

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CROP 19/04-05

Ref: CB(3)/CROP/3/4 (Part III)

**Paper for the House Committee meeting
on 17 December 2004**

Committee on Rules of Procedure

Proposed arrangements for the debate on the 2005 Policy Address

Purpose

This paper informs the House Committee (HC) of Members' views on the arrangements for the debate on the 2005 Policy Address (the 2005 Debate) proposed by the Committee on Rules of Procedure (CRoP), and invites HC to consider CRoP's recommendations.

Background

2. At its meeting held on 11 November 2004, CRoP agreed that:
 - (a) subject to agreement by Members and the Administration, the arrangements for the debate on the 2004 Policy Address should be adopted for the 2005 Debate to be held from 26 to 28 January 2005, two weeks after the delivery of the 2005 Policy Address on 12 January 2005. Details of the arrangements are as follows:
 - (i) the 2005 Debate should adopt the "3-day-5-session" format, i.e. a total of five debate sessions should be held on three consecutive days. Each debate session should be devoted to one group of policy areas. The number of debate sessions in each day should depend on the length of the debate on each group of policy areas. The grouping of policy areas should be agreed between the Administration and HC;
 - (ii) policy briefings for Panels should be held after the delivery of the 2005 Policy Address and before the commencement of the 2005 Debate;

- (iii) each day of the Debate should start at 2:30 pm and end at 10:30 pm, but should be extended to 11:00 pm where necessary;
 - (iv) subject to the total speaking time limit of 20 minutes, and provided that no Member may speak after the designated public officer(s) has/have spoken, a Member can speak once in each of the five debate sessions;
 - (v) the HC Chairman may speak for more than once in the fifth session on the amendment(s) and in reply respectively. The HC Chairman, as mover of the motion for the 2005 Debate, should have an additional 15-minute speaking time for moving the motion and in reply. If there is/are amendment(s) to the motion, another five minutes to speak on the amendment(s) should be allowed;
 - (vi) after Members' speeches in each session, there should be a 10-minute suspension of the Council meeting for the Administration to coordinate its response;
 - (vii) the total speaking time limit for designated public officers in each debate session should be -
 - (a) for one or two officers, each officer may speak for not less than 15 minutes, subject to the total speaking time limit of 45 minutes. Under this arrangement, where two officers are to speak, the officer speaking first should not speak for more than 30 minutes, leaving at least 15 minutes for the other officer. Subject to such a restriction, it should be up to the officers to determine their order of speaking and actual speaking time; and
 - (b) for three or more officers, it should be calculated on the basis of 15-minute speaking time limit for each officer; and
 - (viii) the timing and manner in which the Policy Address-related publications are released, as decided by the Administration, should not cause inconvenience to Members; and
- (b) Members' views on the arrangements should be collected for consideration by CRoP at its meeting to be held on 7 December 2004.

Members' views on the proposed arrangements

3. 59 Members responded to the questionnaire on the proposed arrangements. Their views are detailed in **Appendix I**.

4. Members' views on the proposed arrangement set out in paragraph 2(a)(iv) above are as follows:

- (a) 29 Members support the proposed arrangement;
- (b) 26 Members suggest that the speaking time limit for each Member should be 30 minutes;
- (c) two Members have no comment on the proposed arrangement;
- (d) one Member has no particular view on the speaking time limit for each Member and considers that subject to the time limit, each Member can choose to speak once or more than once in each session; and
- (e) one Member does not support the proposed arrangement or give reasons for that.

A number of the Members suggesting the 30-minute speaking time limit also have suggestions on the proposed arrangements regarding the number of days and the duration of each day of the 2005 Debate set out in paragraph 2(a)(i) and (iii) above respectively.

5. The majority of Members support the other proposed arrangements set out in paragraph 2(a)(ii) and (v) to (viii) above.

CRoP's recommendations

6. Having considered the above views at its meeting on 7 December 2004, CRoP agreed to the following:

- (a) the proposed arrangements set out in paragraph 2(a)(i), (iii) and (iv) should be adjusted to meet the following requirements:
 - (i) the number of days for the 2005 Debate should be kept to three;
 - (ii) the starting times for the first day and the other two days should be 2:30 pm and 9:00 am respectively;

- (iii) meal breaks should not be provided on any of the three days; and
 - (iv) the scheduled ending time for each day may be extended for a period of not more than 30 minutes where necessary, provided that the total duration of the Debate will not be exceeded;
- (b) the following three options on adjustments to the speaking time limit and ending time of each day of the Debate, which meet the above requirements, should be presented to HC for consideration;

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
Speaking time limit for each Member	20 minutes	25 minutes	30 minutes
Proposed duration of each day of the 2005 Debate (Components of the Debate and their duration are in Appendix II)	First day: 2:30 pm – 10:30 pm*		
	Second day 9:00 am – 5:00 pm*	Second day 9:00 am – 7:30 pm*	Second day 9:00 am – 10:00 pm*
	Third day 9:00 am – 5:10 pm*	Third day 9:00 am – 7:35 pm*	Third day 9:00 am – 10:00 pm*

* subject to a 30-minute extension provided that the total duration of the Debate is not exceeded.

