

## **Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

### **Progress of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

#### **Introduction**

This paper reports on the progress of work on the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project.

#### **Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District**

2. The Consultative Committee (CC) on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) and its three Advisory Groups (AGs), namely the Museums Advisory Group (“MAG”), the Performing Arts and Tourism Advisory Group (“PATAG”) and the Financial Matters Advisory Group (“FMAG”) have been actively working on their respective recommendations since their establishment in April 2006.

3. At its fourth meeting held on 23 November 2006, CC discussed the recommendation report submitted by MAG. It endorsed the MAG’s recommendation to set up an innovative and forward-looking cultural institution (the **M+** concept) which embodies museum functions plus some important key values in WKCD, and agreed to forward the report to FMAG for assessment of the financial implications. FMAG is planning to submit to the CC its recommendation report during the first quarter of 2007. The CC would then take an overall view, deliberate and submit its recommendations to the Chief Executive on the need and justifications for the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in the WKCD, their financial implications, as well as the possible financing approaches for developing and operating these facilities.

#### **The Recommendations of the Museums Advisory Group**

4. In drawing up their recommendations, MAG has in

mind their primary task — to deliberate and recommend the types of museum(s) which can best achieve the stated objective and vision of WKCD, i.e. a world-class arts and cultural district comprising local, traditional as well as international elements, which could sustain Hong Kong’s cultural position as a Special Administrative Region in China which bridges Chinese culture and other cultures of the world. Members have also considered views received from the public and local / overseas experts through public consultations, sharing sessions and overseas study visit, and the current provision of museums in Hong Kong.

5. Following thorough deliberations, MAG recommends to set up in WKCD a brand new and forward-looking cultural institution – which focuses on 20<sup>th</sup>-21<sup>st</sup> visual culture under the name **M+**, or **Museum Plus** – in place of the four museums proposed in the original Invitation for Proposals (IFP). In a nutshell, **M+** is more than a museum or a building space. It is a new and emerging form of cultural institution that embodies museum functions plus other important key values. It emphasizes on maximum cross-fertilization and minimum fixed boundaries. It should be interactive, outreaching and dynamic, should be able to inspire, delight, educate and engage the public, and should explore diversity and foster creativity. In other words, **M+** should be an innovative platform for interpreting and presenting visual culture through ways and means that goes beyond typical presentations in traditional museums. It is a forward-looking, flexible and responsive cultural institution encompassing ideas, displays, dialogue, education and entertainment.

6. As for the originally proposed Art Exhibition Centre (AEC) in the IFP, MAG has reconfirmed the need for it, but considered that it should not be used solely for art exhibition purpose, and should tentatively be named the “Exhibition Centre” to reflect a wider usage.

7. The key recommendations of MAG and the rationale behind are as follows:

**(a) The Concept of Visual Culture**

8. Following the public consultations held in May and

June 2006, MAG conducted an initial assessment of the themes received with the assistance of professional staff of Leisure and Cultural Services Department. MAG noted that about 60% of the themes received are related to visual culture.

9. The term “visual culture” refers to areas of culture that are founded on visual expressions and embrace a broad range of creative activity and experiences that cross many media. Given its broad and evolutionary boundaries, visual culture includes not only visual art (such as installation, painting, photography and sculpture), but also architecture, design (such as fashion, graphic and product design), moving image (such as film, television and video) and popular culture (such as advertising and comics). It is an area of shared interest with rich development potential. It also covers most of the themes or subject areas for museums which were proposed by different parties during the public consultation.

10. MAG considers that the selection of visual culture for development of museum institutions in WKCD could adequately respond to the public views as well as in line with various key principles and considerations which MAG had taken into account in selecting subject areas for museums. These considerations are set out at **Annex A**.

11. Given the fact that the boundaries of visual culture are broad, fluid, overlapping and elastic, MAG recommends the following four initial broad groupings (in alphabetical order) for development (i) Design; (ii) Moving Image; (iii) Popular Culture; and (iv) Visual Art (including ink art).

***(b) M+ – A Platform for Visual Culture***

12. Given the nature of visual culture, MAG considers that it would be more appropriate to accommodate and develop this area through a new type of cultural institution (instead of different thematic museums. This would allow maximum flexibility in presentation, as well as ample space for co-operation and interaction between different initial broad groupings.

13. MAG recommends to set up a cultural institution named **M+**. The **M+** (or **Museum Plus**) is a new and emerging

form of cultural institution which embraces all museum functions plus other important key values (see para 5 above). with a mission to focus on 20<sup>th</sup> – 21<sup>st</sup> century visual culture, broadly defined, from a Hong Kong perspective, the perspective of now and with a global vision.

14. The main features of **M+** are as follows:

- (i) The initial broad groupings (in alphabetical order) are “Design”, “Moving Image”, “Popular Culture” and “Visual Art (including ink art)”. New groupings could be explored in the course of development;
- (ii) The key characteristics of **M+**’s unique curatorial vision should include the following:
  - (a) presenting visual culture from a Hong Kong perspective;
  - (b) presenting visual culture from the perspective of now (i.e. from the time in which we are living, presenting visual culture of the past if it can see its relevance to the present moment);
  - (c) presenting visual culture with a commitment to its diversity;
  - (d) presenting visual culture with a flexible attitude open to new interpretations, fostering cross-fertilization and communication;
  - (e) presenting visual culture by promoting community engagement, based on a continuing dialogue with the public; and
  - (f) presenting visual culture with respect for curatorial and other specialized professional expertise.
- (iii) The key functions of **M+** are:
  - (a) collection building and preservation;
  - (b) education and outreach;
  - (c) exhibition and display; and
  - (d) research and publications.
- (iv) The **M+**, as a “Museum Plus”, must comply with the highest professional standards comparable to those of well-acclaimed museums worldwide;

- (v) Given the nature of **M+** and the changing environment, MAG considers that the collection strategy should be broad and general at this stage, and recommends the following strategy, having regard to the unique position of **M+** and the strength of Hong Kong in relevant fields:
- ✦ The collection may focus on 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century visual culture, beginning with visual art, design, moving image and popular culture from Hong Kong, expanding to other regions of China, Asia and the rest of the world.
  - ✦ Hong Kong has rich collections of ink art works. **M+** should try to attract those collections, to showcase this important visual form and its interplay with other art forms.
- (vi) The ownership of the collections will be held in a public trust and supervised by a Board of Trustees;
- (vii) The governance should preferably take the form of a statutory body with an independent Board of Trustees;
- (viii) The facilities proposed in **M+** are exhibition galleries and back-of-house facilities, a dedicated outreach and education centre, a library cum archive, screening facility, a bookstore, artists-in-residence studios, amenities including catering facilities and shops and outdoor space.

### **Site and Space requirements and Architectural Programme**

15. MAG considers that the architecture of **M+** has to be iconic, innovative, forward-looking and flexible to cater for organic growth in future. MAG strongly recommends holding an open international architectural competition for **M+**.

16. MAG acknowledges the importance of size and a need to allow flexibility for future expansion. Following a benchmarking survey of three well-known overseas museums of

similar nature and size (Centre Pompidou, New York Museum of Modern Art and Tate Modern), MAG proposes the preliminary development parameters as follows:

	<b>First phase</b>	<b>Subsequent phase(s)</b>	<b>Eventual size<sup>1</sup></b>
<b>Site area<sup>2</sup></b>	37 500 m <sup>2</sup>		
<b>Net operating floor area (“NOFA”)</b>	49 000 m <sup>2</sup>	26 000 m <sup>2</sup>	75 000 m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Net exhibition area<sup>3</sup></b>	20 000 m <sup>2</sup>	10 000 m <sup>2</sup>	30 000 m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Gross floor area (“GFA”) (estimated)</b>	81 000 m <sup>2</sup>	44 000 m <sup>2</sup>	125 000 m <sup>2</sup>

MAG also recommends that the location and configuration of the land lot for **M+** should be left to the jurisdiction of the future master planner of the WKCD.

### **(c) Exhibition Centre**

17. MAG is aware that there is an acute shortage of quality exhibition space for arts and culture related events in Hong Kong. MAG considers that the scope of the originally proposed AEC in the IFP should not be confined to the arts and, therefore, the AEC should be re-named as Exhibition Centre (“EC”) as a working title to reflect its wider usage.

18. MAG recommends the EC to give priority to uses relating to arts, culture, creative industries and events / activities related to WKCD. With the establishment of the EC, major art, culture and creative industries related events like art fairs, auctions, conferences, design shows etc. as well as a mixture of different uses (some of which could be beyond traditional forms) could be held frequently to enhance the attraction of WKCD.

<sup>1</sup> The proposed figures in the table above are recommended to be verified by the future museum experts and planners for the **M+**.

<sup>2</sup> The site area is worked out based on the assumption that net area is 60% of gross area, **M+** has five storeys and 50% open space would be allowed within the **M+**.

<sup>3</sup> According to the benchmarking survey and information obtained from different sources, normally 40% of the NOFA is designated for exhibition area. The net exhibition area of the first phase of **M+** is benchmarked from the average of the current net exhibition areas of Centre Pompidou and New York MOMA.

19. The main features of the EC are:
- (i) it should have a separate identity from the **M+**;
  - (ii) the NOFA is recommended to remain as 10 000 m<sup>2</sup> as originally proposed in the IFP. In addition, 20% open space at the site should be provided;
  - (iii) the EC should be self-contained with a maximum of two storeys. Its internal space should be flexible to cater for a wide range of usages / events of different nature;
  - (iv) the EC should aim to run on a self-financing basis with its management to be overseen by an independent body; and
  - (v) certain time slots could be earmarked or concessionary rates could be given to relevant uses to achieve the objective to promote arts, culture and creative industries.

**(d) Action Steps**

20. MAG considers that the interim period from the decision to establish **M+** to its formal opening is crucial in laying a solid foundation for the success of **M+**. Preparatory steps should be taken as soon as practicable. The interim steps proposed are :

- (i) to set up an advisory committee to take forward the recommendations of MAG, including advising on the promotion plan, implementation plan, collection strategy and public education in the arts;
- (ii) to identify an interim venue for **M+** to gather momentum for WKCD as well as providing a platform for training professional staff and nurturing a sizable audience for **M+**;
- (iii) to start collecting, acquiring and building up collections as soon as practicable, and to foster a

donation culture through introducing incentives to help build up sizable and impressive collections;

- (iv) to encourage training in professional pursuits and fields related to the initial broad groupings, as well as education on the arts for public of all ages; and
- (v) to establish strategic networking with local and global cultural institutions, particularly the existing museums in Hong Kong. The relationship between **M+** and other public museums should be further examined when the future WKCD Authority is in place.

The full report is at **Annex B**.

### **Progress of the Financial Matters Advisory Group**

21. The FMAG has been tasked to advise the CC on the financial implications of developing and operating the arts and cultural facilities as recommended by the PATAG and MAG. Given the sequential nature of the work among the three Advisory Groups, the work of the FMAG has to dovetail with that of the PATAG and MAG. The FMAG has so far held five meetings.

22. The CC had discussed, in September and November 2006 respectively, the recommendation reports submitted by the PATAG and MAG on the provision of performing arts facilities, museums, exhibition centre and other related facilities, and had forwarded the reports to the FMAG for assessing the related financial implications. With the assistance of the Financial Consultant appointed by the Government, the FMAG is currently conducting detailed analysis and assessment on the financial implications of developing and operating the proposed facilities under private sector involvement scenarios. In carrying out such analysis, the FMAG has made reference to local and overseas experiences in developing and operating cultural and other facilities under the Public Private Partnership approach. The Financial Consultant will also prepare a Public Sector Comparator for developing and operating the arts and cultural facilities in the WKCD.



23. The FMAG plans to submit to the CC, in the first quarter of 2007, its recommendation report on the financial implications of developing and operating the arts and cultural facilities and other related facilities as recommended by the other two Advisory Groups.

**Home Affairs Bureau  
December 2006**

**MAG's initial considerations for assessing  
the museum theme(s) for inclusion in WKCD**

**Basic Requirements**

- Whether the proposed theme(s) and development concept of the museum should be conducive to achieving the objectives of developing WKCD into a world-class arts and cultural district comprising local, traditional as well as international elements, and to sustaining Hong Kong's cultural position as a Special Administrative Region in China which bridges Chinese culture and other cultures of the world.
- Whether the proposed theme(s) could also reflect the cultural characteristics of Hong Kong.

**Function**

- Whether the proposed theme(s) are compatible with the development of the museum as a cultural institution performing its core functions, including preservation, research, interpretation and education.

**Sustainable development of the New Museum Facility**

- Whether there is strong potential to sustain the interests of, and engagements with local and overseas visitors.

**Feasibility of the New Museum Facility**

- Whether there is sufficient expertise available to provide sustainable support in museum management and curating as well as providing input to enhance the museum's collection acquisition, development, research and educational role.
- Whether there is strong potential for quality collection development and creative interpretation.

## Contribution to the Cultural Ecology of Hong Kong

- Whether the theme(s) can enrich the cultural ecology<sup>1</sup> of Hong Kong.

---

<sup>1</sup> “Cultural ecology” refers to a holistic cultural environment in which cultural growth is sustained by a simulative and mutually supporting mechanism within a diversified, multi-faceted yet interdependent cultural equilibrium. Literally speaking, it is the objective environment formed within an integrated network of institutions and practitioners, such as museum, theatre, media, artist, audience, art mediator, educationalists, and policy makers etc. in the making of an overall cultural scenario.

**Consultative Committee on the  
Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District**

**Museums Advisory Group**

**The Report to the Consultative Committee**

**23 November 2006**

**CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON THE  
CORE ARTS AND CULTURAL FACILITIES OF THE  
WEST KOWLOON CULTURAL DISTRICT**

**MUSEUMS ADVISORY GROUP**

**Table of Contents**

	<i>Page</i>
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1 : BACKGROUND CONSIDERATIONS</b>	<b>8</b>
(a) General Background	8
• Original Recommendations in the Invitation for Proposals	
• The Museums Advisory Group of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District	
• Roles of Museums	
• Current Provision of Museums in Hong Kong	
(b) Public Consultation and Advice from Overseas Experts	13
(c) Cultural Policy	15

**CHAPTER 2 : PROPOSED M+ (MUSEUM PLUS) 17**

(a)	Background	17
(b)	The Concept of Visual Culture	21
(c)	Initial Broad Groupings	22
	• Design	
	• Moving Image	
	• Popular Culture	
	• Visual Art (including ink art)	
(d)	<b>M+</b> (Museum Plus) – A Platform for Visual Culture	28
(e)	Mission, Characteristics, Core Values and Key Functions of <b>M+</b>	30
(f)	International Standards	33
(g)	Collection Strategy	34
(h)	Governance	35
(i)	Architectural Programme	35
	• Profile	
	• Size	
	• Site Configuration	
	• Proposed Facilities	
	- Exhibition Galleries and Back-of-house Facilities	

- Dedicated Outreach and Education Centre
- Library and Archive
- Screening Facility
- Bookstore
- Artists-in-residence Studios
- Amenities Including Catering Facilities and Shops
- Outdoor Space

(j)	Sustainability of <b>M+</b>	42
-----	-----------------------------	----

### **CHAPTER 3 PROPOSED EXHIBITION CENTRE 43**

(a)	Background	43
(b)	Needs	43
(c)	Specifications	44
(d)	Governance and Hiring Policy	45

### **CHAPTER 4: ACTION STEPS 47**

(a)	Preparatory Steps	47
	• Advisory Committee	
	• Interim Centre	

- Collection Strategy / Donation Culture
- Professional Training
- Audience Building and Education
- Local and Global Networking and Interaction with Existing Institutions

**CHAPTER 5 : OTHER RELEVANT ISSUES 54**

- |  |                          |    |
|--|--------------------------|----|
|  | (a) Committee on Museums | 54 |
|  | (b) Other Minority Views | 54 |

<b>Annexes</b>	<b>:</b>	<b>(1) Original Recommendations in the Invitation for Proposals</b>	<i>Annex_p.1</i>
		<b>(2) Terms of Reference of MAG</b>	<i>Annex_p.3</i>
		<b>(3) Membership List of MAG</b>	<i>Annex_p.4</i>
		<b>(4) List of Museums in Hong Kong</b>	<i>Annex_p.5</i>
		<b>(5) The Schedules and Notes of the Consultation Events Held by MAG</b>	<i>Annex_p.10</i>
		<b>(6) Summary of Written Submissions and Views Submitted via Public Affairs Forum</b>	<i>Annex_p.39</i>



- (7) List of Themes Received Since 2004** *Annex\_p.45*
- (8) Notes of the Briefings by Overseas Experts** *Annex\_p.48*
- (9) Report on the Duty Visit to Major Overseas Museums** *Annex\_p.85*
- (10) List of Meetings Held by MAG** *Annex\_p.130*
- (11) Hong Kong's Cultural Policy** *Annex\_p.131*
- (12) Key Data of the Benchmarking Museums** *Annex\_p.134*

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### ***M+ - a cultural platform for the future***

1. The roles of museums are changing rapidly. Many forward-looking museums no longer use the term “museum” to describe themselves. Rather they consider themselves “centre” or “platform” which seek to engage the community in order to keep pace with its developments. These forward-looking museums not only acquire, conserve, research and exhibit evidence of people’s material culture, but they also engage, communicate, delight and inspire for the purposes of research, education, appreciation and enjoyment, and to enhance the quality of the people’s life.
2. The Museums Advisory Group, through public consultation and input from local and overseas professionals, has identified an area of shared interest with rich development potential, which could be broadly categorised as “Visual Culture”. The Museums Advisory Group has also determined that the most desirable form of cultural institution to collect, preserve, research, educate and present visual culture would be an **M+**, or “**Museum Plus**”.
3. **M+** would be a single cultural institution with its mission

to focus on 20<sup>th</sup> – 21<sup>st</sup> century visual culture, broadly defined, from a Hong Kong perspective, the perspective of now, and with a global vision. With an open, flexible and forward-looking attitude, **M+** aims to inspire, educate and engage the public, to explore diversity and foster creativity.

### ***Visual culture and M+***

4. ‘Visual culture’ is a broad area that embraces many areas of interest identified during public consultations. It is a fluid concept which, while making it difficult to define, offers the flexibility and scope to explore new aspects and rejuvenate itself in response to changing circumstances. Typically visual culture includes, but is not limited to, interrelated areas such as architecture, design, moving image, popular culture, visual art etc.
5. Four “initial broad groupings” for development are being proposed (in alphabetical order): design, moving image, popular culture and visual art.
6. To embrace flexibly the four initial broad groupings, a new type of cultural institution, the concept of **M+** is proposed. **M+** is more than a museum or a building space. It is a platform for visual culture. It is a forward-looking, flexible and responsive approach which

encourages dialogue and delivers ideas, exhibits, education and entertainment. It is under an open-ended format that encourages partnership, interaction and cross-fertilisation of ideas – with the general public, with sector professionals and with experts worldwide.

### ***The “Now Perspective” and the “Hong Kong Perspective”***

7. A major aspect of the **M+** concept is the desire to bring this cultural institution closer to the audience. Projecting or presenting visual culture with a “now perspective” requires that each idea or exhibit be linked to the experiences of its current – and future – audience.
8. As a cultural institution in Hong Kong, **M+** will perceive and interpret things from a “Hong Kong perspective” which creates an audience experience that is unique and from a Hong Kong social and cultural standpoint.
9. Within these perspectives, we propose focusing on visual culture of the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century. Focusing on this period brings the **M+** experience closer to its audience, making it engaging and relevant. It also coincides with a rich period of development in Hong Kong’s cultural and social history.

### ***Practical considerations***

10. Size and flexibility within **M+** is a key component. Visual culture and Hong Kong lifestyle thrives on change and pace. The space of **M+** must be responsive to changing circumstances and accommodate a range of ideas, which can be quickly refreshed, updated or adapted.
11. For **M+** to flourish we must set ourselves the highest international standards comparable with world-leading facilities. This would include codes of ethics, research, curatorship, conservation, interpretation, display, presentation, management and operations.
12. A stringent governance model – preferably a statutory body with an independent Board of Trustees – would guarantee the principles of curatorial independence, professional excellence, collaboration and accountability to the public.
13. The collection strategy would begin in Hong Kong before expanding outward to other regions of China, then into the wider Asia region and finally to include perspectives from the rest of the world.

### ***Community engagement and response***

14. Community participation is essential to breathing life and energy into **M+**. Relevance comes from the people who visit, exhibit, learn and enjoy within the space of **M+**. Art education and audience building programmes are recommended and a dedicated outreach and education centre will be included in **M+**.

### ***Architectural parameters***

15. An open and international architectural competition is proposed to attract the most innovative and appropriate architecture for **M+**. Apart from projecting its own identity, the design should be fully integrated with the whole WKCD, particularly in terms of interaction with surrounding attractions to allow an easy flow of visitors between different types of activities in West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”).
16. The site footprint covers 37 500 m<sup>2</sup>, allowing for a multiple-phase development to an eventual NOFA of 75 000 m<sup>2</sup>, an estimated GFA of 125 000 m<sup>2</sup> and a net exhibition area of 30 000 m<sup>2</sup>. The space will comprise exhibition galleries, an outreach and education centre, a library / archive, screening facility, artists-in-residence studios, a bookstore, back-of-house facilities and customer convenience amenities, such as catering

facilities and shops. **M+** will also offer flexible open spaces for outdoor events.

### ***Exhibition Centre***

17. It is proposed to have an Exhibition Centre (NOFA: 10 000 m<sup>2</sup>) which will be operated on a self-financing basis. Overseen by an independent body, it will accord priority to displays of arts, culture and creative industries and other events related to WKCD. The centre will be equipped to support a variety of events and will have a simple, practical and flexible interior format, allowing individual users to project their own ideas within the space. It has a separate identity from **M+**.

### ***Proposed action steps***

18. A strong foundation is essential for the development of the **M+** concept. An advisory committee should be set up to advise on and oversee the implementation plan, the collection strategy and relevant preparatory steps.
19. An interim venue should be identified to provide a platform for ideas, partnership, education, research and professional staff training.

20. Pivotal to the success of the **M+** concept is the strength of our local and global cultural partnerships. A strong focus must be given to developing strategic relationships with local and international museums and cultural institutions to enrich our experience and share ideas, exhibits and best practice.

*The development of an **M+** concept focused on visual culture is a bold initiative – and not be undertaken lightly. It requires commitment, excellence and innovation at every stage. The Hong Kong public has demonstrated its desire for world-class facilities in WKCD, including an institution to collect, preserve and celebrate our visual culture in a unique way. **M+** must fulfill the mission to inspire, delight, educate and engage the public to explore diversity and foster creativity.*



## **CHAPTER 1**

### **BACKGROUND CONSIDERATIONS**

#### **(a) General Background**

1.1 This report sets out the recommendations of the Museums Advisory Group (“MAG”) to the Consultative Committee (“Consultative Committee”) on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities (“CACF”) of the West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”) on the museum and exhibition facilities to be built in the WKCD. The recommendations are made following intensive deliberations of the MAG who have taken into account views from the general public, the arts and cultural sector, overseas experts as well as the museum professionals. The report does not define specifics. Rather it provides a vision, conceptual framework and some broad guidelines to assist future governing bodies and professionals, including curators, to formulate detailed plans and proposals, and make decisions based on their expertise and the circumstances.

- **Original Recommendations in the Invitation for Proposals**

1.2 In September 2003, the Administration launched the Invitation for Proposals (“IFP”) for the development of the WKCD into a world-class arts, cultural, entertainment and commercial district. The IFP, now discontinued, had specified a museum cluster with four themes and an art exhibition centre as Mandatory Requirements of the project, details of which are at **Annex 1**.

- **The Museums Advisory Group of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District**

1.3 MAG was appointed in April 2006 by the Chief Executive under the Consultative Committee to advise the Consultative Committee on the following:

- (i) the need for the four museums previously proposed in WKCD and their preferred themes;
- (ii) the need to include museums with other themes;
- (iii) the scale and major requirements of each museum;  
and
- (iv) the need for and major specifications of the Art Exhibition Centre.

The terms of reference and the membership of the MAG are at **Annexes 2** and **3** respectively.

