

立法會
Legislative Council

Paper No. WKCD-519

Ref: CB1/HS/2/04

Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development

**Summary of views of various organizations and individuals on
"Key aspects of the proposed legislation for establishing a statutory body to
take forward the West Kowloon Cultural District project"**

* * * * *

Contents

Section		Page
I	Purposes and objects, powers and functions of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority	1 - 5
II	Composition of the board of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority	6 - 15
III	Financial arrangements	16 - 20
IV	Land matters	21 - 24
V	Public accountability	25 - 27
VI	Consultation	28
VII	Vision of the West Kowloon Cultural District project, cultural policy	29 - 30
VIII	Cultural software	31 - 33
IX	Arts and cultural facilities	34- 37
X	General and other comments	38 - 42

I. Purposes and objects, powers and functions of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

- Local Action
Habitus
Community Concern
People's Foundation
基層發展中心
梁俊彥 and 10 other
members of the public*
- The West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) should plan and manage arts and cultural facilities in a democratic way. In planning the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD), the Government should capitalize on the opportunity to implement a bottom-up participatory approach.
 - WKCD will be an opportunity to enhance the living quality of grass-roots citizens. It should accommodate both refined and popular arts and culture. Apart from meeting the basic needs of grass-roots citizens, WKCDA should also be responsible for promoting popular arts and culture. Arts and culture is not welfare, it is an important indicator to measure the living quality of the citizens.
- The Lion Rock Institute*
- The organization queries whether the powers of WKCDA are too great.
- New Forum*
- It is not absolutely necessary for WKCDA to plan and conduct consultations on infrastructure, the waterfront promenade, parks and developments near the terminal of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link. Those facilities can be planned and developed by the Government promptly. The 36% of Gross Floor Area in WKCD for arts and cultural facilities should be planned by WKCDA.
- Momentum 107*
- Arts and cultural development should be community-led rather than Government-led. WKCDA will be a large bureaucracy which will limit innovative arts and cultural development.
 - WKCDA will have overlapping functions with existing Government departments like the Leisure and Cultural Services Department. They cannot operate in synergy.
- Hong Kong Dance Company*
- The organization expresses support for establishing WKCDA, the duties of which should emphasize audience building and attracting citizens to participate in WKCD activities. The prime mission during the planning stage is to formulate the master plan for WKCD for approval by the Town Planning Board.

I. Purposes and objects, powers and functions of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

- Hong Kong Repertory Theatre* • The organization expresses support for establishing WKCD as soon as possible. The prime mission during the planning stage is to formulate the master plan for WKCD for approval by the Town Planning Board.
- Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.* • The word "Authority" is not suitable in a name intended to connote artistic excellence and creativity.
- Civic Party*
- WKCD's policy perspectives should be macro and strategic, and should meet the objectives and needs of various parties.
 - Humanistic vision, cultural diversity and community-led orientation should be WKCD's basic principles in cultural development.
 - WKCD should affirm that as culture is a right of every person, cultural policies and industries involve all citizens. Seamless operation of WKCD can serve as a good example in the democratization of public policy formulation.
- The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers* • The Government should expedite the implementation of the project. The planning of basic facilities such as the waterfront promenade and property developments near the terminal of the planned Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link should not be vested with WKCD. They should be planned and implemented by the Government.
- Mr Oscar HO, Department of Cultural and Religious Studies, The Chinese University of Hong Kong*
- The powers and duties of WKCD should be clearly defined to ensure that arts and cultural activities will not be subject to ultra vires interference by those in the top tier.
 - Arts and cultural development needs to be accommodative, respectful to creativity and perseverant to professional operations. WKCD must put this into effect because it plays a decisive role in the success or otherwise of WKCD.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd.* • WKCD will shoulder very important responsibilities in achieving the objectives of WKCD under the Government's proposed legislation. WKCD should be conferred on the necessary powers to carry out its functions.

I. Purposes and objects, powers and functions of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

- Hong Kong Christian Institute* • WKCDA should have a responsibility to participate in preserving community culture with local characters and maintain Hong Kong's cultural vibrancy.
- Museum of Site, Ltd.* • The terms of reference of WKCDA should not confine to matters pertaining to Hong Kong. WKCDA should be entitled to initiate, manage and operate cultural and profit-making projects outside Hong Kong.
- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District* • The organization disagrees that WKCDA should prepare the master plan for the whole (arts, cultural, commercial and entertainment, including residential, hotel and offices) district in the South West Kowloon Outline Zoning Plan.
- The organization agrees to the following objects proposed for WKCDA --
- (a) To design and develop an integrated arts, culture and entertainment venue complex (excluding the office, residential and hotel sites which will be disposed under the normal land sale mechanism) in West Kowloon;
 - (b) To manage the venue complex to provide arts, cultural, entertainment and related services meeting the needs for the local community, the residents of the Pearl River Delta and visitors from overseas;
 - (c) To dedicate funding to foster the development of related cultural and creative industries and activities in the Mainland and Hong Kong; and
 - (d) To promote the WKCD facilities and services among the local and regional community, and to overseas visitors.
- Dr CHAN Yan-chong, Associate Professor, Department of Management Sciences, Faculty of Business, City University of Hong Kong* • WKCDA should only be responsible for construction of arts and cultural facilities and thereafter the facilities should be financially self-sustaining.
- The Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) should continue its work on the allocation of funding for arts groups.
- Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors* • It is necessary to set up a statutory body to manage the arts and cultural district. The legislation should cover aspects such as functions, powers, composition of the Board, appointment of the Chief Executive Officer,

I. Purposes and objects, powers and functions of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

financial arrangement, land grant, report, audit and other accountability requirements in a similar manner as the Airport Authority Ordinance and the Urban Renewal Authority Ordinance.

- WKCDA would need to run a substantial portfolio of property business, in order to earn sufficient income to subsidize the operating deficits of cultural venues. There will be a situation that the property business accounts for a substantial portion of WKCDA's normal business.

Hong Kong Curators Association • There should be clear delineation of powers and responsibilities between WKCDA, the M+ governing body and other relevant bodies.

Chung Ying Theatre Company • The objects and purposes of WKCDA under the current proposal have omitted audience building and nurturing of artists.

- Hong Kong is suffering poverty in arts and culture. People in some remote areas lack the opportunities to access arts and cultural activities. There is a strong need to raise the quality of people's cultural life, not just for the middle class but the entire population. WKCDA should earmark part of its funding to hold activities in new towns and remote areas.
- The name of WKCDA should not include "West Kowloon" because it should service the whole city.

The People's Panel on West Kowloon • The primary task of statutory body should be the development of a people-oriented cultural metropolis through WKCD. The statutory body should be accountable to the community in its implementation of a comprehensive cultural development plan; it must not become a huge property and venue management company.

- The proposed object of "to promote and provide for the appreciation of and participation in culture and the arts and enrich the cultural life and meeting the needs of the local community" (paragraph 5(c) in Paper No. WKCD-451) should be amended to "to promote and provide for the appreciation of and participation in culture and the arts, to provide various complementary facilities, to actively cultivate the creativity among local social groups and communities, to develop cultural

I. Purposes and objects, powers and functions of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

diversity and to explore and develop the potential of the community in culture and the arts, so as to enrich the cultural life of Hong Kong people".

