

**Consultative Committee on the
Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the
West Kowloon Cultural District**

Museums Advisory Group

**Comments and Views collected during the Consultation
Period from 17 May 2006 – 16 June 2006**

Purpose

This paper provides a full account of views received from various sources on the need for the museums facilities in the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) during the consultation period, which forms the basis of discussion on the “Comments and Views Concerning the Four Preferred Museums Themes” (Discussion Paper MAG/16/2006).

Advice Sought

2. Members are invited to note the views received on the need for museums facilities and other related issues in WKCD (paragraph 5).

Background

3. At the first Museums Advisory Group (MAG) meeting held on 24 April 2006, Members endorsed the proposed work plan of holding open consultative forums and focus group meeting to

gauge views on the museum facilities and art exhibition centre in WKCD in May 2006. Members also agreed to take into account overseas experience as far as practicable.

4. MAG held 10 meetings in the past two months, including two regular meetings, one focus group meeting, two open consultative forums, two briefings by overseas experts and three presentation hearings. The regular meetings aimed to form an overall framework to discuss the themes and the operation mode of MAG. The focus group meeting aimed to have a frank exchange of views with curators in the government and non-government sectors in Hong Kong, particularly on the interface between the proposed new facilities in WKCD and existing facilities. Open consultation forums aimed to gauge views from different sectors and the general public. Some organizations that had submitted written submissions during the consultation period from 17 May 2006 to 16 June 2006 had requested for a face-to-face presentations to MAG. Presentation hearings had been conducted to meet them. The list of regular meetings, focus group meeting, open consultative forums, briefings by overseas experts and presentation hearings held by MAG from April to June is at **Annex A**.

Comments and Views Received

5. Views received at the focus group meeting are at **Annex B**. More than 100 participants attended the two consultative forums. Summaries of discussion are at **Annex C**. Summaries of discussion for the briefings by overseas experts and

presentation hearings are **Annexes D and E**.

6. By the end of the consultation period, we received 43 written submissions. Among them, 28 are related to museum facilities, which are at **Annex F**. Moreover, we had sought advice from members of the Public Affairs Forum (an online forum to canvass views on major public issues, operated by HAB). Over 60 responses were received. A summary of their views is at **Annex G**.

7. As some of the views expressed are sensitive and the authors might not want to release their names and views to the public, Annexes D, E and the written submissions themselves are for internal reference only.

Secretariat, Museums Advisory Group

June 2006

List of Regular Meetings, Focus Group Meetings, Open Consultative Forums, Briefings by Overseas Experts and Presentation Hearings held by Museums Advisory Group (MAG) from April to June 2006

MAG Regular Meeting

1 st Meeting	Monday, 24 April 2006
2 nd Meeting	Monday, 15 May 2006

Focus Group Meeting

- Meeting with Curators in government and non-government sectors on 23 May 2006

Open Consultative Forums

- 1st session at Lecture Hall, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre, Kowloon Park, Kowloon on 29 May 2006
- 2nd session at Fringe Club Theatre, Ground Floor, Hong Kong Fringe Club, 2 Lower Albert Road on 30 May 2006

Briefings by Overseas Experts

- 1st briefing by Dr David Elliott, Director, Mori Art Museum in Tokyo on 11 May 2006
- 2nd briefing by Dr Michael Knight, Deputy Director for Strategic Programmes and Partnerships and Senior Curator of Chinese Art, Asian Art Museum in San Francisco on 9 June 2006

Presentation Hearings

- The Ink Society on the ink art museum theme on 6 June 2006
- The Hong Kong International Film Festival on the moving image museum theme, Hong Kong Federation of Design Associations on the design museum theme, Para-site Art Space and Hong Kong International Association of Art Critics on the modern and contemporary art museum theme on 13 June 2006
- Individual artists on the modern and contemporary art museum theme on 21 June 2006

**Summary of Views Received at the
Focus Group Meeting with Curators in Government
and Non-government Sector**

Date : 23 May 2006 (Tuesday)
Time : 2:30 pm – 4:30 pm
Venue : 41/F Revenue Tower, Wanchai
Attendees : see Appendix

