

立法會
Legislative Council

Paper No. WKCD-463
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/HS/2/04/1

**Subcommittee on
West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

**Minutes of thirty-fifth meeting held on
Tuesday, 23 October 2007, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun (Deputy Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Margaret NG
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon CHIM Pui-chung

**Public officers
attending**

: Ms Esther LEUNG, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 1

Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 2

Mr Howard LAM
Chief Treasury Accountant
(West Kowloon Cultural District)
Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Anthony T K KWAN
Assistant Director for Planning/Metro

Mr Raymond HO Wai-fu
Government Engineer/Railway Development
Highways Department

Mr LAM Hon
Chief Engineer/Traffic Engineering (Kowloon)
Transport Department

Mr Sheridan LEE Sha-lun
Principal Education Officer
(Curriculum Development)
Education Bureau

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Hong Kong Society for Education In Art

Mr Coleman WAI
Vice-President

Zuni Icosahedron Ltd.

Mr Mathias WOO
Creative & Programme Director

Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.

Miss Tisa HO
Executive Director

The Association of Architectural Practices Ltd.

Mr HO Chi-lok, Nevin
Member

The Hong Kong Institute of Architects

Mr Alex LUI
Convenor
West Kowloon Cultural District Taskforce

Mr Freddie HAI
Member
West Kowloon Cultural District Taskforce

The Democratic Party

Mr LAM Hon-kin
Deputy Spokesman for Culture, Arts and Sports

The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong

阮兆輝先生
副主席

Association of Engineering Professionals in Society

Mr YIM Kin-ping
Senior Vice Chairman

Hong Kong Institute of Real Estate Administration

Mr Kyran SZE
Vice President

Hong Kong Alternatives

Mr Ken WAI
Member

Mr CHIK Wing-hong
Member

Hong Kong Construction Association

Mr Anthony CHAN
Honorary Secretary

Mr Thomas TSE
Secretary General

Hong Kong Repertory Theatre

Mr CHAN Kin-bun
Executive Director

Hong Kong Arts Administrators' Association Ltd.

Mr Philip SODEN
Convenor
Focus Group on West Kowloon

Hong Kong Arts Centre

Mrs Cissy PAO WATARI, BBS
Chairman, Board of Governors

Mr Alexander HUI
Executive Director

Hong Kong Curators Association

Mr CHAN Ki-hung
Chairman

Mr TANG Man-leung
Vice Chairman

The People's Panel on West Kowloon

Prof CHAN Ching-kiu, Stephen
Convenor

Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra

Ms CHIN Man-wah, Celina
Executive Director

The International Association of Art Critics
(Hong Kong Chapter)

Ms Valerie DORAN
Member

Individual

Ms HO Loy

Hong Kong Arts Development Council

Mr MA Fung-kwok
Chairman

Mr Louis YU
Chief Executive

Ink Society

Mr David PONG Chun-yee
Vice Chairman

Mr Charles WONG Pak-chung
Administration Officer

The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts

Prof Kevin THOMPSON
Director

Dr Herbert HUEY
Associate Director (Administration) & Registrar

Civic Party

Miss Tanya CHAN
Representative

Professional Commons

Mr NG Wing-fai, Stanley
Representative

The Associations of Managers, Cultural Services

Miss Irene LAM
President

Miss Shirley WONG
Vice-President

Action Group on Protection of the West Kowloon
Culture District

Ms CHENG Lai-king
Member

Habitus

Mr TSANG Tak-ping
Member

People's Democracy Foundation

Miss SO Lok-yee, Sophia
Co-ordinator

Mr SHAM Hok-man, Desmond
Member

香港小童群益會長沙灣中心

Ms FU Suk-yin
Representative

Clerk in attendance : Ms Anita SIT
Chief Council Secretary (1)4

Staff in attendance : Ms Pauline NG
Assistant Secretary General 1

Mr Anthony CHU
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)7

I Recommendation report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District

(Paper No. WKCD-398 -- Paper on "Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District" provided by the Administration)

The Subcommittee noted the following papers tabled at the meeting –

- (a) Submission received from Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd on 23 October 2007 (Paper No. WKCD-430);
- (b) Submission dated 22 October 2007 from The Hong Kong Institute of Architects (Paper No. WKCD-431);
- (c) Submission dated 23 October 2007 from The Democratic Party (Paper No. WKCD-432);
- (d) Submission received from Hong Kong Construction Association on 23 October 2007 (Paper No. WKCD-433);
- (e) Submission received from Hong Kong Arts Development Council on 23 October 2007 (Paper No. WKCD-435);
- (f) Submission dated 23 October 2007 from Professional Commons (Paper No. WKCD-436); and
- (g) Submission received from Ms Sabrina M Y FUNG on 22 October 2007 (Paper No. WKCD-442).

