

立法會
Legislative Council

Paper No. WKCD-337
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/HS/2/04

**Subcommittee on
West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

**Minutes of twenty-sixth meeting held on
Friday, 23 June 2006, at 10:45 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP
Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP
Hon Margaret NG
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

Members absent : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

- Public officers attending** : **Agenda items III & IV**
- Ms Esther LEUNG
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)
- Mr Vincent FUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 1
- Clerk in attendance** : Ms Anita SIT
Chief Council Secretary (1)4
- Staff in attendance** : Ms Pauline NG
Assistant Secretary General 1
- Ms Bernice WONG
Assistant Legal Adviser 1
- Mr Anthony CHU
Council Secretary (1)2
- Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)7

Action

I Confirmation of minutes of meeting

- | | | |
|---------------------|----|---|
| (Paper No. WKCD-250 | -- | Minutes of meeting on 20 December 2005 |
| Paper No. WKCD-297 | -- | Minutes of meeting on 3 February 2006 |
| Paper No. WKCD-306 | -- | Minutes of meeting on 10 February 2006) |

The minutes of the meetings held on 20 December 2005, 3 February 2006 and 10 February 2006 were confirmed.

II Information papers issued since last meeting

- | | | |
|--|----|---|
| (Papers Nos. WKCD-256, 257, -- 258, 259, 260, 261, 262 and 263 | -- | Agenda and papers for the first meeting of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District on |
|--|----|---|

- 21 April 2006
- Papers Nos. WKCD-264, 265, -- Agendas and papers for the first
266, 267, 268, 269, 270 and meetings of the Performing Arts
271 and Tourism Advisory Group and
the Museums Advisory Group on
24 April 2006
- Papers Nos. WKCD-272, 273, -- Agenda and papers for the first
274 and 275 meeting of the Financial Matters
Advisory Group on 28 April 2006
- Paper No. WKCD-276 -- Paper on "Access to the Proposals
and Models of the three Screened-in
Proponents" for the first meeting of
the Performing Arts and Tourism
Advisory Group on 24 April 2006
- Paper No. WKCD-277 -- Paper on "Scope of Studies to be
Conducted by a Financial Advisor"
for the first meeting of the Financial
Matters Advisory Group on
28 April 2006
- Papers Nos. WKCD-281, 282, -- Agendas and papers for the second
283, 284, 285, 286, 287 and meetings of the Museums Advisory
288 Group and the Performing Arts and
Tourism Advisory Group on 15 and
16 May 2006 respectively
- Paper No. WKCD-289 -- A notice on the public consultative
forums held by the Museums
Advisory Group on 29 and 30 May
2006 and the Performing Arts and
Tourism Advisory Group on 1 and
2 June 2006)

2. Members noted that the above information papers had been issued since the last meeting.

III Views received from non-government organizations and individuals on the way forward for the West Kowloon Cultural District development

- (Paper No. WKCD-290 -- Submission dated 15 May 2006 from
Hong Kong Arts Development
Council
- Paper No. WKCD-291 -- Submission dated 9 May 2006 from
Museum of Site, Ltd.
- Paper No. WKCD-292 -- Submission received from Hong
Kong Alternatives on 23 May 2006

- Paper No. WKCD-293 -- Submission dated 23 May 2006 from The Hong Kong Academy For Performing Arts
- Paper No. WKCD-294 -- Submission dated 25 May 2006 from Dr Robert CHUNG, Public Opinion Programme, The University of Hong Kong
- Paper No. WKCD-295 -- Submission received from Hong Kong Society For Education In Art on 29 May 2006
- Paper No. WKCD-296 -- Submission dated 29 May 2006 from Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.
- Paper No. WKCD-298 -- Submission dated 2 June 2006 from Hong Kong Dance Company
- Paper No. WKCD-299 -- Submission dated 2 June 2006 from Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra
- Paper No. WKCD-300 -- Submission dated 8 June 2006 from Hong Kong Curators Association
- Paper No. WKCD-302 -- Submission received from Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Ltd. on 9 June 2006
- Paper No. WKCD-303 -- Submission dated 12 June 2006 from Government Cultural Services Grades' Alliance
- Paper No. WKCD-304 -- Submission dated 16 June 2006 from Hong Kong Repertory Theatre
- Paper No. WKCD-305 -- Submission received from The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong on 19 June 2006
- Paper No. WKCD-307 -- Paper entitled "Views received from non-government organizations and individuals on the way forward for the West Kowloon Cultural District development" prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- Paper No. WKCD-308 -- Information paper entitled "Recommendations of the Phase I and Phase II Reports and Administration's Response" provided by the Administration)

IV Arrangements for meeting(s) with the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District and its Advisory Groups

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at the **Appendix**).