Suggestions on Major Museum Facilities in WKCD

1. A participant took “Miraikan” in Japan as an example, and considered the definition of “museums” in the original proposal too narrow. The construction of facilities in the name of “museums” might not meet the development needs in WKCD, and it might limit the types of museums proposed in WKCD. As “culture” could have a very wide definition, it should cover a wider array of contents. If the facility concerned was entitled “centre” instead of “museum”, it might attract more visitors. Besides, he suggested that a gallery or centre themed on science should be set up in WKCD to balance with the proposed museum themes with a view to attract the younger generations and families.
2. Regarding the four proposed museum themes in WKCD, an attendee held the view that there might be conflicts among the museums in the acquisition of collections. For example, the collections in Modern Art Museum and the Ink Museum might overlap. Taking the Moving Image Museum as another example, she opined that the visual exhibits in the museum might overlap with those in the existing Film Archive. A widely encompassing Design Museum might also have its collections overlapped with the Modern Art Museum. Therefore, extra care should be exercised.

3. An attendee supported the establishment of a modern art or contemporary art museum in WKCD to showcase the art creations of Hong Kong in the last decade or so. He proposed provision of exhibition space in WKCD for alternate and separate display of different art forms. Another attendee stressed the importance of pluralism. As ink was part of the modern art, he agreed that ink and modern art museums might be put under one roof.
4. Another attendee believed that the four proposed museum themes in WKCD put too much emphasis on visual arts. He was worried that there might be too few alternatives for visitors. He observed that science museums were the most popular among all museums, followed by history and visual arts museums. Therefore, there should be diversity in the types and combinations of museums in WKCD. In addition to the museums of the four proposed themes, Science Museum, History Museum and Transport Museum could be set up. The latter could mark the transformation process of Hong Kong from a small fishing village into a financial centre. Other options were Sports Museum and Children Museum. Regarding the four proposed museum themes, he believed that “Modern Art”, “Ink” and “Design” had, to some extent, overlapped with the existing museum themes. It was suggested that “ink” and “design” be put under the theme “modern art” and this museum be expanded into an “Asian Modern Art Museum”. Besides, he supported the proposed setting up of a “Moving Image” museum.
5. Another attendee stated that museums could create unique identity through their theme, collections and architectural design, thereby attracting their own visitors. Therefore a museum displaying its collections in the mode of a “centre” would never measure up to other museums in terms of function and long-term development. It would diminish the identity of the museum and the incentives of sponsorship and donation.

6. Seeing that WKCD was by the seashore and the history and life of Hong Kong were closely related to sea transport, one attendee suggested setting up a maritime museum in WKCD.

Opinions on vision of the museum cluster and ancillary facilities in the West Kowloon Cultural District

7. Many attendees opined that museums must have their own collection. Therefore, museums in WKCD, regardless of their category, must consider whether they have adequate supply of collections with good quality.
8. An attendee pointed out the importance of long-term planning to the success of a museum. Curators should start acquisition early in the preparation period of the museum.
9. Another attendee remarked that the decision on the museum themes could be deferred so as to allow more room and flexibility to accommodate the future development of society and the arts sector. The attendee also proposed a large-scale museum in WKCD as an icon and landmark, as well as 5 to 6 smaller museums with appealing collection.
10. One attendee considered the “programme activities” of museums were more important than their themes. Citing Hong Kong Arts Centre and Macao Cultural Centre as examples, she proposed that there be 5 to 6 museums of no specific themes in WKCD and each museum should display its collection every 5 years. It would provide organic and flexible arrangements for art exhibition programmes, and contribute to the success of the museum. But another attendee expressed doubt about the attractiveness of themeless museums to the visitors, and pointed out that museums should have a clear position as an appeal to visitors.
11. One attendee regarded the success of a museum depended heavily on the significance and quality of its collection, as

well as ancillary measures in arts educational activities. Hence the financial factor (such as funding for acquisition of high quality collection) is of utmost importance. It would directly affect the decision on the themes of museums. Good quality management staff was also crucial to the operation of museums.

12. One attendee expressed reservations about the Public Private Partnership approach for the development of WKCD because there had not been any successful precedent case. Besides, the attendee suggested enactment of a museum ordinance and enhanced training for the management staff of museums so as to ensure the success of museums in WKCD.

