

立法會
Legislative Council

Paper No. WKCD-527
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/HS/2/04/1

**Subcommittee on
West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

**Minutes of thirty-eighth meeting held on
Friday, 4 January 2008, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP
Hon Margaret NG
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon CHIM Pui-chung

**Public officers
attending**

- : Ms Esther LEUNG, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)
- Mr Vincent FUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 1
- Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 2
- Mr Howard LAM
Chief Treasury Accountant
(West Kowloon Cultural District)
- Mr Anthony T K KWAN
Assistant Director/Metro
Planning Department

**Attendance by
Invitation**

- : Individual
- Ms HO Loy
- Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.
- Miss Tisa HO
Executive Director
- Professional Commons
- Mr Albert LAI
Chairman
- Professional Property Services Limited
- Mrs Margaret BROOKE
Chief Executive Officer
- Hong Kong Society for Education In Art
- Mr Coleman WAI
Vice-President
- The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts

Prof Kevin THOMPSON
Director

Dr Herbert HUEY
Associate Director (Administration) & Registrar

Zuni Icosahedron

Mr Mathias WOO
Creative & Programme Director

The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd.

Prof CHAN Wing-wah, JP
Chairman

Individual

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Civic Party

Miss Tanya CHAN
Representative

The Fringe Club

Mr CHIA Chun-heng, Benny
Founder/Director

Hong Kong Arts Centre

Mr Alexander HUI
Executive Director

Miss Josephine NG
Research Officer

The Hong Kong Institute of Architects

Mr Alex LUI
Convenor
West Kowloon Cultural District Taskforce

Mr Freddie HAI

Member
West Kowloon Cultural District Taskforce

The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers

Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
President

Individual

Dr CHAN Yan-chong
Associate Professor
Department of Management Sciences
Faculty of Business
City University of Hong Kong

Hong Kong Christian Institute

Mr TOO Kin-wai
Acting Director

Miss LEUNG Cheuk-kwan
Assistant Programme Secretary (Publications)

Local Action

Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Member

Community Cultural Concern

Mr YUEN Chi-yan
Co-ordinator

People's Democracy Foundation

Miss SO Lok-yee, Sophia
Co-ordinator

The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors

Mr YU Kam-hung
President

Dr Paul HO
Past Chairman
Quantity Surveying Division

Hong Kong Curators Association

Mr CHAN Ki-hung
Chairman

Mr TANG Man-leung
Vice Chairman

Chung Ying Theatre Company

Mr Lawrence LAM
Chairman

Mr KO Tin-lung
Artistic Director

Zonta Club of Hong Kong

Mrs Nancy LEE
Representative

The People's Panel on West Kowloon

Prof CHAN Ching-kiu, Stephen
Convenor

Mr Jeffrey AU
Committee Member

The Lion Rock Institute

Mr WONG Kin-ming
Associate Scholar

Mr WONG Yee-wai
Executive Director

New Forum

Mr CHAN Choi-hi
Board Member

The Association of Architectural Practices Ltd.

Mr HO Chi-lok, Nevin
Member

Hong Kong Sinfonietta Ltd.

Ms YIP Wing-sie
Music Director

Miss LEE Ho-yee
General Manager

Individual

Mr Oscar HO
The Department of Cultural and Religious Studies
The Chinese University of Hong Kong

Momentum 107

Mr HO Man-kit, Raymond
Convenor

Ink Society

Mr David PONG Chun-yee
Vice Chairman

Mr Charles WONG Pak-chung
Administration Officer

The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong

Ms Liza WANG
Chairman

Hong Kong Arts Development Council

Mr Louis YU
Chief Executive

Asia Art Archive

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE
Chair, Board of Directors

Clerk in attendance : Ms Anita SIT
Chief Council Secretary (1)4

Staff in attendance : Miss Monna LAI
Assistant Legal Adviser 7

Mr Anthony CHU
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)7

Action

I Confirmation of minutes

(Paper No. WKCD-463 -- Minutes of meeting on
23 October 2007)

The minutes of the meeting held on 23 October 2007 were confirmed.

