

立法會
Legislative Council

Paper No. WKCD-454
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/HS/2/04

**Subcommittee on
West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

**Minutes of thirty-fourth meeting held on
Tuesday, 9 October 2007, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP
Hon Margaret NG
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

**Public officers
attending**

: Ms Esther LEUNG, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 1

Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 2

Mr Howard LAM
Chief Treasury Accountant
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Spring-Time Stage

Mr KO Chi-sum
Chief Executive Officer & Producer

Designing Hong Kong Harbour District

Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN
Principal

The Fringe Club

Mr CHIA Chun-heng, Benny
Director

Professional Property Services Limited

Mrs Margaret BROOKE

Individual

Mr Oscar HO
The Department of Cultural and Religious Studies
The Chinese University of Hong Kong

The Hong Kong Institute of Planners

Mr Kim CHAN
Vice-President

Hong Kong Institute of Archaeology

Ms LIU Mao
Director

Hong Kong Construction Industry Employees General Union

Mr CHOI Chun-wa
Chairman

Hong Kong Dance Company

Mr YUEN Lup-fun
Executive Director

Hong Kong Ballet

Mr John YING
Board Chairman

Mrs Stacey MORSE
Honorary Chief Executive Officer

Local Action

Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Member

Community Cultural Concern

司徒薇女士
成員

The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd.

Prof CHAN Wing-wah, JP
Chairman

Happening Group

Mr Andy TAM
Chairman

Museum of Site

Mr LAM Hon-kin, Andrew
Curator

Clerk in attendance : Ms Anita SIT
Chief Council Secretary (1)4

Staff in attendance : Ms Pauline NG
Assistant Secretary General 1

Mr Anthony CHU
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)7

Action

I Recommendation report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District

(Paper No. WKCD-398 -- Paper on "Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District" provided by the Administration

Paper No. WKCD-404 -- Submission dated 3 October 2007 from Mr CHAN Kin-shing, Yau Tsim Mong District Council member)

The Subcommittee noted the following papers tabled at the meeting –

- (a) Submission dated 9 October 2007 from Designing Hong Kong Harbour District (Paper No. WKCD-413);
- (c) Submission received from Professional Property Services Limited on 9 October 2007 (Paper No. WKCD-414);
- (d) Submission dated 9 October 2007 from Happening Group (Paper No. WKCD-415);
- (e) Submission dated 9 October 2007 from Museum of Site (Paper No. WKCD-416); and

- (f) Joint submission dated 11 September 2007 from Community Cultural Concern and Local Action (Paper No. WKCD-417).

(Post-meeting note: The above papers were circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)30/07-08 on 10 October 2007.)

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at the **Appendix**).

Meeting with organizations and individual

3. The Chairman welcomed the deputations to the meeting. At the invitation of the Chairman, individual and representatives of various organizations presented their views on the Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District (the Recommendation Report).

Discussion

WKCD Authority

4. Members enquired whether there would be interim arrangements before the establishment of the WKCD Authority to expedite the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project. Such arrangements might include the formation of a provisional body to take up the necessary preparatory work and the publication of a White Bill on the WKCD Authority for early public consultation.

5. The Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs(3) (DS/HA(3)) said that after the completion of the public engagement exercise, if there was a general public consensus to accept the Recommendation Report as the basis for the way forward for the WKCD project, the Administration would introduce the enabling legislation for the WKCD Authority into the Legislative Council (LegCo) by early 2008. As such, a provisional body or a White Bill might not be necessary. To facilitate Members' early discussion on matters relating to the establishment of the WKCD Authority, the Administration would provide details of the proposed legislative framework for the Authority to LegCo before the formal introduction of the Bill into LegCo.

6. As to how the WKCD Authority should be constituted, Mr LEE Wing-tat suggested that some members of the WKCD Authority could be nominated by the relevant arts and cultural sectors to enhance their accountability. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung stressed that the Administration should make public the criteria it would use in appointing members of the Authority. Some deputations, however, expressed reservations on having some members of the Authority

nominated by the relevant arts and cultural sectors, as the current nomination system adopted for the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) was much criticized by the arts and cultural sectors. These deputations suggested that before a better nomination system had been worked out, appointment of people with high standing in the relevant arts and cultural sectors to the Authority by the Government would be preferred.

7. Ms Audrey EU expressed concern about the role of the WKCD Authority in contributing to the long-term development of Hong Kong as a cultural metropolis and its relationship with the existing public bodies in the arts and cultural sector. Dr KWOK Ka-ki considered that there should be representatives from the arts and cultural sectors and representatives of the general public in the WKCD Authority. He was concerned on how the WKCD Authority would be accountable to the public and LegCo for its work.