- (c) subject to the above adjustment, CRoP's proposed arrangements should be adopted for the 2005 Debate.

Advice sought

7. Members are invited to consider CRoP's recommendations in paragraph 6 above. HC's decision on the arrangements for the 2005 Debate will be conveyed to the Administration.

Legislative Council Secretariat

15 December 2004

**Members' views on the proposed arrangements for
the debate on the 2005 Policy Address**
(as at 5:00 pm on 10 December 2004)

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views		
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)
1.	The debate on the 2005 Policy Address (the 2005 Debate) should adopt the "3-day-5-session" format, i.e. a total of five debate sessions should be held on three consecutive days. Each debate session should be devoted to one group of policy areas. The number of debate sessions in each day should depend on the length of the debate on each group of policy areas. The grouping of policy areas should be agreed between the Administration and the House Committee. The Debate should take place at the Council meeting scheduled to be held from 26 to 28 January 2005, which is the second regular Council meeting after the delivery of the 2005 Policy Address on 12 January 2005.	<p>Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong^a (10 Members)</p> <p>Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions^b (3 Members)</p> <p>Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Dr Hon David LI Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah Hon Bernard CHAN Dr Hon Philip WONG Hon Timothy FOK Hon Abraham SHEK Hon LI Fung-ying Hon Albert CHAN Hon Frederick FUNG Dr Hon Joseph LEE Hon Daniel LAM Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon Patrick LAU Hon TAM Heung-man</p>	<p>Liberal Party^c (10 Members)</p> <p>Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon Albert CHENG</p>	<p>Democratic Party^d (9 Members)</p> <p>Additional debate sessions may be held in the mornings of Wednesday, Thursday, Friday and Saturday, or debate sessions can start in the morning on Wednesday, Thursday and Friday, if three days are found to be insufficient for the Debate when the total speaking time limit for each Member is extended.</p> <p>Article 45 Concern Group^e (4 Members)</p> <p>It is fairer to set the total speaking time limit for a Member at 30 minutes as Members have to debate many issues. If this means more days will have to be allocated to the Debate, so be it.</p> <p>Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon LAU Chin-shek The previous format, whereby the Debate is not devoted to specific policy areas, should be restored. Each Member should speak once.</p> <p>Hon Emily LAU The Debate may need to last for four days as the total speaking time limit for each Member should be extended to 30 minutes.</p> <p>Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Time allocated to the Debate is insufficient and should be extended to three whole days (Wednesday to Friday). If the debate on each day is conducted on a half-day basis, it should last for four days (Wednesday to Saturday).</p>
		(29 Members)	(12 Members)	(18 Members)

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views		
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)
2.	Policy briefings for Panels should be held after the delivery of the 2005 Policy Address and before the commencement of the 2005 Debate.	Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (10 Members) Democratic Party (9 Members) Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions (3 Members) Article 45 Concern Group (4 Members) Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Dr Hon David LI Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah Hon Bernard CHAN Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Dr Hon Philip WONG Hon LAU Chin-shek Hon Emily LAU Hon Timothy FOK Hon Abraham SHEK Hon LI Fung-ying Hon Albert CHAN Hon Frederick FUNG Dr Hon Joseph LEE Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Hon Patrick LAU Hon TAM Heung-man	Liberal Party (10 Members) Hon Daniel LAM Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon Albert CHENG	
		(46 Members)	(13 Members)	(Not applicable)

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views		
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)
3.	Each day of the Debate should start at 2:30 pm and end at 10:30 pm, but should be extended to 11:00 pm where necessary.	<p>Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (10 Members)</p> <p>Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions (3 Members)</p> <p>Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Dr Hon David LI Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah Hon Bernard CHAN Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Dr Hon Philip WONG Hon LAU Chin-shek Hon Abraham SHEK Hon LI Fung-ying Hon Frederick FUNG Dr Hon Joseph LEE Hon Daniel LAM Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon Patrick LAU Hon TAM Heung-man</p>	<p>Liberal Party (10 Members)</p> <p>Hon Albert CHENG</p>	<p>Democratic Party (9 Members)</p> <p>If the Debate is to be finished within three days, Members may consider starting each day of the Debate in the morning.</p> <p>Article 45 Concern Group (4 Members)</p> <p>Please refer to their views on Item 1.</p> <p>Hon Emily LAU</p> <p>Debate sessions can start at 9:00 am each day in the hope that they need not last until late night.</p> <p>Hon Timothy FOK</p> <p>Debate sessions will not draw much attention from the public if they extend into late night.</p> <p>Hon Albert CHAN</p> <p>Debate sessions can start at 9:00 am or 10:00 am.</p> <p>Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG</p> <p>Debate sessions should start earlier (Please refer to his views on Item 1.)</p>
		(31 Members)	(11 Members)	(17 Members)

