as an urgent item on the agenda on this basis. He added that in future, while he would consider any requests from the Administration to include urgent items on the agenda for PWSC meetings on a case-by-case basis, the Administration should provide clear justification in writing for such requests to facilitate consideration whether or not to exercise his discretion to waive the required notice. Although the relevant item was included in the agenda, it was up to PWSC members to decide whether to proceed with the item or not at the meeting.

28. Members agreed to proceed with the item.

29. The item was voted on and endorsed.

30. The meeting ended at 11:10 am.