- **Roles of Museums**

1.4 The roles of museums in a society have been changing rapidly as communication and dialogue with visitors, including new media, becomes increasingly important. In the past, museums mainly performed the role to collect, document, preserve, exhibit and interpret material evidence and associated information for the public benefit.<sup>1</sup> Nowadays, museums are expected to communicate with the community as well as to keep pace of its developments. They would not only acquire, conserve, research and exhibit, but they also communicate and inspire for the purposes of study, education, enjoyment and appreciation of material evidence of people and their environment, and to enhance the quality of the people's life.<sup>2</sup>

1.5 In Hong Kong, the objectives of the Government-run public museums are to provide quality museum services to enrich the cultural life of the people in Hong Kong, to preserve cultural heritage, to promote professionalism and excellence in museum service and to play

---

<sup>1</sup> The old definition adopted by Museums Association ("MA"). Set up in 1889, the MA is the oldest museum association in the world to look after the interests of museums and galleries. Today it is still entirely independent of government and is funded by its members. The MA now has approximately 5 000 individual members, 600 institutional members and 250 corporate members.

<sup>2</sup> The roles of museums currently adopted by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization ("UNESCO"), the Museums Association and the International Council of Museums.

a vital role in education.

- **Current Provision of Museums in Hong Kong**

1.6 As at 1 October 2006, there are 24 museums in Hong Kong. Of these 13 museums and one film archive, occupying a total exhibition space of 45 840 m<sup>2</sup>, are managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (“LCSD”). The other 10 museums, having a total exhibition space of 6 313 m<sup>2</sup>, are run by tertiary institutions, non-profit or private organizations, Correctional Services Department and Hong Kong Police Force. Taken together, LCSD manages about 88% of the total museum exhibition space whereas other government and non-government organizations manage 12%. The museums in Hong Kong and their themes are at **Annex 4**.

1.7 According to a 1996 research, the ratio between the population and the number of museums was 30 560:1 in the US and 172 110:1 in Japan.<sup>3</sup> The ratio for Beijing in 2006 is 99 174:1, according to the Beijing Municipal Administration of Cultural Heritage. Meanwhile, according to the information provided by “Museums of the World” in 2002, there are 203 museums in London, 52 in Los Angeles, 107 in New York, 211 in Paris and 121 in Tokyo. Comparing with

---

<sup>3</sup> Wang, Hongjun (王宏鈞) (ed.) *Zhongguo Bo Wu Guan Xue Ji Chu* 《中國博物館學基礎》 (*The Basics of Chinese Museology*), (Shanghai: 2001), pp 129.

the above, the ratio in Hong Kong in 2006, i.e. 24 museums and 290 410 citizens per museum, is relatively low.

1.8 The museums and film archives managed by LCSD can broadly be classified into three streams, i.e. art, history and science, having the roles of enhancing public's appreciation, interest and knowledge in respective fields. The attendance rates of LCSD museums have shown a steady growth from 3.35 million in 2000 to 4.24 million in 2003 and further to 4.76 million in 2005. The total number of collection items as at 2006 is about 960 000, of which 4 – 5 % are star-pieces displayed on a regular basis. About 110 exhibitions and 20 000 – 25 000 educational programs are organised by LCSD museums per year. LCSD subsidizes between 73.23% (Hong Kong Space Museum) to 99.35% (Lei Cheng Uk Museum) of the operational expenditure of its museums. To enhance the attractiveness of museums to visitors, LCSD has been organizing more blockbuster exhibitions and renewing exhibitions in Hong Kong Space Museum.

1.9 Among the 10 non-LCSD museums, the two museums at the University of Hong Kong and the Chinese University of Hong Kong are art museums that carry a strong educational function in association with the respective Department of Fine Arts. The Tung Wah Museum and Po Leung Kuk Museum are museums depicting the history and

services of these two charitable organisations. The Hong Kong Maritime Museum, Hong Kong Museum of Medical Sciences, Hong Kong Racing Museum and Museum of Ethnology are private museums that introduce specific themes, in particular in the context of Hong Kong history, city life and the associated industries. The Correctional Services Department and Hong Kong Police Force have their own museums to promulgate the history and services of the respective departments.

#### **(b) Public Consultation and Advice from Overseas Experts**

1.10 To embark on the task of re-examining, and re-confirming if appropriate, the need for CACF, MAG conducted a public consultation exercise from mid May to mid June 2006 to solicit views. The public consultation exercise was publicised through newspaper advertisements, webpage announcements, radio APIs, press release and invitation letters to interested parties. During the consultation period, the following events were organised:

- (i) 1 focus group meeting;
- (ii) 2 open consultative forums; and
- (iii) 3 presentation hearings.

The schedule and notes of the above consultation events are at **Annex 5**.

1.11 In addition, 28 written submissions and 30 views via the Public Affairs Forum related to museum facilities were received, the summary of which is at **Annex 6**. A list of themes received since 2004 is at **Annex 7**.

1.12 In order to gain a better understanding of the planning and operation of major museums overseas, MAG invited the following six museum experts from Australia, USA, Japan and France to exchange views and share experience<sup>4</sup>:

- (i) Ms Kate Brennan, Chief Executive Officer of Federation Square Pty. Ltd, Melbourne;
- (ii) Ms Yuko Hasegawa (長谷川祐子), Chief Curator of Museum of Contemporary Art, Tokyo;
- (iii) Dr Michael Knight, Deputy Director for Strategic Program and Partnerships and Senior Curator of Chinese Art, Asian Art Museum, San Francisco;
- (iv) Ms Kara Lennon, Advisor (International Relations) and Mr Joël Girard, Advisor to the President of Centre national d'art et de culture Georges Pompidou (commonly known as Centre Pompidou),

---

<sup>4</sup> MAG members were also invited to attend a session by Dr David Elliott, Director of Mori Art Museum, Tokyo on 11 May 2006. The session was jointly organised by International Association of Arts Critics, Asia Art Archive and Goethe Institute.

Paris; and

- (v) Mr Tony Sweeney, Director / CEO of Australia Museum of Moving Image, Melbourne.

The notes of the 5 briefings are at **Annex 8**.

1.13 In addition, MAG organised a delegation in mid-July to visit over 10 museums / related organizations in Paris, London, New York and San Francisco, including Centre Pompidou, French Ministry of Culture, Quai Branly Museum, Tate Modern, Museum of Modern Art, New York, P.S.I Contemporary Art Centre, Asian Art Museum and de Young Museum etc. The report of the duty visit is at **Annex 9**.

1.14 MAG had held 14 regular or special meetings to intensively deliberate on the views received with a view to drawing up their recommendations. A list of the meetings held is at **Annex 10**.

### **(c) Cultural Policy**

1.15 MAG has formulated its recommendations with due regard to Hong Kong's existing cultural policy which, in a nutshell, refers to the policy on culture and the arts. The



policy objective is to create an environment which is conducive to the freedom of artistic expression and creation, and the wider participation in cultural activities. The policy comprises four major elements:

- respect for freedom of creation and expression
- provision of opportunities for participation
- encouraging diversified and balanced development
- providing a supportive environment and conditions (venues, funding, education and administration).

An elaboration of Hong Kong's existing cultural policy is at **Annex 11**.

## **CHAPTER 2**

### **PROPOSED M+ (MUSEUM PLUS)**

2.1 After much deliberation, MAG has put forward the concept of a very forward-looking cultural institution – which focuses on visual culture under the name “**M+**” (**Museum Plus**) to replace the four museums proposed in the IFP. The analyses leading to this recommendation is detailed in this chapter.

#### **(a) Background**

2.2 The most recently established major museum in Hong Kong was opened in 2000. In the past few years, various proposals on new museums have been put forward by different parties. The Culture and Heritage Commission (“CHC”)<sup>5</sup> discussed in detail from 2000 to 2003 on the need for new museums in Hong Kong and their best location. In its Policy Recommendation Report, CHC considered WKCD an unprecedented opportunity for cultural development in Hong Kong, and further mooted an inspiration of “flagship”

---

<sup>5</sup> The Culture and Heritage Commission was a high-level advisory body responsible for advising the government on the policies as well as funding priorities on culture and strategies to promote the long-term development of culture of Hong Kong.

museums in WKCD.<sup>6</sup> The vision of CHC on WKCD was accepted by the Government and subsequently expressed in the IFP for WKCD launched by the Government in late 2003, in which a museum cluster with four themes was stipulated as a Mandatory Requirement.<sup>7</sup>

2.3 In order to gauge public views on the Screened-in Proposals under the IFP process, a public consultation was subsequently launched in 2004, during which many museum themes were received.<sup>8</sup> After the IFP was discontinued and the MAG, inter alia, was established in early 2006, a public consultation was launched to solicit views for assisting MAG in the process of re-examining the original themes proposed. During the consultation, themes were put forward by the public, interested groups and the arts and cultural sector for inclusion in the WKCD. Apart from that, there were also views on the museum themes from presentation hearings of interested parties, arts groups and individuals. In total, a total of 66 themes were received between 2004 and 2006, which are listed in **Annex 7**. An analysis of the themes was subsequently conducted with the assistance of the professional curatorial staff of LCSD.

---

<sup>6</sup> Culture and Heritage Commission, *Policy Recommendation Report*, (Hong Kong: 2003), pp 27 and 52.

<sup>7</sup> See para. 1.2.

<sup>8</sup> It has to be pointed out that the proposed themes in the IFP were NOT Mandatory Requirement and the Proponents had to justify their recommendations. Hence the public was encouraged to comment on the museum themes to be included in WKCD during the public consultation.

2.4 In order to examine public views properly, MAG formulated the following initial considerations for assessing the museum theme(s) with a view to selecting the suitable ones for inclusion in WKCD:

(i) Basic Requirements

- Whether the proposed theme(s) and development concept of the museum should be conducive to achieving the objectives of developing WKCD into a world-class arts and cultural district comprising local, traditional as well as international elements, and to sustaining Hong Kong's cultural position as a Special Administrative Region in China which bridges Chinese culture and other cultures of the world.
- Whether the proposed theme(s) could also reflect the cultural characteristics of Hong Kong.

(ii) Function

- Whether the proposed theme(s) are compatible with the development of the museum as a

cultural institution performing its core functions, including preservation, research, interpretation and education.

(iii) Sustainable development of the New Museum Facility

- Whether there is strong potential to sustain the interests of, and engagements with local and overseas visitors.

(iv) Feasibility of the New Museum Facility

- Whether there is sufficient expertise available to provide sustainable support in museum management and curating as well as providing input to enhance the museum's collection acquisition, development, research and educational role.
- Whether there is strong potential for quality collection development and creative interpretation.

(v) Contribution to the Cultural Ecology of Hong Kong

- Whether the theme(s) can enrich the cultural

ecology<sup>9</sup> of Hong Kong.

## **(b) The Concept of Visual Culture**

2.5 MAG has conducted an initial assessment of the themes received with assistance of professional staff of LCSD. MAG noted that about 60% of the themes received are related to visual culture.

2.6 "Visual culture" is a broad area that embraces many areas of interest identified during public consultations. It refers to areas of culture that are founded on visual expressions and embrace a broad range of creative activity and experience that cross many media. It is a fluid concept which, while making it difficult to define, offers flexibility and scope to explore new aspects and rejuvenate itself in response to changing circumstances. Visual culture includes, therefore, not only visual art (such as installation, painting, photography and sculpture), but also architecture, design (such as fashion, graphic and product design), moving image (such as film, video and television) and popular culture (such as advertising and comics).

---

<sup>9</sup> "Cultural ecology" refers to a holistic cultural environment in which cultural growth is sustained by a simulative and mutually supporting mechanism within a diversified, multi-faceted yet interdependent cultural equilibrium. Literally speaking, it is the objective environment formed within an integrated network of institutions and practitioners, such as museum, theatre, media, artist, audience, art mediator, educationalists, and policy makers etc. in the making of an overall cultural scenario.

2.7 In view of the above, MAG considers that the development of visual culture in WKCD could adequately respond to the public views as well as convincingly fit the initial considerations. It is also relevant to the objective of developing WKCD into a world-class art and cultural district expressing the unique cultural position of Hong Kong, which is more than a place where East meets West and able to reflect not only the diversity of our cultural heritage but also the vibrancy of our contribution to its ongoing development.

**(c) Initial Broad Groupings**

2.8 When considering the breadth of Hong Kong's vibrant visual culture, MAG proposed the following initial broad groupings (in alphabetical order):

- (i) Design;
- (ii) Moving Image;
- (iii) Popular Culture; and
- (iv) Visual Art (including ink art)<sup>10</sup>.

2.9 MAG stresses that the above should not be regarded as “museum themes” as it would limit the vibrancy, flexibility

---

<sup>10</sup> See paras. 2.23, 2.35, 5.3 and 5.4 for the arrangements on ink art.

and sustainability of their future development. Instead, they should be regarded as “initial broad groupings”. In addition, these initial broad groupings should not be fixed in stone. Instead, they should continue to be re-examined during the course of development, based on the professional expertise of the curators, current international trends and feedback from visitors and experts.

2.10 Since the boundaries of visual culture are broad, fluid, overlapping and elastic, the future institution presenting it in WKCD should be forward-looking, flexible and inclusive. In this connection, the four initial broad groupings of visual culture listed in para. 2.8 above will be interconnected and may often overlap. The future institution will not only recognise those connections but also celebrate them, by fostering cross-disciplinary communications and dialogue in collection, preservation, research, education and presentation.

2.11 The possible contents of the four broad groupings are highlighted below:

- **Design**

2.12 Design is defined to include, but is not limited to, architecture, commercial, fashion, graphic, industrial, urban



planning etc. Design is the human capacity to change our environment, on both large scale and in small detail. It is concerned with change and closely linked to the improvement of the quality of our everyday life. Design has a very strong forward-looking nature. Much depends on how design is understood, whether as a superficial decorative blandishment or instrument of manipulative commercial change, or as an essential determinant of the quality of modern life, of the material expression of our culture, and of our communal sense of meaning and values. Design can be all these things and more, with many specialisations and applications, ranging from architecture, garments and adornment, landscape and environments, through products and communications, services and systems.

2.13 Adopting design as a broad grouping in WKCD is a major opportunity to move beyond the limited degree of visual observation implicit in the concept and practice of museums, to involve people actively in experiencing and understanding the implications of design for them, their families and their community, in a way that has yet to be attempted in any other institution.

2.14 In addition to showcasing design from Hong Kong,

China and the rest of the world, MAG recognises there is an exciting opportunity for the future institution to explore Asian designs in great depth alongside with quality research programmes on Asian lifestyle.

- **Moving Image**

2.15 Moving image is a major and fast moving area of visual culture, comprising art forms such as film, television, media art, digital art and other multi-disciplinary art forms. It is a vital form of expression that involves personal creativity and collective articulation, with powerful capacities for representing human experience, public concerns and distilling truths of our society. Moving image, by its multi-disciplinary nature, can also effectively assimilate with other art forms such as visual art, design and popular culture etc. to formulate forceful artistic manifestations and synergy. A modern international society like Hong Kong is distinguished by a unique culture, with its very own sight, sound and rhythm. All these can be most effectively captured and visualised by the area of moving image.

2.16 The international success of Hong Kong films is a compelling testament to the importance of moving image in Hong Kong's visual culture. The film industry, with a large

number of trained and experienced professionals, has brought a lot of exciting visual cultural experiences to Hong Kong and the rest of the world over the years.

2.17 Notwithstanding the success of Hong Kong film industry, the presentation of moving image would not be limited to local productions. Instead, it would include moving image of Asia as well as the rest of world to enable cross-fertilization and exchanges.

- **Popular Culture**

2.18 Amongst the museum themes proposed by the public on visual culture, 25% are related to popular culture, such as Museum of Canton-pop, Museum of Games, Popular Culture Museum, Museum of Popular Art etc. Popular culture is an important cultural asset of Hong Kong, it includes, but is not limited to, materials from the mass media, toys, comics, clothing and fashion, gaming, etc. It is a form of cultural expression that is deeply integrated into our daily lives. Since the early 20th century, Hong Kong has developed a strong, colourful tradition of popular culture, which is unique, rich and diversified, and it has profound influence on Asian countries as well as many overseas communities.

2.19 MAG recognises popular culture as an important part of culture, and believes that it could showcase the rich and diverse culture, reinforce the sense of collective cultural experience of a community, and make an impact on local as well as overseas audience. Though local popular culture will play an important role in this group, MAG recommends the presentation should go beyond it to Asia and other parts of the world, as some of these cultures have been interacting with and influencing the local culture. MAG also recommends further research in this area during the interim period in order to lay a foundation for quality presentations in due course.

2.20 MAG also recognizes the richness of the popular cultures within Asia. Some of these cultures have been integrating with and influencing the local culture. Popular cultures in Asia have not been fully explored and is an area which should be seriously considered in future collection and curatorial programmes.

- **Visual Art (including ink art)**

2.21 “Visual art” encompasses, but is not limited to, a wide variety of visual expressions like ceramics, drawing, installation, painting, photography, printmaking, new media (such as digital art, internet, video, and other forms of expression that incorporate moving images), sculpture, etc.

2.22 The area of “visual art” should be from a “now” perspective<sup>11</sup>, forward-looking and inclusive. The grouping of “visual art” should be broad and, in addition to a focus on art from Hong Kong, other regions of China and Asia, should also engage the international sphere.

2.23 MAG acknowledges that 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century ink art reflects a continuation of the millennium-long Chinese calligraphy and painting tradition, and has thrived in Hong Kong with innovative developments in a contemporary mode. MAG recommends that from the Hong Kong perspective, ink art should be given special attention in this broad grouping.

#### **(d) M+ (Museum Plus) - A Platform for Visual Culture**

2.24 MAG recommends to set up a **M+** (Museum Plus) to embrace flexibly the four initial groupings related to visual culture mentioned above. **M+** is more than a museum. It is a new and emerging form of cultural institution that embodies museum functions plus some added values. **M+** is an innovative platform for interpreting and presenting visual culture through ways and means that goes beyond those normal presentations in traditional museums.

---

<sup>11</sup> See para. 2.30.

2.25 **M+** represents a new concept which is forward-looking, open, flexible, and responsive to changes over time. With its open nature, **M+** would embrace flexibly the initial broad groupings of visual culture, the boundaries of which are overlapping and elastic. More importantly, **M+** celebrates the overlapping experiences. The openness of **M+** would enhance dialogues, cross-fertilization among different broad groupings as well as communication among people, and building up a platform which is unswerving in its mission to spread knowledge and foster interests in arts and creative works, which are rooted in contemporary times from a Hong Kong perspective with maximum cross-fertilization and minimum fixed boundaries. In other words, **M+** will be part of a deliberate arts and cultural development strategy which allows people of different ages to be involved in visual culture.

2.26 **M+** responds to the CHC's recommendations for WKCD: that it should aim to enliven the city's cultural life, animate people's participation and evoke a greater emotional depth in people's hearts and minds. MAG believes that **M+** could achieve this objective more effectively as compared with the conventional museum format.

2.27 MAG considers **M+** the most appropriate name now to represent the concept. However, we are open to other

recommendations on the name through various means, including professional advice and public naming competition in future.

**(e) Mission, Characteristics, Core Values and Key Functions of M+**

2.28 The proposed Mission Statement of **M+** is as follows:

*“The mission of **M+** is to focus on 20th and 21st century visual culture, broadly defined, from a Hong Kong perspective and with a global vision. With an open, flexible and forward-looking attitude, **M+** aims to inspire, delight, educate and engage the public, to explore diversity and foster creativity.”*

2.29 Hong Kong is unique in its history, its background and its location. It is more than a place where East meets West. This uniqueness gradually helps develop a unique “Hong Kong perspective” which, in other words, is the way Hong Kong people perceive and interpret. Curating exhibitions from a Hong Kong perspective implies that the displays will be interpreted from a distinct Hong Kong’s curatorial point of view which differs from the perspectives of other world cultural capitals. Such a perspective echoes the

vision of the CHC to reflect the uniqueness of Hong Kong's culture which encompasses global perspective and local attitude.

2.30 **M+** will also address the field of visual culture from the time in which we are living: now. Starting from our actual life experience of visual culture in all its forms, **M+** would attempt to present, interpret and preserve for the future all that is of value in this diverse field. Although differing from museums which focus primarily on other historical eras, **M+** will present art and other visual culture of the past if it can see its relevance to the present moment. In particular, it is expected that **M+** will exhibit and collect a great deal of art and other visual culture of the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries: understanding that experience of modernity which helped shape the moment in which we are living will be crucial. Because of the fast pace of social and cultural changes which characterizes the present moment in which we live (particularly in a very contemporary city such as Hong Kong), only a flexible and outward-looking institution such as **M+** would be capable of responding to and acting within it. **M+** will hope to actively intervene in the present cultural moment, rather than just passively documenting other eras. In this respect it will differ from the traditional historically-orientated museums which already exist in Hong Kong.

2.31 The perspective of now would be highlighted



throughout presentations in **M+** in future to help the community understand the experience of modernity and the moment they are now, although the period 20<sup>th</sup> to 21<sup>st</sup> century is recommended as the focus period. The period is recommended because it is exerting, forward-looking and rich in new developments. It is also a period which is closely linked to our current experience for it was the time when Hong Kong experience, including cultural experience, was built up and consolidated. Since this period is important in the history of Hong Kong, it deserves more attention.

2.32 MAG recommends that the key characteristics of **M+**'s unique curatorial vision should include the following:

- (i) presenting visual culture from a Hong Kong perspective;
- (ii) presenting visual culture from the perspective of now;
- (iii) presenting visual culture with a commitment to its diversity;
- (iv) presenting visual culture with a flexible attitude open to new interpretations, fostering cross-fertilization and communication;
- (v) presenting visual culture by promoting community engagement, based on a continuing dialogue with

the public; and

- (vi) presenting visual culture with respect for curatorial and other specialized professional expertise.

2.33 MAG recommends the key functions of **M+** to include the following (in alphabetical order):

- (i) Collection building and preservation;
- (ii) Education and outreach;
- (iii) Exhibition and display; and
- (iv) Research and publications.

**(f) International Standards**

2.34 MAG reiterates that **M+**, as a “Museum Plus”, must comply with the highest professional standards comparable to those of the well-acclaimed museums worldwide. This includes international codes of ethics, research, curatorship, conservation, interpretation, display and presentation, management and operations. In overseas countries, such professional standards are usually ascertained through established accreditation or registration schemes imposed by government agencies.

## **(g) Collection Strategy**

2.35 Given the nature of **M+** and the changing environment, MAG considers that the collection strategy should be broad and general at this stage and recommends as follows:

*“The collection may focus on 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century visual culture, beginning with visual art, design, moving image and popular culture from Hong Kong, expanding to other regions of China, Asia and the rest of the world.*

*Hong Kong has rich collections of ink art works. **M+** should try to attract these collections, to showcase this important visual form and its interplay with other art forms.”*

2.36 The above has taken into account the unique position of **M+** and the strength of Hong Kong in relevant fields.

2.37 MAG recommends the ownership of the collections will be held in a public trust supervised by a Board of Trustees.

## **(h) Governance**

2.38 MAG recommends that the governance structure of **M+** must guarantee the principles of curatorial independence, professional excellence, collaboration and accountability to the public. The governance should preferably take the form of a statutory body with an independent Board of Trustees, whose members consist of representatives from different sectors in the community, including government appointees, people from the business and professional fields, and art supporters such as philanthropists, collectors and specialists in the relevant broad groupings. The mandate of the Board of Trustees would be to uphold the Mission Statement and develop the strategic direction of **M+**, to maintain good relations with the public, to develop essential funding sources, to monitor the activities of **M+**, including financial strength, and to appoint or dismiss the Director of **M+**.

## **(i) Architectural Programme**

- **Profile**

2.39 The architecture of **M+** should be innovative and forward-looking. The architecture should have flexibility for organic growth in future and should be able to attract visitors

from other events and activities in WKCD. MAG strongly recommends holding an open and international architectural competition for **M+**.

- **Size**

2.40 MAG acknowledges the importance of size and a need to allow flexibility for future expansion. An in-depth benchmarking survey of three well-known overseas museums of similar nature and size has been conducted for comparative study to work out the architectural parameters of **M+**. The benchmarking museums are Centre Pompidou (Centre national d'art et de culture Georges Pompidou), New York Museum of Modern Art and Tate Modern. The key data of the benchmarking museums is at **Annex 12**.

2.41 In addition, MAG uses the current and projected population, and the number of tourists of Hong Kong and overseas cities to compare the museum provisions for reference for the architectural parameters.