4. The Chairman suggested and members agreed to discuss Items III and IV of the agenda together.

5. The Chairman advised members that pursuant to the decision of the Subcommittee at the last meeting on 6 April 2006, the Secretariat had issued letters to more than a hundred arts and cultural groups and other concern groups and individuals inviting them to express views on the way forward for the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD). The Secretariat had received 14 submissions so far. He drew members' attention to the paper prepared by the Secretariat (Paper No. WKCD-307) on the views received and the paper provided by the Administration (WKCD-308) setting out the Administration's response to the recommendations of the Subcommittee's Phase I and Phase II Reports. The Chairman then invited members to give views on how the Subcommittee should continue its work taking into account the views received.

Work of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District (CC) and its Advisory Groups (AGs)

6. Ms Margaret NG requested the Administration to elaborate on the progress of the work of CC and AGs and asked whether the CC and AGs would study the submissions received by the Subcommittee. The Chairman noted that according to the original work plan of the CC, it would submit a report to the Executive Council by the end of September 2006. He enquired whether the work plan had been revised and when CC and AGs would come up with concrete recommendations.

7. The Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3) (DS/HA) recapitulated that the CC and its three AGs were established in April 2006. CC had held one meeting so far. The Performing Arts and Tourism Advisory Group (PATAG) had held three meetings and organized five focus group meetings and two public forums, while the Museums Advisory Group (MAG) had held five meetings and organized one focus group meetings and two public forums. MAG had also met with overseas experts on museum management. During 17 May to 16 June 2006, some 30 written submissions had been received by the AGs. Groups of specific sectors had been invited to attend the focus group meetings. At this stage, the two AGs were still examining various subject matters under their respective purviews and had not come up with any concrete proposals. The Financial Matters Advisory Group (FMAG) would commence work at a later stage and the Government would commission a financial advisor to prepare

analyses on the financial implications of the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD and various financing options for FMAG's consideration. The original timeframe was for the CC to submit a report in six months after its establishment. Due to the enthusiastic discussions at the AGs with more than 30 forums, meetings and focus group meetings organized in the past two months, the AGs needed more time to complete their studies. The CC would endeavour to complete its work and submit the final report to the Chief Executive before the end of 2006.

8. As regards the submissions received by the Subcommittee, the Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District) 1 (PAS/HA) said that the CC and AGs would take into consideration the views in the submissions relevant to their respective purviews. He remarked that some of the organizations which had submitted views to the Subcommittee had also submitted views to the AGs and some of their representatives had also participated in the public forums and focus group meetings held by PATAG and MAG.

9. Miss CHAN Yuen-han was concerned that the Administration would exert too much influence and steer the deliberations of the AGs. Mrs Selina CHOW declared that she was a member of the CC and the Chairman of PATAG. She said that there had been candid and enthusiastic discussions at the PATAG and all members had adequate opportunities to express their views. She did not have the impression that the Administration was trying to steer the deliberations of the PATAG. However, members of PATAG were aware of the divergent views among stakeholders on what arts and cultural facilities should be provided in WKCD. In order that the project could be taken forward to the next stage as soon as possible, members of PATAG had worked hard to forge a consensus on the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD.

Statutory body for WKCD

10. In response to Mr Patrick LAU's enquiry on the timeframe for the establishment of the independent statutory body for WKCD, DS/HA replied that the work at the present stage was on the confirmation of CACF. The establishment of the statutory body would be the focus of the work at the next stage. According to the current plan, proposals for the establishment of the statutory body would be submitted to the Legislative Council (LegCo) in early 2007.

11. Miss CHAN Yuen-han asked whether the Administration would consider setting up a provisional authority to oversee the planning of WKCD and provide a platform for the solicitation and exchange of views of stakeholders and concerned parties on WKCD.

12. DS/HA advised that the Administration would not preclude the setting up of a provisional authority for WKCD before the independent statutory body for WKCD was established. At this stage, the Administration did not have a timetable for this matter as the priority task at present was to re-examine the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD.

Issues to be followed up by the Subcommittee and arrangements for next meeting

13. Ms Margaret NG suggested that the Subcommittee should hold a meeting before the start of the next legislative session, say in late September, to review the work progress of the CC and to plan for the work of the Subcommittee for the new session.