**II Key aspects of the proposed legislation for establishing a statutory
body to take forward the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

(Paper No. WKCD-471 -- Submission dated 7 December
2007 from Chinese-Scottish Band
Paper No. WKCD-472 -- Submission dated 31 December
2007 from Hong Kong Dance
Company
Paper No. WKCD-473 -- Submission dated 19 December
2007 from Hong Kong Repertory
Theatre
Paper No. WKCD-474 -- Submission dated 20 December
2007 from C & G Artpartment
Paper No. WKCD-475 -- Submission dated 21 December
2007 from Hong Kong
Philharmonic Orchestra
Paper No. WKCD-476 -- Submission dated 28 December
2007 from Habitus
Paper No. WKCD-477 -- Submission dated 28 December
2007 from 基層發展中心

Paper No. WKCD-483	-- Submission dated 28 December 2007 from 梁俊彥 and 10 other members of the public
Paper No. WKCD-484	-- Submission dated 2 January 2008 from The Hong Kong Construction Association, Ltd.
Paper No. WKCD-485	-- Submission dated 2 January 2008 from Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd.
Paper No. WKCD-451	-- Information paper on "Key aspects of the proposed legislation for establishing a statutory body" provided by the Administration
Paper No. WKCD-459	-- Information paper on "Some key aspects of the proposed legislation for establishing a statutory body" provided by the Administration)

2. The Subcommittee noted the following papers tabled at the meeting –

- (a) Chinese version of the submission dated 2 January 2008 from Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd. (Paper No. WKCD-478);
- (b) Submission dated 3 January 2008 from Cantonese Opera Advisory Committee (Chinese version only) (Paper No. WKCD-488);
- (c) Submission dated 4 January 2008 from Hong Kong Christian Institute (Chinese version only) (Paper No. WKCD-490);
- (d) Submission received from Professional Property Services Ltd. on 3 January 2008 (English version only) (Paper No. WKCD-492);
- (e) Submission dated 3 January 2008 from The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong (Chinese version only) (Paper No. WKCD-493);
- (f) Submission dated 3 January 2008 from The Hong Kong Institute of Architects (English version only) (Paper No. WKCD-494);
- (g) Submission dated 12 December 2007 from The People's Panel on West Kowloon (Chinese version only) (Paper No. WKCD-496); and
- (h) Submission dated 30 December 2007 from The People's Panel on West Kowloon (Chinese version only) (Paper No. WKCD-497).

(Post-meeting note: The above papers were circulated to members vide CB(1)537/07-08 on 7 January 2008.)

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at the **Appendix**).

Provision of papers

4. Mr LEE Wing-tat pointed out that the Administration should provide discussion papers at least three clear days before the relevant Subcommittee meeting to allow sufficient time for members to scrutinize the papers, otherwise, the Subcommittee should consider not discussing the papers. The Administration took note of Mr LEE's view.

Meeting with organizations and individuals

5. The Chairman welcomed the deputations to the meeting. At the invitation of the Chairman, individuals and representatives of various organizations presented their views on the Government's proposals for establishing a statutory body to take forward the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project.

(Post-meeting note: The powerpoint presentation materials of Community Cultural Concern and People's Democracy Foundation were issued to members by e-mail on 4 January 2008.)

Follow-up

6. Noting Mr Oscar HO's views expressed in his presentation about the inadequacies with the existing nomination system to return the 10 Council members of the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) representing the specified arts interests, Mr Albert HO requested the deputations, in particular, Mr Oscar HO, to give views on the aforesaid nomination system and on whether and how the nomination system can be improved and applied to the future statutory body to take forward the WKCD project. Since Mr Oscar HO had left the meeting, the Clerk was instructed to convey the request to Mr Oscar HO.

(Post-meeting note: The submission from Mr Oscar HO (Paper No. WKCD-508) providing further views on the nomination system of HKADC was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)655/07-08 on 22 January 2008.)