- The proposed object of "to strengthen Hong Kong's position as a premier tourist destination" should be amended to "to conserve and nurture the local peculiar cultural environment and to promote the identification with indigenous culture through effective measures with a view to strengthening Hong Kong's position as a premier tourist destination".

The Ink Society Ltd

- A provision should be incorporated in the proposed legislation requiring WKCDA to use a small of portion of its annual funding for education and community outreach purposes.

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

- Professional Commons* • The composition of WKCDA should follow the "stakeholder-led" principle whereby its membership should be diversified and should comprise not only appointees of the Government but also those who are chosen by concern groups so as to strike a prudent balance among all stakeholders.
- Local Action
Habitus
Community Concern
Cultural
People's Democracy
Foundation
基層發展中心
梁俊彥 and 10 other
members of the public* • Except for the three representatives of the policy bureaux, members of WKCDA should be nominated from within the respective arts and cultural sectors, the Legislative Council (LegCo) and the District Councils.
- New Forum* • The identity, background and number of members of the board of WKCDA should not be specified in the legislation so as to maintain flexibility in appointment by the Chief Executive. Nevertheless, the Government should state the principles for appointment when introducing the legislation. To enhance society's recognition of the board, its members should include representatives of the community (e.g. LegCo and District Council members), representatives of relevant statutory bodies (e.g. Arts Development Council, Town Planning Board), persons of relevant sectors (e.g. arts and cultural sectors, education sector) and persons with management and professional background (e.g. real estates, finance and legal professions).
- Hong Kong Dance
Company
Hong Kong Repertory
Theatre* • The organizations express support for the membership composition of the board of WKCDA as currently proposed by the Government. Various dedicated committees can be set up under the board to involve more professionals to participate in the planning for and operation of WKCD.
- Hong Kong Arts Festival
Society Ltd.* • Cultural and management experts who are knowledgeable in operations of arts facilities as well as programmes and exhibitions should be present in the board of WKCDA at all times.

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

Civic Party

- The composition of the board of WKCDA should be balanced.
- Members of the board of WKCDA should have sufficient expertise in arts and culture, and should uphold moral standards and social responsibilities.
- The board of WKCDA should consist of 20 members including a Chairman, comprising --
 - (a) a Chief Executive Officer employed by the board through an appropriate mechanism;
 - (b) three public officers appointed by the Chief Executive;
 - (c) three persons representing business experiences and view points, recommended by the community and appointed by the Chief Executive;
 - (d) three persons representing community experiences and view points, recommended by the community and appointed by the Chief Executive; and
 - (e) 10 other persons representing the arts and cultural sectors and relevant professions elected through a mechanism, with five possessing ample knowledge in arts and culture and relevant working experience in arts and culture, and the other five possessing relevant expertise and experience in areas other than arts and culture.
- Should use the existing mechanism to establish a consolidated electoral register so as to clearly define the electors. The consolidated electoral register includes the following two sources of electors --
 - (a) electors of the arts and cultural sectors, that is, all eligible registered electors of HKADC will be electors; and
 - (b) electors of the professions, that is, all eligible registered electors in elections of the professions for forming the Election Committee for electing the Chief Executive of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region will be electors.
- Through a recognized mechanism, the arts and cultural sectors and the professional sectors will be responsible for nominating representatives of their respective sectors.
- Through a recognized mechanism, the five representatives of the arts and cultural sectors and the five representatives of the professional sectors will be elected at the same time by all electors in the consolidated electoral register using the "one person,

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

one vote" mode.

- The Chairman should be elected by all members from among themselves and appointed by the Chief Executive.
- On the basis of the above membership composition, the Civic Party will agree that a one-off upfront endowment be provided to WKCDA for carrying out long-term cultural work.

*The Hong Kong
Institution of Engineers*

- To avoid unnecessary politicization, the organization opposes the proposal of having some WKCDA board members from a few limited cultural sectors who are to be elected by voting in their sectors.
- Inputs from professional engineers with their engineering and construction expertise would be crucial to the success of the development projects as well as on the management of the facilities in WKCD.

*Mr Oscar HO,
Department of Cultural
and Religious Studies,
The Chinese University
of Hong Kong*

- In appointing members to various bodies, apart from having relevant expertise, the Government often appoints those having a good relationship with the Government, and a small number of non-apologists of the establishment for political balance and window dressing purposes; even if their expertise or recognition in the relevant sector is questionable. The result is that professional quality is being compromised.
- Under a highly politicized environment, Government officials are concerned with smooth operation. Political parties only demand their own presence. Professional quality and planning with a long-term vision are being compromised. WKCD is a highly professional project. If the same mentality is adopted in establishing WKCDA, the result will be catastrophic.
- However, it will be an even bigger mistake if it is thought that election should replace appointment of WKCDA board members. Election does not amount to democracy. If it is impossible to define the electors in a reasonable and fair manner, it is pointless to talk about democracy.
- Apart from professionals from the arts and cultural sectors, WKCDA also needs those from sectors like planning, finance, business, etc. How many elections will be required to avoid having partial democracy? Or is it that only the arts and cultural sectors will be granted a privilege in "democracy".

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

- There seems to be a deadlock. On the one hand, there is distrust in the Government's appointment mechanism. On the other hand, the so-called democratic election of representatives is unworkable and self-deceiving. In other places, members of important cultural establishments are appointed by the government, but the top government officials have to shoulder the political results for making a wrong decision.
 - Mr HO would choose an appointment mechanism rather than an election mechanism which is imbalance, unrepresentative and may not take advantage of professionalism; provided that the Government must be accommodative by appointing appropriate persons based on professional requirements without considerations based on politics or administrative convenience, and that there should be a transparent operation mechanism and an independent monitoring mechanism.
- The Hong Kong Construction Association, Ltd.* • Expert advice and professional supervision would be paramount to ensure that the performance facilities are delivered with the appropriate quality and on time. Therefore, the WKCDA board ought to include representatives from the construction industry and should include representatives from organizations such as The Hong Kong Construction Association, Ltd.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd.* • When the master plan, design and development for WKCD are being formulated, the WKCDA board should have members who are engineers with ample experience in large scale infrastructure construction, transport and environmental protection engineering.
- Cantonese Opera Advisory Committee* • WKCDA board should have at least one representative from the Chinese opera sector so as to provide input to the board on matters of concern of the sector.
- Hong Kong Christian Institute* • The membership composition of the WKCDA board as currently proposed by the Government is extremely undemocratic and lacks community participation. The board must include democratically elected community and resident representatives, especially resident representatives living near WKCD.

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

Museum of Site, Ltd.

- The election should not be a small-circle game, it must be "open" as far as possible.
- WKCDA must define clearly the qualification of candidates and electors, as well as the procedure and mechanism of election.
- The election model of HKADC is largely problematic as classification of candidates rigidly based on art form is anachronistic. WKCDA should not follow that election model. A good and professional system of election must be taken.
- The qualification of electors and candidates must be as broad as possible, as WKCDA will not confine its scope to West Kowloon or arts, its interest will be territory-wide, cross-region and cross-disciplinary.
- The term of office for each member must be limited to six years; and for every three years, rotation of office is required for 2/3 of the members, or at least half of its non-official members.
- Official members can be recruited from Secretaries of Government Bureaux. WKCDA can be formed by policy planners, cultural practitioners, accountants, bankers, administrators and professionals from exhibition, catering or tourism industry.
- Election or appointment of members should be based on the candidate's personal experience and qualification in management and culture.
- Half of WKCDA's members must be cultural activists/professionals affiliated with performing or museum affairs on the date of appointment.
- Appointment of persons with records of sound public service can be considered.
- The ideal number of members of the WKCDA board can be around 20-22, with members serving as chairmen of trusts, which are to be formed under WKCDA.
- The Chairman should not be a councilor, politician or merchant; ideally he or she should be an emeritus or veteran cultural worker without interest. Persons with potential conflict of interest should not be appointed.
- Advisers or professional consultants in cultural fields from China (Pearl River Delta) and/or other cities can be appointed if sound reasons can be given.
- WKCDA should encompass the following committees: Finance & Fund-raising, Strategic Planning & Development, Resource & Management, Museum,

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

Performing Art, Education, etc.