2.42 The development parameters of **M+** recommended are as follows:

	<b>First phase</b>	<b>Subsequent Phase(s)</b>	<b>Eventual size<sup>12</sup></b>
<b>Site area<sup>13</sup></b>	37 500 m <sup>2</sup>		
<b>Net operating floor area (“NOFA”)</b>	49 000 m <sup>2</sup>	26 000 m <sup>2</sup>	75 000 m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Net exhibition area<sup>14</sup></b>	20 000 m <sup>2</sup>	10 000 m <sup>2</sup>	30 000 m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Gross floor area (“GFA”) (estimated)</b>	81 000 m <sup>2</sup>	44 000 m <sup>2</sup>	125 000 m <sup>2</sup>

- **Site Configuration**

2.43 MAG recommends that the location and configuration of the land lot for **M+** should be left to the jurisdiction of the future master planner of the whole cultural district, who should have due regard for **M+**'s cultural and

---

<sup>12</sup> The proposed figures in the table above are recommended to be verified by the future museum experts and planners for **M+**.

<sup>13</sup> The site area is worked out based on the assumption that net area is 60% of gross area, **M+** has five storeys and 50% open space would be allowed within the **M+** site.

<sup>14</sup> According to the benchmarking survey and information obtained from different sources, normally 40% of the NOFA is designated for exhibition area. The net exhibition area of the first phase of **M+** is benchmarked from the average of the current net exhibition areas of Centre Pompidou and New York MOMA.

civic prominence and its full integration with WKCD.

- **Proposed Facilities**

2.44 MAG proposes a wide range of facilities to be included in **M+** to enhance its roles. The ambit of those facilities could be loosely defined in some cases to facilitate crossover and synergy.

- ***Exhibition Galleries and Back-of-house Facilities***

2.45 MAG recommends the use of space in **M+** should be flexible in order to maximize the exhibition areas. MAG stresses that the height of exhibition space is important too. The exhibition space is recommended to be demarcated flexibly so as to maximize cross-fertilization amongst the broad groupings. The storage area and conservation laboratory could be located outside the WKCD, if possible.

- ***Dedicated Outreach and Education Centre***

2.46 A dedicated outreach and education centre to promote art education and knowledge of the creative industries is considered an essential tool for nurturing talent

and engaging students, visual culture professionals and the general public. This centre is in line with public requests for more arts education and setting up an education centre / children's centre within the WKCD.

- ***Library and Archive***

2.47 **M+** recognizes the importance of developing and sustaining a comprehensive library and archive for visual culture of the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century. It would include ephemeral, published, unpublished, electronic and multi-media material that can be easily accessed by the public, both physically and electronically.

2.48 Being more than a static collection of materials, the library and archive collection would provide a platform for in-depth research, and the tools to forge new ways in which visual culture is read.

2.49 By encouraging research and dialogue between different groupings, producing new primary source material and working closely with other departments in the organization, the archive, library and research centre would form an integral part in the way visual culture is presented.



2.50 MAG recommends that an archive to systematically preserve and make accessible documents about the development of **M+** be established to include administrative and programme records, sound and video recordings of **M+** related events and oral histories with staff, artists and those closely associated with the institution.

- ***Screening Facility***

2.51 Since moving image is one of the broad groupings of **M+**, MAG recommends that a quality and sizable screening facility should be provided in **M+** so that events relevant to the moving image community could be held in WKCD. MAG considers that this could enhance the profile of **M+** and strengthen its linkage with relevant sectors.

- ***Bookstore***

2.52 A bookstore on visual culture is recommended. Subjects like visual art, design, moving image, popular culture, as well as performing arts could be included. The bookstore could serve as a complement to other facilities in WKCD.

- ***Artists-in-residence Studios***

2.53 Space for art creation by invited artists for short term uses is recommended. Studios of this nature are very common in overseas major arts museums, which could facilitate cultural exchange, artistic creation and enhance the profile of **M+**.

- ***Amenities Including Catering Facilities and Shops***

2.54 MAG considers that both catering services and shops could bring comfort to visitor and extend their length of stay. Cooking, ambience and customer service are of equal importance to the success of catering services. MAG recommends that the catering services should be able to provide a wide range of menus which would be served in a comfortable and welcoming environment. Catering services could even go beyond **M+**'s opening hours.

2.55 Similarly, shops consistent with the **M+** experience will be of great interest to visitors. They should be strategically located to make visible to visitors upon entering **M+**. Such facilities would give visitors a pleasant experience, a desire to stay longer and an opportunity to take home products which will remind them of their visit or even a further

opportunity for study.

- ***Outdoor Space***

2.56 **M+** should play a significant role in enriching the cultural ecology of Hong Kong. MAG recommends that sufficient open space should be provided in **M+**, as it could be suitably used for exhibits, special events like evening screening, performing and literary arts presentations etc. to complement the programmes and ambience of **M+**.

**(j) Sustainability of M+**

2.57 **M+** would enhance its strong potential to sustain the interests of and engagements with local and overseas visitors through various means including, but is not limited to, outstanding architecture, attractive programming and high professionalism in the operation. MAG envisages that with a healthy cultural ecology, the annual attendance of **M+** should reach 2.5 million per annum as the target number of visitors.

## **CHAPTER 3**

### **PROPOSED EXHIBITION CENTRE**

#### **(a) Background**

3.1 In view of the persistent and foreseeable demand for more well-equipped and centrally located hiring venue for mounting large-scale exhibitions and art fairs, an Art Exhibition Center (“AEC”) was included in the original IPF. It was proposed that the AEC would have a NOFA of at least 10 000 m<sup>2</sup> and would be a self-contained and free standing building with flexible design and well equipped exhibition galleries to cater for a wide variety of exhibitions and collections of local and overseas sources.

#### **(b) Needs**

3.2 On top of the public consultation, MAG has had discussions with representatives of relevant sectors, individual artists, architects and designers to exchange views on the AEC. There is a consensus that an acute shortage of quality exhibition space for the arts and culture-related events has been a phenomenon for quite some time. MAG

considers that the uses of the AEC should not be confined to the arts and, therefore, the AEC should be re-named as Exhibition Centre (“EC”) as a working title to reflect its wider usage. MAG recommends the EC to give priority to uses for the arts, culture, creative industries and events / activities related to WKCD, e.g. banquets and pre-performance drinks related to performances or events to strengthen the overall image of WKCD and its synergy with other facilities in the district. With the establishment of the EC, major art, culture and creative industries related events like art festivals, auctions, design shows, conferences etc. as well as a mixture of different uses (some of which could be beyond traditional forms) could be held frequently to enhance the attraction of WKCD.

### **(c) Specifications**

3.3 MAG supports the NOFA of the EC to remain as 10 000 m<sup>2</sup> as included in the IFP. In addition, 20% open space at the site should be provided.

3.4 As for the architecture of the EC, it is preferred to be self-contained with a maximum of two storeys. It needs not be free standing. The architecture is suggested to be practical with bare but flexible internal space to cater for a wide range of usages. The EC is recommended to be

equipped to cater for events of different nature, e.g. auctions, conferences, exhibitions, fairs, workshops, shows etc. In this connection, facilities like conferencing facilities, food and beverage, storage, strong room etc. would be required. Furthermore, an in-depth study on the feasibility of the EC is recommended to be conducted in future to facilitate the detailed planning of the EC.

3.5 MAG recommends that there should be a separate identity for the EC. The EC, however, could join hands with other facilities in WKCD to organise arts and cultural events to attract people's attention and encourage them to visit the district. It is advisable to be close to hotel facilities to provide convenience to its users.

#### **(d) Governance and Hiring Policy**

3.6 MAG recommends that the EC should aim to run on a self-financing basis with its management overseen by an independent body. Experts in the fields of arts, culture and creative industries could be engaged to advise on the types of events to be allowed in the EC in order to achieve a balanced mix in its usage.

3.7 The rental of the EC could be flexible at the initial

stage, with concessionary rates for non-commercial arts, cultural and creative industries related usage. In addition, certain exhibition areas and certain time slots could be earmarked for relevant uses if such uses fulfill the mission to promote the arts, culture and creative industries. Concessionary rental would need to be assessed and approved by an advisory panel according to some established criteria.

## **CHAPTER 4**

### **ACTION STEPS**

#### **(a) Preparatory Steps**

4.1 MAG attaches great importance to work during the interim period from the decision to establish **M+** to its formal opening in WKCD, as this would be laying down a solid foundation to the success of **M+** since it will take a long time to plan, build up collections and develop relevant expertise. MAG recommends the following measures / steps to be undertaken during the interim period:

- ***Advisory Committee***

4.2 MAG recommends the preparatory work for setting up **M+** to be started as soon as practicable after the proposal is endorsed by Government. Although we do not recommend a full-scale public consultation on their recommendations, we consider an informal platform for continual dialogues with interested parties to seek feedback is appropriate. Since our recommendations consist of philosophical and complicated ideas and concepts which may need elaboration, briefings could be held at a suitable juncture to engage the public.



4.3 To take the recommendations forward, MAG suggests to set up an advisory panel to advise, before the establishment of the WKCD Authority, on issues relating to **M+**. Professionals on museum and the related broad groupings could be included in the panel which is recommended to advise on the following:

- (a) the promotion plan, including interim exhibitions, events, website etc. to build public awareness and interest, and to nurture future audience;
- (b) the implementation plan, including time schedule;
- (c) the proposed collection strategy, including funding and collection; and
- (d) the need for and programs to enhance public education in the arts.

- ***Interim Centre***

4.4 To gather momentum for **M+**, MAG recommends to identify somewhere to be an interim venue for **M+** during the period before it is formally opened. Such an interim centre would not only provide a platform for training of professional staff for **M+** but also provide art education to the public to cultivate and develop audience and build and sustain public

interest in visual culture. The interim centre should also perform research functions with a view to laying a solid foundation for **M+** to do presentations with a global vision and from a Hong Kong perspective.

- ***Collection Strategy / Donation Culture***

4.5 Collections are pivotal for building knowledge, competence and value of **M+**. Time and funding are required to build up sizable and impressive collections. MAG, therefore, recommends the future authority start acquiring and building collections as soon as practicable.

4.6 Meanwhile, MAG acknowledges that collections which define the attribute of **M+**, need long time to build up through acquisitions as well as donations. MAG, however, also acknowledges that donations to museums are not a common phenomenon in Hong Kong. We therefore suggest measures be undertaken to fostering a donation culture to help **M+** build up sizable and impressive collections. The donation culture could be encouraged through introducing incentives. Experience from institutions which are successful in attracting substantial and regular donations could be drawn. MAG, however, stresses that the autonomy on the content and style of exhibitions and other programmes have to be retained by **M+**.

- ***Professional Training***

4.7 MAG stresses the importance of adequate training in professional pursuits, technical or management skills which include cultural policy, curatorship, museology, museum management, operations and fields related to the initial broad groupings in order to build up a sufficient size of expertise for **M+**. Such training and education could be conducted by relevant government departments and tertiary institutions.

- ***Audience Building and Education***

4.8 MAG acknowledges the importance to nurture a sizable audience for **M+**. We strongly recommend to encourage art education at all levels to foster the awareness, understanding and appreciation of arts and culture by the general public. Like professional training, art education could be conducted by schools, relevant government departments and tertiary institutions.

- ***Local and Global Networking and Interaction with Existing Institutions***

4.9 MAG acknowledges that **M+** will not be operated as an isolated institution. In almost all aspects, **M+** will have interactions with a network of related institutions, from the public and private sectors, local and overseas. Among local institutions that impinge on **M+**, it is very likely that the existing public museums are the most profound ones. MAG envisages there will be multiple relationships between the existing public museums and **M+**. The two groups could develop collaborations to share or fully utilize resources or to build up wider audiences through partnerships, programmes or joint promotional efforts. There may be healthy competition on collections, expertise, programming and resources between them. MAG welcomes collaboration as well as positive competition between the two groups. We, therefore, recommend **M+** to develop a close communication with existing and future museums.

4.10 MAG attaches great importance to professionalism and independency in curatorship and recommends to leave to the future curators to plan the collection development, programming and curatorial training for **M+**. Meanwhile, as there are overlapping of broad groupings between the existing public museums and **M+**, MAG does not rule out the possibility of collection sharing. In fact, sharing of collections is not uncommon and such an arrangement could help the professionals to research and explore new interpretations of collections which will benefit **M+**, existing museums and the visitors at large.

4.11 MAG also recommends to leave the decision on how and to what extent collection and curatorial sharing and exchanges between the existing public museums and **M+** to the future curators.

4.12 MAG members have different views on whether the existing public museums should be realigned after **M+** is opened. Some members support realignment since this would enable public resources to be shared or utilized fully and avoid confusion in identity. Other members considered that professional independence of all museums should be respected and curators should be given the autonomy to decide on the exhibitions and presentations. Any control or unjustified intervention on the broad groupings and scope of collections of the existing public museums should not be encouraged. MAG advises that this issue should be further examined when the future WKCD Authority is in place. The Committee on Museums (“CoM”) should also study on this issue in due course.

4.13 MAG supports to start developing a network of global cultural partnerships in parallel. Such partnerships and networks would be essential for formulating attractive programmes and attracting donations and sponsorships. MAG wishes to point out that the **M+** project can only succeed

as part of an overall arts development strategy for Hong Kong that is in line with the goal of creating a diversified cultural ecology.

## **CHAPTER 5**

### **OTHER RELEVANT ISSUES**

#### **(a) Committee on Museums (“CoM”)**

5.1 The CoM<sup>15</sup> which was established to advise the Government on the provision of public museum services has a close relationship with MAG. Apart from overlapping key members of CoM in MAG, the former is conducting reviews on a series of issues related to existing museums, which include the mode of governance of public museums and the relationship between **M+** and the existing museums. MAG has discussed with members of CoM on their work and exchanged views on the proposed museum facilities in WKCD. MAG takes a close interest in the CoM’s recommendations on issues like interfacing and the mode of governance of public museums in due course.

#### **(b) Other Minority Views**

---

<sup>15</sup> Committee on Museums (“CoM”) was established by Government in November 2004 in response to the recommendations of the Culture and Heritage Commission. The CoM advises the Secretary for Home Affairs on the provision of public museum services. It comprises 22 unofficial members appointed by the Secretary for Home Affairs. It has two sub-committees, namely Sub-committee on Governance of Museum Services and Sub-committee on Development Strategy of Museum Services.

5.2 There are minority views to establish a separate broad grouping for ink art and a children's museum in **M+**.

5.3 A few members advocate putting ink art as a separate broad grouping because it represents an important and unique Chinese contribution to the world culture. This millennium old art form is still thriving. Hong Kong artists have contributed to its evolution, and Hong Kong has the expertise and resources to showcase this tradition in a coherent and comprehensive manner to the world.

5.4 After much deliberation, MAG considers the proposal not recommendable since ink art is an integral part of visual art. Segregating the former from the latter will marginalize the former and defeat the challenging vision of **M+** to achieve cross-fertilization. Nevertheless, MAG agrees that the uniqueness of ink art in the Hong Kong context should be given due consideration and should be highlighted in the collection strategy.

5.5 One member considered that a children's museum would be educational, interesting and attractive to family visitors, especially given the fact that children account for around one fifth of the local population. MAG, however, does not support a separate children's museum in WKCD and considers that the educational facilities and programmes in



the proposed **M+** could cater for the needs of children and to engage young generation. The future curators should be given the challenge to produce programmes that would target both adults and children.

**Museums Advisory Group**  
**The Report to the Consultative Committee**  
**23 November 2006**

- |         |   |
|---------|---|
| Annexes | <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>(1) Original Recommendations in the Invitation for Proposals</li><li>(2) Terms of Reference of MAG</li><li>(3) Membership List of MAG</li><li>(4) List of Museums in Hong Kong</li><li>(5) The Schedules and Notes of the Consultation Events Held by MAG</li><li>(6) Summary of Written Submissions and Views Submitted via Public Affairs Forum</li><li>(7) List of Themes Received Since 2004</li><li>(8) Notes of the Briefings by Overseas Experts</li><li>(9) Report on the Duty Visit to Major Overseas Museums</li><li>(10) List of Meetings Held by MAG</li><li>(11) Hong Kong's Cultural Policy</li><li>(12) Key Data of the Benchmarking Museums</li></ol> |
|---------|---|

**Original Recommendations  
in the Invitation for Proposals**

In September 2003, the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China ("Government") launched the Invitation for Proposals ("IFP") for the development of a 40-hectare waterfront site at the southern tip of the West Kowloon Reclamation into a world-class arts, cultural, entertainment and commercial district. The IFP, now discontinued, had specified the following museums and art exhibition facilities as Mandatory Requirements of the project -

- (i) **Museum Cluster ("MC")** comprising four museums with different themes with a total Net Operating Floor Area ("NOFA") of at least 75 000 m<sup>2</sup>; and
- (ii) **Art Exhibition Centre ("AEC")** with NOFA of at least 10 000 m<sup>2</sup>.

2. According to the IFP, the MC and the AEC should be located at the eastern part of the cultural headland. The MC would present world-class exhibitions and programmes, the design of which should be state-of-the art and facilitate the carrying out of core museum functions. The AEC, on the other hand, would be a self-contained building housing flexibly designed and well equipped galleries to cater for a wide variety of exhibitions and collections of overseas and local sources.

3. The four preferred themes (which were not Mandatory Requirements) were highlighted in the IFP as follows:

- (i) **Museum of Moving Image** – to illustrate the development of the Hong Kong film industry and technology related to the creation of the moving image. An IMAX 3D Theatre with a seating capacity of around 500 seats should be included;
- (ii) **Museum of Modern Art** – to feature Hong Kong’s modern art collections in different media and to present in-house and loan exhibitions on contemporary art from international sources;
- (iii) **Museum of Ink** – to feature collections created in the ink medium and present exhibitions on these subjects; and
- (iv) **Museum of Design** – to feature collections of local design and to present exhibitions on contemporary local as well as international design and related disciplines.

**Consultative Committee on the  
Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the  
West Kowloon Cultural District**

**Museums Advisory Group**

**Terms of Reference**

Based on the existing arts and cultural policy and having regard to the current provisions in Hong Kong, to advise the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”) on the following –

- ◆ the need for the four museums proposed in the WKCD and the preferred themes of these museums<sup>(Note)</sup>;
- ◆ the need to include museums with other themes;
- ◆ following confirmation of the themes, the scale and major requirements of each museum as far as practicable; and
- ◆ the need for and major specifications of the Art Exhibition Centre.

---

(Note) The Invitation for Proposals only requires a Museum Cluster comprising four museums of different themes, with at least 75 000 m<sup>2</sup> Net Operating Floor Area. The four “preferred museum themes” are:

- ◆ Museum of Moving Image
- ◆ Museum of Modern Art
- ◆ Museum of Ink
- ◆ Museum of Design

These themes are not Mandatory Requirements in the IFP.

**Museums Advisory Group**

**Membership**

- Convenor : Hon Victor LO Chung-wing, GBS, JP
- Members : Mr Benny CHIA Chun-heng  
Dr David CLARKE  
Ms Jane DEBEVOISE  
Ms Sabrina FUNG Mee-ying  
Mr Oscar HO Hing-kay  
Ms Claire HSU  
Mr Andrew LAM Hon-kin  
Mr Freeman LAU Siu-hong, BBS  
Mr Tim LI Man-wai  
Ms LO Kai-yin  
Mr Vincent LO Wing-sang, BBS, JP  
Prof David LUNG Ping-ye, SBS, JP  
Ms Nansun SHI  
Ms Ada WONG Ying-kay, JP  
Dr Peter WONG King-keung, BBS, JP  
Mr Wucius WONG Chung-ki  
Dr Philip WU Po-him, BBS, JP  
Mr YEUNG Chun-tong  
Mr Rocco YIM Sen-kee  
Mr YIM Shui-yuen
- Secretary : Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1, Home Affairs Bureau
- In attendance : Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3) / Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1, Home Affairs Bureau  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Planning & Lands) 5, Housing Planning & Lands Bureau (changed to Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2, Home Affairs Bureau on 1 June 2006)  
Deputy Director (Culture) / Assistant Director (Heritage & Museums), Leisure and Cultural Services Department  
Chief Curator (Heritage & Museum Services), Leisure and Cultural Services Department  
A representative of Architectural Services Department

**List of Museums in Hong Kong**

<b>Museums</b>	<b>Year Opened</b>	<b>Gross Floor Area ("GFA")</b> (Exhibition area in bracket)	<b>Themes</b>
<u>LCSD Museums</u>			
1. Lei Cheng Uk Han Tomb Museum	1957	185 m <sup>2</sup> (93 m <sup>2</sup> )	Featured artefacts including ceramics, bronze wares and related relics unearthed at the historical tomb of the Eastern Han dynasty at Lei Cheng Uk.
2. Hong Kong Space Museum	1980	8 110 m <sup>2</sup> (1 600 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features artefacts of space mission and technology with sky show and omnimax show programmes at its planetarium.
3. Sheung Yiu Folk Museum	1984	500 m <sup>2</sup> (450 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features artefacts including farming tools and a lime kiln at the historical Sheung Yiu village.
4. Flagstaff House Museum of Tea Ware	1984	2 985 m <sup>2</sup> (603 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features Chinese teaware and introduces the custom of tea drinking in China, Chinese ceramics and seal carvings. Exhibits were donated by the Dr K.S. Lo Foundation.

5. Hong Kong Railway Museum	1985	6 500 m <sup>2</sup> (6 380 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features trains and the history of railway transportation at the historical old Tai Po Railway Station.
6. Sam Tung Uk Museum	1987	2 000 m <sup>2</sup> (1 300 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features artefacts and daily utensils at the historic Hakka walled village, Sam Tung Uk, in Tsuen Wan.
7. Law Uk Folk Museum	1990	230 m <sup>2</sup> (124 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features artefacts and daily utensils at the historic Hakka house, Law Uk, in Chai Wan.
8. Hong Kong Museum of Art	1991 <sup>Note</sup>	17 530 m <sup>2</sup> (6 019 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features Chinese antiques, Chinese painting and calligraphy, historical pictures and contemporary Hong Kong art, with temporary exhibitions on classical art and modern / contemporary art of the world.
9. Hong Kong Science Museum	1991	13 500 m <sup>2</sup> (7 250 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features various themes of science and technology, such as meteorology, life science, motion, water and wave, telecommunication, etc. with interactive exhibits.

<sup>Note</sup> The City Museum and Art Gallery was housed in City Hall since 1962. In 1975, it was split into the Hong Kong Museum of Art and Hong Kong Museum of History. The “Year Opened” here denotes the opening of their present premises.



10. Hong Kong Museum of History	1998 (refer to Note)	17 500 m <sup>2</sup> (8 135 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features the history of Hong Kong from the prehistoric period to the 20 <sup>th</sup> century and other themes such as folk culture and the natural environment of Hong Kong.
11. Hong Kong Museum of Coastal Defence	2000	34 200 m <sup>2</sup> (8 135 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features the history of coastal defence in Hong Kong with a theatre and historical trail.
12. Hong Kong Heritage Museum	2000	32 000m <sup>2</sup> (7 500 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features the heritage of Hong Kong with thematic galleries on the New Territories heritage, Cantonese opera, paintings and calligraphy by Professor Chai Shao-an and other temporary exhibitions.
13. Hong Kong Film Archive	2001	7 200 m <sup>2</sup> (214 m <sup>2</sup> )	Features the history of film in Hong Kong with film shows, exhibitions and maintains an archive on films for public's access and research.
14. Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre	2005	4 948 m <sup>2</sup> (1 337m <sup>2</sup> )	Features archaeological finds, monuments and built heritage of Hong Kong.

<u>Non-LCSD Museums</u>			
15. University Museum and Art Gallery, The University of Hong Kong	1953	1 100 m <sup>2</sup>	University Museum. Featured exhibitions on art, history and culture related to the University's educational role.
16. Art Museum, The Chinese University of Hong Kong	1971	1 000 m <sup>2</sup>	University museum related to the Fine Arts Department of the university. Features exhibitions of Chinese antiques, Chinese painting and calligraphy and contemporary art.
17. Tung Wah Museum	1971	368 m <sup>2</sup>	Museum operated by the Tung Wah Group. Features the history of the Tung Wah Group of Hospitals and medical services provided by the Group with artefacts, photographs and documents.
18. Police Museum	1988	570 m <sup>2</sup>	Government department museum. Features the history of the Hong Kong Police with artefacts, photographs, guns, drugs and the history of the Triads etc.
19. The Hong Kong Racing Museum	1996	378 m <sup>2</sup>	Museum operated by the Hong Kong Jockey Club. Features the history of the Hong Kong Jockey Club and the history of horse racing in Hong Kong.