Secretariat, Museums Advisory Group
May 2006

List of Attendees

Curators:

Mr. CHAN Ki-hung
Mr. CHAN Shing-wai
Mr. Sam CHOW
Mr. Albert LEE
Mr. Tom MING
Dr. Louis NG
Ms. Angela TONG
Mr. YIP Chi-kuen
Ms. WONG Fei
Mr. SIU King-chung
Ms. Phoebe MAN
Ms. Christina LAM
Mr. Mabel WONG
Ms. Valerie DORAN
Dr. Stephen DAVIES
Mr. Tobias BERGER

Members of Museums Advisory Group:

Mr. Victor LO (Convenor)
Dr. David CLARKE
Ms. Jane DEBEVOISE
Ms. Sabrina FUNG
Mr. Oscar HO
Ms. Claire HSU
Mr. Andrew LAM
Mr. Freeman LAU
Mr. Tim LI
Ms. LO Kai-yin
Mr. Wucius WONG
Dr. Philip WU
Mr. YEUNG Chun-tong
Mr. YIM Shui-yim

Mr. Rocco YIM

Government Officials:

Ms. Esther LEUNG

Deputy Secretary (Home Affairs)³, Home Affairs Bureau

Mr. Vincent FUNG

Principal Assistant Secretary (Home Affairs) West Kowloon
Cultural District)¹, Home Affairs Bureau

Mr. Peter KWOK

Principal Assistant Secretary (Home Affairs) (Culture)², Home
Affairs Bureau

Mr. K.C. HO

Chief Curator (Heritage Museum Services), Leisure and Cultural
Services Department

**Summary of Views Received at
Two Open Consultative Forums**

(a) 1st Consultative Forum

Date	:	29 May 2006 (Monday)
Time	:	5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m.
Venue	:	Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre, Kowloon Park, Hoiphong Road, Tsimshatsui, Kowloon
No. of Participants	:	about 50

Welcoming Remarks

1. The convenor of the Museums Advisory Group (MAG) welcomed the participants and hoped that the public could give views on the museum facilities in the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) through the consultative forums.
2. A representative from the Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) briefed the participants on the background leading to the formation of MAG and the nature of its work. Other Members of the Advisory Group were invited to sit on stage to gauge the views of the participants.

Views of the Participants

3. A participant commented that each of the four themes of the museums proposed in the previous Invitation for Proposals (IFP) for WKCD had its own defects and she could not render them full support. She further suggested that consideration should be given to build a Hong Kong branch museum of the Palace Museum in WKCD so that the collections of the Palace Museum could be borrowed for exhibition in Hong Kong, with a view to further showcasing the unique characteristic of Hong Kong as a converging place of Chinese and Western cultures. She hoped that with the

establishment of the branch museum, the public could have access to appreciate the heritage treasures. This would in turn enhance the cultural profile of Hong Kong in the world and bring in more tourists.

4. A participant opined that museums of a particular place should epitomize its cultural identity through the essence of its local culture. The functions of the museums should resemble those of ancestral halls in the old days or churches. He supported that museums of different themes should be built in WKCD to demonstrate unique identities and characteristics of various local community. This would help attract not only local people but also a large number of tourists. Lastly, the participant agreed that a museum had to take a long time to develop and could not operate by relying on collections borrowed from elsewhere or operating as a branch of some other museums, as this would not be conducive to upgrading the cultural profile of the museum.
5. A participant also queried the content of IFP. He opined that if the Museum of Modern Art only covered modern installation arts, the works of local artists would be excluded. He further pointed out that there should be an overall planning for the WKCD development and that more opportunities should be provided for the local artists. He therefore suggested that art galleries with various themes should be established to promote the art works of Hong Kong artists and to allow these art works to be traded freely so as to provide the means for the artists to achieve self-support. Furthermore, he held that at present only one “art biennial exhibition” was held in Hong Kong was insufficient. In addition, he reckoned that the WKCD development should not be aimed solely at promoting tourism, and the Government should set enhancing Hong Kong’s culture as the ultimate goal. Lastly, the participant suggested that the proceeds generated from the property project in WKCD could be used for the construction of an independent academy of arts.