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views				
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)		
				The total speaking time limit for each Member is proposed to be 30 minutes.	No particular views on the total speaking time limit for each Member. Subject to the total speaking time limit, each Member can choose to speak once or more than once in each debate session.	No reasons are given.
4.	Subject to the total speaking time limit of 20 minutes, and provided that no Member may speak after the designated public officer(s) has/have spoken, a Member can speak once in each of the five debate sessions.	<p>Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (10 Members)</p> <p>Liberal Party (10 Members)</p> <p>Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions (3 Members)</p> <p>Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO</p> <p>Dr Hon David LI</p> <p>Hon Timothy FOK</p> <p>Hon Albert CHAN</p> <p>Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki</p> <p>Hon TAM Heung-man</p>	Hon Daniel LAM Hon CHIM Pui-chung	<p>Democratic Party¹ (9 Members)</p> <p>Article 45 Concern Group² (4 Members)</p> <p>Hon LEE Cheuk-yan</p> <p>Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah</p> <p>Hon Bernard CHAN</p> <p>Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung</p> <p>Hon LAU Chin-shek</p> <p>Hon Emily LAU</p> <p>Hon Abraham SHEK</p> <p>Hon Frederick FUNG</p> <p>Dr Hon Joseph LEE</p> <p>Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung</p> <p>Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG³</p> <p>Hon Patrick LAU</p> <p>Hon Albert CHENG⁴</p> <p>(26 Members)</p>	Hon LI Fung-ying	Dr Hon Philip WONG
		(29 Members)	(2 Members)	(28 Members)		

¹ The total speaking time limit of 20 minutes for each Member is insufficient and proposed to be extended to 30 minutes.

² Please refer to their views on Item 1.

³ The speaking time limit should be extended to 30 minutes to cater for the needs of independent Members.

⁴ Each Member should be allowed to speak for 30 minutes as independent Members may not have sufficient time to speak on more than 10 policy areas if their speaking time is limited to less than 30 minutes.

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views		
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)
5.	The House Committee Chairman may speak for more than once in the fifth session on the amendment(s) and in reply respectively. The House Committee Chairman, as mover of the motion for the 2005 Debate, should have an additional 15-minute speaking time for moving the motion and in reply. If there is/are amendment(s) to the motion, another five minutes to speak on the amendment(s) should be allowed.	<p>Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (10 Members)</p> <p>Democratic Party (9 Members)</p> <p>Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions (3 Members)</p> <p>Article 45 Concern Group (4 Members)</p> <p>Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Dr Hon David LI Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah Hon Bernard CHAN Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Dr Hon Philip WONG Hon LAU Chin-shek Hon Emily LAU Hon Timothy FOK Hon Abraham SHEK Hon Frederick FUNG Dr Hon Joseph LEE Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Hon Patrick LAU Hon TAM Heung-man</p>	<p>Liberal Party (10 Members)</p> <p>Hon Daniel LAM Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon Albert CHENG</p>	<p>Hon LI Fung-ying The motion for the debate on the Policy Address should be couched in neutral terms and no amendment to the motion should be allowed.</p> <p>Hon Albert CHAN The same arrangements should apply across the board.</p>
		(43 Members)	(14 Members)	(2 Members)

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views		
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)
6.	After Members' speeches in each session, there should be a 10-minute suspension of the Council meeting for the Administration to coordinate its response.	Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (10 Members) Democratic Party (9 Members) Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions (3 Members) Article 45 Concern Group (4 Members) Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Dr Hon David LI Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah Hon Bernard CHAN Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Dr Hon Philip WONG Hon LAU Chin-shek Hon Emily LAU Hon Timothy FOK Hon Abraham SHEK Hon Albert CHAN Hon Frederick FUNG Dr Hon Joseph LEE Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Hon Patrick LAU Hon TAM Heung-man (44 Members)	Liberal Party (10 Members) Hon LI Fung-ying Hon Daniel LAM Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon Albert CHENG (15 Members)	(Not applicable)