20. Hong Kong Museum of Medical Sciences	1996	700 m <sup>2</sup>	Run by Hong Kong Museum of Medical Sciences Society. Features the history of medical services in Hong Kong and artefacts related to medical sciences.
21. Po Leung Kuk Museum	1998	820 m <sup>2</sup>	Museum operated by the Po Leung Kuk. Features the history of the Po Leung Kuk and the care and protection of women in Hong Kong.
22. Museum of Ethnology	2000	757 m <sup>2</sup>	Private museum. Features themes of ethnology and folk culture, in particular that of China, with artefacts and photographs.
23. Hong Kong Correctional Services Museum	2004	480 m <sup>2</sup>	Government department museum. Features history and provision of the Correctional Services Department.
24. Hong Kong Maritime Museum	2005	140 m <sup>2</sup>	Non-profit private museum operated by a Board of Directors. Features the maritime history of Hong Kong and thematic exhibitions related to the shipping industries.

**The Schedules and Notes of the Consultation Events  
Held by MAG**

*Focus Group Meeting*

- Meeting with Curators in government and non-government sectors on 23 May 2006

*Open Consultative Forums*

1 <sup>st</sup> session	29 May 2006	Lecture Hall, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre, Kowloon Park, Kowloon
2 <sup>nd</sup> session	30 May 2006	Fringe Club Theatre, Ground Floor, Hong Kong Fringe Club, 2 Lower Albert Road

*Presentation Hearings*

1 <sup>st</sup> hearing	6 June 2006	Meeting the Ink Society
2 <sup>nd</sup> hearing	13 June 2006	Meeting the International Film Festival, Hong Kong Federation of Design Associations, Para/Site Art Space and Hong Kong International Association of Art Critics
3 <sup>rd</sup> hearing	21 June 2006	Meeting individual artists

**Focus Group Meeting with Curators held by  
Museums Advisory Group**

Date : 23 May 2006  
Time : 2:30 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau,  
41/F Revenue Tower, Wanchai  
Attendees : see Appendix

**Summary of the Meeting**

**Views on Major Museum Facilities in West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”)**

1. “Miraikan” in Japan was cited as an example and considered the definition of “museums” in the original proposal too narrow. The construction of facilities in the name of “museums” might not meet the development needs in WKCD, and it might limit the types of museums proposed in WKCD. As “culture” could have a very wide definition, it should cover a wider array of contents. If the facility concerned was entitled “centre” instead of “museum”, it might attract more visitors. Besides, a gallery or centre themed on science should be set up in WKCD to balance with the proposed museum themes with a view to attract the younger generations and families.

2. Regarding the four original proposed museum themes in WKCD, there might be conflicts among the museums in the acquisition of collections. For example, the collections in Modern Art Museum and the Ink Museum might overlap. Taking the Moving Image Museum as another example, the visual exhibits in the museum might overlap with those in the existing Film Archive. A widely encompassing Design Museum might also have its collections overlapped with the Modern Art Museum. Therefore, extra care should be exercised.
3. The establishment of a modern art or contemporary art museum in WKCD was supported to showcase the art creations of Hong Kong in the last decade or so. Provision of exhibition space in WKCD for alternate and separate display of different art forms was proposed. The importance of pluralism was stressed. As ink was part of the modern art, ink and modern art museums might be put under one roof.
4. The four proposed museum themes in WKCD put too much emphasis on visual art. There might be too few alternatives for visitors. As science museums were the most popular among all museums, followed by history and visual art museums there should be diversity in the types and combinations of museums in WKCD. In addition to the museums of the four proposed themes, Science Museum, History Museum and Transport Museum could be set up. The latter could mark the transformation process of Hong Kong from a small fishing village into a financial centre. Other options were Sports Museum and Children Museum. Regarding the four proposed museum themes, “Modern Art”, “Ink” and “Design” had, to some extent, overlapped with the existing museum themes. It was suggested that “ink” and “design” be put under the theme “modern art” and this museum be expanded into an “Asian Modern Art Museum”. Besides, the proposed setting up of a “Moving Image” museum was supported.

5. Museums could create unique identity through their themes, collections and architectural design, thereby attracting their own visitors. Therefore a museum displaying its collections in the mode of a “centre” would never measure up to other museums in terms of function and long-term development. It would diminish the identity of the museum and the incentives of sponsorship and donation.
6. Seeing that WKCD was by the seashore and the history and life of Hong Kong were closely related to sea transport, the setting up of a maritime museum in WKCD was suggested.

#### **Opinions on Vision of the Museum Cluster and Ancillary Facilities in the WKCD**

7. Museums must have their own collection. Therefore, museums in WKCD, regardless of their category, must consider whether they have adequate supply of collections with good quality.
8. Long-term planning is important to the success of a museum. Curators should start acquisition early in the preparation period of the museum.
9. The decision on the museum themes could be deferred so as to allow more room and flexibility to accommodate the future development of society and the arts sector. A large-scale museum in WKCD as an icon and landmark was proposed, as well as 5 to 6 smaller museums with appealing collections.
10. “Programme activities” of museums were more important than their themes. Citing Hong Kong Arts Centre and Macao Cultural Centre as examples, there should be 5 to 6 museums of no specific themes in WKCD and each museum should display its collection every 5 years. It would provide

organic and flexible arrangements for art exhibition programmes, and contribute to the success of the museum. But the attractiveness of themeless museums to the visitors was doubted, and pointed out that museums should have a clear position as an appeal to visitors.

11. The success of a museum depended heavily on the significance and quality of its collection, as well as ancillary measures in arts educational activities. Hence the financial factor (such as funding for acquisition of high quality collection) is of utmost importance. It would directly affect the decision on the themes of museums. Good quality management staff was also crucial to the operation of museums.
12. Reservations were expressed about the Public Private Partnership approach for the development of WKCD because there had not been any successful precedent case. Besides, enactment of a museum ordinance and enhanced training for the management staff of museums were suggested so as to ensure the success of museums in WKCD.



**List of Attendees**

Curators

Mr Tobias BERGER  
Mr CHAN Ki-hung  
Mr CHAN Shing-wai  
Mr Sam CHOW  
Dr Stephen DAVIES  
Ms Valerie DORAN  
Ms Christina LAM  
Mr Albert LEE  
Ms Phoebe MAN  
Mr Tom MING  
Dr Louis NG  
Mr SIU King-chung  
Ms Angela TONG  
Ms WONG Fei  
Ms Mabel WONG  
Mr YIP Chi-kuen

Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)  
Dr David CLARKE  
Ms Jane DEBEVOISE  
Ms Sabrina FUNG  
Mr Oscar HO  
Ms Claire HSU  
Mr Andrew LAM  
Mr Freeman LAU  
Mr Tim LI  
Ms LO Kai-yin  
Mr Wucius WONG

Dr Philip WU, BBS, JP

Mr YEUNG Chun-tong

Mr Rocco YIM

Mr YIM Shui-yim

Government Officials

Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Mr Peter KWOK, Principal Assistant Secretary (Culture)2

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr K.C. HO, Chief Curator (Heritage & Museum Services)

## **Open Consultative Forums held by Museums Advisory Group**

[ Combined summary of discussion of the two forums ]

### 1<sup>st</sup> Open Consultative Forum

Date : 29 May 2006  
Time : 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m.  
Venue : Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre,  
Kowloon Park, Hoiphong Road,  
Tsimshatsui, Kowloon  
No. of Participants : about 50

### 2<sup>nd</sup> Open Consultative Forum

Date : 30 May 2006  
Time : 5:00 p.m. - 7:00 p.m.  
Venue : Hong Kong Fringe Club,  
2 Lower Albert Road,  
Central, Hong Kong  
No. of Participants : about 50

### **Invitation for Proposals (“IFP”)**

1. The four original themes mentioned in IFP had their own merits.
2. Each of the four themes of the museums proposed in the previous IFP for West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”) had its own defects.

3. The themes of the four museums proposed in WKCD had put too much emphasis on visual art. There might be too few alternatives for visitors in future. Science museums were the most popular among all museums, followed by history museums and then visual art museum. Therefore, there should be more diversity in terms of disciplines and combinations for the museums in WKCD. Besides, the museum themes should be closely related to the local life. The method of parallel comparison should be adopted in choosing the museums best suited for Hong Kong people.
4. The four museums of different themes in WKCD were unnecessary. Museums of different levels under one broad theme might be an option to draw a clearer line between different sub-themes.
5. MAG should provide further rationale for the proposition of the four museums of specific themes as defined in IFP.
6. It was necessary for the Government to provide justifications for the four museum themes based on a more comprehensive study to facilitate in-depth public discussions.
7. The four themes mentioned in the proposal were restrictive.
8. The Museum of Modern Art in the IFP only covered modern installation arts, the works of local artists would then be excluded.

## **Overall Views**

9. MAG should invite some academics to conduct a forward-looking study with a view to formulating a WKCD policy from an objective and scientific perspective.
10. Comprehensive and diversified museums should be built for WKCD to stimulate the public's interest in learning. The museums could become part of the life of Hong Kong people and reflect the characteristics of Hong Kong life.
11. More galleries of small and medium scale should be built to give full play to Hong Kong's local characteristics.
12. There should be an overall planning for the WKCD development and that more opportunities should be provided for local artists.
13. In developing any museums in WKCD, consideration should be given to the overall positioning of different museums in the territory.
14. The roadmap and method of consultation of the WKCD project should be published.
15. The way to position museums in WKCD a "social space" should be deliberated.
16. The new function of museums in today's society, e.g. to take on an educational role instead of collecting exhibits should be considered.
17. The way for public to take part in the discussion on WKCD effectively could be informed.

18. WKCD project would only be the starting point for the exploration of Hong Kong culture.
19. The Government might consider designing a plan based on the “Greater Hong Kong” concept by conducting a multi-disciplinary study of the existing and future museums throughout Hong Kong in order to map out a territory-wide cultural plan. The cluster of museums built according to such a plan would be larger in scale and would be more effective than the building of several museums in WKCD.
20. Museums should possess cultural sensitivity. Visitors should not treat museums as leisure venues. The existing and future museums could provide more visit guides so as to allow visitors understand the feature of the museum exhibits more easily.
21. More background information could be provided for a better understanding of the characteristics and strengths of the existing museums.
22. WKCD would strike a good balance between international dimension and local arts.
23. The development of the WKCD should be organic in order to ensure a mutually beneficial and complementary relationship among the different types of facilities.
24. Museums of a particular place should epitomize its cultural identity through the essence of its local culture. The functions of the museums should resemble those of ancestral halls in the old days or churches. Museums of different themes should be built in WKCD to demonstrate unique identities and characteristics of various local communities. This would help attract not only local people but also a large number of tourists. Lastly, a museum had to take a long time to develop and could not operate by relying on

collections borrowed from elsewhere or operating as a branch of some other museums, as this would not be conducive to upgrading the cultural profile of the museum.

25. While high standard museums were expected to be built in WKCD, MAG and the public should first define the term “high standard” and clearly identify the future target audiences of WKCD, as this would be conducive to the planning development of WKCD.
26. The recent trends of overseas museums were to spend a huge amount of money for collecting prestigious works of art. If the Government was determined to proceed with the WKCD project, it should start to acquire world-class exhibits as soon as possible.
27. The identity of the museums in WKCD as museums of world-class or Asian standard had to be clearly stated.
28. The resources of Hong Kong had currently focused on performing arts and visual art had been given little attention.

### **Museums Themes**

29. Museum themes had to be identified first before building a world-class museum in WKCD.
30. Visual art covered a wide spectrum of topics. A contemporary art gallery, which kept up with the international trends in arts, and a Hong Kong art gallery, which introduced local modern arts in a comprehensive and well-organised manner, should be established in WKCD. The former would focus on how the foreign contemporary art were introduced into the local community, while the latter

would focus on promoting local arts, such as ink art, design or art of image.

31. A New Media Art Museum should be built in WKCD incorporating modern visual art, moving image and performing arts. This would not only provide opportunities for young people to participate and express themselves in arts activities, but also bring relevant benefits to tourism and education sectors.
32. The existing museums in Hong Kong held a lot of collections but there was limited exhibition space. A museum of ink should, therefore, be established in WKCD for displaying existing ink painting and calligraphy collections. A museum of photography should also be considered under the WKCD project for displaying precious works of photography in Hong Kong.
33. Regarding the proposal to have separate museums for modern art and ink art, since these two forms of art were so closely related that it was not easy for classification. However, setting up a museum of ink merited serious consideration because the conditions of Hong Kong had been quite favourable for its establishment.
34. Art galleries with various themes should be established to promote the art works of Hong Kong artists and to allow these art works to be traded freely so as to provide the means for the artists to achieve self-support. Furthermore, at present only one “art biennial exhibition” was held in Hong Kong, which was insufficient. In addition, the WKCD development should not be aimed solely at promoting tourism, and the Government should set enhancing Hong Kong’s culture as the ultimate goal. Lastly, the proceeds generated from the property project in WKCD could be used for the construction of an independent academy of arts.



35. Clear classification was essential in the heritage and streaming of arts and therefore emerging artists would require more room for displaying their exhibits. Finally, in view of the increasing development of modern arts scene in the Mainland, Hong Kong had to double its efforts in the development of arts, and therefore arts education should be particularly strengthened.
36. Regarding the contents of the museums, if “ink art” were taken out of “Modern Art”, the latter’s collection might be incomplete somehow.
37. An Art Centre incorporating popular art and various themes should be established to demonstrate the unique local popular culture in Hong Kong.
38. Galleries specifically designed for Hong Kong artists should be built in WKCD.
39. Design was a very unique form of arts and was different from visual art. Thus, the functions of the Museum of Design should not be limited to collecting and displaying exhibits. It should also demonstrate the process of social change. This would be conducive to the development of our academic and industrial sectors.
40. The construction of the original Museum of “Design” proposed in IFP was supported so that the future young people of Hong Kong would have more opportunities.
41. An interactive museum of technology and science should be built in WKCD to support life-wide learning and promote children’s participation.
42. An interactive Toy Museum should be set up in WKCD so that parents and their children could have access to culture together.

43. Museums of interesting themes and local characteristics should be built in WKCD in order to attract the public. Museums should function as a promoter of arts for all and the interest of children should be taken care of. “Ink art” might not be able to arouse the interest of young people. Besides, galleries of famous local artists, such as Anita Mui, Leslie Cheung and Roman Tam, should be built.
44. A museum of miniatures should be set up in WKCD. Miniatures with their details and aesthetic perception were a fine display of handicraft and art. Making miniatures of the special events and features of the society could help recapture scenes of the good old days.
45. Consideration should be given to build a Hong Kong branch museum of the Palace Museum in WKCD so that the collections of the Palace Museum could be borrowed for exhibition in Hong Kong, with a view to further showcasing the unique characteristic of Hong Kong as a converging place of Chinese and Western cultures. With the establishment of the branch museum, the public could have access to appreciate the heritage treasures. This would in turn enhance the cultural profile of Hong Kong in the world and bring in more tourists.
46. A “Greater China” museum and an international art exhibition gallery should be built in WKCD.
47. A Museum of Transport could be considered.
48. The choice of themes of the museums in WKCD should not be affected by any conflicts of interest among different sectors.

## **Relationship with Existing Public Museums**

49. There was a mismatch in the existing museums in terms of locality. The location of some museums, like the Hong Kong Film Archive which was located at Quarry Bay and the Hong Kong Museum of Coastal Defence at Shau Kei Wan, was the reason for their failure to attract more visitors. All the existing museums should be relocated to WKCD as far as possible. With WKCD as the focal point of museums, it would be convenient for visitors to visit the various museums at one go. Lastly, regarding the new museums to be built, if there was no means to enhance the attractiveness of the museums with their architectural features, emphasis should be put on the substance of the museums.
  
50. The existing museums were ineffective in attracting visitors. Quite a number of people just regarded the museums as leisure venues. It was easier for thematic museums to attract the public. Different study classes should be organised by the future museums in WKCD to enhance the community life of the public.
  
51. The relationship between the new museums to be built in WKCD and the existing museums should be explored.

## **Financial Matters**

52. HAB could make best use of relevant opinions collected during previous WKCD consultative forums. Moreover, the financial matters would play a pivotal role in deciding the museum themes. The Financial Matters Advisory Group should, therefore, participate in the WKCD discussions as early as possible.

53. If the collections of the museums would be of world-class standard, Hong Kong should first consider whether it had the financial resources to acquire world-class collections, and what world-class exhibits Hong Kong itself had for our museums.
54. The museums would encounter operational difficulties and the Government should seek different resources, such as making use of the revenues from the tourism industry to support the financial needs of the museums so as to maintain the long-term development of the museums.

### **Architecture of WKCD Museums**

55. The best architectural design for the museum should be selected through a competition.
56. It was certainly a tremendous challenge for MAG to facilitate the development of museums in WKCD. However, the museums would become a precious jewel of the District as long as the most representative and unique design was adopted. Specific museum themes were essential to highlight the architectural features of the museums. An international competition could be held for selecting the best architectural design. Finally, the Government should not merely consider the fiscal factor in deciding the museum themes.

### **Other Suggestions**

57. The idea of having a museum cluster comprising, inter alia, a Museum of Modern Art and a Museum of History in WKCD was raised. A Hong Kong branch of the Beijing Palace Museum in WKCD was also proposed. Besides, the themes

of existing museums should be reconsidered for transfer to future museums in WKCD.

58. WKCD could provide more room for the public to express their personal feeling.
59. The number of galleries in WKCD should not be too many so that some land could be released for property development.
60. The proceeds from which could be used to support the arts and cultural development.
61. It was difficult for the emerging local artists to find suitable venues for holding exhibitions. Special venues should be reserved for the emerging artists in WKCD. Moreover, with the advanced technology in today's society, the internet had a profound impact on our lives. Therefore, a website for WKCD should be set up to introduce the works of local artists to the world.
62. Hong Kong should adopt an open approach for performing arts and support more activities of street performance.
63. A "Chinese Book City" could be built in the WKCD to cluster books published in Chinese over the world together and to exhibit a selection of books and related relics from Hong Kong, Macau, Taiwan and the Mainland China, with a view to demonstrating the essence of the Greater China culture.
64. Young generation should be taken as the main target audience group in future when planning the WKCD facilities.
65. More relevant educational activities, such as guided tours in museums and educational programmes jointly organised with primary / secondary schools and universities be conducted in WKCD, with a view to effectively enhancing the

cultural attainment of members of the public. Interfacing activities might be organised among the museums of visual art, moving image and design in WKCD to achieve a better crossover effect.

66. Art Exhibition Centre should not be used to replace the museums.

**Consultative Committee on the  
Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District**

**Museums Advisory Group**

**Summary of Discussion of the Presentation Hearings**

**The Ink Society**

Date : 6 June 2006  
Time : 2:30 p.m. – 3:30 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau,  
25/F., Wanchai Tower, Hong Kong  
Attendees : see Appendix I

1. Ink art had a unique identity in the Chinese culture.
2. Although there were several museums that presented ink art of famous ink artists in the Mainland e.g. 關山月博物館, there was no fix exhibits over those museums. The Ink Museum in WKCD would be the first of such museum in the world to present world-class collections of ink art. Moreover, both modern and contemporary Chinese Art could be displayed in the Museum.
3. Ink art was performing a bridging role between traditional and contemporary art in China.
4. Ink art would still have great evolvments in future no matter in its theory, system and style. An independent Ink Museum in WKCD would enhance its development.

5. An independent Ink Museum rather than an ink art department in an integrated Arts Centre would have more meaningful and organic dialogues with other proposed museum.
6. It was estimated that 5 000 to 10 000 world-class collections would be secured through donation or long-term loan to the ink art museum in WKCD, which would be governed by an independent board.

**Hong Kong International Film Festival, Hong Kong Federation of Design Associations, Para/Site Art Space and Hong Kong International Association of Art Critics**

Date : 13 June 2006  
Time : 2:30 p.m. – 5:30 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau  
25/F., Wanchai Tower, Hong Kong  
Attendees : see Appendix II

Moving Image

1. A Museum of Moving Image (“MOMI”) could enhance the public’s interest in moving image, including digital and media art, which might be the focus of attention in the next ten years.
2. A MOMI could also educate general public about the knowledge of non-film works outside a cinema.
3. Sizable screen, collections and classical library were essential



elements for a MOMI in WKCD.

4. Hong Kong film should be regarded as one of the representatives of Hong Kong culture. A MOMI in WKCD could benefit not only the local film industry, but also providing a pleasant experience about film art to general public, including local citizen and overseas tourist.
5. Students could also learn and absorb technology for film making at MOMI. Moreover, MOMI would provide more space and opportunity to emerging artists.
6. Besides preserving all kinds of materials of moving image and film art, MOMI could open up vision of both arts practitioner and audience through presentation of novel ideas and collections.
7. The scope of MOMI should not only HK, but also South East so as to widen visitors' exposure.
8. A MOMI could be a "museum" or an "institution". It could also be built either in WKCD or other area in Hong Kong.
9. It was expected that MOMI would be funded by the Government during the start-up period with an aim to break-even in the medium term and small profit making in the longer term.

### Design

1. A Design Museum in WKCD should show how design affected the life of people.
2. It was not easy to separate the relationship between design and other art forms.

3. The Design Museum in WKCD should focus on Asian design.
4. The scope of collections in Design Museum should be mainly related to living life.
5. As design was a forward-looking concept, it might be better to call it “Design Centre / Institute / Institution” instead of “Design Museum”.
6. As most design museum was started as a teaching institution, it was suggested that the design “Centre” should cover (a) a traditional museum to show design artworks; (b) a research centre to enhance the research capability of emerging designs and strengthen the development of creative industries; and (c) an international design forum to enhance experience sharing among different places and widen local designers’ exposure.
7. As the Heritage Museum had substantial collection on design artwork, consideration should be given to the interface with the future design “Centre” in WKCD.

#### Modern / Contemporary Art

1. No thematic museum should be built in WKCD before a comprehensive cultural policy was established.
2. An independent Contemporary Art Space with educational, curatorial and exhibition role should be set up in WKCD.
3. As ink art had an important position in the development of contemporary art, it might worth an Ink Museum in WKCD.

4. If the scope of an art museum was too narrow, it might not have sufficient audience.
5. Exhibitions / programmes were more important than collections.

### **Individual Artists**

Date : 21 June 2006  
Time : 7:30 p.m. – 9:30 p.m.  
Venue : Humphrey Room, Level 7, Conrad Hong Kong,  
Pacific Place, 88 Queensway, Hong Kong  
Attendees : see Appendix III

1. Exhibition space for contemporary art in WKCD was essential. The space should be loosely linked with core cultural institutions and managed in an unconventional governance mode outside the framework of government.
2. WKCD should benefit local art artists through reinforcing Hong Kong's art value and improving existing inadequacies. The WKCD should acquire and / or provide exhibition space for local artists like experimental art which could reflect contemporary art trend and philosophy of artists. Countries like Japan and Korea were keen in helping local art development. For instance, department stores in Japan commonly provided exhibition space for local contemporary art which might not be up to museum standard. Moreover, local contemporary art were affordable at this moment.
3. Acquisition of art works and flexible exhibition space could complement each other.

4. Although “contemporary” was commonly defined as “post WWII”, the definition could be revised since it had been adopted for a long time and that Hong Kong art only had a history of about three decades.
5. The government-operated museums could not implement their acquisition policy fully as curatorial staff was too occupied with scheduled exhibitions. The interface between new museum(s) in WKCD and existing museums would be important.
6. Museum and exhibition facilities should be put together with entertainment and shopping facilities in order to attract more people traffic.
7. It might not be desirable to use hard data which mainly reflected on the popularity of museums to tourists rather than the real quality of museums. The quality of a museum and attraction to tourists should not be mutually exclusive.
8. Education was very important in promoting the public’s understanding and appreciation of arts. Art education in Hong Kong was a bit behind the Mainland and suggested to do more, like holding classes for students in WKCD with curriculum specially designed by curators such as the website on Hong Kong art (compiled by in-house curators to promote local art) launched by the Hong Kong Museum of Art.