6. A participant put forward the following views:
 - 6.1 It was hoped that more background information could be provided for a better understanding of the characteristics and strengths of the existing museums;
 - 6.2 It was hoped that the WKCD would strike a good balance between international dimension and local arts; and
 - 6.3 The development of the WKCD should be organic in order to ensure a mutually beneficial and complementary relationship among the different types of facilities.
7. A participant suggested that a “Chinese Book City” could be built in the WKCD to cluster books published in Chinese over the world together and to exhibit a selection of books and related relics from Hong Kong, Macau, Taiwan and the Mainland China, with a view to demonstrating the essence of the Greater China culture.
8. A participant suggested that museums of interesting themes and local characteristics should be built in WKCD in order to attract the public. She opined that museums should function as a promoter of arts for all and the interest of children should be taken care of. She therefore considered that “ink art” might not be able to arouse the interest of young people. Besides, she suggested that galleries of famous local artists, such as Anita Mui, Leslie Cheung and Roman Tam, should be built.
9. A Member told the participants that the themes of the museums had not yet been finalized by MAG. The public might take this opportunity to express their views and actively participate in the discussion.
10. A participant opined that the existing museums were ineffective in attracting visitors. Quite a number of people just regarded the museums as leisure venues. She therefore doubted if it was necessary to construct the

museums of the four themes in WKCD. Besides, the participant agreed that it was easier for thematic museums to attract the public. Different study classes should be organized by the future museums in WKCD to enhance the community life of the public.

11. Another participant disagreed with the views of the previous participant. She opined that museums should possess cultural sensitivity. Visitors should not treat museums as leisure venues. She hoped that the existing and future museums could provide more visit guides so as to allow visitors understand the feature of the museum exhibits more easily.
12. A participant agreed that the themes of the museums in WKCD should be identified first before their design or the related issues were put forward for discussion. The remarkably different themes of the museums might engender different requirements in terms of exterior design and operational mode. He supported the Museum of Moving Image mentioned in IFP and hoped that it would complement the Hong Kong Film Archive given the inadequacy of facilities. He also suggested that the establishment of a Museum of Transport could be considered. Besides, he disagreed with the idea of using art exhibition centre to replace the museums as the former could not replace the latter's unique roles and specialties. Lastly, he considered that the museums would encounter operational difficulties and the Government should seek different resources, such as making use of the revenues from the tourism industry to support the financial needs of the museums so as to maintain the long-term development of the museums.
13. A participant put forward the following suggestions:
 - 13.1 To publish the roadmap and method of consultation of the WKCD project;

- 13.2 To explore the relationship between the new museums to be built in WKCD and the existing museums;
- 13.3 To prevent the choice of the themes of the museums in WKCD to be affected by any conflicts of interest among different sectors;
- 13.4 To deliberate on how the museums in WKCD could be positioned as a “social space”;
- 13.5 To consider the new function of museums in today’s society, for an instance, to take on an educational role instead of collecting exhibits; and
- 13.6 To inform the public in detail how they could take part in the discussion on WKCD effectively.
14. Another participant proposed to set up a museum of miniatures in WKCD. She held that miniatures with their details and aesthetic perception were a fine display of handicraft and art. Making miniatures of the special events and features of the society could help recapture scenes of the good old days.
15. Another participant had the following views on the existing museums and the future ones in WKCD:
 - 15.1 The resources of Hong Kong had currently focused on performing arts and visual arts had been given little attention;
 - 15.2 In developing any museums in WKCD, consideration should be given to the overall positioning of different museums in the territory;
 - 15.3 Galleries specifically designed for Hong Kong artists should be built in WKCD;