7. Members noted that the next meeting scheduled for Thursday, 24 January 2008 at 10:45 am would be devoted to discussing the outstanding issues in relation to the proposals for establishing a statutory body to take forward the WKCD project. Members also agreed that further meetings should be scheduled for 4 and 14 February 2008.

III Any other business

8. The meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 March 2008

**Proceedings of the thirty-eighth meeting of the
Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development
on Friday, 4 January 2008, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000 – 000857	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 23 October 2007 (Paper No. WKCD-463)	
000858 – 001200	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001201 – 001259	Administration	Briefing by Administration	
001300 – 001737	Chairman Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration	Further meetings to be scheduled for 24 January 2008, 4 and 14 February 2008	
001738 – 002036	Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC)	Presentation of views	
002037 – 002607	The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
002608 – 003031	Ms HO Loy	Presentation of views	
003032 – 003549	Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-478)	
003550 – 004022	Professional Commons	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-464)	
004023 – 004555	Professional Property Services Limited	Presentation of views	
004556 – 004828	Hong Kong Society for Education In Art	Presentation of views	
004829 – 005434	The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts	Presentation of views	
005435 – 010214	Zuni Icosahedron	Presentation of views	
010215 – 010735	The Composers & Authors Society of HK	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	Ltd.		
010736 – 011000	Ms Sabrina FUNG	Presentation of views	
011001 – 011516	Civic Party	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-479)	
011517 – 012117	The Fringe Club	Presentation of views	
012118 – 012729	Hong Kong Arts Centre	Presentation of views	
012730 – 013307	The Hong Kong Institute of Architects	Presentation of views	
013308 – 013737	The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-480)	
013738 – 014142	Dr CHAN Yan-chong	Presentation of views	
014143 – 014644	Hong Kong Christian Institute	Presentation of views	
014645 – 015210	Local Action	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-465)	
015211 - 015846	Community Cultural Concern	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-466)	
015847 – 020615	People's Democracy Foundation	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-467)	
020616 – 021157	The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors	Presentation of views	
021158 – 021733	Hong Kong Curators Association	Presentation of views	
021734 – 022155	Chung Ying Theatre Company	Presentation of views	
022156 – 022642	Zonta Club of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
012643 – 023400	The People's Panel on West Kowloon	Presentation of views	
023401 – 023758	The Lion Rock Institute	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-468)	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
023759 – 024311	New Forum	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-469)	
024312 – 024613	Hong Kong Sinfonietta Ltd.	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-481)	
024614 – 025111	Mr Oscar HO	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-482)	
025112 – 025639	Momentum 107	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-470)	
025640 – 030154	The Ink Society Ltd.	Presentation of views	
030155 – 030614	Asia Art Archive	Presentation of views	
030615 – 031621	Chairman Administration	<p>The Administration's explanation that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) there was a general consensus that the composition of the board of the WKCD Authority (WKCD Authority) should comprise professionals, especially during the planning and construction phases. The Administration would further consider whether representatives from the community could be appointed to the Board. As regards having some Board members nominated by the relevant arts and cultural sectors, there were practical difficulties in defining the arts and cultural sectors, given that there was no registration system for the sectors; (b) the Administration would consider specifying arts education and promotion, outreaching work to the community, software and audience development in the purposes, functions and powers of WKCD Authority; (c) WKCD Authority should allow the public to enjoy the public space in WKCD at no cost; (d) WKCD was a working title and the Administration welcomed suggestions for the name of the 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>cultural district. There was suggestion that the name of the cultural district should be linked to the "harbour" concept, and the names of overseas cultural districts had adopted the names of the respective regions. The name of the cultural district would be finalized in the