### List of Attendees

#### Presenters

Mrs Alice KING, The Ink Society Ltd

Mr David PONG, The Ink Society Ltd

#### Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE

Mr Oscar HO

Ms Claire HSU

Mr Andrew LAM

Mr Freeman LAU

Prof David LUNG, SBS, JP

Mr Wucius WONG

Mr YIM Shui yuen

#### Government Officials

##### Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Mr Danny LAU, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2

Mrs Candy YEUNG, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Secretary)

##### Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr K.C. HO, Chief Curator (Heritage and Museum Services)

##### Architectural Services Department

Mr Richard CUTHBERTSON, Chief Project Manager 101

**List of Attendees**

Presenters (for item (i))

Mr Peter TSI, Hong Kong International Film Festival

Mr Jacob WONG, Curator of Hong Kong International Festival  
Society

Presenters (for item (ii))

Prof John HESKETT, Hong Kong Federation of Design  
Associations (“HKFDA”)

Mr Eddy YU, HKFDA

Mr Barrie HO, HKFDA

Mr Richard LI, HKFDA

Ms Priscilla LAI, HKFDA

Ms Nettie NG, HKFDA

Presenters (for item (iii))

Ms YEUNG-yang, Para/Site Art Space

Mr HO Wai-chi, Para/Site Art Space

Mr John BATTEN, International Association of Art Critics  
 (“IAAC”)

Dr Eric WEAR, IAAC

Ms Irene NGAN, IAAC

Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Dr David CLARKE

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Mr Oscar HO

Mr Andrew LAM  
Mr Freeman LAU  
Mr Tim LI  
Ms LO Kai-yin  
Mr Vincent LO, JP  
Prof David LUNG, SBS, JP  
Ms Nansun SHI  
Dr Philip WU, BBS, JP  
Dr Peter WONG, BBS, JP  
Mr Rocco YIM  
Mr YIM Shui yuen

Government Officials

Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)  
Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1  
Mr Danny LAU, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2  
Mr Peter KWOK, Principal Assistant Secretary (Culture)2  
Mrs Candy YEUNG, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Secretary)

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr CHUNG Ling-hoi, JP, Deputy Director (Culture)  
Mr K.C. HO, Chief Curator (Heritage & Museum Services)

Architectural Services Department

Mr Richard CUTHBERTSON, Chief Project Manager 101

**List of Attendees**

Guests

Prof CHAN Yuk-keng

Ms CHOI Yan-chi

Dr HO Siu-kee

Mr KAN Tai-keung

Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Dr David CLARKE

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Government Officials

Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Mr Peter KWOK, Principal Assistant Secretary (Culture) 2

Miss Susanna SIU, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Designate)  
(Secretary)

Mrs Candy YEUNG, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr TANG Hoi-chiu, Chief Curator (Art)



**Summary of Written Submissions and  
Views Submitted via Public Affairs Forum**

Summary of Written Submissions

43 written submissions were received. Among them, 28 were related to museum facilities. The major points of these written submissions are summarized below.

- (a) An Asian Art Centre covering both modern and contemporary art should be built in West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”) to maximize flexibility;
- (b) Local art should be supported. Consideration should be given to set up an independent academy of art in WKCD;
- (c) An ink art museum should be built in WKCD. It would not only help promote Chinese art including calligraphy, but also counter balance the current situation of too much focus on the development of western art;
- (d) Design, moving image, media art, popular culture and Cantonese opera could be integrated into a “Centre”. It would help the development of creative industries;
- (e) There were suggestions on other museum themes in WKCD such as maritime transport, pirates on the South China Sea, city planning and transportation;
- (f) As each museum had its own identity, an integrated “Centre” covering four preferred museum themes might not be able to attract donation and visitors;

- (g) Besides one or two giant museum(s), a cluster of small and medium-sized museums should be set up in WKCD to enhance variety;
- (h) Promotion of arts in grass roots through cooperation with district art bodies should be strengthened;
- (i) Cooperation with the Mainland authorities in the art and culture field should be enhanced;
- (j) Relevant laws would be necessary to ensure better governance on museums in WKCD; and
- (k) There was a suggestion to establish a Collection Development Authority (收藏發展局) to promote the collection culture in Hong Kong.

#### Views Submitted via Public Affairs Forum

Forum members posted a total of 68 messages. Among them, 30 messages are related to museum facilities. Their comments were summarized below.

Proposed museums facilities in the WKCD:

1. Members generally preferred one big, metropolitan-type museum with different themes to several separate museums with clear identity. Many members considered that a large museum would be more flexible in adjusting the sizes and types of exhibitions based on factors like the availability of collections, popularity, art trends, etc. A member considered that museums with specific themes would hinder creativity.

2. A few members, however, preferred to have several separate museums with clear identity to take advantage of individual characteristics and lower set up and maintenance costs.
3. A few members opined that an arts centre / exhibition hall would be more appropriate than a museum. One member, however, added that there should be a balance between static museums and dynamic art centres.
4. A member regarded the concept of museum as traditional. He proposed a flexible and versatile venue, called the “Hong Kong Centre”, which could change, modify, adapt, evolve, suit and fit into the ever changing social structure, culture, taste and trend of Hong Kong. The member suggested that the Hong Kong Centre could make use of virtual reality effects to re-create mummies from the pyramid, Mona Lisa of Da Vinci or tomb warriors from the Qin dynasty for viewing by our next generation.
5. Most members believed that the museums should aim to attract visitors from Hong Kong and tourists from all over the world.
6. Some members supported the four “preferred museum themes” as proposed in the Invitations for Proposals for the WKCD development. One member, however, hoped to focus on one theme instead of having four scattered themes.
7. A member opined that the Museum of Moving Image would help support Hong Kong’s film industry. However, another member considered it unnecessary as we had already had a Hong Kong Film Archive.
8. Some members raised doubt about the attractiveness of the four proposed museums, especially the Museum of Modern Arts and the Museum of Ink. They believed that it was not worth the effort to build the museums due to lack of

uniqueness and limited exhibits. Instead, they suggested other museum themes, such as the museums of Chinese, dinosaur and childhood, for consideration.

9. Some members preferred to feature themes unique to Hong Kong, for examples, the history of Hong Kong, the merge of Oriental and Western culture, and Cantonese opera.
10. A member suggested establishing a Hong Kong Popular Music Museum in WKCD to attract tourists and to foster creativity in the local entertainment business. Citing the Motown Museum in Detroit as an example; the member further proposed a mini concert hall to complement the music museum.
11. A few members pointed out that the tradition of excellence, the popularity of themes, the uniqueness, and the affluence and quality of exhibits were major considerations in deciding museum themes.
12. A few members were concerned that Hong Kong did not have enough arts talents and artworks in view of its short history in arts and culture.
13. A few members suggested replacing some of the existing museums with the proposed ones in WKCD or simply re-locating existing museums to WKCD for centralized management.
14. A member mentioned that there was no special need to establish new museums in WKCD as there were already a lot of museums in Hong Kong. The member considered it more important to strengthen the existing museums, especially those located in Tsimshatsui East.
15. Some members opined that the architecture of the museums should be innovative which could be another landmark of Hong Kong. A member remarked that the museum should be

the focal point of civic pride.

16. Observing that the number of visits to museums was low, a member considered that it was not the right time to discuss this proposal.
17. A member proposed to extend the opening hours of the museums to increase people-flow.
18. Some members suggested strengthening the education of arts and culture at school along side the development of the WKCD. A member warned that unless the core arts and cultural facilities in WKCD could be well utilized, we would end up building a big white elephant. In order to promote the interest in performing arts, he supported further emphasizing arts in the education system.
19. A member proposed the Government to increase financial support to local performing arts groups. Another member urged the Government to sponsor the WKCD project and invest in the long run.
20. A few members proposed to form a separate body with broad representation to monitor and manage the WKCD. Another member suggested employing companies with relevant overseas experience to operate and manage the WKCD.
21. A member reminded that shopping and dining places should not be omitted when planning the WKCD.
22. A member had reservation on the way this topic was discussed in the Forum. He believed that insufficient information was given regarding the purpose, functional utility, capital and recurrent costs of the proposed facilities and alternative usage of the WKCD site. Another member, on the contrary, praised that this consultation was a good civic exercise to the general public.

23. A member believed that deeper understanding of the needs of the public was required before coming to a decision in the WKCD project. Yet there were a few others who believed that the project should be launched as soon as possible.

**List of Themes Received Since 2004**

**(I) Visual Culture**

(a) Arts

Museum of Contemporary Asian Art  
Hong Kong Museum of Contemporary Art  
Museum of Modern Art or Museum of Contemporary Art  
Museum on Hong Kong Art (香港藝術館/香港美術館)  
Museum of Hong Kong Artists  
Ink Museum  
Museum of Chinese Calligraphy and Paintings  
Museum of Community Arts  
Museum of Digital Art  
Museum of Media  
New Media Art  
Museum of the Future  
Museum of Photography  
Museum of Architecture

(b) Design

Design Museum/Design Complex  
Museum of Creative Industries  
Museum of Creativity  
Museum of Textiles and Fashion  
Museum of Living  
Museum of Plastic Products  
Museum of Clocks and Watches  
Museum of Postage and Philatelic

(c) Film

Museum of Moving Image

- (d) Popular Culture
  - Pop Culture Museum
  - Museum of Hong Kong Celebrities
  - Museum of Canton-pop
  - Museum of Games
  - Museum of Popular Art
  - Toys Museum
  - Museum of Folk Prints
  - Museum of Handicraft
  - Miniature Museum
  - Museum of Puppetry Art
  
- (e) Performing Arts
  - Museum of Performing Arts
  - Museum of Resource Centre of Music History
  
- (f) Others
  - Museum of Chinese Culture Development
  - Museum of Culture
  - Museum of Asian Civilisations
  - Museum of Arts Education

**(II) Non Visual Culture**

- Museum of Technology
- Museum of Education Development
- City Planning and Transport Museum
- Museum of Hong Kong Urban Planning
- Transport Museum (運輸博物館)
- Maritime Museum
- Museum of Traditional Fisheries
- Museum of Hong Kong Writers and Inventors
- Hong Kong Children's Museum (香港兒童博物館)
- Museum of Gourmet
- Museum of Local Food Culture (香港飲食文化博物館)
- Museum of Hong Kong Archeology



Museum of Cultural Revolution  
Museum of Chinese Medicine and Herbs  
Museum of Literature  
Museum of Chinese Relics  
Branch Museum of the Beijing Palace Museum (故宮博物館)  
Museum of Childhood Memories (小時候博物館)  
Museum of Invention and innovation  
Hong Kong Museum Complex (香港綜合博物館大樓)  
Museum of Sports (運動博物館)  
Museum of Ammunition and Military Affairs  
Museum of Western Opera  
Science Museum  
Museum of Natural History  
Museum of Environmental Protection  
Cultural Green Park (with a Hong Kong Museum , a Hong  
Kong Museum of Science & Technology, and a Hong  
Kong Museum of Arts)

**Notes of the Briefings by Overseas Experts  
(Subject to verification and confirmation on factual accuracy)**

*Briefings by Overseas Experts*

1 <sup>st</sup> briefing	9 June 2006	Dr Michael Knight, Deputy Director for Strategic Programmes and Partnerships and Senior Curator of Chinese Art, Asian Art Museum in San Francisco
2 <sup>nd</sup> briefing	10 July 2006	Mr Tony Sweeney, Director / Chief Executive Officer of Australian Museum of Moving Image, Melbourne
3 <sup>rd</sup> briefing	10 July 2006	Ms Kara Lennon, Advisor to the President and Mr Joël Girard, Advisor to the President of External Affairs of the Centre Pompidou
4 <sup>th</sup> briefing	11 July 2006	Ms Kate Brennan, Chief Executive Officer of Federation Square Pty. Ltd.
5 <sup>th</sup> briefing	12 July 2006	Ms Yuko Hasegawa (長谷川祐子), Chief Curator of Museum of Contemporary Art Tokyo (東京都現代美術館)

**Briefing by Dr Michael Knight, Deputy Director for Strategic Program and Partnerships and Senior Curator of Chinese Art, Asian Art Museum, San Francisco**

Date : 9 June 2006  
Time : 4:00 p.m. – 5:30 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau,  
25/F., Wanchai Tower, Hong Kong  
Attendees : see Appendix

1. The Asian Art Museum opened in 1966 in Golden Gate Park and operated until 1999.
2. After residing in Golden Gate Park for 35 years, the museum raised \$178 million during a five-year capital campaign to renovate a 185 000 square foot facility, formerly the San Francisco Public Library, in the Civic Center Historic District (where there were various performing arts facilities including War Memorial Opera House, Home of the San Francisco Ballet and the San Francisco Opera, Louise M Davies Symphony Hall, Home of the San Francisco Symphony) across from City Park.
3. According to survey and research, a high percentage of tourists visited the museums in San Francisco especially during summer holidays.
4. Since the former San Francisco Public Library was destructed by earthquake, Architect Gae Aulenti reconstructed the new Asian Art Museum through construction and restoration. The new Asian Art Museum (“AAM”) opened on 20 March 2003.
5. There were a number of galleries inside AAM. Visitors could walk through from one gallery to another which was a journey in Asia from West to East. The biggest part of the

collection was from China. There were 11 000 Chinese objects on display. Nevertheless, visitors from different countries might complain that there were not enough collections of their particular country. It was always a challenge for the museum on how to find a balance of the collections.

6. According to surveys, most of the visitors came to AAM for special exhibitions rather than permanent collection. Therefore, AAM put a lot of resources in organising special exhibitions.
7. The museum conducted a lot of education programmes e.g. student and teacher tours and school group visits.
8. The budget for AAM in the fiscal year 2005-06 was US\$16 million. Of which, 34% came from City and County of San Francisco, 64% were from private contribution and earned income. The collections of the museum and the building belonged to the City of San Francisco. Only 10% of the museum's revenue came from the admission fees. Nevertheless, attendance was very important, as high attendance would attract sponsorship from large corporations.
9. The museum worked closely with a number of large foundations, which supported AAM financially and in organising exhibitions and educational programmes.
10. AAM put effort in developing corporate partners. These large corporate partners were mainly concerned about what kind of exposure they could get by supporting the museum programmes.
11. A Commission appointed by the Mayor of San Francisco looked after the operation of the museum in terms of the collection and the maintenance of the building.

12. There were a number of very interesting museums in Hong Kong which formed a good representation. There might be a need to conduct some studies, market surveys and strategic planning to facilitate a good start for working out balancing and complementing themes for the new museums in WKCD.
13. AAM's experience showed that the organization of exhibitions for different audiences at the same time was a mistake. The museum should focus its energy on one topic and should not divide its audiences within a short period of time.
14. There was about 200 staff in AAM covering development, registration, facility operation and security.
15. The museum had a constant programme on contemporary art but not a collection. However, there was no evidence to demonstrate that more contemporary art would attract more young audience.
16. The total exhibition space of the museum was about 50 000 square feet. Of this total, about 45 000 square feet was for permanent collection and 10 000 square feet for special exhibitions. Therefore, the museum required "big black box" for storage of collection. It was suggested that for planning purpose, the size of the "big black box" should be about 12 000 square feet. The audience usually spent about 1.5 hour in a museum according to market research. It might be a problem if the museum was too big in size. The size of Shanghai Museum was small but it had very good attendance. According to survey, people tended go to a museum per trip per day. Therefore, if there were several big exhibitions at different museums at the same period of time, the museums would compete with each other for visitors.
17. The permanent collection of the museum served special mission for the audience. It would attract tourists to come

to see it as they knew about the collection. It also helped advancing the San Francisco public along the route of understanding and being aware of what Asian art was about.

18. It was considered that having separate museums of different themes in San Francisco would not be successful but it might be feasible in Hong Kong.
19. Apart from private donations, the museum curator would work with a small group of collectors to borrow their collections on a regular basis. They worked with the collecting community and keep them involved in the museum.

**List of Attendees**

Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Ms Claire HSU

Ms LO Kai yin

Mr Wucius WONG

Mr YEUNG Chun-tong

Mr Rocco YIM

Government Officials

Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Danny LAU, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2

Mr Vincent KWAN, Chief Treasury Accountant (WKCD)

Mrs Candy YEUNG, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Secretary)

## **Briefing by Ms Kara Lennon and Mr Joël Girard, Advisors to the President of Centre Pompidou**

Date : 10 July 2006  
Time : 4:10 p.m. – 5:50 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau,  
25/F., Wanchai Tower, Hong Kong  
Attendees : see Appendix

### Background

1. The Centre Pompidou (“Centre”) opened in 1977. There had been about 175 million visitors since it opened, which made the Centre a popular meeting place of different arts.
2. The project was initiated at the late 60s by former French President George Pompidou. The idea was to unite various elements including art, museum, industrial design and public library in a cultural centre under one-roof building. Therefore, it was named as a “Centre” rather than a “Museum”.

### Design and Operation of the Centre

3. The building was designed in two parts, i.e. a 3-level infrastructure housing the technical facilities and service areas; and a vast 7-level glass and steel superstructure (including a terrace and mezzanine floor) housing most of the Centre's activities. The designers aimed to maximize spatial movement and people flow to foster an interdisciplinary approach instead of having many traditional and old fashion museums. Fine arts was somehow treated as a limited arts form because of its pure visually functions.



4. An architectural competition was launched in 1970. Over 680 proposals received. The competition was won by two architects: the Italian Renzo Piano and British designer Richard Rogers who proposed a constraint-free architecture in the spirit of the 60's. Regarding the design of the Centre, the supporting structure, movement and flow systems, such as the escalators, were relegated to the outside of the building, thereby freeing up interior space for the museum and activity areas. The Centre had an area of 100 000 m<sup>2</sup> including 60 000 m<sup>2</sup> public space.
5. The Centre composed of (a) the National Museum of Modern Art (MNAM) which commenced the collection items from mid-20<sup>th</sup> century before the set up of the Centre; (b) the Public Reference Library (BPI) which was established since 1970; (c) the Music and Acoustic Research Institute (IRCAM) which was one of the main core body of the Centre; (d) the Children's Gallery which focused not only on workshop for children, but also education & outreach programmes; (e) the Espace which was a contemporary creation centre of about 315 m<sup>2</sup> for young and creative artist to present their works; (f) the Kandinsky Library, a smaller library than BPI which mainly stored reference materials for professionals; and (g) the Cinema and Performance Halls which were dedicated for both film and performance arts.
6. In order to display more collections and conduct more outreach programmes, an additional building – the Centre Pompidou Metz, would be opened in 2008, mainly contemporary art collections.
7. The Centre was a public institution under the Ministries of Culture and of Finance. A Board of Directors headed by the chairman (i.e. President of the Centre) operated the Centre. The managing director, who acted under the authority of the chairman, was responsible for the daily operation of the Centre. Other Board members included 6 representatives of

the State, 4 members of Parliament and the Senate, the Mayor of Paris, 3 recognized experts in the arts field and 3 representatives of the Centre's staff.

8. The Centre was created at 1970s as a statutory body with financial autonomy. The staff of the Centre was not civil servant but as employees of this body. This arrangement allowed international staff to work for the Centre without working for other departments of French government.
9. Besides, the Centre was not within the coverage of the Museum National Reunion (Reunion), which was a financial redistribution machinery between the government and the museum. The income of each museum would need to be put into this Reunion for re-distribution among others museums particularly the small-sized museums.
10. The Centre opened 6 days a week (closed on Tuesday) and 1 May 2006 with opening hours from 11:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. (except late opening on Thursdays and closed at 1 p.m.)
11. The President of the Centre was nominated by the French minister under a political nomination. It was elected for every five years with three years renewable terms. For the Board of Directors, its functions and number of Board members were fixed by law.

### Operation of the MNAM

12. MNAM had a collection of 60 000 works produced by 5 000 artists from 100 nationalities, which was the largest collection in Europe and the second largest modern art and contemporary art collections in the world after the Museum of Modern Art in New York. There were both modern & contemporary art collection in MNAM as it could reflect artworks in different time periods in a natural flow, which

were influenced by the development of creative industries, such as new media, internet, video and technology.

13. MNAM adopted an active loan policy. In 2005, 3 327 artworks items were on loan to other museums (1 800 items to international museums). All collections were owned by the Government and the Centre had no right to sell it out.
14. The Centre involved a large spectrum of local cultural institutions and other national museums. The collaboration among various similar institutions and museums could enrich the content of the Centre. The Centre had about 1 000 staff with 60 curators. All the acquisition work were decided and approved by the Minister of Culture as per advice by the Acquisition Committee. The membership composed art historians, collectors, gallerists and other experts who were appointed by the Minister of Culture.

#### Financial Information

15. The Centre had an annual budget of about Euro 100 million – 75% of its income (about Euro 75 million) was Government subsidy while 25% (about Euro 25 million) was self-earned income including admission fees, souvenirs, concessions, royalties, traveling exhibition fees. About 70% of its expenditure was the operating cost while the rest of 30% were programming costs and other expenses.
16. The Centre was required to work with other international museums (e.g. to acquire artwork jointly with other museums) to compensate the small acquisitions budget (about Euro 7 million per year). Moreover, the Centre intended to acquire more “upcoming” artworks which was more affordable. In addition, the Centre lobbied very hard for donation of artefacts.

17. About 600 members of Friends of the Centre Pompidou contributed up to Euro 8 000 a year aiming at expanding the collection for the Centre.

### Visitation

18. The Centre had about 5.3 millions visitors per year. Among them, 3 millions were visitors of permanent collections, temporary exhibitions and traveling exhibitions.
19. The visitors of the Centre were mainly young people. 65% of the 5.3 millions visitors were less than 35 years old, 41% were school or university students. Among the 45 149 memberships card holders of the Centre, 45% of them were under 26 years old.
20. 30% of the 5.3 million visitors were international visitors, 40% from France and 30% from Paris.
21. Pompidou organised a lot of school programmes and activities to attract visitors. The children gallery was also an attractive place for children and family visitors.
22. The government did not set any pre-set visitation target for the Centre.

### Programming

23. The Centre had over 70 programmes / exhibitions per year. All programmes were discussed at the Programming Committee of the Centre composing the President of the Centre, the Museum Director, the Library Director and the Music Research Institute Director. They would discuss the programmes with the curators in specialized field from

different departments. Despite its public institution status, the Centre enjoyed independence in programming. The variance of programming was really the essence of the Centre so as to make the Centre unique and attracted repeated visitors.

### Relationship with the Creative Industry

24. The Centre believed that advertising, design, architecture, sound etc. were different parts of the creative industry, which were inter-related with each other. Students from different parts of the creative industry such as architecture of design school, dance and performance arts used to be invited by the Centre to show and present their works there.

### Reason for Using the Integrated Concept of the Centre in other Places

25. It was sure that the integrated concept was not a “bad” model. Indeed, the Centre was successful to repeat. It was an ambitious model and would be difficult to find a right balance from the very beginning between different institutions that were physically presence in the Centre.

### Ideas for the West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”) Project

26. The Centre had proposed this integrated concept for the WKCD Project in 2004.
27. Hoped the future collections in WKCD would cover not just modern art but also other areas such as moving image and design, which are broader concepts.