(Post-meeting note: The above papers were circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)112/07-08 on 24 October 2007.)

2. The Chairman drew members' attention to the Administration's response to some of the questions raised and information requested by Subcommittee members at and subsequent to the meetings on 3 and 9 October 2007 which was tabled at the meeting. The paper (Paper No. WKCD-441) was subsequently circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)117/07-08 on 24 October 2007.

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at the **Appendix**).

Meeting with organizations and individuals

4. The Chairman welcomed the deputations to the meeting. At the

invitation of the Chairman, individual and representatives of various organizations presented their views on the Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District.

II Any other business

5. The meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 January 2008

**Proceedings of the thirty-fifth meeting of the
Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development
on Tuesday, 23 October 2007, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000 – 000400	Chairman	Opening remark Time limit for deputations to present their views at the meeting Schedule of meetings	
000401 - 000530	Hong Kong Society for Education In Art	Presentation of views	
000531 - 001025	Zuni Icosahedron Ltd.	Presentation of views	
001026 - 001426	Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.	Presentation of views	
001427 - 001506	The Association of Architectural Practices Ltd.	Presentation of views	
001507 - 002129	The Hong Kong Institute of Architects (HKIA)	Presentation of views	
002130 - 002444	The Democratic Party	Presentation of views	
002445 - 002943	The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
002944 - 003240	Association of Engineering Professionals in Society	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-425)	
003241 - 004018	Hong Kong Institute of Real Estate Administration	Presentation of views	
004019 - 004700	Hong Kong Alternatives (HKA)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-420)	
004701 - 005059	Hong Kong Construction Association	Presentation of views	
005100 - 005429	Hong Kong Repertory	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	Theatre		
005430 - 010014	Hong Kong Arts Administrators' Association Ltd.	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-421)	
010015 - 010601	Hong Kong Arts Centre	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-426)	
010602 - 011248	Hong Kong Curators Association (HKCA)	Presentation of views	
011249 - 011914	The People's Panel on West Kowloon (PPWK)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-427)	
011915 - 012016	Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra	Presentation of views	
012017 - 012449	The International Association of Art Critics (Hong Kong Chapter)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-422)	
012450 - 013204	Ms HO Loy	Presentation of views	
013205 - 013703	Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC)	Presentation of views	
013704 - 014129	Ink Society	Presentation of views	
014130 - 014539	The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts (HKAPA)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-419)	
014540 - 015137	Civic Party	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-428)	
015138 - 015805	Professional Commons	Presentation of views	
015806 - 020355	The Associations of Managers, Cultural Services (AMCS)	Presentation of views	
020356 - 020934	Action Group on Protection of the West Kowloon Culture District	Presentation of views	
020935 - 021431	Habitus	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(Paper No. WKCD-423)	
021432 - 022042	People's Democracy Foundation (PDF)	Presentation of views (Paper No. WKCD-424)	
022043 - 022659	香港小童群益會長沙灣中心	Presentation of views	
022700 - 023000	Chairman	The Chairman summarized the concerns expressed by the deputations in relation to the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) Authority, connectivity between WKCD and other districts, integration between WKCD and the neighbouring districts, the planning process for WKCD and cultural software development.	
023001 - 024247	Administration	<p>The Administration's explanation that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it would shortly consult the Subcommittee on the major contents and proposals of the Bill on the WKCD Authority. The Authority would have the participation of the arts and cultural sector and representatives of the public; (b) individual arts and cultural facilities in WKCD might adopt different management modes depending on their respective characteristics; (c) the Administration would strengthen cultural software development and manpower training. A study was being conducted on funding matters for the major professional performing arts groups. The Administration would also conduct a comprehensive manpower mapping survey to assess the demand and supply of artists and arts-related professionals (the Survey). The relevant sector and the cultural 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>services managers of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) would be consulted in due course;</p> <p>(d) the Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) and Education Bureau had reviewed the strategy and objectives of implementing arts education in primary and secondary schools, with particular emphasis on arts appreciation;</p> <p>(e) HAB would explore with the Tourism Commission on promoting arts and cultural programmes to overseas visitors;</p> <p>(f) the Administration would enhance the promotion of arts to the community, with the provision of alternative arts space, creative arts centres and new performing venues at various districts. Pilot projects would be conducted to explore using facilities within school premises as community-based venues for arts and cultural uses; and</p> <p>(g) in addition to the present public engagement exercise, the public would have opportunities to give views on the development parameters for WKCD when the proposed amendments to the draft South West Kowloon outline zoning plan (OZP) to incorporate the development parameters had been submitted to the Town Planning Board for consideration.</p>	