14. DS/HA advised that it was unlikely that the CC would have come up any concrete proposals by September, when the FMAG would have just commenced its work after receiving the recommendations from the other two AGs.

15. Mrs Selina CHOW said that based on the present work schedule, the FMAG would unlikely finish its study by September. Without the information and analyses on the financial arrangements, members would not be able to grasp the full picture. While she did not object to an interim progress report in September, she was concerned that the information available then would not provide a sufficient basis for a meaningful discussion by the Subcommittee. She considered it more desirable for the Subcommittee to hold its next meeting at the end of 2006 after the CC had submitted its report to the Chief Executive.

16. Ms Margaret NG considered it desirable for the Subcommittee to meet in late September to review the progress of the work of CC and AGs to ensure that the Subcommittee kept abreast of the development of the WKCD project. She also opined that those issues or concerns expressed in the submissions to the Subcommittee not covered by the CC and AGs should be followed up by the Subcommittee.

17. The Chairman said that it appeared that the first recommendation in the Phase II Report of the Subcommittee, namely, "Adopt an integrated and coordinated approach in the planning of West Kowloon Reclamation" (the integrated approach issue) would not be covered by the study of the CC. Ms Margaret NG then suggested that the Subcommittee should hear views from concern groups and individuals on the subject at the next meeting and the Secretariat should prepare some relevant background information to facilitate members' discussion.

18. Mr Abraham SHEK opined that the Subcommittee should monitor how the Administration took forward the WKCD project and whether it had duly followed up the recommendations of the Subcommittee. He emphasized that the Administration should have a substantiated cultural policy and the WKCD

should be geared to realize the policy objectives.

19. DS/HA recapped that the objective of WKCD was to develop it into an integrated arts, cultural and entertainment district. As an integrated development, the planning of the WKCD must be well co-ordinated with a unified style. Only by then would the WKCD meet public aspirations and become a new cultural landmark for Hong Kong. The CC and the AGs were fully aware of the need to adopt an integrated and coordinated approach in determining the types and themes of arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD. As regards the Government's cultural policy, she advised that the Administration had initiated discussions with the Panel on Home Affairs on the subject. The Panel would also discuss the first report of the Committee on Performing Arts at its meeting on 27 June 2006 and the areas covered by the report would address some major concerns of the arts and cultural sector.

(Post-meeting note: The meeting of the Panel on Home Affairs to discuss the first report of the Committee on Performing Arts was subsequently rescheduled for 3 July 2006.)

20. Mrs Selina CHOW said that according to her understanding, the CC and the AGs were aware that the provision of arts and cultural facilities in WKCD should not be separated from the planning context and thus had borne in mind the need for an integrated and coordinated approach. There was also coordination among the AGs to avoid gaps between their studies. The Housing, Planning and Lands Bureau (HPLB), which was represented at the CC, would look after the planning issues. HPLB, the Planning Department and other relevant departments would be actively involved at the next stage of planning after the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD had been confirmed. She therefore considered that the problem of piecemeal planning or the lack of coordination would not arise.

21. The Chairman said that while CC would bear in mind the need to adopt an integrated and coordinated approach in planning the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD, since the focus of its study was the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD, it probably would not consider issues such as the effects of the WKCD development on its neighbouring areas and other aspects of the WKCD in a wider context.

22. Mr Patrick LAU opined that an interim report on the recommendations or general directions of the deliberations of the CC and AGs should be presented to the Subcommittee. Given that planning should be based on users' requirements, he considered that relevant professionals should be involved to assist the CC or the Government to translate the users' requirements into specific planning parameters and design specifications.

23. On specific issues that the Subcommittee might consider to study, ASG1 pointed out that apart from the integrated approach issue, the development of creative industries in Hong Kong had been raised by Members on some past occasions but was not being followed up by any committee of the LegCo at present. The issue of how WKCD could support the development of creative industries in Hong Kong was one of the issues raised by deputations and might be a focal point of the Subcommittee's future study. In addition, the Subcommittee might also study certain issues not covered by the CC such as providing home base facilities in WKCD for arts groups to facilitate their long-term development. She noted that the Committee on Performing Arts commented in its report that a full-scale residency arrangement for the arts groups might not be a viable option, and remarked that the CC and AGs might be constrained by this comment in considering the types of facilities to be provided in WKCD.