bill to be submitted to LegCo;</p> <p>(e) the integration and connectivity between WKCD and neighbouring areas would be given further thoughts by the relevant Government departments in conjunction with WKCDA when preparing the master layout plan for WKCD;</p> <p>(f) the Administration would allocate additional resources to strengthening software training and arts education. A study would be undertaken by Home Affairs Bureau, Education Bureau and the Committee on Performing Arts on arts education in a school setting and in the community. The Administration would also examine measures for the local performing groups to retain talents. A survey would be undertaken on the manpower supply for the arts and cultural sector so that the training programmes at the relevant institutes could be enhanced to address the shortfall in manpower, if any; and</p> <p>(g) under the current schedule, the bill for the WKCDA would be introduced into LegCo in February 2008.</p>	
031622 – 032153	Ms Margaret NG	<p>Ms NG's expression of views that –</p> <p>(a) WKCDA was responsible for planning, developing and operating a substantial number of arts and cultural facilities as well as to promote the arts and cultural development and policies in Hong</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Kong. Any failure of the governance of WKCD would have dire consequences for Hong Kong's arts and cultural development;</p> <p>(b) a mechanism should be put in place to engage the public during different stages of the project development and to ensure the incorporation of public views;</p> <p>(c) various functions for WKCD, such as software development, developing Hong Kong into a cultural metropolis and the design of WKCD to complement the Victoria Harbour should be stipulated in the relevant sections of the proposed legislation;</p> <p>(d) a trust would have obvious benefits of better accountability and monitoring and the Administration should further consider the suggestion;</p> <p>(e) approving the endowment funding for WKCD in phases would enhance the accountability and monitoring of the project; and</p> <p>(f) the Administration should draft the bill in a way that flexibility would be allowed for WKCD to develop in a sustainable manner while proper monitoring mechanisms would be in place to ensure that there was no abuse of powers by WKCD.</p>	
032154 – 032755	Miss CHAN Yuen-han	<p>Miss CHAN's expression of view that –</p> <p>(a) masterplanning for WKCD should be undertaken by the Administration in view of the wide spectrum of interests involved;</p> <p>(b) WKCD and its neighbouring areas should not be planned discretely; otherwise, the integration, connectivity and accessibility between WKCD and the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>neighbouring districts could not be achieved;</p> <p>(c) WKCD and the Administration should bring arts and culture to the grassroots and to different districts, including Tin Shui Wai;</p> <p>(d) she had reservation that inclusion of only one LegCo Member in WKCD Board could effectively monitor the WKCD project;</p> <p>(e) she objected to the one-off upfront endowment arrangement and considered that the endowment funding should be approved in phases to improve accountability and transparency of WKCD; and</p> <p>(f) she was concerned whether LegCo Members would have sufficient time to complete the scrutiny of the bill, given that the current LegCo term would expire in July 2008.</p>	
032756 – 033252	Mr LEE Wing-tat	<p>Mr LEE's expression of views that –</p> <p>(a) the comment made by an individual attending the meeting that the purpose of organizations attending this meeting was to solicit funding from the future WKCD was grossly unfair and unfounded;</p> <p>(b) arts and cultural institutions all over the world were not financially self-sustainable. Arts organizations should strive to solicit funding from private sector. He invited the deputations to give views on how to achieve a balance between the participation of the Government and private sector in arts and cultural programmes; and</p> <p>(c) the arts and cultural programmes in WKCD should cater for the needs of different sectors of the community;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mr LI expressed concern on the training of local artists and talents and how Hong Kong's arts education could be implemented more effectively to nurture audience for arts and cultural programmes.</p>	
033253 – 033759	Mr Albert HO	<p>Mr HO's expression of views that –</p> <p>(a) while there was a consensual view on setting up a statutory board to take forward the WKCD project, there were different views on the implementation details; and</p> <p>(b) WKCD should complement the other performing venues and museums in Wanchai and Tsim Sha Tsui upon its commissioning.</p> <p>Mr HO expressed concern that the funding policy of WKCD would have implications on the funding policy for arts and culture in Hong Kong, and enquired about the details of funding support to the arts and cultural programmes in WKCD.</p> <p>Mr HO sought the views of deputations, in particular those of Mr Oscar HO, about whether and how improvements could be made to the nomination system for the Council members of HKADC representing the specified arts interests.</p>	<p>The Clerk to convey Mr Albert HO's enquiry to Mr Oscar HO</p>