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views		
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)
7.	<p>The total speaking time limit for designated public officers in each debate session should be :</p> <p>(a) for one or two officers, each officer may speak for not less than 15 minutes, subject to the total speaking time limit of 45 minutes. Under this arrangement, where two officers are to speak, the officer speaking first should not speak for more than 30 minutes, leaving at least 15 minutes for the other officer. Subject to such a restriction, it should be up to the officers to determine their order of speaking and actual speaking time; and</p> <p>(b) for three or more officers, it should be calculated on the basis of 15-minute speaking time limit for each officer.</p>	<p>Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (10 Members)</p> <p>Democratic Party (9 Members)</p> <p>Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions (3 Members)</p> <p>Article 45 Concern Group (4 Members)</p> <p>Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Dr Hon David LI Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Hon LAU Chin-shek Hon Emily LAU Hon Timothy FOK Hon LI Fung-ying Hon Albert CHAN Hon Frederick FUNG Dr Hon Joseph LEE Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon TAM Heung-man</p>	<p>Liberal Party (10 Members)</p> <p>Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Hon Albert CHENG</p>	<p>Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, Hon Bernard CHAN, Hon Abraham SHEK and Hon Patrick LAU</p> <p>The total speaking time limit for public officers should be no more than 30 minutes.</p> <p>Dr Hon Philip WONG No reasons are given.</p>
		(41 Members)	(13 Members)	(5 Members)

Item	Feature of the arrangements	Members' views		
		Support	No comment	Do not support (reasons/suggestions)
8.	The timing and manner in which the Policy Address-related publications are released, as decided by the Administration, should not cause inconvenience to Members.	<p>Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (10 Members)</p> <p>Democratic Party (9 Members)</p> <p>Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions (3 Members)</p> <p>Article 45 Concern Group (4 Members)</p> <p>Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Dr Hon David LI Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah Hon Bernard CHAN Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Dr Hon Philip WONG Hon LAU Chin-shek Hon Emily LAU Hon Timothy FOK Hon Abraham SHEK Hon LI Fung-ying Hon Albert CHAN Hon Frederick FUNG Dr Hon Joseph LEE Hon Daniel LAM Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Hon Patrick LAU Hon TAM Heung-man</p>	<p>Liberal Party (10 Members)</p> <p>Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon Albert CHENG</p>	
		(46 Members)	(13 Members)	(Not applicable)

Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong^a
 (10 Members)
 Hon CHAN Kam-lam
 Hon WONG Yung-kan
 Hon Jasper TSANG
 Hon LAU Kong-wah
 Hon CHOY So-yuk
 Hon TAM Yiu-chung
 Hon LI Kwok-ying
 Hon MA Lik
 Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming
 Hon WONG Ting-kwong

Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions^b
 (3 Members)
 Hon CHAN Yuen-han
 Hon WONG Kwok-hing
 Hon KWONG Chi-kin

Liberal Party^c
 (10 Members)
 Hon James TIEN
 Hon Mrs Selina CHOW
 Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG
 Hon Howard YOUNG
 Hon LAU Wong-fat
 Hon Miriam LAU
 Hon Tommy CHEUNG
 Hon Vincent FANG
 Hon Jeffrey LAM
 Hon Andrew LEUNG

Democratic Party^d
 (9 Members)
 Hon Albert HO
 Hon Martin LEE
 Hon Fred LI
 Hon James TO
 Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
 Hon SIN Chung-kai
 Dr Hon YEUNG Sum
 Hon Andrew CHENG
 Hon LEE Wing-tat

Article 45 Concern Group^e
 (4 Members)
 Hon Margaret NG
 Hon Audrey EU
 Hon Alan LEONG
 Hon TONG Ka-wah

The following Member has not given any views:
 Hon Mrs Rita FAN

Duration of the components of the five-session debate on the 2005 Policy Address

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
	20-minute speaking time limit for each Member	25-minute speaking time limit for each Member	30-minute speaking time limit for each Member
Speeches by House Committee Chairman in moving the Motion of Thanks, speaking on the amendment(s), if any, and reply	20 minutes	20 minutes	20 minutes
Speeches by 59 Members	19 hours 40 minutes	24 hours 35 minutes	29 hours 30 minutes
Speeches by 14 public officers (POs) calculated on the basis of 15 minutes for each officer	3 hours 30 minutes	3 hours 30 minutes	3 hours 30 minutes
Four suspensions before POs speak, which are calculated on the basis of 10 minutes for each suspension	40 minutes	40 minutes	40 minutes
Total duration	24 hours 10 minutes	29 hours 5 minutes	34 hours
Breakdown of the total duration by day of debate			
First day	2:30 pm – 10:30 pm* (8 hours)	2:30 pm – 10:30 pm* (8 hours)	2:30 pm – 10:30 pm* (8 hours)
Second day	9:00 am – 5:00 pm* (8 hours)	9:00 am – 7:30 pm* (10 ½ hours)	9:00 am – 10:00 pm* (13 hours)
Third day	9:00 am – 5:10 pm* (8 hours 10 minutes)	9:00 am – 7:35 pm* (10 hours 35 minutes)	9:00 am – 10:00 pm* (13 hours)

* subject to a 30-minute extension provided that the total duration of the debate is not exceeded.