- 15.4 A “Greater China” museum and an international art exhibition gallery should be built in WKCD; and
- 15.5 The number of galleries in WKCD should not be too many so that some land could be released for property development. The proceeds from which could be used to support the arts and cultural development.
16. A participant suggested that an interactive museum of technology and science be built in WKCD to support life-wide learning and promote children’s participation. Another participant suggested that an interactive Toy Museum should be set up in WKCD so that parents and their children could have access to culture together.
17. Another participant opined that the four original themes mentioned in IFP had their own merits. He was of the view that in the past, Hong Kong had many renowned film companies with remarkable achievements, which had produced a lot of outstanding films and nurtured a wealth of talent for the film industry. He therefore supported that a Museum of Moving Image should be set up in WKCD. Lastly, he commented that the Government should take steps to attract more members of the public to visit the museums.
18. Two participants also agreed that more galleries of small and medium scale should be built to give full play to Hong Kong’s local characteristics. Besides, he commented that there was a mismatch in the existing museums in terms of locality. The location of some museums, like the Hong Kong Film Archive which was located at Quarry Bay and the Hong Kong Museum of Coastal Defence at Shau Kei Wan, was the reason for their failure to attract more visitors. One of the participants suggested all the existing museums be relocated to WKCD as far as possible. With WKCD as the focal point of museums, it would be convenient for visitors to visit the various museums at one go. Lastly, regarding the new museums to be built, if there was no means to enhance the

attractiveness of the museums with their architectural features, emphasis should be put on the substance of the museums.

19. A participant suggested MAG to invite some academics to conduct a forward-looking study with a view to formulating a WKCD policy from an objective and scientific perspective. Another participant suggested that comprehensive and diversified museums should be built for WKCD to stimulate the public's interest in learning. He hoped that museums could become part of the life of Hong Kong people and reflect the characteristics of Hong Kong life.
20. A participant hoped that WKCD could provide more room for the public to express their personal feeling.
21. The Convenor thanked the participants for attending the consultative forum to give their views. He said that it would take a long time if Hong Kong had to develop arts and culture as part of its infrastructure. He hoped that the public would make use of this opportunity and continue to give their views.

(b) 2nd Consultative Forum

Date : 30 May 2006 (Tuesday)
Time : 5:00 p.m. - 7:00 p.m.
Venue : Hong Kong Fringe Club,
2 Lower Albert Road, Central,
Hong Kong
No. of Participants : about 50

Welcoming Remarks

1. The Convenor of the Museums Advisory Group (MAG) welcomed all the participants to the consultative forum and briefly explained the purpose of this forum was to solicit public views on the museum facilities in the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD). MAG hoped that the museum themes to be selected would cater for the future needs of the Hong Kong society. The Convenor emphasized that MAG did not have any pre-set plans for this consultation but aimed to collect different opinions from the public. Nevertheless, MAG also hoped that the best museums instead of just numerous museums would be built in the future WKCD.
2. A representative of the Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) outlined the background of the establishment and work nature of MAG. Other members of MAG were invited to sit on stage to gauge views of the participants.

Views of the Participants

3. A participant said that it was difficult for the emerging local artists to find suitable venues for holding exhibitions. He suggested that special venues should be reserved for the emerging artists in WKCD. Moreover, the participant was of the view that with the advanced technology in today's society, the Internet had a profound impact on our lives. Therefore, he proposed setting up a website for WKCD to introduce the works of local artists to the world.
4. A participant considered that while high standard museums were expected to be built in WKCD, MAG and the public should first define the term "high standard" and clearly identify the future target audiences of WKCD, as this would be conducive to the planning development of WKCD. The Convenor pointed out that "high standard" meant the

attainment of the highest level of standard in a particular arts field.

5. A participant hoped that the HAB would make the best use of the useful opinions collected during previous WKCD consultative forums. Moreover, he believed that the financial matters would play a pivotal role in deciding on the museum themes. He therefore suggested that the Financial Matters Advisory Group should participate in the WKCD discussions as early as possible.
6. Another participant supported the construction of the original Museum of “Design” proposed in IFP. She hoped that, by doing so, the future young people of Hong Kong would have more opportunities.
7. A participant, however, considered four museums of different themes in WKCD were unnecessary. He proposed that museums of different levels under one broad theme might be an option to draw a clearer line between different sub-themes. Besides, the participant stressed that clear classification was essential in the heritage and streaming of arts and therefore emerging artists would require more room for displaying their exhibits. Finally, in view of the increasing development of modern arts scene in the Mainland, the participant considered that Hong Kong had to double its efforts in the development of arts, and therefore arts education should be particularly strengthened.
8. A participant opined that regarding the themes of the four museums proposed in WKCD, too much emphasis had been put on visual arts. He was worried that there might be too few alternatives for visitors in future. He observed that science museums were the most popular among all museums, followed by history museums and then visual arts museums. Therefore, there should be more diversity in terms of disciplines and combinations for the museums in WKCD. Besides, the participant considered that the museum themes should be closely related to the local life.