033800 – 034340	Prof Patrick LAU	<p>Prof LAU's expression of view that -</p> <p>(a) the one-off upfront endowment would not facilitate monitoring and the Administration should consider enhancing the monitoring measures;</p> <p>(b) reference could be made to the cultural district development in Bilbao of Spain which was comparable to WKCD in terms of scale. The composition of the board of the Bilbao Rio 2000 was flexible; during the initial stage, more professionals in the engineering and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>construction industries were involved while professionals from arts and cultural sectors were invited to participate at a later stage; and</p> <p>(c) consideration could be given to organizing an open competition on the masterplan for WKCD.</p> <p>Highlighting the need for the integration between WKCD and the neighbouring areas, he sought information on the planning of the areas adjacent to WKCD, such as the site reserved for the terminal of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link.</p>	
034341 – 034949	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG's expression of views that –</p> <p>(a) WKCD site was originally planned to provide open space for the West Kowloon residents and the Administration had used administrative means, such as setting up a statutory body, to resolve the political issues in resources allocation;</p> <p>(b) the Administration's timetable that LegCo was to complete examination of the bill before July 2008 was unrealistic as there would not be sufficient time to consider and assimilate public views. Given that WKCD was irreversible once the arts and cultural facilities were developed, the project needed further and detailed discussion in consultation with the public;</p> <p>(c) Hong Kong should have a dedicated "Cultural Affairs Bureau" to take forward the development of arts and culture in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(d) as WKCD only focused on high culture which would not cater for the general public; instead of using \$21.6 billion for developing WKCD, the resources could be better utilized</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>to help people in poor districts;</p> <p>(e) he objected to granting \$21.6 billion for the WKCD project.</p>	
034909 – 035107	Hong Kong Curators Association	<p>The deputation's view that –</p> <p>(a) planning for hardware and software in WKCD should be undertaken together;</p> <p>(b) the appointment of members to the WKCDA board could make reference to the Smithsonian Institute to enhance accountability; and</p> <p>(c) WKCDA's funding policy would definitely have implications on the funding policy for arts and cultural in Hong Kong.</p>	
035108 – 035240	Zuni Icosahedron	<p>The deputation's view that –</p> <p>(a) there would not be sufficient time for LegCo and the public to discuss the bill if the bill was to be passed by July 2008; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should provide further information on the Planning Office for WKCD.</p>	
035241 – 035540	The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd.	<p>The deputation's view that –</p> <p>(a) a provisional board could be set up to undertake the preparatory work for the WKCD project;</p> <p>(b) committees and working groups could be formed under WKCDA to assist the board to carry out its work and conduct necessary consultation;</p> <p>(c) WKCD should offer different programmes to cater for the needs of different strata of the community; and</p> <p>(d) its concern that the general rule that</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		members of statutory bodies should not be appointed for more than six years would have impact on the work of WKCD.	
035541 – 035753	The People's Panel on West Kowloon	The deputation's view that WKCD should have an important task to make Hong Kong a cultural metropolis	
035754 – 035829	The Lion Rock Institute	The deputation's view that the proposed matching grant between the Government's contribution and private donation should be maintained at a ratio of 1 to 1	
035830 – 035934	Momentum 107	<p>The deputation's view that –</p> <p>(a) the public could not monitor the cost-effectiveness of arts and cultural programmes due to a lack of objective criteria; and</p> <p>(b) it objected to the endowment of \$21.6 billion for the WKCD.</p>	
035935 - 040102	Ms HO Loy	<p>The deputation's view that –</p> <p>(a) the Government should conduct researches on the vital processes of local cultural life to further understand the development of arts and culture in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(b) there was insufficient time for LegCo and the public to discuss the bill if the bill was to be passed by July 2008.</p>	
040103 – 040218	Chairman	Date of next meeting	