### List of Attendees

#### Presenters

Ms Kara Lennon, Centre Pompidou

Mr Joël Girard, Centre Pompidou

#### Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Dr David CLARKE

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Ms Claire HSU

Mr Freeman LAU, BBS

Mr Andrew LAM

Mr Tim LI

Prof David LUNG, SBS, JP

Mr Vincent LO, BBS, JP

Ms Nansun SHI

Ms Ada WONG, JP

#### Committee on Museums

Mr Tony CHAN

Mr Richard KAN

Dr KWOK Viem

#### Government Officials

##### Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Mr Danny LAU, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2

Mr Peter KWOK, Principal Assistant Secretary (Culture) 2  
Miss Susanna SIU, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Designate)  
Mrs Candy YEUNG, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Secretary)

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr CHUNG Ling-hoi, JP, Deputy Director (Culture)  
Mr HO Kam-chuen, Chief Curator (Heritage & Museum Services)  
Mr TANG Hoi-chiu, Chief Curator (Art)  
Mr Albert LEE, Chief Manager (Film & Cultural Exchange)  
Ms Angela TONG, Head (Film Archive)  
Ms Evita YEUNG, Curator (Conservation) 3D Objects

***Absent with apology***

Museums Advisory Group

Mr Benny CHIA  
Mr Oscar HO  
Ms LO Kai yin  
Dr Peter WONG, BBS, JP  
Dr Philip WU, BBS, JP  
Mr Wucius WONG  
Mr YEUNG Chun-tong  
Mr Rocco YIM  
Mr YIM Shui-yuen

**Briefing by Mr Tony Sweeney, Director / CEO of Australia Museum of Moving Image, Melbourne**

Date : 10 July 2006  
Time : 2:35 p.m. – 4:10 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau,  
25/F., Wanchai Tower, Hong Kong  
Attendees : see Appendix

Background

1. The idea for the establishment of The Australian Centre for the Moving Image (“ACMI”) could be traced back to 1940s when the State Film Centre was established with reference to the model of Canada and the UK to promote both mainstream films and educational programmes, documentaries and archives about the history and culture of Australia.
2. In the late 80s, the State Film Centre was joined together with Film Victoria, which was an institution for investment of Filmmaking and renamed as Cinemedia in order to promote screen culture through screen exhibition, archiving and also film investment.
3. In early 1990s, there was a discussion on the need to establish a public film center, which paved the way for the split of Cinemedia into two entities: The Australian Centre for the Moving Image, and Film Victoria, with the latter focussing only on film investment. The reason for the split of two Cinemedia was mainly due to the different needs of film making community and film culture community.
4. ACMI was established under the Film Act in 2001. The government provided a capital funding of \$67 million (Australian Dollars). ACMI was operated under the



governance of an independent board of trustee. It worked closely with the relevant government departments and at arm's length with the Parliament. The government positioned ACMI as an important institution in Melbourne as a culturally interesting place and world-class tourism destination.

5. ACMI opened in 2002 in the Federation Square located in the city center of Melbourne. It was situated in the Federation Square which was a demolished old industrial building next to Victoria Arts Centre and Fenwick Street Central Station. The Square was now a major big public square for the arts and public celebration. The building, which was in modernistic style, had four levels. It also included a TV station and studios named SBS, cinemas, small museum, shops and restaurant. There was a pent floor with a gallery and function space with stairs going down to the exhibition gallery.
6. ACMI launched exhibitions on digital media art that had wide international acclaim. However, the public questioned the value of ACMI after one year of its operation as digital art only served minority interest.
7. From 2003 to 2004, ACMI suffered from a crisis. Due to high involvement but diverse interests from different sectors such as internet, digital media, video games, tradition film industry etc. in the beginning of the project, ACMI lacked a clear idea about its role and functions and ran into trouble as a result. The original management team was dismissed. With strong government and public support, a new management team was then formed to seek new development direction for ACMI.

### Operations in ACMI

8. The concept of ACMI was different from traditional film

museum. It was about film, television, games, new media and arts, which included both traditional and emerging art forms.

9. The mission of ACMI was to create a place for audience to experience the world of film, television and digital media and to make it beyond just a “traditional museum” by engaging not only filmmakers, film industry, digital mobile industry, film festivals but also the public for creative production.
10. These were the five elements ACMI targeted at different audiences of different generations (a) (not yet launched) permanent exhibitions; (b) special exhibition in gallery for digital media shows; (c) cinemas to screen moving images, (d) media production studios and (e) (not yet launched) a cultural resource centre. As ACMI was not allowed to compete with the commercial sector, screening of fresh release and contemporary films was only done occasionally.
11. The special exhibition gallery comprised a 1 200 m<sup>2</sup> area with a ceiling of 7 m which provided a flexible exhibition space. A lot of big shows such as the celebration of 50 years of Australian Federation were held.
12. Two cinemas (398 seats and 198 seats) and a preview theatre of 25 seats catered for broadcasters and the film industry for preview screenings. It was also a popular venue for festivals such as Melbourne International Film Festival and other cultural partnership programmes.
13. Public education programmes for animations were held at the media production studios inside ACMI in daytime and evening. ACMI also provided a platform for the community to show their works through their programmes.
14. The Games Lab in ACMI helped the development of mobile games. It received a lot of industry support because

distributors could look for independent new products through the exhibitions and events.

15. ACMI had 15 000 titles in DVD and VHS for lending by about 2 600 active members. However, as video format had been changing fast, ACMI was facing a problem of updating video format in their collections.

### Public Perception about ACMI

16. According to a recent independent survey, the Australian public regarded ACMI as a mixture of museum, film centre and art gallery. It was also observed that the audience bases were different between visitors of traditional art gallery and cinemas.

### Visitation

17. The number of visitors had been increasing since 2002. During the period from July 2005 to June 2006, there were 510 000 visitors (200 000 for special exhibition, 145 000 for cinemas, 25 000 for education programmes and 140 000 for general events). In general, 64% of the visitors were from Victoria and Melbourne, 25% from the rest of Australia and 11% international visitors. The number of website visitors was nearly doubled to about 3.2 million in 2005/06 as compared with 2004/05. The number of visitation to programmes and websites were the main performance indicators for ACMI. ACMI was expected to have 20% increase in the number of visitation since the number of visitors grew rapidly due to extensive media coverage for popular events of film, media and game in ACMI. A very dynamic programming strategy was adopted in a 3-year cycle.

### Financial Information

18. ACMI had a budget about \$20M (Australian dollars). As ACMI was regarded as one of the flagship cultural attraction of Melbourne, the government committed about 85% of its budget. Around 15% of ACMI's budget was for its rental cost to the Federation Square. The budget for acquisition was small in ACMI but it would develop a serious collection policy in the near future.

### Relationship with Other Museums / Institutions in Federation Square

19. There was not much collaboration with other museums / institutions in Federation Square but ACMI worked closely with the MTV, another Victorian institution operating by a trustee body. For examples, in 2004 for successful shows every 2 years, which included concerts screening, festivals, animation, shows, TV exhibition, giant TV dinner and open air activities. The notion of outdoor arena worked very well.

### Comparison with the UK Museums of Moving Image

20. There were two museums for moving images in the UK, namely Museum of Photo, Film and Television ("MPFT") located in the 200 miles north of London and the Museum of the Moving Images ("MOMI") in South bank of London as part of the London Film Institute. The former worked really well but the latter closed down in early to mid-1990s as it was badly located and lacked investment in updating its contents.
21. The reason for the success of MPFT despite its location was outside London was that it constantly changed its special exhibitions to sustain the audiences' interest. The annual

budget of MPFT was around £7 million, 60% of which was government-funded. Other self-earned sources revenue included I-Max cinema, shops and admission fees. Unlike ACMI, MPFT was not required to pay rent.

22. The challenge of MPFT would be how to keep itself growing. A possible way could be to expand its current scope into the contemporary and digital art area. Another possible way was to make use of internet era to enhance the relationship between the film industry and different digital media by providing a platform for them to exchange ideas.
23. ACMI would make reference to the MPFT model and might take it even further to bring diversity to digital art as well as to help people to look back into history.

#### Relationship between ACMI and Film Industry

24. The relationship between the two was very close since the era of Cinemedia. The industry helped ACMI and the film industry to develop the audience interest in cultural films, which would in turn help the film production. Through talks and classes hosted by filmmakers and producers for ACMI, the film industry could produce the films which appeal to the public.

#### Challenges for ACMI

25. The notion of Federation Square as a place accommodating a variety of art forms was a good idea indeed. However, the identity for ACMI was apparently subsumed under it.
26. The tastes of audiences on digital art were split. Although ACMI had a strong reputation in the professional field, it did

not have enough support from the public. ACMI would produce more programmes specifically for the public. It was expected that the audience for digital art would grow through word of mouth in future.

### Competition with Other Moving Image Museums

27. In the UK, MPFT was still a major attraction outside London for many years because of its reputation.
28. In Paris, the overall number of museums had been increasing despite the fact that there were many museums already. It was believed that museums could mutually benefit from each other through healthy competition. In fact, by visiting one museum, audiences would discover more museums nearby.
29. The City of Melbourne used to invest in blockbuster international exhibitions exclusively in Victoria so as to generate an impression that only Melbourne could provide these services.
30. When comparing with other museums of moving image and film centre around the world, ACMI was expected to take over the leading role of MPFT in the future. It was because those other museums were either badly located or lack comprehensive programmes catering for different audiences.

### List of Attendees

#### Presenter

Mr Tony SWEENEY, Director/CEO, Australian Centre for the Moving Image

#### Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Dr David CLARKE

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Ms Claire HSU

Mr Freeman LAU, BBS

Mr Andrew LAM

Mr Tim LI

Prof David LUNG, SBS, JP

Mr Vincent LO, BBS, JP

Ms Nansun SHI

Ms Ada WONG, JP

#### Committee on Museums

Mr Tony CHAN

Mr Richard KAN

Dr KWOK View

#### Government Officials

##### Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Mr Danny LAU, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2

Mr Peter KWOK, Principal Assistant Secretary (Culture) 2

Miss Susanna SIU, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Designate)

Mrs Candy Yeung, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Secretary)

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr CHUNG Ling-hoi, JP, Deputy Director (Culture)

Mr HO Kam-chuen, Chief Curator (Heritage & Museum Services)

Mr TANG Hoi-chiu, Chief Curator (Art)

Ms Evita YEUNG, Curator (Conservation)3D Objects

Mr Albert LEE, Chief Manager (Film & Cultural Exchange)

Ms Angela TONG, Head (Film Archive)

***Absent with apology***

Museums Advisory Group

Mr Benny CHIA

Mr Oscar HO

Ms LO Kai yin

Dr Peter WONG, BBS, JP

Dr Philip WU, BBS, JP

Mr Wucius WONG

Mr YEUNG Chun-tong

Mr Rocco YIM

Mr YIM Shui-yuen



**Briefing by Ms Kate Brennan, Chief Executive Officer of Federation Square Pty. Ltd.**

Date : 11 July 2006  
Time : 2:30 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau,  
25/F, Wanchai Tower, Wan Chai  
Attendants : see Appendix

Background of Federation Square

1. The Federation Square (“Fed. Sq.”) was a highly integrated multi-interest space. It was mooted when a desire for a public square in Melbourne was seriously contemplated. Its site, at the heart of Melbourne, was formerly a busy centre of water and rail transport. It was therefore a drastic re-configuration of the old space to make way for culture and civic uses. Its architectural design, although remarkable as reputed, was very arbitrary and controversial especially on its un-compatible design to the heritage nearby.
2. The Fed. Sq. project commanded great support from the government and community, which was reflected by the acceptance of the substantial increase of budget and delay of project, i.e. the budget rose from AUS \$128M to \$450M and the project was delayed by a couple of years.
3. Although the Fed. Sq. and the WKCD shared similarities in their framework, the current set up of the square was actually the outcome of a gradual evolution of different concepts of free expressions of cultural identity, rather than a rational pre-planning.

## Organization

4. The Fed. Sq. was a corporation company holding the title for the land which was affected at the will of Government and the city. The company was wholly owned by the state trustees which were represented by a minister of Government, who was currently the Treasurer. Technically, the single shares of the title were held by representatives of Government.
5. The Fed. Sq. had 26 staff members, four of whom were contractors. Although the company was small, it was flexible. The board of the Fed. Sq. had four members whom were appointed by the Minister. The Board met nine times a year to discuss routines, financial performance, corporate plan etc.

## Business Plan

6. The Fed. Sq. was currently developing its business plan with an aim to be seen as international contemporary world site and at the same time, a constant attraction to local community and a place belonged to the whole community.
7. Working towards a multi-cultural community, building up strong leadership and developing partnership for projects were important goals of the Fed. Sq. For instance, it encouraged individual artists to utilize the space for their creative works and the public to come to experience the arts.
8. The major characteristics of the Fed. Sq. and the reasons for the success of the square were:
  - Close collaboration amongst the institutions achieved;
  - Service excellence at every level pursued;
  - Environmental sustainability, creative sustainability and financial sustainability achieved;

9. One of the major challenges ahead currently was the city edge development site which was about 6 hectares in size, for development into a complementary site for Fed. Sq. with much focus on private uses.

### Financial Aspect

10. The Fed. Sq. was a small entity from a financial point of view, with a turn over of about AUS \$20M and a small cash surplus.
11. It received no recurrent funding from Government although it was required to manage and develop a half a billion dollars of public asset. The operation revenue had to, therefore, rely solely on commercial and cultural tenancy revenue, and sponsorship. As a result, achieving financial sustainability was one of their major concerns of Fed. Sq.
12. The financial model of Fed. Sq. was a mix of cultural and commercial activities. It had both upside and downside. To make the model successful, the Fed. Sq. had to ensure that the cultural and commercial institutions were operating successfully and the institutions to fully interacting with each other, and to communicating with the management.

### Operation

13. The operation problems of the Fed. Sq. included practicable problem arising from architecture and design, e.g. not enough commercial floor space (7 000 m<sup>2</sup> at present, 1 000 m<sup>2</sup> would be adequate); confusion to visitors created by the many lane ways around the square etc.

14. The Fed. Sq. was operated 24 hours a day in high standard. It organised 1 500 events annually, representing 4-5 activities a day.
15. There were 34 different tenancies on the site, 6 of which were non-profit and the rest were retails, food and beverages etc. managed by individual owners / managers.
16. Until January 2006, about 80% of the activities in the public space were organised by third party organizations. Now that there were 35 % of the activities run by the proprietor of Fed. Sq. which had adopted a pro-active approach in running the square recently. The CEO did not expect the proprietor to do more than 50% of the activities.
17. Political bodies were allowed to use the public space of the square for protest, rally etc. on condition that the activities were conducted legally and in a safe way.

#### Visitation and Statistics

18. The total visitation since the opening of the square four years ago was 3 million. Although it had a short history, the Fed. Sq. had already been regarded as a popular meeting place of the local community and had won 50 awards.
19. 30% of the people in Victoria hated the architecture of Fed. Sq., same percentage loved the architecture, and more than 80% liked to come to Fed. Sq. to enjoy the activities.

20. Composition of visitors:

- 50% were local Melbourne people (who would revisit the square);
- 20% from the State;
- 14% from other parts of the country; and
- About 17% from overseas.

No significant change of the composition since the opening of the Fed. Sq.

21. More than 80% of the population of the State visited the Fed. Sq. in the past 12 months. Most of the visitors came for live broadcast of World Cup soccer matches, not cultural facilities.

22. The Fed. Sq. was one of the top three attractions to foreign visitors to Victoria.

### List of Attendees

#### Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Mr Benny CHIA

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE

Mr Oscar HO

Ms Claire HSU

Mr Andrew LAM

Mr Freeman LAU, BBS

Mr Vincent LO, BBS, JP

Prof David LUNG, SBS, JP

Ms Nansun SHI

Ms Ada WONG, JP

Mr Rocco YIM

#### Government Officials

##### Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Mr Danny LAU, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2

Mr Peter KWOK, Principal Assistant Secretary (Culture) 2

Miss Susanna SIU, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Designate)  
(Secretary)

Mrs Candy YEUNG, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

##### Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr CHUNG Ling-hoi, JP, Deputy Director (Culture)

Ms Alice TSANG, Curator (Conservation) 2D Objects

Ms Evita YEUNG, Curator (Conservation) 3D Objects

Ms Eve TAM, Curator (Art) Modern Art

***Absent with apology***

Museums Advisory Group

Dr David CLARKE

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Mr Tim LI

Ms LO Kai-yin

Mr Wucius WONG

Dr Peter WONG King-keung, BBS, JP

Dr Philip WU Po-him, BBS, JP

Mr YEUNG Chun-tong

Mr YIM Shui-yuen

**Briefing by Ms Yuko HASEGAWA, Chief Curator, Museum of Contemporary Art, Tokyo**

Date : 12 July 2006  
Time : 11:25 a.m. – 1:25 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Home Affairs Bureau,  
25/F., Wanchai Tower, Hong Kong  
Attendees : see Appendix

Background of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Museum of Contemporary Art, Kanazawa (“Kanazawa Museum”)

1. 100 architects took part in a competition on the design of the Kanazawa Museum. The winner had successfully integrated open space and closed areas (such as museum and library) in one building.
2. The Kanazawa Museum opened in 2004. It composed of an art museum, a library, a theatre, a studio, a museum shop, a conference room and many showrooms.
3. There was minimum number of walls in the Museum, which allowed the general public more space to appreciate arts. Besides, there was a Japanese style garden inside the museum, which made the museum as a linking space for people.
4. The theatre had about 100 seats, which could have flexible arrangement for different kinds of functions and activities.
5. A small “swimming pool” located at the entrance provided visitor a home feeling. Visitors would like to have more direct interaction with the artwork by themselves and were likely attracted to visit the Museum if they were allowed to create their own experience.



## Operational Information & Visitation of the Kanazawa Museum

6. The Museum was operated by a Director who oversaw a general affairs section, a curatorial section and a communication section.
7. The Kanazawa Museum built up their collections five years before its opening. The Museum focused on the artworks that were made in 1980s and 1990s as they were more affordable. The Museum had about 200 items of collection up to the moment.
8. About 60 pre-events were held five years before the opening of the Museum to educate the audience. The events were held at different places from the city, such as temple, teahouse & mini cinemas.
9. The Museum invited different curators to organise a number of small-scale exhibitions for the local community to educate them on “Art is for our life” and “We can live with art”. Post-discussions (which were facilitated by scientists, psychologists or socialists) were also held for each exhibition. The facilitator shared their views on the artwork with the participants and listened to their comments. All these activities were well received by participants.
10. Besides, the Museum invited a young designer to design the uniform for security guards in the Museum to create a new and good-looking image at work. A famous singer in Western Europe was also invited to compose a song for promoting the Museum’s branding.
11. The mounting cost for a car exhibition was about US\$1.2M. The exhibition had about 17 000 visitors in two months period. It would likely attract more visitors if the exhibition would extend for 2-4 months.

12. There were about 2 million visitors for the Kanazawa Museum since its opening. About 50% of them were from places other than Kanazawa.

#### Background of the Museum of Contemporary Art, Tokyo (“Tokyo Museum”)

13. The Tokyo Museum was opened in March 1995. It presented a great number of important exhibitions to local and international visitors. The Museum had presented artworks selected from 3 800 works in the historical permanent collections, in order to provide visitors a systematic understanding on the development of contemporary art.
14. Apart from exhibition programmes, the Museum also organised various outreach and educational programmes for children and parents. There was an information center, an auditorium with 120 seats, a library and a workshop in the Museum.

#### Operation & Visitation of the Tokyo Museum

15. The Museum was operated by a Director who oversaw an administrative department and a curatorial department.
16. There were about 300 000 paid visitors for the Museum last year while one-third of them had visited the exhibition on permanent collections.
17. For the latest exhibition “Collection of the Foundation Cartier pour l’art contemporain” from April to July 2006, there were about 74 000 visitors joining various kinds of programmes.

18. A museum of contemporary art would generally need a lot of financial support from public funding. In Tokyo, people could easily see different interesting arts on street. It was quite difficult to attract them to visit contemporary art in a museum. In order to attract more visitors without incurring much cost, the Museums did a lot of proactive collaborative works with local artists (e.g. re-organization of some programmes to suit local artists' needs). In addition, it sought extra funding resources and explored the possibility to mix the existing artwork collections with other art forms.

#### View on the Scope and Operation of a Museum of Contemporary Art ("MOCA")

19. There were three essential elements for a MOCA: (a) archive and memory; (b) communication; and (c) inspirational & spiritual sharing. On (a), it was important for MOCA to show the history of art development for a specific region. On (b), a museum should produce its own programme as well as to pass on an artistic idea to audience so as to educate the visitors especially the younger generations, and to enhance the experience sharing between local and international curators. On (c), music played an important element for a programme in MOCA. Information and sound should be everywhere inside MOCA.
20. Internet was a good channel to promote the exhibitions in a museum and build up branding. Most people would be curious to know what new elements would be available in a museum via internet. Branding was not only important in the commercial world, but also for the creative industry.
21. Basically, people were not just coming to visit a place, but also to share their feeling and idea about human beings with each other. A museum was just a media to promote the concept of contemporary living to people and therefore it should create its own character.

22. A museum should pay more attention to selecting its artworks. For the preparation work, it must be conscious of how the artwork would be presented in the museum and how the people would react to the artwork. Furthermore, stimulation and imagination that inspired by the artwork were also important.

#### Views on the West Kowloon Cultural District (“WKCD”) Project

23. Regarding the four original proposed museum themes for WKCD, it was considered there were already target markets for Ink Art and Moving Image, so they should be ready to build up their own museums in WKCD. However, it would not be easy to make a difference between Design and Contemporary Art. Therefore, it might be more practicable if Design could be part of Contemporary Art so that more dialogue and interaction would take place between these two art forms.
24. Hong Kong is famous for its multi-national qualities with a mixture of Western and Chinese culture. A Museum of Contemporary Art in Hong Kong should be able to connect these concepts together with a unique character. However, considerations should be given to the preparation for building up the collections so that people could enjoy visiting the Museum.
25. As different artworks would have different life spans, a museum of contemporary art would be more flexible than a museum of modern art.
26. A modern museum in Munich would be a good reference to demonstrate how contemporary art interface with design.

**List of Attendees**

Presenter

Ms Yuko HASEGAWA, Chief Curator, Museum of Contemporary Art, Tokyo

Museums Advisory Group

Hon Victor LO, GBS, JP (Convenor)

Dr David CLARKE

Ms Jane DEBEVOISE

Ms Sabrina FUNG

Mr Oscar HO

Ms Claire HSU

Mr Andrew LAM

Mr Freeman LAU, BBS

Mr Tim LI

Mr Vincent LO, BBS, JP

Mr Wucius WONG

Mr YEUNG Chun-tong

Committee on Museums

Mr Tony CHAN

Mr Stephen C.M. SY, JP

Government Official

Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Esther LEUNG, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1

Mr Danny LAU, Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)2

Miss Susanna SIU, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Designate)  
Mrs Candy YEUNG, Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1 (Secretary)

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr CHUNG Ling-hoi, JP, Deputy Director (Culture)  
Mr TANG Hoi-chiu, Chief Curator (Art)

***Absent with apology***

Museums Advisory Group

Mr Benny CHIA  
Ms LO Kai yin  
Prof David LUNG, SBS, JP  
Ms Nansun SHI  
Ms Ada WONG, JP  
Dr Peter WONG, BBS, JP  
Dr Philip WU, BBS, JP  
Mr Rocco YIM  
Mr YIM Shui-yuen

**Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural  
Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District  
Museums Advisory Group**

**Report on the  
Duty Visit to Major Overseas Museums**

Period:	17 – 25 July 2006
Destinations:	Paris - Centre Pompidou - French Ministry of Culture - Quai Branly Museum London - Tate Modern - Design Museum New York - Museum of Modern Art - P.S.1 Contemporary Art Centre San Francisco - Asian Art Museum - Exploratorium - San Francisco Museum of Modern Art - de Young Museum
MAG Delegates:	Hon Victor Lo, GBS, JP (Convenor) Ms Jane Debevoise Ms Claire Hsu
Report prepared by:	Mr Vincent Fung, PAS (WKCD)1

**I. Center Pompidou**

1. Received by Mr Bruno Racine, President; Ms Kara Lennon, Adviser and Mr Joel Girard, Adviser.

## 2. **Background**

### a. **Theme**

The Centre Pompidou was named after President Georges Pompidou who wanted to create a cultural centre which served as a center focusing on modern and contemporary creation, where fine arts would exist alongside music, cinema, books and audio-visual research. Therefore, it was named as a “Centre” rather than a “Museum”.

### b. **Mission**

To spread knowledge about all creative works from the 20th century and those heralding the new millennium.

### c. **Building**

In 1970, an international architectural competition was launched. It was based on a programme aimed at achieving the objectives set by President Georges Pompidou. The prize-winners were Renzo Piano, Richard Rogers and Gianfranco Franchini. The building was designed on the lines of an "evolving spatial diagram" aiming to maximize spatial movement and flow to foster an interdisciplinary approach.