- Dr CHAN Yan-chong, Associate Professor, Department of Management Sciences, Faculty of Business, City University of Hong Kong* • Dr CHAN objects to election of the members of WKCDA as it is impossible for the concerned parties to arrive at a consensus on the election arrangements.
- Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors* • In reality, only the Chairman of the Board and the Chief Executive Officer would actively engage in the work of WKCDA; other parties represented in the Board would mainly be concerned about the allocation of funds.
- Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors* • The establishment of WKCDA may not by itself be able to fulfill the objects. Its success hinges on whether the Government will appoint appropriate and competent members into the governing board as well as the executive arm.
- Hong Kong Curators Association* • The proposed size (20 members) of WKCDA Board is appropriate as similar boards in overseas countries normally consist of below 20 members.
- The proposed composition of the Board is reasonable.
 - A good reference is the Smithsonian Institution in the United States. It comprises 17 members, with the Chief Justice being the Chairman and the Vice President being an ex-officio member. This reflects that the country accords high importance to this cultural institution. The inclusion of congressional members, who are elected by the people, obviates the need for election for the institution.
- Chung Ying Theatre Company* • The organization supports the proposed composition of the WKCDA Board, but is concerned about the actual membership.
- Zonta Club of Hong Kong* • The organization supports the proposed composition of WKCDA. The statutory body needs to include administrative, financial as well as curatorial and performance arts expertise. Where will these professional and expertise be drawn from and who will decide and approve the selection are important issues. LegCo will continue to have an important role in the checks and balances of the administrative and financial aspects of the development, and particularly the choice of Chairman which will significantly affect the future outcome of the development.

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

- The People's Panel on West Kowloon* • The composition of WKCDA should have broad community representation and solid foundation of public views; it should not inherit the 100% appointment system from the colonial era. At least 15% of the members of the Board (i.e. at least three members) should represent community experience and community viewpoints in the planning and development of culture.
- Hong Kong Arts Development Council* • The organization supports appointing people from different fields of the arts and cultural sectors who have the necessary expertise, experience and vision to the board of WKCDA.
- The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong* • Professionals representing the arts and cultural sectors, including the Cantonese opera, should be appointed to the board of WKCDA.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • The proposed composition of the board of WKCDA appears to be focused and appropriate with material non-official representation and a limit of three public officers.
- WKCDA board members should have strong commitment to do as well as to advise. Members with specialist experience which is needed for a relatively short time span could be appointed for a term less than three years.
 - The appointment of the Chairman of WKCDA would be crucial to moving matters forward. The Chairman would have to lead by example and bring together different Government departments and other stakeholders from a wide range of background. As the matters under the discussion of WKCDA could be controversial and a consensus of the Board is unlikely, the decision making process for WKCDA requires careful consideration.
- Hong Kong Society for Education In Art* • The arts education frontline workers should be represented in the board of WKCDA.
- Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts* • Size of the board has a direct correlation and positive impact on the success of a cultural district.
- Zuni Icosahedron* • The organization suggests that the HKADC nomination system for its members representing different arts

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

interests could be adopted, with appropriate improvement, for WKCDA.

The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd

- The organization supports the proposed composition of WKCDA to include professionals in engineering, architecture and surveying, as well as representatives from the arts and cultural sectors and the creative industry.
- The organization does not support members of the board of WKCDA to be nominated through election by the relevant sectors as election could not bring out suitable professionals to be members of the board. It has confidence that the Government would consult the stakeholders and relevant sectors before appointing the appropriate persons to the board.

Ms Sabrina FUNG

- Ms FUNG supports appointing professionals to the board of WKCDA as election could not turn out the suitable professionals.

The Fringe Club

- The proposed board composition is of an appropriate size but five members connected with the arts and cultural were not sufficient to represent the various arts and cultural sectors. It is important to define the relevant areas that should be represented.

Hong Kong Arts Centre

- The appointment of members to the board of WKCDA should be based on fair and transparent criteria. It is important to engage the public in the WKCD project and some members should be appointed to represent the public. The existing proposal of having all members appointed by the Chief Executive is not desirable.
- The organization suggests that reference can be made to the Board composition of Hong Kong Arts Centre, in which three members are appointed by the Chief Executive, four members are elected by individual members and organization members of the Centre. Another four but not more than seven members, being persons interested in the visual, literary, musical or performing arts, would be co-opted to the Board through a highly transparent mechanism.
- The organization suggests that an initial composition of the WKCDA board with four appointed members and six members elected using a mechanism of the District Council Board elected members. These 10 members

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

could then discuss a transparent mechanism to elect other professionals in engineering, architect and so on to the board.

The Hong Kong Institute of Architects

- The founding WKCDA is expected to deal with complicated planning, architecture, engineering, traffic, environmental, survey, landscape issues, involving complicated financing. Therefore it is considered appropriate to have not less than 50% of the Board members, excluding Authority executives and Government representatives, to have expertise in these related fields. Subsequently, the composition of members should change, corresponding to changes in the nature of issues to be faced by the Authority.
- The founding WKCDA is expected to ensure that the arts and cultural facilities would be designed and built to enable efficient functioning and smooth operation of the facilities. Therefore, experiences in arts and cultural facility management and operation among the Board members and/or Technical Subcommittees set up to assist the Board are considered crucial to the success of this project.

Hong Kong Sinfonietta

- The organization supports the proposed composition of the board of WKCDA comprising five members from arts and cultural sectors and one LegCo Members to monitor the work of the WKCDA.
- The organization suggests appointing former members of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of WKCD for the sake of continuity in implementing the recommendations in the Recommendation Report.

The Ink Society Ltd

- The organization supports the arrangement that members of the board of WKCDA are to be appointed by the Chief Executive in their personal capacity. If a member represents one particular organization, the members would be obligated to act for that organization and this would compromise his ability to address the needs of the overall community.
- As an election process would politicize the organization and create factions, a transparent and open system of appointment based on fair and reasonable guidelines is the most practicable option.
- It is important that WKCDA invites the best and most

II. Composition of the board of WKCDA

qualified candidates regardless of their nationality to join the committees/working groups under the board. Hong Kong must embrace the top international talent in order to make WKCD a success in the world arena.

Asia Art Archive

- The organization supports the proposed composition of the board of WKCDA.
- The organization does not support election for board members of WKCDA as election might not be able to turn out the required professionals. Members should be appointed and reference could be made to the composition of the Consultative Committee and its Advisory Groups for seasoned professionals who are committed to arts and culture development in Hong Kong.
- Committees and working groups need to be set up under the Board to assist its work.

Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra

- The organization expresses support for the composition of the board of WKCDA as currently proposed by the Government. Various dedicated committees can be set up under the board to involve more professionals to participate in the planning for and operation of WKCD.

III. Financial arrangements

- Professional Commons*
- The organization proposes the setting up of a "District Cultural Development Fund" to promote long-term programmes of stationing performing troupes or artists in venues for performing arts or at schools, or to promote sustainable cultural activities in remote areas.
- Local Action
Habitus
Community Concern
People's Democracy
Foundation
基層發展中心
梁俊彥 and 10 other
members of the public*
- In order to avoid segregation of WKCD by property developments and to ensure that the general public can enjoy the facilities in WKCD, the Government should stop land sale in WKCD. The land sale proceeds from the reclamation areas in the vicinity should be used to subsidize the WKCD project. The proposed office premises, luxury residential flats and hotel developments in WKCD should be rented out through long-term leases. This will prevent property developments from monopolizing arts and culture and ensure long-term financial support for the operation of WKCD.
- The Lion Rock Institute*
- The organization cannot accept using \$21.6 billion public funds to establish WKCD. The Government owes an explanation on why it wants to please a small group of people by using \$21.6 billion public funds to construct a white elephant. The funds can be used for assisting the needy or effecting tax exemption.
 - The organization is concerned about how the Government will handle WKCD's operational deficits. It is not difficult to imagine that the deficits will be made up by using public funds.
 - The organization queries why the Government does not invite tenders from private operators for the franchised operation, management and maintenance of the arts and cultural facilities and the dining and entertainment facilities through time-limited operation contracts so as to create potential competition and thereby continuously improving service. Citizens should be attracted to use arts and cultural facilities through commercial practice.
 - When compared with a one-off subsidy, sustainability in the operation of the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD is obviously even more important. The problem is that the outturn revenues can vary substantially from estimates.
- New Forum*
- The organization expresses support for a one-off upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion so as to ensure stability of the

III. Financial arrangements

funds and give more flexibility to WKCD in using the funds. Appropriation of funds by phases will bring uncertainties or even negative impacts on the development of WKCD.

Momentum 107

- The organization objects to using public funds to develop WKCD. There is a serious lack of public monitoring in how funds are used in adopting direct injection of public funds. If WKCD is not financially self-sufficient, it will become a burden for taxpayers.
- The Government should establish a community matching fund to develop arts and cultural activities.

Hong Kong Dance Company

- A one-off upfront endowment represents the Government's long-term commitment in WKCD and arts and culture, and it gives more flexibility to WKCD. If appropriation of funds is to be made by phases, there will be uncertainties in the provision of funds and undesirable effects on the overall planning for WKCD and development of facilities in WKCD.

Hong Kong Repertory Theatre

- A one-off upfront endowment represents the Government's long-term commitment in WKCD and arts and culture, and it gives more flexibility to WKCD. Appropriation of funds by phases is non-conducive to the overall planning for WKCD and the development of facilities in WKCD.

Hong Kong Philharmonic Orchestra

- In order to achieve this visionary project, it is essential that the Government's one-off funding proposal be approved by LegCo to enable the project to have the full green light from the outset.

Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.

- While there should be scope for optimal flexibility, parameters need to be established in certain areas. For example, it is already proposed that Government approval is required for loans beyond an amount to be specified. This should apply also to reserve funds.
- The need and the parameters for fund raising activities of WKCD require further review and discussion. It will be seriously deleterious to existing organizations and activities if support is diverted away from them to WKCD.

III. Financial arrangements

- The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers* • Endowment by instalments may have negative impact on the development of the entire project. LegCo should have confidence in the professionals and support the upfront endowment to ensure that the construction of the project can be implemented in a smooth and uninterrupted manner.
- Hong Kong Sinfonietta Ltd.* • If payment by instalments is tied to certain conditions being fulfilled at different stages of development, it will create uncertainty and lead to disputes, thus causing further delays.
- If payment by instalments is merely a payment arrangement, it will reduce the total amount set aside for the project as the upfront endowment amount is based on its net present value in 2008.
 - The Government needs to examine its overall funding policy for Hong Kong's cultural activities to see how the two funding sources, one from the Government and another from WKCDA, can best be used to turn Hong Kong into a cultural hub. An increase in spending in WKCD should not mean a reduction in spending by the Government on cultural activities outside WKCD.
 - Resources should be earmarked for local performing arts groups to raise their artistic level, strengthen their administrative and marketing capabilities so as to reach out to a wider audience.
- Mr Oscar HO, Department of Cultural and Religious Studies, The Chinese University of Hong Kong* • Funding by phases will seriously disturb and limit the long-term planning of WKCD. Large infrastructure projects, individual activities and purchase of museum collections will all be affected by uncertainties in funding.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd.* • WKCDA should ensure financial self-sufficiency through prudent financial management.
- Civic Party* • On the basis of the membership composition it proposes, the Civic Party will agree that a one-off upfront endowment be provided to WKCDA for carrying out long-term cultural work.
- Cantonese Opera Advisory Committee* • The organization agrees to providing a one-off upfront endowment for the WKCD project and believes that this is the most appropriate and flexible mode to enable the

III. Financial arrangements

project to proceed as soon as possible and to ensure that the project can be completed smoothly.

- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District* • It must be stipulated that 50% of all programming and content is sourced (based on actual money spent each year) within China, and that 50% of this local content is sourced within Hong Kong.
- Chung Ying Theatre Company* • The organization supports providing a one-off upfront endowment for the WKCD project.
- Hong Kong Arts Development Council* • The organization agrees to provide a one-off upfront endowment for the WKCD project to ensure funding certainty and facilitate the long-term planning of the project by the statutory body.
- The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong* • The organization does not object to providing a one-off upfront endowment for the WKCD project to avoid the project being hampered by the economic downturn.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • The organization supports a one-off upfront endowment as instalments would impede the planning and development of WKCD.
- Zuni Icosahedron* • The organization considers that before the funding arrangements for WKCD were considered, the following three aspects should be sorted out-
 - (a) The composition of the Planning Office for WKCD under the Home Affairs Bureau;
 - (b) The composition of WKCDA and the criteria for selection of its members;
 - (c) The details of the complementary cultural policy.If the funding for WKCD was approved and the projected was then implemented in a haste without the above aspects well sorted out, the result might be catastrophic.
- The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd* • The organization supports a one-off upfront endowment for WKCDA to show the commitment of the Government. LegCo should take up the monitoring role on the development of the project.
- Ms Sabrina FUNG* • Ms FUNG supports a one-off upfront endowment for WKCDA to ensure funding certainty and facilitate planning.

III. Financial arrangements

- The Fringe Club* • The organization supports a one-off upfront endowment for WKCDA.
- The Ink Society Ltd* • The organization supports an upfront endowment rather than a staggered disbursement process subject to approval at each stage.
- Asia Art Archive* • The organization supports M+ to solicit private donation.
- Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra* • A one-off upfront endowment represents the Government's long-term commitment in WKCD and arts and culture, and it gives more flexibility to WKCDA. Appropriation of funds by phases is non-conducive to the overall planning for WKCD and the development of facilities in WKCD.
- The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong* • Funding for WKCDA should be sought from LegCo as in the case of any other public works or publicly funded projects.