He suggested using the method of parallel comparison in choosing the museums best suited for Hong Kong people. In addition, the participant commented that if the collections of the museums would be of world-class standard, Hong Kong should first consider whether it had the financial resources to acquire world-class collections, and what world-class exhibits Hong Kong itself had for our museums. As to the positioning of the museums, the participant believed that the identity of the museums in WKCD as museums of world-class or Asian standard must be clearly stated. Regarding the contents of the museums, he opined that if “ink art” were taken out of “Modern Art”, the latter’s collection might be incomplete somehow. Lastly, the participant suggested introducing legislation on museums to ensure that the museums could be developed under a well-established system.

9. Another participant agreed that it was certainly a tremendous challenge for MAG to facilitate the development of museums in WKCD. However, the museums would become a precious jewel of the District as long as the most representative and unique design was adopted. He supported that specific museum themes were essential to highlight the architectural features of the museums and suggested that an international competition could be held for selecting the best architectural design. Finally, he hoped that the Government would not merely consider the fiscal factor in deciding the museum themes.
10. A participant remarked that the existing museums in Hong Kong held a lot of collections but there was limited exhibition space. He therefore supported that a museum of ink should be established in WKCD for displaying existing ink painting and calligraphy collections. He further noted that a museum of photography should be considered under the WKCD project for displaying precious works of photography in Hong Kong.

11. Another participant supported the idea of having a museum cluster comprising, inter alia, a Museum of Modern Art and a Museum of History in WKCD. She further suggested that a Hong Kong branch of the Palace Museum in WKCD should be taken into consideration. Besides, she held that the themes of existing museums should be reconsidered for transfer to future museums in WKCD.
12. A participant opined that MAG should provide further rationale for the proposition of the four museums of specific themes as defined in IFP. Regarding the proposal to have separate museums for modern art and ink art, he held that these two forms of art were so closely related that it was not easy for classification. However, he remarked that the setting up of a museum of ink merited serious consideration because the conditions of Hong Kong had been quite favourable for its establishment.
13. Another participant commented that Hong Kong should adopt an open approach for performing arts and support more activities of street performance.
14. A participant supported the establishment of an Art Centre incorporating popular art and various themes to demonstrate the unique local popular culture in Hong Kong.
15. Another participant suggested more relevant educational activities, such as guided tours in museums and educational programmes jointly organized with primary/secondary schools and universities be conducted in WKCD, with a view to effectively enhancing the cultural attainment of members of the public. She also suggested that interfacing activities might be organized among the museums of visual arts, moving image and design in WKCD to achieve a better crossover effect.
16. A participant opined that visual arts covered a wide spectrum of topics. She suggested that a contemporary art gallery, which kept up with the international trends in arts,

and a Hong Kong art gallery, which introduced local modern arts in a comprehensive and well-organized manner, should be established in WKCD. The former would focus on how the foreign contemporary arts were introduced into the local community, while the latter would focus on promoting local arts, such as ink art, design or art of image.

17. Another participant took the view that the four themes mentioned in the proposal were restrictive. He suggested a New Media Art Museum be built in WKCD incorporating modern visual arts, moving image and performing arts. This would not only provide opportunities for young people to participate and express themselves in arts activities, but also bring relevant benefits to tourism and education sectors.
18. A participant agreed that museum themes had to be identified first before building a world-class museum in WKCD. He supported that the best architectural design for the museum should be selected through a competition. In addition, he noted that recent trends of overseas museums were to spend a huge amount of money for collecting prestigious works of art. He opined that if the Government was determined to proceed with the WKCD project, it should start to acquire world-class exhibits as soon as possible.
19. Another participant opined that the WKCD project was only the starting point for the exploration of Hong Kong culture. Regarding the four museum themes mentioned in IFP, he held that it was necessary for the Government to provide justifications based on a more comprehensive study to facilitate in-depth public discussions.
20. A participant who spoke earlier supplemented that the Government might consider designing a plan based on the “Greater Hong Kong” concept by conducting a multi-disciplinary study of the existing and future museums throughout Hong Kong in order to map out a territory-wide cultural plan. The cluster of museums built according to

such a plan would be larger in scale and would be more effective than the building of several museums in WKCD.