8. DS/HA(3) advised that the relationship between the WKCD Authority and the Government might be similar to that between HKADC and the Government. Given the broad range of powers and functions of the Authority, the Administration would consider additional measures to enhance its accountability.

9. Ms Audrey EU suggested and members agreed that the Subcommittee should schedule another meeting for members to further discuss with interested parties on the functions, powers and composition of the WKCD Authority.

Cultural policy and software development

10. Members expressed concerns on how the cultural software development in Hong Kong, such as nurturing of budding artists and development of small to medium-scale performing arts groups, could complement the WKCD project. The Administration was requested to formulate a holistic plan and take immediate actions to implement enhancement and strengthening measures. Some deputations suggested that a Bureau on Cultural Affairs should be set up to oversee the development of arts and culture in Hong Kong.

11. In response, DS/HA(3) said that the Administration would strengthen its work on cultural software development. In this connection, it would conduct a review on the funding arrangements for performing art groups and the development of "flagship" performing companies. HKADC would offer specific programmes to nurture the young and budding artists. The Administration would also discuss with the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts and local universities on manpower training for the arts and cultural sector. The Administration would brief the Panel on Home Affairs on this subject matter shortly.

Review on existing arts and cultural facilities

12. Mr LEE Wing-tat saw a need for the Administration to review the usage and management of existing performing venues and other cultural facilities under the management of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) so that the venues could be optimized for arts and cultural development. This view was shared by Miss CHOY So-yuk. Miss CHOY called on the Administration to take positive actions to further develop cultural hardware outside WKCD to foster a cultural ambience across the 18 districts in Hong Kong.

13. DS/HA(3) said that the Administration was mindful of the need to realign the existing public arts and cultural facilities to complement the WKCD project. The Administration was studying the implementation of the recommendations of the Committee on Museums and the Committee on Performing Arts, including transferring the management of public museums to a statutory museum board in a few years' time and the adoption of the venue partnership scheme for public performing venues which would be open to local arts groups/organizations.

Follow-up actions

Admin 14. The Administration was requested to explicate in writing how it would respond to the following recommendations of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District and to provide detailed information on the relevant work plans:

- (a) Pending introduction of the Bill into LegCo for establishment of the WKCD Authority and scrutinization of the Bill, there was a need to consider whether, through administrative means, a provisional body or some form of steering committee should be set up to take forward the early stage of preparatory work at once, such as masterplanning, conducting research and detailed planning studies on individual facilities and recruitment of senior staff for the WKCD Authority. (*Paragraph 8.1.8 of the Recommendation Report*)
- (b) There was a need for a review on the current funding and assessment system for performing arts so as to facilitate its long-term growth and development. (*Paragraph 8.2.3 of the Recommendation Report*)
- (c) The Government to take the opportunity to review the operational modes of existing LCSD performing venues and museums with a view to seeking improvements and providing on-the-job training opportunities for arts administration and venue management which would be in great demand for the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities in WKCD in future. (*Paragraph 8.2.8 of the Recommendation Report*)

15. Members noted that the next Subcommittee meeting scheduled for 23 October 2007 would also be devoted for interested parties to express views on the Recommendation Report and so far 24 individuals/organizations had registered to attend the meeting.