IV. Land matters

- Professional Commons*
- Private residential development can be reduced by one-third and unnecessary communal facilities, for example, fire service complex, can be removed. By so doing, 14 000 square meters of open space can be released. A "creativity jam" with an area of 5 000 square meters can also be provided.
- Community Concern* *Cultural*
- People's Foundation* *Democracy*
- 基層發展中心*
- The Government should designate land for constructing public rental housing when planning for WKCD so as to allow grass-roots citizens to establish a grass-roots community in that district.
 - In order to avoid segregation of WKCD by property developments and to ensure that the general public can enjoy the facilities in WKCD, the Government should stop land sale in WKCD. The proposed office premises, luxury residential flats and hotel developments in WKCD should be rented out through long-term leases.
- The Lion Rock Institute*
- The best use of the land should be decided by the community. Selling the land in West Kowloon and allowing the community to develop commerce and industry that the community consider appropriate will be most beneficial for Hong Kong.
- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District*
- Developing the urban plan for the whole district (not just the venues) is a responsibility above and beyond, and quite different from, the development and management of the arts and cultural venue complex.
 - It is important that the district is planned first and foremost as an integral part of the Kowloon area -- and not as a stand alone complex.
 - The district is an important waterfront and should be planned according to the Harbour Planning Principles.
 - Established planning processes and institutions should be followed.
 - The plans should be reflected in amendments to the South West Kowloon Outline Zoning Plan and be subject to the approval by the Town Planning Board under section 12 of the Town Planning Ordinance. WKCDA should participate in this process as the venue developer.
 - Communal and utilities facilities in the whole district should be zoned as such and kept separate from the venue complex (managed by WKCDA) and the various commercial sites. These facilities should be managed by the respective departments and owners and be kept

IV. Land matters

free from additional rules and regulations otherwise imposed by WKCDA.

- Hong Kong Christian Institute* • There should be good road and transport connectivity with neighbouring districts to ensure easy accessibility for all. The facilities in WKCD should be accessible to all.
- Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors* • The institute does not have strong views on the proposed plot ratio and building height limits for WKCD. On the 20% Gross Floor Area (GFA) limit for residential developments in WKCD, the institute considers that given that land resources are precious in Hong Kong, the institute wonders whether the Government has conducted any study on the best development mix for the project.
- The institute notes that out of the 23 hectares of open space in WKCD, only 15 hectares would be at the ground level. The ground-level open space represents some 27% of entire site area of WKCD. The institute considers that this percentage is on the low side.
 - As the Government would propose to incorporate development parameters into the relevant Outline Zoning Plan very soon, the Government should seriously reconsider the optimum development mix and development parameters at this stage for the overall benefit of the public.
 - The institute agrees that the residential, hotel and office development sites should be disposed of by the Government under the normal land sale mechanism.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • Whilst the residential, office and hotel sites will be disposed of by Government in the usual way, the developments on these sites should be compatible with the overall design and ambiance of WKCD. As WKCDA will be responsible for the master plan but will they have any control over the developments on them? If not, how will this necessary compatibility be safeguarded?
- The Fringe Club* • The planning and design of WKCD and its buildings should blend well with the harbour. The organization suggests that WKCD should be accessible via road and sea, and it is important that WKCD should be visible from the harbour.

IV. Land matters

- The Hong Kong Institute of Architects*

 - The organization supports setting up the Planning Office to commence early preparatory work. Relevant professionals in planning, design, and so on should be deployed to the Planning Office.
 - To integrate with the surrounding urban fabric, it is essential that a "Greater WKCD" could function seamlessly. The Government has to partner with WKCDA to ensure the connectivity channels for pedestrians, traffic, views, sea breezes, etc., and the design, planning, development and functions of adjacent land parcels and waterfront on both sides of WKCD boundary are compatible, well integrated and mutually supporting each other. These requirements should all be reflected in a visionary 3-dimensional urban design master plan for a socially and environmentally sustainable "Greater WKCD".

- The Ink Society Ltd*

 - The organization supports the Administration's decision to take the commercial land component out of the purview of WKCDA to address concern that developers would be involved in the operation of arts and cultural facilities. Under this arrangement, WKCDA could focus on the arts and cultural aspects.

- Zuni Icosahedron*

 - Given that the Planning Office would be responsible for the important tasks to co-ordinate efforts in preparing for the establishment of WKCDA and to undertake initial tasks such as those relating to the preparation of the outline zoning plan, the Government should brief and consult LegCo on the details of the Planning Office, including the scope of responsibilities and functions, staff expertise, monitoring system and the concrete operation timetable.

- The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong*

 - The Retail/Dining/Entertainment space to be designated in WKCD should be genuinely ancillary and limited to servicing the patrons of the venues within WKCD. All other land for residential, office and hotel developments in WKCD should be disposed of in the open market under Government's normal land sale mechanism.

- Hong Kong Arts Centre*

 - With reference to the area of the retail, dining and entertainment (RDE) facilities in the Hong Kong Arts Centre at the ratio of 1:1 to the area of the performing

IV. Land matters

venues, the organization considers that the ratio of 16% of the total GFA for RDE facilities against 36% of the total GFA for arts and cultural facilities in WKCD is on the low side and suggests to increase GFA for RDE facilities to relieve the pressure on land sale.

V. Public accountability

- The Lion Rock Institute*
- The organization is concerned about how the Government can ensure that the management of WKCD will not be inadequate, as is the case of some public bodies. WKCD will be a super public body and may create many more incidents of abuse of public assets. If developing WKCD by private developers can be regarded as collusion between the Government and business, what about establishing WKCD and then appointing pro-Government persons to take up high-paid directorship posts?
- New Forum*
- How to strengthen the accountability of WKCD is an issue that the Government must handle. The Government should exercise appropriate monitoring through the official members of the WKCD board. The board should report the operation of WKCD to LegCo on a regular basis. The Government should formulate precise, objective and measurable quantitative and qualitative indicators to assess the cost-effectiveness of WKCD. WKCD should be subject to the examination of the Director of Audit and the Independent Commission Against Corruption.
- Civic Party*
- There should be a clear and effective mechanism to ensure that WKCD can be held accountable to the public, LegCo and the Chief Executive.
- Hong Kong Sinfonietta Ltd.*
- There are already checks and balances built in to control and ensure transparency in planning and spending of WKCD under the current proposals.
- Mr Oscar HO, Department of Cultural and Religious Studies, The Chinese University of Hong Kong*
- Existing mechanisms like the Audit Commission has proven to provide effective monitoring. Together with participation by LegCo Members, there should be effective and responsible monitoring and control.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd.*
- WKCD should submit annual reports and audited statements of accounts to the Government, and the audited accounts should be tabled in LegCo.
- Hong Kong Christian Institute*
- There should be mechanisms and provisions to ensure public accountability of the WKCD board. Merely submitting plans and reports to LegCo is inadequate.