21. A participant suggested that the young generation should be taken as the main target audience group in future when planning the WKCD facilities.
22. A participant opined that Design was a very unique form of arts and was different from visual arts. Thus, the functions of the Museum of Design should not be limited to collecting and displaying exhibits. It should also demonstrate the process of social change. This would be conducive to the development of our academic and industrial sectors.
23. In response to the questions raised by the above participants, the Convenor made the following points:
 - 23.1 Convenors of different groups would strive to work together with the Chief Secretary for Administration for promoting the WKCD project;
 - 23.2 Convenors would lead their groups to undertake essential tasks, such as conducting discussions, studies and data research, and advise the Government after deliberation;
 - 23.3 Group members possessed professional knowledge and interest in art, and would declare their interests before participating in any discussions;
 - 23.4 MAG would definitely consider the interface between the proposed museums in WKCD and the existing museums;
 - 23.5 MAG would seek to exchange views with the world-class experts and solicit their comments on the museum project.
24. Another group member added that:
 - 24.1 Group members were deeply concerned about what the Government and the community would do in preparation for

the establishment of WKCD in the next 10 years before the completion of the project.

- 24.2 He personally took the view that nurturing sufficient size of audience and professional artists as well as promoting arts education were vital tasks in preparing for the establishment of WKCD.
- 24.3 He also agreed that more studies and discussions on the WKCD facilities should be conducted.
25. Another group member also agreed that discussions on the WKCD facilities should be held in the context of integrated planning.

**Secretariat, Museums Advisory Group
May 2006**

**Summary of Discussion
of Briefings by Overseas Experts from May to June 2006
(for internal reference only)**

Summary of Discussion of the Presentation Hearings
(for internal reference only)

**List of Written Submissions Received
on the West Kowloon Cultural District
during the Consultative Period
from 17 May 2006 to 16 June 2006**

The Secretariat received 43 written submissions. Among them, 28 were related to museum facilities. Main points of these written submissions are summarized below.

- (a) An Asian Art Centre covering both modern and contemporary art should be built in WKCD to maximize flexibility;
- (b) Local art should be supported. Consideration should be given to set up an independent academy of art in WKCD;
- (c) An ink art museum should be built in WKCD. It would not only help promote Chinese art including calligraphy, but also counter balance the current situation of too much focus on the development of western art;
- (d) Design, moving image, media art, popular culture and Cantonese opera could be integrated into a “Centre”. It would help the development of creative industries;
- (e) There were suggestions on other museum themes in WKCD such as maritime transport, pirates on the South China Sea, city planning and transportation;
- (f) As each museum had its own identity, an integrated “Centre” covering four preferred museum themes might not be able to attract donation and visitors;

- (g) Besides one or two giant museum(s), a cluster of small and medium-sized museums should be set up in WKCD to enhance variety;
- (h) Promotion of arts in grass roots through cooperation with district art bodies should be strengthened;
- (i) Cooperation with the Mainland authorities in the art and culture field should be enhanced;
- (j) A museum law would be necessary to ensure better governance on museums in WKCD; and
- (k) There was a suggestion to establish a Collection Development Authority (收藏發展局) to promote the collection culture in Hong Kong.

2. The written submissions are at Appendixes I to XXVII. As the authors might not want to disclose his/her names and views to the public, the content of these written submissions are for internal reference only.

**Secretariat, Museums Advisory Group
June 2006**

**Summary of Views Received from the
Public Affairs Forum
Regarding the Museum Facilities in the
West Kowloon Cultural District**

Forum members posted a total of 68 messages. Among them, 30 messages are related to museum facilities. Their comments were summarized below.