II Any other business

16. The meeting ended at 12:13 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 December 2007

**Proceedings of the thirty-fourth meeting of the
Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development
on Tuesday, 9 October 2007, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000 – 000340	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000341 - 000500	Ms Emily LAU Prof Patrick LAU Chairman	Attendance of the Secretary for Home Affairs and other public officers responsible for planning at the meeting	
000501 - 000640	Chairman	Time limit for deputations to present their views at the meeting	
000641 - 001107	Spring-Time Stage (STS)	Presentation of views	
001108 - 001803	Designing Hong Kong Harbour District	Presentation of views	
001804 - 002532	The Fringe Club	Presentation of views	
002533 - 003044	Professional Property Services Limited	Presentation of views	
003045 - 003759	Mr Oscar HO	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-405)	
003800 - 004119	The Hong Kong Institute of Planners	Presentation of views	
004120 - 004924	Hong Kong Institute of Archaeology (HKIA)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-401)	
004925 - 005500	Hong Kong Construction Industry Employees General Union	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-406)	
005501 - 010143	Hong Kong Dance Company (HKDC)	Presentation of views	
010144 - 010819	Hong Kong Ballet	Presentation of views	
010820 - 011613	Local Action (LA)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-402)	
011614 - 012326	Community Cultural Concern (CCC)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-403)	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
012327 - 013050	The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd. (TCASHK)	Presentation of views	
013051 - 013839	Happening Group (HG)	Presentation of views	
013840 - 014409	Museum of Site (MoS)	Presentation of views	
014410 - 015114	Administration	<p>The Administration explained about –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the plan to strengthen cultural software development and the Administration would brief the Panel on Home Affairs on the latest progress of the matter; (b) the plan to realign the existing arts and cultural facilities with the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project; (c) the planning process of WKCD project; and (d) preparatory work for the Museum Plus (M+). 	
015115 - 015616	Prof Patrick LAU Administration	<p>Prof LAU enquired whether a provisional WKCD body would be formed to provide a platform for dialogue with the relevant arts and cultural sectors and professionals.</p> <p>Prof LAU's view on the need for the Administration to take immediate actions to enhance cultural software development.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that the Bill on the WKCD Authority would be introduced into Legislative Council (LegCo) in early 2008 if there was a consensus on the way forward for the project after the completion of the public engagement exercise. The Administration would provide details of the legislative framework</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		to LegCo for early discussion.	
015617 - 020234	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG's expression of views that –</p> <p>(a) development of arts and culture would be successful only under an environment which respected freedom of expression and creation;</p> <p>(b) WKCD project should not be operated under commercial principles as the high costs would not be conducive to developing Hong Kong as a cultural metropolis;</p> <p>(c) establishment of the WKCD should not be conducted in a hasty manner. Thorough discussion on the Authority's composition and the criteria for appointing its members was required; and</p> <p>(d) the public should be encouraged to give views on planning and land use for the WKCD project at the present public engagement exercise.</p>	
020235 - 021133	<p>Ms Audrey EU TCASHK CCC Chairman Ms Margaret NG</p>	<p>Ms EU invited views from deputations on the roles, work, functions and composition of the WKCD Authority.</p> <p>TCASHK's suggestions of setting up a Bureau on Cultural Affairs to oversee the planning and implementation of cultural affairs at both the territorial and district levels.</p> <p>CCC's view that a standing mechanism should be established for continuous dialogue between District Councils and the Home Affairs Bureau on cultural matters and on WKCD. Another</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>mechanism should also be established for continuous engagement of primary and secondary schools and local tertiary institutes in the WKCD project.</p> <p>Ms EU and Ms NG suggested the Subcommittee should hold a meeting to discuss on the WKCD Authority.</p>	
021134 - 021836	Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration	<p>Dr KWOK expressed regret that the Secretary for Home Affairs and the Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs failed to attend the meeting to hear deputations' views.</p> <p>Dr KWOK's expression of concerns about –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the training and nurturing of local artists and art groups to complement the WKCD project and the relevant funding arrangements; (b) the composition of WKCD and how the WKCD Authority would be accountable to the public and LegCo for its work; (c) whether the WKCD project would led to a reduction in Government funding for arts and cultural facilities development in other districts. <p>The Administration's explanation that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration would provide the details about the WKCD Authority for discussion by LegCo as soon as possible; (b) the relationship between the WKCD Authority and the Government might be similar to that between the Hong Kong Arts Development Council 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(HKADC) and the Government, while additional measures might be introduced to ensure the accountability of the WKCD Authority; and</p> <p>(c) the cultural policy and the overall cultural software development in Hong Kong were outside the ambit of the WKCD Authority. The Government would allocate additional resources to strengthen the training of artists, development of performing companies and arts education.</p>	