024248 - 025004	Ms Emily LAU PDF HKA HKIA	<p>Ms LAU sought deputations' views on the suggestion made by HKA and PDF of using the WKCD site to build a cultural park without residential and commercial developments.</p> <p>PDF and HKA pointed out that</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>compared with overseas metropolises, Hong Kong did not have any great central park. If the design of the park could cater for public accessibility, sufficient people flow could be ensured. HKA suggested that a Hong Kong Cultural Authority should be established and an entrepreneur should be appointed to lead the Authority to operate the cultural park in WKCD for long-term financial viability.</p> <p>HKIA's expression of view that WKCD should be planned to provide diversified hardware and software contents. Given the time required for planning, public consultation on planning for WKCD should start as soon as possible.</p>	
025005 - 025738	Miss CHOY So-yuk Administration	<p>Miss CHOY's expression of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration should clarify the official Chinese name for WKCD; (b) she was concerned about the shortfall in manpower for cultural services managers under LCSD; (c) she supported the setting up of a child museum and other facilities for children and families; (d) she was concerned whether WKCD could address the issue of preservation of indigenous arts; (e) she asked whether the Administration would review existing legislations that restricted street performance to facilitate its development; and (f) she asked whether the Administration would consider organizing open competitions instead of competitions by 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>invitation for the design of the iconic buildings in WKCD.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that –</p> <p>(a) suggestions of the Chinese name for WKCD from the public were welcome;</p> <p>(b) the Survey would cover the supply of cultural services managers under LCSD;</p> <p>(c) WKCD would provide room for the development of local and indigenous cultures. The Administration would strengthen efforts to promote arts at the community level. M+ was a forward-looking idea with the flexibility to cater for the change in the museum scene in the next 20-30 years. The concept of M+ also stressed the importance of outreaching and bringing arts to the community; and</p> <p>(d) Subject to public views, the Administration would consider organizing open architectural competitions for the iconic buildings in WKCD. Organizing open competitions would require more time.</p>	
025739 - 030457	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Habitus The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong PPWK	<p>Miss CHAN's expression of views that –</p> <p>(a) it was important to ensure the integration of WKCD with the old districts in West Kowloon. The Administration should make use of the WKCD opportunity to revitalize these old districts;</p> <p>(b) she was concerned about the composition of the WKCD Authority; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) she asked how the Government would engage the community and arts and cultural groups to promote arts in the community.</p> <p>Habitus' view that priority should be given to developing a community in WKCD and the community building process would inspire artists' creativity. M+ could not provide a community ambience if it was segregated from public space.</p> <p>PPWK's view that culture and the community were interactive. To ensure that there was organic development in WKCD, emphasis should be put on both the hardware and software contents and their affordability and accessibility to the public. He supported that the community should be brought into WKCD to provide impetus for the latter's development.</p> <p>In response to Miss CHAN's enquiry about the development of Cantonese Opera, the Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong said that there was a lack of performing venues for the sector due to escalating land cost. The Association was concerned about the structure and operating mode of the WKCD Authority and how it would interact with the sector. Transport infrastructure facilities should be planned for the public to access WKCD conveniently from different districts in Hong Kong.</p>	
030458 - 031101	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG's expression of concerns that –</p> <p>(a) WKCD was biased towards high culture;</p> <p>(b) WKCD should seek to integrate arts with the community as arts and culture were closely</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>intertwined with the community;</p> <p>(c) WKCD should not be operated on commercial principles and a financially self-sustaining basis;</p> <p>(d) He questioned whether the initial planning objective for West Kowloon Reclamation in the past to provide more open space for the residents in West Kowloon still existed; and</p> <p>(e) In order to solicit public views and adopt the "always people first" principle, large-scale public consultation forums should be organized on the planning of WKCD at each district.</p>	
031102 - 031656	Mrs Selina CHOW AMCS	<p>Mrs CHOW's enquiry about the views of AMCS on the suggestion to privatize performance venues under LCSD to complement future development of arts and culture in Hong Kong.</p> <p>AMCS said that even with the privatization of performance venues under LCSD, Government red tapes and the lack of a cultural policy would hamper the progress of arts and cultural development, as other government departments would not be working under a single policy direction to complement the development of arts and culture. The Association did not agree that privatization was the only way to improve the existing venues, because as distinct from the private sector, civil servants were seen to be fair and transparent and had an advantage of neutrality in the allocation of public resources and in procuring cultural programmes.</p>	