24. Mrs Selina CHOW pointed out that the issues covered in the report of the Committee on Performing Arts Committee were pertinent to the overall performing arts policy rather than targeting at the WKCD. The recommendations in the report would be discussed by the Panel on Home Affairs. While AGs would make reference to the report, their deliberations would not necessarily be constrained by the comments and recommendations contained therein.

Conclusion

25. The Chairman said that the Subcommittee was very concerned about how the WKCD project would be taken forward, and would consider inviting CC members to exchange views after the CC had submitted its report to the Chief Executive. In the interim, members requested the Administration to provide a progress report by end September with details on the inclinations, if there were no concrete recommendations by then, of the AGs and CC, and the Subcommittee would meet in late September or early October to discuss the progress report. On the adoption of an integrated and coordinated approach in planning the WKCD, the Subcommittee would like to hear further views from concern groups and individuals and thus would invite them to attend the next meeting to present views on the subject.

26. DS/HA said that the Administration would provide an updated progress report to the Subcommittee by end of September and would try to include details on the progress of the work of the AGs and CC notwithstanding that their work would still be in progress and concrete recommendations might not be available by then.

27. Mrs Selina CHOW expressed concern that without any focal issues, deputations might find it difficult to provide views. In response, the Chairman suggested that only those deputations who had given views on issues relevant to

the adoption of an integrated and coordinated approach for planning the WKCD be invited to attend the next meeting, and certain focal points would be highlighted to facilitate their provision of views. He would discuss the detailed arrangements with the Secretariat. He added that the deputations' views and the discussion at the meeting might shed light on pertinent issues for the planning of WKCD and that would help the Administration and CC to plan the arts and cultural facilities and other elements of WKCD in a more comprehensive manner. Members agreed to the arrangement suggested by the Chairman.

V Any other business

28. The meeting ended at 12:00 noon.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
28 September 2006

**Proceedings of the twenty-sixth meeting of the
Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development
on Friday, 23 June 2006, at 10:45 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000-000346	Chairman	- Confirmation of minutes of meetings	
000347-001256	Ms Margaret NG Chairman Administration	- Whether the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District (CC) and its three Advisory Groups (AGs) would study the 14 submissions received by the Subcommittee - Briefing by the Administration on the work progress of CC and AGs - Whether the CC would release an interim report before submission of final report to the Chief Executive	
001257-001846	Ms Margaret NG Chairman Administration	- Suggestion of holding a meeting in late September to review the work of CC and AGs - The Administration agreed to provide a progress report in late September - Timetable for CC to submit a final report to the Chief Executive	
001847-002441	Mrs Selina CHOW	- Concern that there would not be concrete recommendations for the Subcommittee to discuss in September - Suggested that the Subcommittee to hold a meeting in December instead to discuss the report of CC	
002442-002824	Chairman ASG1 Ms Margaret NG	- The Subcommittee might follow up those issues that were raised in the submissions but were not covered by CC and AGs - The recommendation on adopting and integrated and coordinated approach in planning the WKCD in the Phase II Report might not be	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		followed up by the Government	
002825-002918	Ms Margaret NG Mr Abraham SHEK Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Subcommittee should not duplicate the work of CC and AGs - The need for a substantiated cultural policy for Hong Kong - The Subcommittee should monitor how the WKCD was taken forward and whether its recommendations were duly followed up by the Administration 	
002919-003746	Administration Chairman Mrs Selina CHOW	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - West Kowloon Cultural District to be developed into an integrated cultural district, with different elements under a unified style - The Administration would brief the Panel on Home Affairs on the report of the Committee on Performing Arts at its meeting on 27 June 2006 - The AGs were fully aware that the arts and cultural facilities should be planned in an integrated and coordinated manner 	
003747-004433	Mr Patrick LAU Chairman Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Request for an interim report to summarise the views received by the AGs and the inclinations or recommendations of the AGs - Timetable for setting up an independent statutory body for WKCD 	
004434-005402	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Administration Chairman Mrs Selina CHOW	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Concern over the influence of the Administration over the deliberations of CC and AGs - Whether a provisional authority would be set up during the lead time for the establishment of the statutory body for WKCD 	
005403-010445	Chairman ASG1 Mrs Selina CHOW	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Possible issues to be studied by the Subcommittee 	
010446-011148	Chairman ASG1 Mrs Selina CHOW Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Invitation of deputations to attend the next Subcommittee meeting - Information to be provided by the Administration for the next meeting 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
011149-011331	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Dr KWOK Ka-ki Mr James TIEN ASG1	- Timing of next meeting	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
28 September 2006