### d. **Museum Composition**

- ✧ The National Museum of Modern Art (“MNAM”)
- ✧ The Public Reference Library (“BPI”)
- ✧ The Music and Acoustic Research Institute (“IRCAM”)
- ✧ The Atelier Brancusi
- ✧ The Children’s Gallery
- ✧ The Espace 315
- ✧ The Kandinsky Library
- ✧ The cinema and performance halls



e. **Governance**

A statutory body with financial autonomy. Staff are not civil servants but as employees of this body. Administered by a Board of Directors, whose members are:

- × President of the Centre Pompidou, Chairman of the Board
- × 6 representatives of the state
- × 4 members of Parliament and the Senate
- × Mayor of Paris
- × 3 people with recognized expertise in the arts field
- × 3 representatives of the staff

The President of the Centre is nominated by the French Minister of Culture. His term is five years, which can be extended for another three years. For the Board of Directors, its functions and number of Board members are fixed by law. The Chairman of the Board of Directors (same as President) manages and deals with the daily operation of the Centre. The managing director, who acts under the authority of the chairman, is responsible for the management and administration tasks.

The Centre's units are as follows:

- × Public and Educational Action Unit
- × Safety and Building Unit
- × Communication Unit
- × Publishing Unit
- × Legal and Financial Unit
- × Production Unit
- × Human Resources Unit
- × IT Unit

The Centre also has:

- × Office for audiovisual cultural action
- × Digitisation office

※ Accounts office

f. **Facts**

Opened in:	1977, renovation in 1997 - 1999, reopened in 2000
Area:	8 floors, 103 305 m <sup>2</sup> including 60 000 m <sup>2</sup> of public space
Staff:	1 000 with 60 curators
Collection:	60 000 works by 5 000 artists of 100 nationalities, dated the earliest from mid-20 <sup>th</sup> century before the set up of the Centre (visitor's notes)
Visitors:	175 million since opening 5.5 million annually 18 000 per day
Composition:	65% less than 35 years old 41% school or university students
Membership:	45,149; 45% under 26 years old

g. **Visitor Information**

Opening Hours:	6 days per week (closed on Tuesdays and 1 May 11:00 a.m. – 10:00 p.m., late opening on Thursdays until 11:00 p.m.)
Entrance Fees:	Full price: € 10 (HK\$ 100) Concessions: € 8 (HK\$ 80)

Free Entrance for under 18 years old, unemployed and on the 1st Sunday of every month

Annual Pass: € 22 (HK\$ 220)  
(Students)  
€ 40 (HK\$ 400)  
(Full price)  
€ 70 (HK\$ 700)  
(for two people in two years)

### 3. **Acquisition and Loan**

All acquisition work are decided and approved by the Minister of Culture as per advice by the Acquisition Committee. The membership comprises of art historians, collectors, gallerists and other experts who are appointed by the Minister of Culture. All collections are owned by the Government and the Centre had no right to sell them out. The budget for acquisition is about € 7 million per year. The Centre intends to acquire more “upcoming” artworks, which are more affordable. In addition, the Centre lobbies very hard for donation of artefacts.

Centre Pompidou adopts an active loan policy. In 2005, 3,327 artworks items were on loan to other museums (1,800 items to international museums).

### 4. **Finance**

The Centre has an annual budget of about €100 million. 75% of its income (about €75 million) is Government subsidy while 25% (about €25 million) is self-earned income including admission fees, souvenirs, concessions, royalties and traveling exhibition fees. About 90% of its expenditure [€ 90 million (about HK\$ 900 million)] is operating cost, programming cost and acquisition cost while the rest of 10% (€ 10 million (about HK\$ 100 million)) is other expenses.

## Budget

75% Government subsidy	€ 75 million	(HK\$ 750 million)
25% Self-earned including	€ 25 million	(HK\$ 250 million)
- Admission fees (includes membership fees)	€ 8.9 million	(HK\$ 89 million)
- Product sales and concessions	€ 3.2 million	(HK\$ 32 million)
- Publishing	€ 2.5 million	(HK\$ 25 million)
- Contributions, grants, donations	€ 1.9 million	(HK\$ 19 million)
- Rental	€ 1.3 million	(HK\$ 13 million)
- Fundraising	€ 1.2 million	(HK\$ 12 million)
- Travelling exhibition fees, Royalties	€ 0.8 million	(HK\$ 8 million)
- In-kind contributions	€ 0.3 million	(HK\$ 3 million)
- Other (financial products, investments, ...)	€ 5 million	(HK\$ 50 million)
Total	€ 100 million	(HK\$ 1,000 million)

## Expenditure

70 % Operating costs	€ 70 million	(HK\$ 700 million)
- Staff cost	€ 50 million	(HK\$ 500 million)
- Building maintenance and security	€ 17.6 million	(HK\$ 176 million)
- Utility charges	€ 3.5 million	(HK\$ 35 million)
20 % Programme costs	€ 20 million	(HK\$ 200 million)
- Production and restoration	€ 8.7 million	(HK\$ 87 million)
- Acquisitions	€ 7 million	(HK\$ 70 million)
- Communication and education	€ 4.4 million	(HK\$ 44 million)
10 % Other (taxes, reserve...)	€ 10 million	(HK\$ 100 million)
Total	€ 100 million	(HK\$ 1,000 million)

## 5. Discussion on WKCD

### a. **Architecture**

The museum entity with an outstanding architectural design is important. An impressive architecture is intrinsically an attraction which could draw in crowds.

### b. **A “Complex” Concept**

Centre Pompidou has three major parts, i.e. the Centre Pompidou for Art and Culture, a library and a music center. However, the majority of tourists visit Centre Pompidou only whereas mainly local residents visit the library and the music center. But legally speaking, all the facilities are under the administration of Centre Pompidou.

For the Centre Pompidou for Art and Culture, it accommodates lots of different art forms, departments and operation units such as cinema and theatre. This collaboration will generate a synergy.

It was recommended that WKCD could incorporate a complex comprising of different art forms, like moving image and design, or even different cultural items, except ink. These varieties needed not be located under the same roof but should have an institutional link among them.

### c. **Collections**

It will be a constraint for a museum without its own collections. The ownership of collections not only facilitates one’s own implementation of exhibition but can also be used to exchange for other exhibitions. Collections loaned to foreign places can also act as a promotion medium for the affiliated museum itself and help to gain international prestige.

d. **Importance of Change of Content**

While charming architecture can attract first visit, constant change of content can secure repeated visits. 30% of the Centre visitors are international visitors, 30% from Paris and 40% from other parts of France. People perceive museums such as Centre Pompidou different from Louvre and Versailles for they expect regular influx of new elements in the former.

e. **Programming and Connection with Creative Industry**

Centre Pompidou has over 70 programmes / exhibitions per year. All programmes have been discussed at the Programming Committee composed of President of the Centre, Museum Director, Library Director and Music Research Institute Director whom would also discuss the programmes with the curators in specialized field from different departments. Despite a public institution status, the Centre enjoys independence in programming.

Streams in creative industry such as advertising, design, architecture, sound etc were inter-related parts and Centre Pompidou has been inviting students from these streams to present their works in the Centre.

## **II. French Ministry of Culture**

1. Received by Mr Jean Haussonville, Counsellor, and Ms Mariani-Ducray, Director of the Museums of France.

### **2. Background**

The Minister of Culture is in charge of national museums and monuments; promoting and protecting the arts (visual, plastic, theatrical, musical, dance, architectural, literary, televisual and cinematographic) in France and abroad; and managing the national archives and regional culture centres.

### **3. Governance**

The development of French museums has been immensely affected by the history of France. For example, the Louvre is actually the display of collections once owned by the French imperial family and opens to the public after the downfall of the regime. In this connection, the majority of museums is directly under the government and administered by civil servants, except Centre Pompidou. In addition to the Ministry of Culture, some other ministries, such as education and defense, are also managing museums in France.

But when the incumbent Minister of Culture took office two years ago, a new policy was introduced. He extended the model of Centre Pompidou's autonomous status to a few large museums such as the Louvre and the Versailles and allowed them to run autonomously as a statutory body.

In view of the input of government resources, criteria are set forth for both operational monitoring and evaluation of achievements. There are professional standards which apply to museums of different scales: the larger the museum, the stricter the requirements.

#### 4. **Finance**

Funding allocation, no matter for museums directly under government's control or museums operating through a statutory body, is controlled by the government's budget. Museums staff are employed in accordance with civil service terms.

€250 million (HK\$2.5 billion) is usually budgeted per year for the entire museum system including €60 million (HK\$600 million) for acquisition use. However, a budget cut of 15% was imposed recently in view of the unfavorable economic condition. This move forced museums, especially large scale ones operating under a statutory status, to solicit additional funding elsewhere.

Since the concept of foundation is not common in France, the museums tend to solicit cash donation from large corporations and raise income from admission fees, venue rental and sale of souvenir items. The situation is even worse for small-scale museums which do not have the resources to seek external sponsorship.

#### 5. **Visitation**

It was pointed out that some of the museums in France were mainly visited by tourists, such as the Louvre and the Versailles, as the exhibits basically remain unchanged and local people therefore did not feel the urgency to revisit these museums frequently. In recent years, the French government was trying to encourage more local people to pay frequent visits to these museums.



### **III. Quai Branly Museum**

1. Received by Mr Stephane Martin, President.

#### **2. Background**

##### **a. Set Up Story**

When the French President Jacques Chirac assumed office in 1995, he started to consider the setting up of a non-Western arts museum. A piece of land close to the Eiffel Tower was finally chosen to build the museum.

##### **b. Theme**

Quai Branly Museum features indigenous art, culture and civilizations from Africa, Asia, Oceania and the Americas.

##### **c. Mission**

To allow the diversity of the glances on the objects, the ethnology to the history of art, and to officially recognize the place which occupy civilizations and the inheritance of people sometimes kept away of the current culture of planet.

##### **d. Building**

Built over 25 000 m<sup>2</sup> of land, the architectural concept of this original project was by Jean Nouvel. The building resembles a long footbridge, partly equipped with wood. The architectural unit develops on five levels crowned by a broad terrace, offering a seizing sight on the Eiffel and Paris. Inside the museum, walls of glass replace the windows. The extraordinary “living wall” (200 m long by 12 m tall) on part of the exterior of the museum is designed and planned by Patrick Blanc.

##### **e. Museum Composition**

× Museum entity, 25 100 m<sup>2</sup>

- × Garden, 17 500 m<sup>2</sup>
- × Vegetable frontage, 800 m<sup>2</sup>
- × Theatre Claude Lévi-Strauss
- × Media library

f. **Governance**

The Quai Branly Museum is an “administrative publicly-owned” establishment placed under triple supervision of the Ministry for the Culture and the Communication, Ministry for National Education and Ministry for Research. It is administered by a Board of Directors, with members from the Parliament, local communities, relevant ministries and staff representatives.

g. **Facts**

Opened on:	23 June 2006; collection housed in the Louvre before, 120 works are still exhibiting in the Louvre after the Quai Branly Museum’s opening
Area:	25 100 m <sup>2</sup> , 4 750 m <sup>2</sup> for permanent collection
Collections:	approximately 300 000 objects
Visitors:	151 000 visitors for the first month of opening
Operation Cost:	€6.361 million (HK\$63.61 million) (2003)
Publicity & Development Cost	€1.508 million (HK\$15.08 million) (2003)

#### h. **Visitor Information**

Opening Hours: Tuesdays to Sundays from 10:00 a.m. – 6:30 p.m.; Thursday nights until 9:30 p.m. and closed on Tuesdays

Entrance Fee: Permanent Exhibition:  
€ 8.5 (HK\$ 85) / € 6 (HK\$ 60)  
Thematic Exhibition:  
€ 8.5 (HK\$ 85) / € 6 (HK\$ 60)  
One-day Pass:  
€ 13 (HK\$ 130) / € 9.5 (HK\$ 95)

### 3. **Strategy**

A museum should not be limited to its name and the themes chosen. Regular introduction of new elements and time-limited exhibitions could attract repeated visitors whereas collections are for tourists. In other words, content pluralism and space flexibility should outweigh theme and collection in the development of a museum's strategy.

The strategy for Quai Branly Museum is to attract young and frequent visitors. They therefore often take reference from Centre Pompidou. The target is to build up a "cultural life" in the surrounding area. Museum should provide holistic "experiences" rather than just a visit to see the collections.

### 4. **Collections**

Securing precious collections is not solely for exhibitions but also for loans and exchanges with museum counterparts around the world. Again, the collections on loan from other places should not be confined to certain themes or forms only. Museums are places to demonstrate world-wide exhibits to open up the minds of locals, rather than just showing local heritage.

## 5. **Architecture**

Good architecture and lots of open space are crucial. It should be attractive enough to draw visitors in the vicinity to come close and take a rest in the area, and then visit the museum. Quai Branly Museum well demonstrates this principle through its spacious garden and green frontage area.

#### **IV. Tate Modern**

1. Received by Mr Alex Beard, Deputy Director of Tate, Mr Vincente Todoli, Director of Tate Modern, Ms Virginia Ibbott, Head of International Council, Mr Frances Morris, Head of Acquisitions and Mr Matthew Gale, Curator.

#### **2. Background**

##### **a. Theme**

Tate is the national collection of British art from the year 1500 to the present day.

##### **b. Mission**

Tate's mission is drawn from the 1992 Museums and Galleries Act, which is to increase public knowledge, understanding and appreciation of British art from the sixteenth century to the present day and of international modern and contemporary art.

##### **c. Set Up Story**

In the late 1980s it became clear to Tate that its collection had outgrown its home at Millbank. To solve this problem, the disused Bankside Power Station, built in two phases between 1947 and 1963, was chosen to be the new entity. The building was converted by architects Herzog & de Meuron. The power station consisted of a huge turbine hall, which became a dramatic entrance area, with ramped access, as well as an exhibition space for very large sculptural projects. The boiler house became the galleries. These were on three levels running the full length of the building. The galleries were disposed in separate but linked blocks, known as suites, on either side of the central escalators. The Tate collection of modern art was displayed on two of the gallery floors. The third was

devoted to temporary exhibitions. Above the original roofline of the power station Herzog and De Meuron added a two-storey glass penthouse, known as the lightbeam. The chimney was capped by a coloured light feature designed by the artist Michael Craig-Martin, known as the Swiss Light. At night, the penthouse lightbeam and the Swiss Light has become a landmark.

d. **Governance**

A Board of Trustee under Museum & Galleries Act, supported by a full management / programming team to run the 4 museums under Tate, with Tate Modern and Tate Britain as flagships. Fund-raising, sponsorship and development were important to Tate. Therefore the top management put a lot efforts to attract sponsors from the commercial sector.

e. **Facts**

Opened in: 2000

Area: 7 floors, 34 500 m<sup>2</sup>

Collections: over 65 000 works of art encompassing (including the national collection of historic British art from 1 500, and the national collection of international modern art Tate Modern, Tate Britain, Tate Liverpool and Tate St Ives)

Visitors: More than 20 million since opening  
3 900 000 in 2005

Expenditure: Operation cost: £1.82 million (04/05)  
(including (HK\$27.12 million)  
Tate Modern,

Tate Britain, Acquisition: £17.70 million (04/05)  
Tate Liverpool (HK\$263.76 million)  
and Tate St Ives)  
Program cost: £52.22 million (04/05)  
(HK\$778.11 million)

f. **Visitor Information**

Opening Hours: Sundays to Thursdays, 10:00 a.m. –  
6:00 p.m.  
Fridays and Saturdays, 10:00 a.m. –  
10:00 p.m.  
Closed 24, 25, 26 December (open as  
normal on 1 January)

Entrance Fees: Admission to the gallery is free.  
Entrance fees charged for some  
temporary exhibitions ranging from £7  
(HK\$101) to £10 (HK\$145)

3. **Collections**

The 65 000 artworks are placed in a few different places.  
During the opening of Tate Modern, they have to purchase new  
collections, especially in the theme of modern art.

4. **Funding**

- ※ About 60% from the Department for Culture, Media and  
Sport (“DCMS”)
- ※ Others from tickets, commercial sponsors, rental, etc.

5. **Space**

Tate Modern well demonstrates the advantage of having  
abundant space which enhances exhibition flexibility.  
However, they are again facing inadequacy of space now and  
becoming more selective in choosing exhibitions.

## 6. **Programming**

A lot of programmes, especially those cater for youth and students, are organised which largely contribute to the high attendance.

## 7. **Reasons for Success**

- ※ Strong demand for a modern art museum from the British community
- ※ Image building: Tate maintains a significant cultural institute in UK
- ※ Becoming part of the public life of local people, an impressive architectural design is determinant to ignite sense of belonging and pay regular visits
- ※ Correct pricing policy
- ※ Uniqueness in the service
- ※ Very strong marketing work
- ※ Good programming and display policy (In a recent survey of visitors to Tate Modern, 53% said the collection / displays was the principal reason for their visit.)

## 8. **Views on WKCD**

- ※ Better to have statutory body to oversee the whole district
- ※ A trust fund is a must to ensure continuous funding
- ※ Whether there is a need for a museum ordinance to run museums depends on what risk you want to avoid i.e. not a matter of cultural policy
- ※ To have a good modern art / contemporary art museum, must build up good connections with collectors / curators / major business firms / academics and the museum community i.e. to purchase good collections and secure loans of exhibits



## **V. Design Museum**

1. Received by Sir Terence Conran, Founder and Ms Donna Loveday, Head of Exhibitions.

### **2. Background**

#### **a. Theme**

Modern and contemporary design

#### **b. Mission**

To excite everyone about design.

#### **c. Strategic Goals**

※ To raise public awareness of design and architecture through its exhibitions, website, publishing activities, awards and advocacy

※ To provide practical and inspirational training to students, lifelong learners and educators at all levels throughout the UK to improve their knowledge and professional skills

※ To develop new audiences, and nurture existing ones, to broaden public understanding of design and architecture

#### **d. Building**

The Design Museum is located in an elegant modernist building on the River Thames by Tower Bridge with spectacular views of the City and Canary Wharf. The building was converted from a former 1940s banana warehouse, which was altered beyond recognition.

#### **e. Museum Composition**

※ Ground floor: admission desk, museum shop and restroom

- × First floor:                      exhibition area
  
- × Design Museum:                mezzanine floor, not generally,  
accessible space to public, for  
special use or hiring
  
- × Second floor:                    exhibition area and education  
centre

f. **Governance**

The Design Museum is a registered charity and a company limited by guarantee. It is governed by a Board of Directors. The Director of the Museum reports to the Board. Design Museum Enterprises Limited is the trading arm and wholly owned subsidiary of the Design Museum. It undertakes retail and corporate hospitality activities.

g. **Facts**

- Opened in:                            1989
- Area:                                    2 floors, small museum
- Collection:                            no permanent collections
- Visitors:                                over 250 000 in 2005
- Operation Cost:                        £1.96 million (2005)  
(HK\$29.17 million)
- Publicity & Development:            £0.28 million (2005)
- Cost                                        (HK\$4.15 million)

h. **Visitor Information**

- Opening Hours:                      Daily 10:00 a.m. – 5:45 p.m.  
Open on all bank and national  
holidays, except 25 & 26 December
  
- Entrance Fees:                        adults £7 (HK\$101)  
students and concessions £4

(HK\$58)

Free for under 12

**3. Collections and Exhibitions**

Own a small amount of collections only but they change exhibition once in a few months in order to attract visitors to visit frequently.

**4. Funding**

※ Department for Culture, Media and Sports: 25%  
(non-recurrent funds on projects only)

※ Tickets: 25%

※ Rental (bookshop / bar / restaurant): 25%

※ Sponsorship / Events: 25%

**5. Commercial Events**

Deemed to be a site with potential to organise commercial events.

**6. Plan for a New Building**

In view of the space constraints, they were planning to move to a larger building close to Tate Modern.

**7. Views on WKCD**

A statutory body to oversee the whole district of WKCD was advisable.

Raising public awareness of the importance of the themes in the museum is also important.

## **VI. The Museum of Modern Art, New York**

1. Received by Mr Peter Reed, Senior Deputy Director for Curatorial Affairs.

### **2. Background**

#### **a. Theme**

Modern art

#### **b. Mission**

The encouragement of an ever deeper understanding and enjoyment of modern and contemporary art by the diverse local, national, and international audiences that it serves.

#### **c. Building**

This new building nearly doubles the space for Museum of Modern Art's ("MoMA") exhibitions and programmes. Designed by Yoshio Taniguchi, the new MoMA features 58 529 m<sup>2</sup> of new and redesigned space. A new gallery building on the western portion of the site houses the main exhibition galleries and the Museum's first stand-alone Education and Research Center on the eastern portion of the site provide more space for classrooms, auditoriums, teacher training workshops, and the Museum's expanded Library and Archives. These two buildings frame the enlarged Abby Aldrich Rockefeller Sculpture Garden.

#### **d. Governance**

Administered by a Board of Trustees and supported by a Director with his management team.

#### **e. Facts**

Opened in: 1929 as an educational institution; a recent extensive renovation in 2002 and reopened in 2004

Area:	58 529 m <sup>2</sup>
Staff:	800
Collection:	Include 150 000 paintings, sculptures, drawings, prints, photographs, architectural models and drawings, and design objects. 22 000 films, videos, and media works, as well as film stills, scripts, posters and historical documents
Visitors:	2.67 million from November 2004 to November 2005
Operation Cost:	US\$70 million (HK\$546 million)
Program & Exhibition Cost :	US\$21 million (HK\$163.8 million)

f. **Visitor Information**

Opening Hours:	Saturdays	10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.
	Sundays	10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.
	Mondays	10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.
	Tuesdays	Closed
	Wednesdays	10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.
	Thursdays	10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.
	Fridays	10:30 a.m. – 8:00 p.m.
	Closed on Christmas day and Thanksgiving Day	

- Entrance Fees: Adults \$20 (HK\$ 156)
- Seniors: \$16 (HK\$ 125) (65 and over)

with ID)

- Students: \$12 (HK\$ 94) (full-time with current ID)
- Children: Free (sixteen and under)
- This policy does not apply to children in groups
- Members: Free
- Admission is free for all visitors during Target Free Friday Nights, sponsored by Target, every Friday evening, 4:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.

### 3. **Theme and Staffing**

Though emphasizing on “modern art”, there are a lot different themes under the roof of MoMA.

It may not be necessary to draw a distinction between modern art and contemporary art, as the timeline changes from time to time.

For the selection criteria of design artefacts inside a modern art museum, the aesthetic side should be emphasized instead of other practical values.

### 4. **Collections**

Collections are not solely for in-house display. It should be of extensive use in helping a museum to build image internationally. MoMA continues its world-wide parade of exhibition by continual exchange of collections with other museums during its renovation period. The traveling exhibitions also enhance souvenir sales revenue, especially for museum like MoMA with world-wide retail outlets.

### 5. **Finance**

MoMA’s total budget is US\$ 140 million per year. Some

40-50% is spent on operational matters and 15% on programming and exhibitions. It also operates a very successful art product business.

In terms of revenue, MoMA has a strong team in soliciting donations, sponsorships and fundraising which is critical for its continual operation. Their revenue relies on donation, endowment fund, admission fee, membership fee, rental of venues and retail etc. Government funding is minimal.

#### **6. Use of Space**

MoMA well demonstrates the advantages of a spacious entity and flexible use of space. The configuration of movable walls and partitions allow enormous choices of exhibition without space constraint.

#### **7. Affiliation with P.S.1**

MoMA formalizes its affiliation with P.S.1 Contemporary Art Center in January 2000. The principal objective of MoMA's partnership with P.S.1 is to promote the enjoyment, appreciation, study, and understanding of contemporary art to a wide and growing audience. Collaborative programmes of exhibitions, educational activities, and special projects allowed both institutions to draw on their respective strengths and resources and to continue shaping a cultural discourse (See part VII below).

#### **8. Views on WKCD**

A museum's theme affects aspects such as presentation or collection oriented, staffing strategy, budget of expenditure and space requirement.

The selection and grouping of themes largely depend on the local circumstances.

## **VII. P.S.1 Contemporary Art Centre**

1. Received by Ms Alanna Heiss, Director of P.S.1.

### **2. Background**

#### **a. History**

PS1 was a public school from 1893 - 1963. The Institute for Contemporary Art and Resources, later P.S.1 Contemporary Art Center, was founded in 1971 as a non-profit organization dedicated to the transformation of abandoned and underutilized buildings in New York City into exhibition, performance, and studio spaces for artists. In June 1976 the 83-year-old building opened its doors again, but became a space devoted to contemporary art.

#### **b. Theme and Mission**

Devoted to the production, presentation, interpretation and dissemination of the work of innovative artists in all media, fostering creativity and uninhibited artistic exploration. P.S.1 aims to provide an engaging environment for artists; to inform, inspire, and challenge its audiences; to actively attract new audiences; and to be an accessible resource that elevates the role of art in contemporary culture.