031657 - 032350	Mr CHAN Kam-lam Chairman AMCS	<p>Mr CHAN's views that –</p> <p>(a) WKCD would provide</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>opportunities for professional arts administrators; and</p> <p>(b) he sought views from AMCS about the preferred management modes for the new performance venues and museums in WKCD.</p> <p>The Chairman's remark that the Subcommittee's Phase II Report had recommended about implementing an "arts accountability" system for the performance venues in WKCD.</p> <p>AMCS's response that a substantive cultural policy was required to ensure that resources for arts and culture were allocated equitably. There was a shortfall in manpower for the cultural services managers under LCSD due to a freeze in recruitment. With an establishment of 201, the cultural services managers had to be responsible for more than 4 000 programmes and promotion activities each year. They could not provide internship to train tertiary students who were interested in arts administration. About one-third of the assistant cultural services managers had only one to two years' experience and the turnover rate was high.</p>	
032351 - 032744	Prof Patrick LAU Administration	In response to Prof LAU's enquiry about how public views would be solicited on the planning for WKCD, the Administration's explanation on the statutory process for amending the draft South West Kowloon OZP and the role of the WKCD Authority in preparing the Master Layout Plan (MLP). The public could give views during each stage of the planning process.	
032745 - 033226	Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration	Dr KWOK expressed regret that the Secretary for Home Affairs and the Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs failed to attend the meeting to	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>hear deputations' views.</p> <p>Dr KWOK's expression of concerns about –</p> <p>(a) the training and nurturing of local artists and art groups and building of audience to complement the WKCD project and whether the funding requirements for these purposes had been taken into account in the proposed financial arrangements;</p> <p>(b) the long-term viability of M+ as the estimated attendance was on the high side and there were duplications between the collections of M+ and the existing museums under LCSD.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that the financial assessments conducted by the Financial Advisor had taken into account the costs for the publicity and educational programmes of the performance venues and M+ in WKCD for software and audience development. Outside the context of WKCD, the Administration would strengthen existing software development measures through HKADC, HKAPA and LCSD.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that M+ was a bottom-up proposal from the Museum Advisory Group after extensive public consultation. To ensure the successful implementation of M+, preparatory work, such as the establishment of an interim body, had to be undertaken at an early stage.</p>	
033227 - 033613	Chairman Administration	In response to the Chairman's enquiry on how the public could express views in the planning process for WKCD, the Administration's explanation that public views would be solicited at each stage of the	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>planning process, including the amendments to the draft South West Kowloon OZP and the preparation of MLP by the WKCD Authority. The WKCD Authority could make reference to the public consultation process for the Kai Tak Development when preparing MLP for WKCD.</p>	
033614 - 033808	Ms HO Loy	<p>Ms HO's expression of views that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Government should organize workshops to introduce the WKCD project to the Kowloon West residents; (b) the transport links between WKCD and Hong Kong West should be planned based on a regional concept; and (c) arts and cultural programmes in WKCD should also cater for ethnic minorities in Hong Kong. 	
033809 - 033930	HKIA	<p>The deputation's expression of view that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) open architectural competitions were welcomed to raise the standard of the profession and the competitions should be instigated as soon as possible; and (b) there were concerns about the incorporation of the planning parameters in the draft South West Kowloon OZP before a comprehensive town planning study had been conducted for WKCD. As such, the WKCD Authority would be faced with too many restrictions in preparing the MLP. 	
033931 - 034005	The International Association of Art Critics (Hong Kong Chapter)	<p>The deputation pointed out that concept of M+ was forward looking by focusing on 20th and 21st Century visual arts. As such, it had no duplication with the collections of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		existing museums.	
034006 - 034202	HKCA	<p>The deputation's view that –</p> <p>(a) there was duplication of M+ with the collections of existing museums;</p> <p>(b) arts and cultural facilities provided by the Government and the private sector could engage in healthy competition;</p> <p>(c) there was a succession problem with the curators and professional administrators for the museums in Hong Kong;</p> <p>(d) based on its estimation, 500 000 to 1 million was a reasonable annual attendance for M+; and</p> <p>(e) despite the Government's existing cultural policy, it still lacked a proper mechanism to formulate a list of cultural priorities and to review the existing cultural framework with the participation of the public.</p>	
034203 - 034721	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Administration Mr Albert CHAN	<p>Meetings to be scheduled to discuss the WKCD Authority and planning issues.</p> <p>Information requested by members at previous meetings.</p> <p>Members noted that the Panel on Home Affairs would discuss the item on strengthening the software and humanware for culture and the arts at its meeting on 9 November 2007.</p>	