V. Public accountability

- Hong Kong Curators Association* • The organization is concerned that WKCDA would become an independent kingdom prone to messy financial management, favouritism and cronyism. To avoid these problems --
- (a) WKCDA should be accountable to LegCo; WKCDA should submit its annual budget, annual report and roll-over three-year business plans to LegCo for monitoring and questioning;
 - (b) WKCDA should establish an internal audit department to monitor its financial management;
 - (c) WKCDA should come under the purview of the Audit Commission, the Ombudsman and Independent Commission Against Corruption (ICAC);
 - (d) WKCDA should be required to disclose relevant information when queried by the media, government and the public unless there are sufficient reasons to justify the otherwise;
 - (e) a sound promotion and appraisal system should be established for the staff of WKCDA, and the relevant details should be submitted to LegCo and the Civil Service Bureau for record; and
 - (f) there should be a proper redress system for staff.
- Chung Ying Theatre Company* • The organization supports measures to prevent the conflict of interest and agrees that WKCDA should come under the purview of the Audit Commission and ICAC etc.
- Hong Kong Arts Development Council* • An effective monitoring and public accountability system for WKCDA with respect to LegCo, the public and the arts and cultural sector should be established.
- The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong* • WKCDA should provide detailed annual financial plans for LegCo's scrutiny. A mechanism should be put in place to ensure the transparency of the financial arrangements to facilitate the monitoring by the public and the arts and cultural sector.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • Provisions should be incorporated in the proposed legislation to enhance the public accountability of WKCDA and safeguard public interest. Conflicts of interest must be avoided and corporate plans should be made available publicly for review and discussion.
- The proposed legislation should contain appropriate

V. Public accountability

checks and balances so that actions can be taken if it appears to the Government or the public that funds are not being managed or expended in an optimum manner.

- The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts* • WKCD could be monitored by benchmarking exercises and the public could judge its performance quantitatively, such as attendance and revenue, as well as by the increased public awareness and recognition of the importance of culture in all their lives.
 - WKCDA needs to be extraordinarily transparent, empowered, shared and owned by the arts community, and the greater, distributed community around us.

- Zuni Icosahedron* • WKCDA should be transparent in its funding allocation for arts and cultural programmes.

- Hong Kong Arts Centre* • As WKCDA would be using public resources for the purpose of promoting arts and cultural in Hong Kong, WKCDA should be accountable to the public.

- The Ink Society Ltd* • There needs to be a high degree of transparency and monitoring of WKCDA's work. WKCDA should be subject to independent audits and report regularly to the Government.

- The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong* • WKCDA should be subject to public monitoring.

VI. Consultation

- New Forum* • WKCDA should conduct consultations on the planning of the 36% of Gross Floor Area in WKCD for arts and cultural facilities.
- Hong Kong Dance Company* • WKCDA and the Town Planning Board should consult the public on the master plan for WKCD.
- Hong Kong Repertory Theatre* • WKCDA and the Town Planning Board should consult professionals and the public on the master plan for WKCD.
- Community Cultural Concern* • The Government should establish a bottom-up procedure for public engagement in planning and policy development and all relevant government departments, organizations formed by public elections, relevant professional and executive bodies should send their representatives to participate in the discussions and to steer the process. All major development and redevelopment projects should adopt such a public engagement procedure.
- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District* • Although it may be difficult to predict as to what and when the public should be consulted by WKCDA in designing and developing the venues, minimum standards should be set in discussion with the arts and culture industry. LegCo should be consulted given the magnitude of the one-off cash endowment and land grant.
- The consultation for the planning should specifically include the District Council to ensure integration with the district and accommodation of district requirements. The planning should be conducted by the Planning Department, with the public consultation managed through the Harbour-front Enhancement Committee.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • WKCDA should be obligated to engage the public on certain key issues, such as the masterplanning and the design of major performance venues. Any further consultation should be left to the discretion of WKCDA.
- The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong* • The master plan of WKCD should be subject to the due process of public consultation under the Town Planning Ordinance.

VII. Vision of the WKCD project, cultural policy

- Professional Commons*
- The Government should develop a "West Kowloon for the People" by adopting a "people orientated" approach and a global outlook. It should get rid of the traditional governing mentality and the rigid fiscal policy of self-sufficiency.
 - Should turn West Kowloon into a catalytic force behind the development of local culture or even the development of an overall integrated culture. More factors concerning sustainable development should be injected into the project.
- New Forum*
- Exhibition of the uniqueness of local and traditional culture, and assimilation of regional and international culture should be the main selling-point of WKCD.
 - The Government can consider promoting the culture of ethnic minorities and organize cultural festivals for different countries.
- C & G Artpartment*
- If the Government is sincere in developing arts and culture, a more pressing task is to formulate a cultural policy for the whole territory.
- Hong Kong Philharmonic Orchestra*
- The vision of WKCD is one which will inspire the entire performing arts sector to reach for the highest artistic standards, to inform and expand our audiences and provide the life-blood of an arts precinct which will redefine international perceptions of Hong Kong.
- Ms HO Loy*
- The planning for WKCD has not intertwined with the public daily life and no public arts have been included. There is a lack of "community-driven" element in WKCD. While HKADC and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) modes of delivery arts programmes have their problems, WKCD would only restrict the diversified environment of HKADC and LCSD. The concept of WKCD has not been integrated in the town planning of the West Kowloon area.
 - WKCD does not provide an effective and organic development for arts and culture in Hong Kong. WKCD should form a partnership relationship with the public to foster a sustainable arts and culture development.
 - WKCD could not project the unique Hong Kong characteristics. It should adopt a green concept which could serve as a model for other buildings/projects.

VII. Vision of the WKCD project, cultural policy

- Hong Kong Society for Education In Art* • As arts is intertwined with daily life of the public, WKCD should focus on promoting the local and indigenous cultures to ensure their sustainable development. Hong Kong is a diversified society which should embrace different art forms.
- The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts* • The successful performance of a cultural district hinges on a strategic coalition between stakeholders and the Authority and a stable funding mechanism. Size of a cultural district does matter and proximity to 'live' issues is essential. There is clear recognition of the need for, and value of, a healthy interdependence among all partners, especially cultural providers. Cultural districts are settings predisposed to sharing a confluence of talent pools.
- Successful cultural districts involve people-centred change, seamless education articulation, and partnerships with all arts groups, strategic, governmental, public and private networks, holistic policy integration across all sectors, fundamentally joined-up thinking, cultural hub and spokes.
- The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd* • In planning the facilities and programmes for WKCD, a balance should be achieved between international perspective and local/indigenous perspective. WKCD should also be tasked to promote the development of local creative industries.
- The Fringe Club* • WKCD should foster a consensus among the community to support its purposes. To achieve such purposes, WKCD should formulate an effective strategy with motivational core values.

VIII. Cultural software

New Forum

- Government-led development of arts and cultural troupes should be avoided. The Government should assist those well-equipped troupes in enterprising their business and increase the subsidy for small and medium troupes.
- The Government should strengthen the training of arts and cultural management talent.

C & G Artpartment

- The establishment of the three advisory groups to study the development of WKCD reflects that the Government has adopted a perspective based on economy and hardware, thus reducing the room for cultural software development and placing such development after economic and hardware development.
- Artists not only need exhibition venues, but also room for creation. Government assistance seems to focus on providing venues without comprehensive support in other areas. The organization doubts whether WKCD can make Hong Kong prestigious in the international arts and culture arena under such circumstances. A management mode led by administrative convenience is putting the cart before the horse in arts and culture development.

Dr CHAN Yan-chong,
Associate Professor,
Department of
Management Sciences,
Faculty of Business, City
University of Hong Kong

- A special feature in Hong Kong is that nearly all children of middle class families learned piano, but the children seldom attend concerts. This is because the main purpose of the piano learning is to enter into famous schools. One should bear this in mind when planning the cultural software development in Hong Kong.