Proposed museums facilities in the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD)

1. Members generally preferred one big, metropolitan-type museum with different themes to several separate museums with clear identity. Many members considered that a large museum would be more flexible in adjusting the sizes and types of exhibitions base on factors like the availability of collections, popularity, art trends, etc. A member considered that museums with specific themes would hinder creativity.
2. A few members, however, preferred to have several separate museums with clear identity to take advantages of individual characteristics and lower set up and maintenance costs.
3. A few members opined that an arts centre / exhibition hall would be more appropriate than a museum. One member, however, added that there should be a balance between static museums and dynamic art centres.
4. A member regarded the concept of museum as traditional. He proposed a flexible and versatile venue, called the “Hong Kong Centre”, which could change, modify, adapt, evolve, suit and fit into the ever changing social structure, culture, taste and trend of Hong Kong. The member suggested that the Hong Kong Centre could make use of virtual reality effects

to re-create mummies from the pyramid, Mona Lisa of Da Vinci or tomb warriors from the Chin Dynasty for viewing by our next generation.

5. Most members believed that the museums should aim to attract visitors from Hong Kong and tourists from all over the world.
6. Some members supported the four “preferred museum themes” as proposed in the Invitations for Proposals for the WKCD development. One member, however, hoped to focus on one theme instead of having four scattered themes.
7. A member opined that the Museum of Moving Image would help support Hong Kong’s film industry. However, another member considered it unnecessary as we had already had a Hong Kong Film Archive.
8. Some members raised doubt about the attractiveness of the four proposed museums, especially the Museum of Modern Arts and the Museum of Ink. They believed that it was not worth the effort to build the museums due to lack of uniqueness and limit in exhibits. Instead, they suggested other museum themes, such as the museums of Chinese, dinosaur and childhood, for consideration.
9. Some members preferred to feature themes unique to Hong Kong, for examples, the history of Hong Kong, the Merge of Oriental and Western Culture, and Cantonese opera.
10. A member suggested establishing a Hong Kong Popular Music Museum in WKCD to attract tourists and to foster creativity in the local entertainment business. Citing the Motown Museum in Detroit as an example; the member further proposed a mini concert hall to complement the music museum.
11. A few members pointed out that the tradition of excellence, the popularity of themes, the uniqueness, and the affluence

and quality of exhibits were major considerations in deciding museum themes.

12. A few members were concerned that Hong Kong did not have enough arts talents and artworks in view of its short history in arts and culture.
13. A few members suggested replacing some of the existing museums with the proposed ones in WKCD or simply re-locating existing museums to WKCD for centralized management.
14. A member mentioned that there was no special need to establish new museums in WKCD as there were already a lot of museums in Hong Kong. The member considered it more important to strengthen the existing museums, especially those located in Tsimshatsui East.
15. Some members opined that the architecture of the museums should be innovative which could be another landmark of Hong Kong. A member remarked that the museum should be the focal point of civic pride.
16. Observing that the number of visits to museums was low, a member considered that it was not the right time to discuss this proposal.
17. A member proposed to extend the opening hours of the museums to increase people-flow.
18. Some members suggested strengthening the education of arts and culture at school along side the development of the WKCD. A member warned that unless the core arts and cultural facilities in WKCD could be well utilized, we would end up building a big white elephant. In order to promote the interest in performing arts, he supported further emphasizing arts in the education system.
19. A member proposed the Government to increase financial

support to local performing arts groups. Another member urged the Government to sponsor the WKCD project and invest in the long run.

20. A few members proposed to form a separate body with broad representation to monitor and manage the WKCD. Another member suggested employing companies with relevant overseas experience to operate and manage the WKCD.
21. A member reminded that shopping and dining places should not be omitted when planning the WKCD.
22. A member had reservation on the way this topic was discussed in the Forum. He believed that insufficient information was given regarding the purpose, functional utility, capital and recurrent costs of the proposed facilities and alternative usage of the WKCD site. Another member, on the contrary, praised that this consultation was a good civic exercise to the general public.
23. A member believed that deeper understanding of the needs of the public was required before coming to a decision in the WKCD project. Yet there were a few others who believed that the project should be launched as soon as possible.

Home Affairs Bureau
June 2006