021837 - 022502	Mr LEE Wing-tat STS	<p>Mr LEE's enquired whether some members of the WKCD Authority would be elected by the respective arts and cultural sectors.</p> <p>Mr LEE's expression of concern about –</p> <p>(a) the long-term viability of M+ based on the present concept and proposed theme;</p> <p>(b) the use of existing performing venues for non-cultural activities and the management mode for existing venues; and</p> <p>(c) the efficacy of arts education and the appeal of high art to the younger generation</p> <p>STS pointed out that there had been a substantial increase in the number of audience for arts and cultural programmes in recent years. Some performing groups could sustain themselves without Government subsidy. While it was virtually impossible for art groups to hire a performance venue for a few months, it was now easier to hire a venue for a week or so to stage a performance.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
022503 - 023251	Ms Margaret NG Administration MoS HKIA HKDC	<p>Ms NG expressed the view that Chapter 8 of the Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District only laid down very broad guidelines for the WKCD Authority. The Chapter did not contain sufficient details to facilitate meaningful public consultation on the subject. If the details of the WKCD Authority would only be revealed with the introduction of the Blue Bill, the room for changes would then be highly restricted and thus the approach would not be conducive to building consensus within the community.</p> <p>The Administration's response that it would provide detailed proposals on the WKCD Authority for discussion by LegCo and the public before the relevant Bill was introduced into LegCo.</p> <p>Support from MoS and HKIA on setting up a Bureau on Cultural Affairs to oversee the WKCD project as well as the existing arts and cultural facilities.</p> <p>MoS's reservation on having some members of the WKCD Authority members nominated by the relevant arts and cultural sectors, as current nomination arrangement adopted for HKADC had a number of problems.</p> <p>HKDC's expression of view that the WKCD project should not be held up by anticipated risks and difficulties. The establishment of WKCD Authority could make reference to experiences of similar organizations in Hong Kong and overseas. Instead of establishing a</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Government-led authority, emphasis should be placed on enlisting the engagement of stakeholders.	
023252 - 023937	Miss CHOY So-yuk CCC HG	<p>Miss CHOY's expression of views that –</p> <p>(a) the Administration should review development of software and hardware outside WKCD which should be followed up by the Panel on Home Affairs;</p> <p>(b) the Administration could consider conducting intensive workshops to solicit public views on the WKCD Authority; and</p> <p>(c) overseas arts and cultural groups as well as local artists should be welcomed to perform in WKCD.</p> <p>CCC's expression of view that there was a mismatch between the supply and demand for performing venues and CCC would conduct a bottom-up survey on the supply of performing venues. While expressing support for establishment of a Bureau on Cultural Affairs, CCC would, pending the realization of such institutional arrangements, conduct research and make recommendations to the Home Affairs Bureau regarding the changes and enhancements required of the Government's cultural policy and resource deployment mechanisms. There was also a problem with the nurturing of local literary art talents.</p> <p>HG's view that the development of the arts and culture could not be reflected solely by the attendance rates of popular programmes. The development was inadequate as</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		evidenced by the absence of any arts criticism magazine in Hong Kong.	
023938 - 024606	Ms Emily LAU LA	<p>In response to Ms LAU's enquiry on LA's claim that the Recommendation Report had not consulted the residents living in the old districts in West Kowloon and the accessibility of WKCD to these residents, LA's explanation that –</p> <p>(a) the Financial Matters Advisory Group had not conducted public consultation;</p> <p>(b) the Recommendation Report had not addressed the original purpose of the West Kowloon Reclamation Area to provide more open space for the residents living in the old districts in West Kowloon; and</p> <p>(c) WKCD should be planned without luxury residential developments and its accessibility and integration with the old districts should be ensured.</p>	
024607 - 025309	Mr Albert HO MoS TCASHK STS	<p>Mr HO invited views from deputations on the need for a bureau dedicated to cultural affairs and how the existing arts and cultural facilities could complement the WKCD development.</p> <p>MoS's view that a bottom-up approach should be adopted to engage the residents living in the old districts in West Kowloon in the planning process for WKCD.</p> <p>TCASHK's reservation on the HKADC's member nomination system, which was much criticized by the local arts and cultural sectors, and its view that the Administration and the public</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>should adopt a new mindset on identifying and nurturing of new art talents.</p> <p>STS's clarification that in order to bring art into the community, it had staged performances in Tin Shui Wai.</p>	
025310 - 025714	Chairman	<p>The Chairman's summary of members' concerns about –</p> <p>(a) software development;</p> <p>(b) how to revamp the existing arts and cultural facilities to complement with the WKCD project to develop Hong Kong into a cultural metropolis; and</p> <p>(c) roles, functions and composition of the WKCD Authority and its accountability</p>	
025715 - 025903	Ms Margaret NG	Request for information	Administration to take follow-up actions
025904 - 030235	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG's reiteration of views that –</p> <p>(a) by adopting a commercial principle for the development of WKCD, the high cost would not be conducive to aggregation of art and cultural talents and the incubation of an organic cultural district. Members had a responsibility to ensure that WKCD project was cost-effective and would meet the needs of the public; and</p> <p>(b) he had doubts about the feasibility of the exchange programme of arts and culture programme with the Pearl River Delta, given the different social systems in Hong Kong and China.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
030236 - 030626	Administration Chairman Ms Emily LAU	<p>The Administration was requested to provide information requested by members at previous meeting before the next meeting scheduled for 23 October 2007.</p> <p>Ms LAU's enquiry about the number of deputations registered to present views at the next meeting.</p>	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 December 2007