Chung Ying Theatre
Company

- Macau is competing away art talents from Hong Kong. The arts and cultural sectors in Hong Kong are facing a high wastage problem.

The People's Panel on
West Kowloon

- Cultural software development was the key of success of WKCD. In planning for cultural software development, the following two principles should be adopted --
 - (a) The planning for a cultural community and a community culture should be the core strategies; and the nurturing of diverse cultural creativity, cultural education and administrative personnel for the arts should be the key targets.
 - (b) To achieve the above, the government should set up an interdepartmental working group comprising

VIII. Cultural software

senior officials from the Home Affairs Bureau, Education Bureau, Development Bureau and Commerce and Economic Development Bureau to make concerted efforts in formulating plans for the nurturing and development of various arts talents, arts related professionals, and creativity education for the next 10 years.

- The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong* • The Administration should set out its planning in concrete terms on the software development and artists training. The Cantonese opera sector is facing various difficulties, such as the lack of performing venues, funding and new artists joining the sector and brain drain. There are problems with the existing funding allocation which skews towards western classical music.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • WKCD should not be the only place in Hong Kong where arts and cultural events should be nurtured and supported. For WKCD to be successful, the appreciation of arts and culture should be part of the life of Hong Kong. WKCD should have a role to make this a reality to make Hong Kong as an arts and cultural district as a whole.

 - The Government should explain how its arts and cultural policy could be integrated into that of WKCD to the benefit of local communities throughout Hong Kong.
- Hong Kong Society for Education In Art* • While the nurturing of new and young audience is important, arts education should target all Hong Kong people and WKCD should take up arts education as one of its purposes.
- The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts* • WKCD should be aware that culture can drive performance. WKCD should have a role in building the corporate culture of WKCD, a responsibility for nurturing cultural software, and see how it can connect and join with the rest of Hong Kong in its quest.

 - Education and the role of an Academy will need to be at the centre of building cultural software.
- Zuni Icosahedron* • To build up a large number of arts and cultural audience, the Government should allocate sufficient resources to arts education. The Government should announce the details of the large-scale arts education study so that the public could be informed of the strategic direction of the

VIII. Cultural software

Government in developing cultural software.

- There are fewer new artists joining the local arts and cultural sector and the organization is concerned that most programmes at the future WKCD would be performed by overseas troupes. The Government should formulate measures to retain local arts and cultural talents.
- The Government should revise its funding policy to address the skewing of existing funding support towards western classical music at the expense of local and indigenous art forms.
- The Government should consider setting up a "Cultural Affairs Bureau" to be responsible for cultural development in Hong Kong.

The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd

- The organization suggests that a "Cultural Affairs Bureau" be set up after WKCD is established to review arts education and coordinate the integration between the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD and in other districts, and to nurture young talents for the arts and cultural sectors in Hong Kong.

The Fringe Club

- The Administration should enhance the preparatory work before the opening of WKCD, such as strengthening arts education through the public media, and training for budding artists, reviewing the relationship of WKCD and other arts and cultural facilities outside WKCD and promoting the important role of arts and culture to the public.

Hong Kong Sinfonietta

- The organization requests the Administration to allocate sufficient resources to conduct and promote arts education. A dedicated arts development fund should be set up to build up audience and train new young talents during the interim period before the commissioning of WKCD.

IX. Arts and cultural facilities

- Professional Commons*
- The current development phases of the WKCD project should be further divided, with small scale or even temporary performance areas coming into being by the end of 2012. The construction works of large-scale arts facilities should generally follow the original schedule.
 - Greening of the open space inside WKCD should be maximized to facilitate the setting up of a "West Kowloon Park". With landscaped areas, installation arts and street performances, the whole park belt would be teemed with vivacious activities, creating an atmosphere of natural scenery permeated by and blended with arts.
 - To avoid turning West Kowloon to be an "isolated cultural island", "community cultural networks" must at the same time be built across the territories. It would be of particular importance to set up "community cultural centres". The Government should first invest in areas comparatively lacking cultural and arts facilities by building further cultural centres and performance venues and revitalizing idle premises for cultural and arts purposes.
- Local Action
Habitus
Community Concern
Cultural
基層發展中心
梁俊彥 and 10 other
members of the public*
- WKCDA should ensure that various types of artists and art troupes can enjoy the facilities. It should change the old mentality of over-management and allow artists to manage and operate WKCD on their own.
- The Lion Rock Institute*
- The organization queries whether constructing more arts and cultural venues will stimulate Hong Kong people's demand for arts and cultural activities. Even if enhancing Hong Kong's arts and cultural development is the wish of the citizens, providing relevant activities and operating relevant facilities by a public body will not really achieve the purpose. Substantial public funds have been wasted due to management and efficiency problems of public bodies.
- New Forum*
- The Government can fully utilize facilities like schools to act as venues for community activities at night or during holidays so as to provide more performance venues for arts and cultural troupes.

IX. Arts and cultural facilities

- The Government can encourage private developers to construct performance venues through land policies, such as offering flexibility in plot ratio, so that arts and cultural troupes can have more opportunities to exhibit their talent.
- Momentum 107*
- Constructing venue facilities should be the Government's primary mission and there is no need to concentrate those facilities in a single district.
- Chinese-Scottish Band*
- Unlike foreign places, large scale performances in Hong Kong usually last for half a day or even one to two hours only. Publicity is also insufficient. This is not cost-effective. Organizing long-lasting large scale performances in Hong Kong can greatly increase the number of participants, reduce costs, increase revenues and attract overseas performers and tourists.
 - Roads at the periphery of WKCD should match with the large performance venues. They should be wide and continuous for participants to gather, watch performances and leave, and for holding carnivals and parades.
 - The design of large performance venues can draw reference from the Edinburgh Place outside Edinburgh Castle in Scotland.
 - If performers of marching bands can receive support from the Government and tie in with large performance venues in WKCD, they can promote Hong Kong's cultural and creative industries and bring positive benefits to Hong Kong's economy.
- C & G Artpartment*
- The Government intends to centralize the development of arts and culture in WKCD, but there are no relevant development plans for other districts.
 - The organization is worried about the Government's real intention and queries why the development of arts and culture should be so unitary and highly centralized, and whether this is possible. A highly centralized arts and cultural district is in fact not ideal. Designating idle space in various districts by the Government for artists' use will better assist the development of local arts and culture and better meet the needs of artists.
- Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.*
- The modest aim of providing "quality facilities" may not suffice. WKCD should aim for the highest levels of

IX. Arts and cultural facilities

excellence. The new facilities must provide performance and exhibition conditions that are desirable for the world's top artists and attractive to their most discerning audiences.

- Cantonese Opera Advisory Committee* • The organization fully agrees to the proposal that a Chinese opera centre be constructed in WKCD to provide facilities for Chinese opera performances and activities.
- Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors* • It is disappointing that the core arts and cultural facilities (CACF) would not be operative until 2014-2015. The Government should accelerate the project, say to enable CACF to be operative five years from now.
- CACF require substantial subsidy both for capital and operating costs. The Government should examine their value-for-money by a cost-benefit analysis.
 - In view of the substantial increase in land prices recently, it is estimated that the land sales proceeds would be higher than those estimated in 2006. Hence, there should be no need to reduce the scale of CACF to bridge the funding gap.
- Zonta Club of Hong Kong* • In Hong Kong, collections for public museums are lacking. In order to enhance this, the organization urges the Government to consider offering tax incentives and public recognition such as specific naming rights to major donors of works of arts to public museums. It is essential to hire curatorial staff of the highest standards for M+. Other museums will also benefit by hiring high quality curators, having greater autonomy in finances and measures to encourage donations to public museums.
- On performing venues, the organization is concerned whether there will be sufficient rehearsal facilities for Hong Kong's home performing companies.
- Ms HO Loy* • M+ is not compatible with street culture and consideration should be given to integrating M+ with more elements of street culture.
- Ms Sabrina FUNG* • Ms FUNG supports expediting the setting up of M+ and the interim M+ to start the collection on modern visual art and provide opportunities for relevant arts administrators and professionals.