#### **c. Building**

It is not housed in a new and current form of architecture but in a refurbished schoolhouse built in 1893. It thriftily resides in the educational facilities which lend it its name, Public School 1.

#### **d. Governance**

Led by a Board of Directors with a management team as follows:



Directors Office  
Administration  
Exhibitions Department  
Development Department  
Finance Department  
Curatorial Department  
Visitor Services

e. **Facts**

Opened in: 1971

Area: 2 floors, 12 500 m<sup>2</sup> exhibition space including 2 000 m<sup>2</sup> of which is courtyard

Exhibition: Currently 8 separate exhibitions and over 50 installations and artist projects

f. **Visitor Information**

Opening hours: 12:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m., Thursdays through Mondays  
Closed on Thanksgiving, Christmas and New Year's Days

Entrance Fees: US\$5.00 suggested donation  
US\$2.00 for students and senior citizens; free for MoMA members and MoMA admission ticket holders

3. **Theme**

P.S.1 allows calculated risk and flexibility to try new ideas out. In view of its location, scale, background and orientation, it affords less qualified and experimental exhibitions from young artists.

They also reveal that the investment is high in modern art display which often involves a great deal of modern technology. This should be taken into consideration in terms of costing calculation.

4. **Staffing**

Fewer curators are needed (4 out of 19 staff) due to the focus on exhibition space and the small entity.

5. **Affiliation to MoMA**

Being one of the satellite institutions of MoMA, the affiliation is mainly built upon the aspects of finance and administration.

6. **Finance**

The annual expenditure budget is about US\$5 million. More than US\$3 million comes from fund raising. Operations and programmes of P.S.1 are supported by the P.S.1 Board of Directors, the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs, The Office of the President of the Borough of Queens, The Council of the City of New York, the National Endowment for the Arts, and the New York State Council on the Arts. Additional funding is provided by individuals, foundations and corporate contributions.

Since P.S.1 receive government subsidy, they in return conduct programmes for educational purpose for schools.

## **VIII. Asian Art Museum**

1. Received by Dr Michael Knight, Senior Curator of Chinese Art and Deputy Director of Strategic Programmes and Partnerships, Doria Leong, Director of Development, Mark McLoughlin, Chief Operating Office, Tim Hallman, Director of Marketing and Communications, Amory Sharpe, Director of Institutional Partnership and Akiko Yamazaki, Trustee, Co-Chair of Strategic Planning Committee.

### **2. Background**

#### **a. History**

The Asian Art Museum (“AAM”) was established in 1966 when Mr Avery Brundage donated over 5 000 pieces of Asian art collections to the city of San Francisco. It was moved to the present venue in 2003.

#### **b. Theme and Mission**

To lead a diverse global audience in discovering the unique material, aesthetic, and intellectual achievements of Asian art and culture.

#### **c. Building**

The building was constructed through the rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the city’s former Main Library under the direction of Italian architect Gae Aulenti after the destruction caused by the 1989 earthquake. The building was a 1917 Beaux Arts-style building recognized as one of San Francisco’s most important historic structures. The museum is approximately 18 500 m<sup>2</sup>. The new Asian Art Museum opened on 20 March 2003.

#### **d. Museum Composition**

- ※ 2 900 m<sup>2</sup> of gallery space for collection display on second and third floors

- ※ 850 m<sup>2</sup> of gallery space on the museum's ground floor dedicated to temporary exhibitions
- ※ Education Resource Center on the ground floor, allowing visitors to drop in and view videos, listen to audiotapes, and check out other resources
- ※ Samsung Hall, located at the center of the building, is used to showcase live demonstrations, hands-on art activities, and self-paced learning activities
- ※ 3 multi-purpose classrooms to support the wide range of educational and cultural programmes

e. **Governance**

The Asian Art Commission is responsible for the determination of policy for and the administration of the Asian Art Museum of San Francisco. The Commission consists of 27 members, nominated by the Commission but subject to the Mayor's approval. Commissioners serve a three-year term which may be renewed for a second consecutive term. Exceptional circumstances permit renewal for a third term.

At the time the Asian Art Museum was formed, upon the significant donation of art collections from Mr Avery Brundage, the Asian Art Museum Foundation was established as the private fundraising arm of the Museum.

Commissioners and Foundation Trustees work together for the benefit of the Museum, frequently serving on each other's committees.

f. **Facts**

Opened in: 1966

Area: 18 500 m<sup>2</sup>

Staff: There are about 200 staff covering development, registration, facilities

operation and security

Collection: Approximately 16 000 objects ranging from tiny jades to monumental sculptures of stone, bronze, wood and other materials, paintings on screens, hanging scrolls and other formats, porcelains and ceramics, lacquers, textiles, furniture, arms and armor, puppets, and basketry

Visitors: More than 400 000 visitors during the first full year (2003 - 2004) of operation, a high percentage of tourists visited the museum during summer holidays

Membership: 21 000

**g. Visitor Information**

Opening Hours: Tuesdays through Sundays 10:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. with extended evening hours every Thursday until 9:00 p.m.

Closed on Mondays, major holidays (New Year's Days, Thanksgiving and Christmas), and during certain large scale Civic Center Events

Entrance Fees:

Adults	\$10	(HK\$ 78)
Seniors	\$7	(HK\$ 55)
65 and older with ID		
College students	\$6	(HK\$ 47)
with ID and youth ages 13 through		

17

Children 12 and under, Free

Museum Members, and SFUSD  
students with ID

Thursday evenings \$5 (HK\$ 39)

after 5:00 p.m. for all visitors except  
those under 12 and members

"Target Tuesdays" courtesy of Free

Target Stores on the first Tuesday of  
every month

### 3. **Collections and Exhibitions**

AAM is a traditional museum with a standardized collection on display and a few galleries displaying different thematic exhibitions. There are a number of galleries inside AAM. Visitors can walk through from one gallery to another which is a journey in Asia from West to East. The biggest part of the collection was from China. There are 11 000 Chinese objects available for display. Nevertheless, visitors from different countries may feel that there are not enough collections of their particular country. It is always a challenge for the museum on how to maintain a balanced collection.

The permanent collection of the museum has a special mission for the audience. It would attract tourists if they know about the collection. It also helps advancing the San Francisco public along the route of understanding and awareness of Asian art.

Apart from private donations, the museum curators work with a small group of collectors to borrow their collections on a regular basis. They work with the collecting community closely and keep them involved in the museum.

According to marketing surveys, most of the visitors come to

AAM for special exhibitions rather than permanent collections. Therefore, AAM puts lot of resources in organising special exhibitions.

The total exhibition space of the museum is about 3 750 m<sup>2</sup>, of which about 2 900 m<sup>2</sup> is for permanent collection and 850 m<sup>2</sup> for special exhibitions. Therefore, the museum requires “big black box” for storage of collection. It is suggested that for planning purpose, the size of the “big black box” should be about 1 200 m<sup>2</sup>. According to survey results, the audience usually spent about 1.5 hour in a museum. It may be a problem if the museum is too big in size. In addition, people tend to go to one museum per trip per day. Therefore, if there are several big exhibitions at different museums at the same period of time, the museums would compete with each other for visitors.

#### 4. **Programming**

The museum conducts a lot education programmes e.g. student and teacher tours and school group visits.

#### 5. **Finance**

The budget for AAM in the fiscal year 2005-06 was \$16 million (HK\$124.8 million). Of which, 34% came from City and County of San Francisco, 64% were from private contribution and earned income. The collections of the museum and the building belong to the City of San Francisco. 10% of the museum’s revenue comes from admission fee. Nevertheless, attendance is very important, as high attendance would attract sponsorship from large corporations.

The museum works closely with a number of large foundations, which supports AAM financially and in organising exhibitions and educational programmes.

AAM puts effort in developing corporate partners. These large corporate partners are mainly concerned about what kind of exposure they could get by supporting the museum programmes.

**6. Views on WKCD**

There are a number of very interesting museums in Hong Kong which form a good representation. There may be a need to conduct some strategic planning to facilitate a good start for working out some balancing and complementing themes for the new museums in WKCD.

It is considered that having separate museums of different themes would not be successful in San Francisco but it may be feasible in Hong Kong.



## **IX. Exploratorium**

1. Self visit without reception.

### **2. Background**

#### **a. Theme**

The Exploratorium is a museum of science, art, and human perception founded in 1969. A museum as “educational center”. It provides access to, and information about, science, nature, art, and technology.

#### **b. Mission**

The Exploratorium's mission is to create a culture of learning through innovative environments, programmes, and tools that help people nurture their curiosity about the world around them.

#### **c. Building**

The Exploratorium occupies 11 000 m<sup>2</sup> within San Francisco's historic Palace of Fine Arts, a vacant remnant of the Panama-Pacific International Exposition of 1915, plus offices and exhibit-building shops in adjacent Presidio Buildings.

#### **d. Museum Composition**

- × Multimedia Learning Center with library
- × nine wired classrooms
- × life science laboratory
- × Phyllis C. Wattis Webcast Studio
- × 150-seat McBean Theater

#### **e. Governance**

Led by a Board of Directors and an Advisory Council.

f. **Facts**

Opened in:	1969
Area:	11 000 m <sup>2</sup>
Staff:	412
Collection:	650 original interactive exhibits, displays, and artworks have been designed, prototyped, and built on site, with currently 400 on view
Visitors:	530 000 people annually visited the Exploratorium <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- 51% of visitors were adults and 49% are children</li><li>- 30% were from the Bay Area, 28% from the rest of California, 31% from other states, 11% outside U.S.</li><li>- 128 800 students and teachers visited on school field trips each year</li></ul>
Membership:	10 000 individuals and families

g. **Visitor Information**

Opening Hours:	Open Tuesdays through Sundays 10:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Closed Mondays (Except Martin Luther King Day, President's Day, Memorial Day and Labor Day) Closed on Thanksgiving, Christmas Eve at 3:00 p.m. and Christmas Day
----------------	---

- Entrance Fees:
- Adult (18-64): \$13.00 (HK\$ 101)
  - Student (over 18 with ID) / Seniors (65+): \$10.00 (HK\$ 78)
  - People with Disabilities: \$10.00 (HK\$ 78)
  - Youth (ages 13-17): \$10.00 (HK\$ 78)
  - Children (ages 4-12): \$8.00 (HK\$ 62)
  - Children (3 and under): Free
  - Tactile Dome: \$16.00 (HK\$ 125) (7+; general admission included)

## **X. San Francisco Museum of Modern Art**

1. Self visit without reception.

### **2. Background**

#### **a. Theme**

Modern and contemporary art

#### **b. Mission**

The Museum strives to engage and inspire a diverse range of audiences by pursuing an innovative programme of exhibitions, education, publications, and collections activities. International in scope, while reflecting the distinctive character of the region, the Museum explores compelling expressions of visual culture.

#### **c. Building**

In January 1995, San Francisco Museum of Modern Art (“SFMOMA”) opened a new museum facility of 22 500 m<sup>2</sup>, in the burgeoning South of Market district, designed by renowned Swiss architect Mario Botta in the tradition of Modernist design.

#### **d. Museum Composition**

- × four floors of galleries
- × 280-seat Phyllis Wattis Theater that accommodated lectures, symposia, seminars, film presentations and performances
- × The Schwab Room, a multiple-use event space
- × 700 m<sup>2</sup> Koret Visitor Education Center
- × Museum library
- × one classroom with seating capacity for 100
- × conservation studio

e. **Governance**

Overseen by a Board of Trustees.

f. **Facts**

Opened in: 1935

Area: 22 500 m<sup>2</sup>

- 5 000 m<sup>2</sup> were dedicated to galleries
- three very large galleries of approximately 750 m<sup>2</sup> each
- over 20 galleries ranging from 50 to 350 m<sup>2</sup>

Collection: 23 861 works

Visitors: 768 483 in 2004

Membership: 57 000 in 2004

Operation Cost: US\$ 20.76 million (2004)  
(HK\$ 161.93 million)

Publicity & Development Cost: US\$13.14 million (2004)  
(HK\$ 102.49 million)

g. **Visitor Information**

Opening Hours: Mondays – Tuesdays: 11:00 a.m. –  
5:45 p.m.

Closed on Wednesdays

Thursdays: 11:00 a.m. –  
8:45 p.m.

Fridays – Sundays: 11:00 a.m. –  
5:45 p.m.

Closed on New Year's Day, Fourth of July, Thanksgiving, and Christmas

Closed at 4:45 p.m. on Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve

Open the Wednesday between Christmas and New Year's Day

Entrance Fee: Adults:  
\$12.50 (HK\$ 98)

Seniors (62 years and older):  
\$8.00 (HK\$ 62)

Students (with current ID):  
\$7.00 (HK\$ 55)

Members and children under 12 and accompanied by adults:  
Free

Thursday evenings  
(6:00 p.m. – 9:00 p.m.): Half-price admission

First Tuesday of each month:  
Free

### 3. **Configuration**

SFMOMA is located in a new building. The venue configuration shows that they value architecture, space and a lively environment for display, which could attract many young audiences.

## **XI. de Young Museum**

1. Received by Ms Elisabeth Cornu, Head Conservator.

### **2. Background**

#### **a. Theme**

Fine Arts

#### **b. Mission**

The Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco have rendered a century of public service in the arts with a mission to extend that service into the next century.

#### **c. Building**

The new de Young Museum of 29 300 m<sup>2</sup> embraces both art and nature. On 15 October 2005, the de Young Museum re-opened in a state-of-the-art new facility that integrates art, architecture and the natural landscape in one multi-faceted destination. Designed by the Swiss architecture firm Herzog & de Meuron and Fong & Chan Architects in San Francisco.

#### **d. Museum Composition**

× Permanent Collection Galleries	7 320 m <sup>2</sup>
× Temporary Exhibition Galleries	1 200 m <sup>2</sup>
× Other Art Display Areas	1 100 m <sup>2</sup>
× Education Areas	2 000 m <sup>2</sup>
× Conservation Facilities	1 320 m <sup>2</sup>
× Sculpture Garden	3 500 m <sup>2</sup>
× Children's Garden	4 750 m <sup>2</sup>
× Entry Court	110 m <sup>2</sup>
× Auditorium / Lecture Hall	390 m <sup>2</sup>
× Tower Observation Floor	250 m <sup>2</sup>

e. **Governance**

Administered by a Board of Trustees and an Executive Committee together with the following management departments:

- × Administration
- × Conservation
- × Curatorial
- × Education
- × General
- × Press

f. **Facts**

Opened in: 1895

Area: 29 300 m<sup>2</sup>

Collection: 25 000 works including art in America to the 20<sup>th</sup> century, contemporary art, art of the Americas, native American art, art of Africa, art of Oceania, textiles and photography

g. **Visitor Information**

Opening Hours: Tuesdays – Sundays:  
9:30 a.m. – 5:15 p.m.

Fridays:  
open until 8:45 p.m.

Entrance Fees:	Adults	\$10 (HK\$78)
	Seniors	\$7 (HK\$55)
	Youth 13–17 and	\$6 (HK\$47)
	College students with ID and children	
	12 and under	Free
	First Tuesday of Each Month	Free



MUNI visitor discount \$2 off (HK\$16)  
(fast pass or transfer)

School Groups and Leaders, disabled  
Groups and Leaders, S.F. public /  
private K-12 students with ID

Members Free

### 3. Reason for Success

- ※ The architecture of de Young plays a significant role in its success. The environment is able to convey a sense of life enjoyment. It is spacious, with greening around and provides some tourist facilities. People are willing to cluster in the area. The impressive architecture also becomes a focus for museum promotion.
- ※ The museum is able to keep the momentum during its closure time from 2000-2005. They keep using another museum to organise exhibitions and take the opportunity to do a comprehensive conservation to all collections they have.

## **Observations**

### **1. Decision on Themes to be Adopted**

The selection of themes for new museums relates to a number of factors, some of which may be subjective. For example, some of the recently opened museums include Quai Branly Museum which focuses on non-Western arts is attributable to strong national collections as well as the president's advocacy; Tate's decision to build a modern art museum is an outcome of insufficient space in the Tate Gallery (now Tate Britain); Asian Art Museum was facilitated by an American millionaire's donation of a considerable number of good quality collections of Asian art to San Francisco.

### **2. Architecture is Important**

Referencing from Tate Modern, Quai Branly Museum and de Young, it is obvious that an impressive architectural design, together with a spacious surrounding with sufficient indoor area within the building, could be particularly conducive to the development of a museum, especially in terms of boosting attendance. The point is widely supported and advocated by experts visited throughout the trip. An open, comfortable and user-friendly environment could attract people to wander around even they may not be an arts lover. The tower of de Young illustrates an iconic feature which worth to take reference from.

### **3. Flexible Configuration of Space**

Centre Pompidou, Tate Modern, de Young and MoMA well demonstrate the advantages of an entity with flexible use of space. In view of the dynamic needs for installation and display of art works, the configuration of usable space has become critical to the development of a museum. In other words, a flexible configuration of space with movable walls or partitions that accomodate an ever-changing forms of artistic expression is important.

#### **4. Strategy**

The development and programming strategy as well as orientation of the museum would have a significant impact on cost, attendance and staffing etc. As pointed out by museum professionals throughout the trip, a museum mainly displays its own collections would attract tourists but a museum which keeps an influx of time-limited new exhibitions could attract repeat visitors, particularly from the local area. As stressed by Quai Branly, de Young and P.S.1, new elements are essential to keep a museum lively.

#### **5. Significance of Collections**

The proportion of a museum's operating expenditure to be designated to collections is an important museum management decision, as collections should not only be considered solely for display, but also an asset with different purposes such as cultural exchange.

#### **6. Funding**

Museum programming which includes the organization of good and attractive exhibitions is very expensive. In addition, it is a world trend that Governments no longer provide substantial funding for museums to purchase collections. Therefore, the role of the Development Office in each museum is becoming increasingly important. This office would have to solicit funding, sponsorships, commercial events and donations (of private collections/in kind sponsorships).

**Secretariat, Museums Advisory Group**

**August 2006**

**List of Meetings Held by MAG**

MAG Meetings

1 <sup>st</sup> meeting	24 April 2006
2 <sup>nd</sup> meeting	15 May 2006
Special meeting	13 June 2006
3 <sup>rd</sup> meeting	4 July 2006
Special meeting	3 August 2006
4 <sup>th</sup> meeting	8 August 2006
5 <sup>th</sup> meeting	1 September 2006
Special meeting	8 September 2006
6 <sup>th</sup> meeting	22 September 2006
7 <sup>th</sup> meeting	27 September 2006
8 <sup>th</sup> meeting	10 October 2006
9 <sup>th</sup> meeting	20 October 2006
10 <sup>th</sup> meeting	31 October 2006
11 <sup>th</sup> meeting	15 November 2006

**Hong Kong's Cultural Policy**

Hong Kong's cultural policy mainly refers to the policy on culture and the arts. Our policy objective is to create an environment which is conducive to the freedom of artistic expression and creation, and the wider participation in cultural activities. The policy comprises the following four major elements:

- respect freedom of creation and expression
- provide opportunities for participation
- encourage diversified and balanced development
- support environment and conditions (venues, funding, education and administration)

This policy is in line with the core values of Hong Kong as a free, diversified and open society.

2. The Culture and Heritage Commission ("CHC") Policy Recommendation Report released in March 2003 is the blueprint of Hong Kong's cultural policy. Our cultural policy is generally in line with the six principles laid down by the CHC. The six principles are –

- people-oriented
- pluralism
- freedom of expression and protection of intellectual property
- holistic approach
- partnership
- community-driven

The elaboration of these six principles by CHC are as follows –

- People-oriented

The development of culture cannot be separated from the needs of the people and the community at large. The society of Hong Kong inclines towards short-term interests and utilitarianism at the expense of spiritual pursuit. We need a social environment that pays due respect to culture and the arts.

- Pluralism

Hong Kong is an international city in southern China with the overwhelming majority of the population being Chinese. We must assimilate the best of Chinese and other cultures, and build a cultural environment that starts out from local culture, is grounded in Chinese culture but pluralistic and open to the world.

- Freedom of expression and protection of intellectual property

These are essential conditions for the lively development of a thriving cultural scene. Both the Government and the community must maintain and advance the achievement of Hong Kong in these areas.

- Holistic approach

The development of culture is closely related to many policy areas such as education, urban planning, tourism, creative industries, and trade and economic development. The Government should take cultural development as an important consideration in formulating policies.

- Partnership

The Government must allocate adequate resources on culture, encourage community participation and establish partnership among the Government, the business community and the cultural sector.

- Community-driven

In the long run, non-government organizations should take the lead in cultural development, and the Government should gradually reduce its direct involvement and management in cultural facilities and activities.

3. As a facilitator, the Government will neither impose an official definition on culture and the arts, nor influence the specific operation of artistic creation or contents of creativity. Instead, we are committed to upholding the freedom of cultural and artistic creation and expression, as well as providing an environment that keenly supports the development of culture and the arts. Therefore, we provide platforms and support to both “high culture” with traditional values as well as to those avant garde artistic expressions.

4. The long tradition of Chinese culture has offered a great treasure house for the sustained development of the artists local culture, as well as its pluralistic and international character where contributes to Hong Kong’s unique cultural position, ‘diversity with identity’. Hong Kong people’s cultural identity should start from acknowledging its local character as well as the deeply-rooted Chinese cultural traditions. It should also possess a global vision which is open and pluralistic. As a Special Administrative Region of China, Hong Kong should position itself as a metropolis in China which is most capable of bridging China and the world. It is on this premise that Hong Kong will be able to open up new opportunities on the cultural front and to achieve the aim of becoming an international cultural metropolis.

**Key Data of the Benchmarking Museums**

	<b>Centre Pompidou</b>	<b>New York <i>MoMA</i></b>	<b>Tate Modern</b>
1. Site area (m <sup>2</sup> )	20 000 m <sup>2</sup>	Not yet available	34 300 m <sup>2</sup>
2. Number of storeys	7 (excluding mezzanine floor)	6	7
3. Open space (m <sup>2</sup> )	10 000 m <sup>2</sup>	1 988 m <sup>2</sup>	Not yet available
4. Total gross floor area (m <sup>2</sup> )	103 305 m <sup>2</sup>	58 529 m <sup>2</sup>	34 500 m <sup>2</sup>
5. Total net exhibition space (m <sup>2</sup> )	22 000 m <sup>2</sup>	11 613 m <sup>2</sup>	9 127 m <sup>2</sup>
6. Total net temporary exhibition space (m <sup>2</sup> )	5 415 m <sup>2</sup>	Not yet available	1 300 m <sup>2</sup>
7. Total net back-of-house space (m <sup>2</sup> )	Not yet available	Not yet available	Over 2 850 m <sup>2</sup>
8. Library / archives (a) Net area (m <sup>2</sup> ) (b) Collections	(a) 10 390 m <sup>2</sup> (b) 371 000 books	Not yet available	Not yet available
9. Bookstore (a) Net area (m <sup>2</sup> ) (b) Themes of books	3 bookstores (on levels 0, 5 and 6)	1 bookshop with over 1 500 book titles	(see museum shops)
10. Restaurants (a) Net area (m <sup>2</sup> ) (b) Seats	restaurant: 1 350 m <sup>2</sup>	2 cafés and 1 restaurant	café 1: 240 seats  café 2: 200 seats  restaurant on level 7



	<b>Centre Pompidou</b>	<b>New York <i>MoMA</i></b>	<b>Tate Modern</b>
			2 kiosks at the river and main entrances
11. Total net area (m <sup>2</sup> ) of museum shops	3 000 items on sale at the Printemps Design Store (level 0)	1 design and book store in MOMA building (with over 2 000 book titles)  2 other design stores in New York City	shop 1: 500 m <sup>2</sup>  shop 2: 300 m <sup>2</sup>  shop 3: 150 m <sup>2</sup>
12. Auditoria and screening facilities (a) Net area (m <sup>2</sup> ) (b) Seats	cinema 1: 257 m <sup>2</sup> , 326 seats  cinema 2: 150 m <sup>2</sup> , 150 seats  auditorium 1: 440 seats  auditorium 2: 150 seats	theatre: 2  auditorium: 1 125 seats	one auditorium: 240 seats
13. Artists-in-residence studios (a) Net area (m <sup>2</sup> ) (b) Number of studios	N/A	N/A	all residences are at Tate St Ives