IX. Arts and cultural facilities

Asia Art Archive

- The organization suggests that architectural design competition could be organized for **M+**.
- The organization supports **M+** and interim **M+**. A project director should be engaged during the interim period to develop the collection strategy, plan exhibitions and nurture audience.

X. General and other comments

- Professional Commons*
- West Kowloon should be developed into a "low carbon demonstrative zone" by implementing specific environmentally friendly measures.
 - It is advisable that a public design competition be held for the West Kowloon development plan.
 - The organization agrees to the principles initiated by the Culture and Heritage Commission and the Harbour Planning Guidelines.
- The Lion Rock Institute*
- The organization queries why West Kowloon must be developed into a cultural district, and why a cultural district must be developed in West Kowloon. Arts and cultural treasures have all along been a result of community efforts rather than Government promotion.
 - The organization objects to the development of WKCD by the Government directly and the establishment of WKCDA. The right of developing WKCD should be returned to the community.
- Hong Kong Dance Company*
- The organization expresses support for the key aspects of the Government's proposed legislation for establishing WKCDA, and hopes that the WKCD project could be implemented as soon as possible.
- Hong Kong Repertory Theatre*
- The organization expresses support for the key aspects of the Government's proposed legislation for establishing WKCDA, and hopes that the WKCD project could be implemented as scheduled.
- C & G Artpartment*
- The organization queries the need for explicitly stating ink art as a kind of visual art in the four initial broad groupings of visual culture.
- Hong Kong Philharmonic Orchestra*
- The organization expresses the strongest possible support for WKCD. It is by no means easy to build up a broad consensus in the arts and cultural sector on the facilities to be built.
- Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.*
- WKCD should move forward without delay.
 - WKCD should be planned to support its functions and operations as an integrated whole. A piecemeal approach should be avoided both in the planning and approval processes.

X. General and other comments

- The appointments to key positions including those in artistic and technical areas should be made early in order to provide input during the planning process.
 - The new development will set industry standards in various aspects. Consequences of the policies and practices of WKCD to other organizations need to be monitored and adjustments should be made to the conditions governing their practices where appropriate.
- The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers* • The organization recognizes the importance and benefits of the WKCD project and expresses support for the project.
- Hong Kong Sinfonietta Ltd.* • Similar events like the "Design Week" should be planned for the museum and performing arts groups to build up an international network. Hong Kong lacks high profile forum or conference with emphasis on arts administration, education and marketing for the benefits of local arts groups.
- The Hong Kong Construction Association, Ltd.* • The organization fully supports the early establishment of WKCD so that the WKCD project can be implemented as early as possible. There have been enough debates and arguments and what is needed is a decision to proceed.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd.* • As the planning of WKCD will involve a number of interface issues with the overall planning and infrastructural developments in the West Kowloon Reclamation area, the organization agrees that the Government should set up a dedicated WKCD Planning Office to coordinate the linkage of WKCD with the surrounding areas.
- The organization hopes that the proposed legislation for establishing WKCD can be passed and the WKCD project can be implemented as soon as possible.
- Cantonese Opera Advisory Committee* • The organization fully supports the WKCD project. It should be implemented as soon as possible.
- Hong Kong Christian Institute* • There should be public participation in the planning for and management of WKCD under democratic and open principles. All citizens should be allowed to participate in the activities in WKCD. All citizens, especially

X. General and other comments

grass-roots citizens, should be allowed to enjoy the public space in WKCD at no cost. WKCD should not be a privilege for a few only.

- Use and management of facilities in WKCD should be accommodative to allow and encourage various communities to create and express freely.
- There should be as few restrictions as possible in space management in WKCD so as to maintain openness and avoid interfering with the free use of the space.
- Cultural development in WKCD should be tied to local culture. Monopoly by the so-called world-class cultural performances and exhibitions will only stifle local creativity. Without local characters for international cultural exchange, WKCD will only reduce to an "international" performance venue.
- WKCD should facilitate participation by nearby residents so as to foster a culture with local characters.

The People's Panel on West Kowloon • The Government should implement a more detailed "community culture and arts partnership scheme" 「社區文化和藝術伙伴計劃」, the emphasis of the scheme is to enlist the cooperation of social services organizations, arts groups, creative persons.

Hong Kong Arts Development Council • The organization supports the WKCD project and requests the project be expedited to support the local creativity industry and contribute to making Hong Kong as a cultural metropolis.

The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong • The organization supports the WKCD project and requests the project be expedited.
• As Sunbeam Theatre, the only private performing venue for Cantonese opera, would be closed by January 2009, affecting the livelihood of the practitioners of the sector, the organization requests the Administration to provide assistance to retain the theatre as an interim venue for Cantonese opera before the commissioning of Xiqu Centre in WKCD. The deputation also requests to expedite the conversion of the Yau Ma Tei Theatre into a Cantonese opera centre as mentioned in the Chief Executive's 2007-2008 Policy Address.

Professional Property Services Limited • The organization supports the use of "Authority" for the statutory body to take forward the WKCD project as it

X. General and other comments

indicates the body will have the powers and resources necessary to plan and implement a project of this scale and duration. The wide-ranging power for WKCD is supported as it could act as a model for similar key areas such as the harbour.

- The Planning Office should support rather than lead the delivery of WKCD. The composition should be sufficiently broadly based for it to be successful in the inter-departmental planning and as an interface agency.
- The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd*
- The organization supports WKCD and urged to expedite the project in view of the keen competition from new arts and cultural facilities in the neighbouring areas.
 - WKCD could be a model for China in developing a cultural district.
- The Fringe Club*
- The organization supports the WKCD project and suggests the statutory body adopting the name "West Kowloon Trust" and in Chinese "西九會" to plan, develop and operate the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD.
- The Ink Society Ltd*
- WKCD must involve the private sector as much as possible and ensure that the numerous facilities in WKCD are run by independent boards and professionals in an environment that is free from political interference.
- Asia Art Archive*
- The organization supports the WKCD project and the proposed legislative outline for WKCD.
- Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra*
- The organization expresses support for the key aspects of the Government's proposed legislation for establishing WKCD, and hopes that the WKCD project could be implemented as soon as possible.
- The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong*
- The organization supports the establishment of a statutory body but it must be limited in power and not be allowed to grow into a publicly-funded corporation in competition with the private sector.
- Zuni Icosahedron*
- The organization expresses concern about insufficient time for the public's discussion on the proposed legislation for WKCD which the Government plans to submit in February 2008 and hopes to pass it before July 2008.

X. General and other comments

- Past discussion on WKCD has been focused on the political issues. A balance should be achieved on addressing the cultural needs, such as the ticketing system and the marketing issues.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
1 February 2008