

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/PL/FE

LC Paper No. CB(2) 1735/05-06
(These minutes have been seen by
the Administration)

Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene

Minutes of Special Meeting
held on Friday, 2 September 2005 at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

- Members Present** : Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP (Chairman)
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
- Members Attending** : Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
- Members Absent** : Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Bernard CHAN, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
- Public Officers Attending** : Dr York CHOW
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food
- Mr Eddy CHAN
Deputy Secretary (Food & Environmental Hygiene)
Health, Welfare and Food Bureau
- Mr Wallace LAU
Assistant Secretary (Food & Environmental Hygiene)¹
Health, Welfare and Food Bureau

Mr Gregory LEUNG
Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene

Dr Thomas CHUNG
Assistant Director (Food Surveillance and Control)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr Thomas CHAN
Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation

Dr LEUNG Siu-fai
Assistant Director (Fisheries)
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department

Attendance by Invitation : Hong Kong New Territories Fish Culture Association

Mr LAI Loi-chau
Director

Mr PANG Kwai-hung
Deputy Director

Hong Kong, Kowloon, New Territories and Overseas Fish Wholesalers Association

Mr HUI Hon-man
Director

Hong Kong and Kowloon Fresh Fish Trade General Association

Mr WONG Tin-hung
Director

Yuen Long Fresh Fish Trade Association

Mr WONG Lai-sum
President

Kwok Yuen Poultry and Fisheries Company Limited

Mr KWOK Chi-yau

Clerk in : Mrs Constance LI

Attendance Chief Council Secretary (2)5

Staff in Attendance : Miss Betty MA
Senior Council Secretary (2)1

Ms Anna CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2)5

Action

I Follow-up discussion on the supply and regulation of freshwater fish

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2) 2523/04-05(01)&(02)]

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2) 2513/04-05(01)&(02)]

The Chairman said that after the last meeting on 30 August 2005, malachite green had again been found in one sample of seawater fish. This meeting was convened to follow up the issue of supply and regulation of freshwater fish, as the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (DFEH) had held discussions with the inspection and quarantine authorities in the Mainland.

2. The Chairman informed members that the Administration had provided two papers which were tabled at the meeting, i.e. the immediate and long term measures to regulate aquatic food products and the Administration's response to issues and proposals raised at the meetings on 26 and 30 August 2005.

(Post-meeting note : The Administration's papers tabled at the meeting were issued to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(2)2523/04-05(01) and (02) on 5 September 2005.)

3. The Chairman further said that five deputations had been invited to attend this meeting. He would first invite the Administration to brief members on the latest developments of the regulation of aquatic food products, and then he would invite deputations to give their views.

4. Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (SHWF) extended his apology for not being able to attend the last Panel meeting on 30 August 2005 due to other commitments. SHWF informed members that –

- (a) following the agreement reached between the Administration and the Minister of the State General Administration of the Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine (AQSIQ), AQSIQ had strengthened measures to ensure the safety of live freshwater fish supplied to Hong Kong. About 30 tonnes of freshwater fish accompanied with health certificates

Action

certifying that the fish was free from malachite green had been imported so far, and the response from the market was satisfactory;

- (b) as it would take time for the Mainland to provide a list of registered fish farms supplying aquatic products to Hong Kong, the Administration's primary task was to ensure continuous and stable supply of freshwater fish from the Mainland and to restore public confidence in consuming freshwater fish;
- (c) the Administration would continue to conduct sample inspection at import level, including inspection at Man Kam To Control Point and wholesale fish markets. The freshwater fish traders were urged to keep records of purchase/sale to enable the Administration to trace the product source and take follow-up actions;
- (d) the Administration had discussed with the trade on 1 September 2005 and would help the trade to pass information of their current supplying fish farms to the Mainland authorities for inclusion in the list of registered fish farms;
- (e) the Government Laboratory could provide private laboratories with appropriate technical assistance to enable them to conduct fish safety tests for fish traders;
- (f) as a long-term policy of food safety, the Administration planned to establish the Centre for Food Safety in 2006-07. Consideration was being given to the need of amending the legislation to require registration of all operators in the trade; to require all aquatics products destined for Hong Kong to be accompanied with import and health certificates and to land at designated landing points/port of discharge; and to require suppliers to keep detailed sales record to facilitate source tracing; and
- (g) after malachite green was found in a green grouper sample on 1 September 2005, the Administration had taken more samples for testing of malachite green and was tracing the source of the problematic fish.

Action

Meeting with deputations

Hong Kong New Territories Fish Culture Association

5. Mr LAI Loi-chau said that about 15 000 catties local freshwater fish was sold at the markets in the past few days. He hoped that the public would gradually restore confidence in consuming freshwater fish. To ensure food safety of freshwater fish, both Hong Kong and Mainland authorities should strengthen inspection and quarantine of freshwater fish imported into Hong Kong, and step up enforcement actions against “smuggling” of fish from unregistered fish farms.

6. Mr LAI further said that operators of freshwater fish trade suffered great financial hardship after the malachite green incidents. He strongly urged the Administration to provide interest-free loans to the affected traders to tide them over the crisis.

Hong Kong, Kowloon, New Territories and Overseas Fish Wholesalers Association

7. Mr HUI Hon-man expressed appreciation that the Administration had provided great assistance to the freshwater fish traders to arrange for supply of freshwater fish from the Mainland, particularly the supply of four types of domestic fish to Yuen Long by land transport. While he understood that it was only the first step in resuming freshwater fish supply, he pointed out that many freshwater fish wholesalers were mainly engaged in trading of mixed fish and they could not resume business yet. He urged the Administration to continue to follow up the supply of mixed fish with the Mainland authorities. Mr HUI said that in view of the grave difficulties faced by the trade, the Administration should seriously consider granting rent reduction/waiver to affected fish wholesalers.

Hong Kong and Kowloon Fresh Fish Trade General Association

8. Mr WONG Tin-hung said that to his understanding, there had been no supply of freshwater fish by land transport since 20 August 2005, i.e. after the test results of imported freshwater fish samples on malachite green were released. Given that the majority of freshwater fish from the Mainland was imported by land transport, fish wholesaling had almost ceased in the past days. He urged that the Administration should provide assistance to the affected traders.

9. Mr WONG further said that the recent malachite green incidents revealed that the communication between the Administration and the Mainland was ineffective. To address the problem at root, the Administration should discuss directly with the provincial authorities, instead of AQSIQ in Beijing, in order to expedite response and actions in the provinces where the food was produced.

Yuen Long Fresh Fish Trade Association

Action

10. Mr WONG Lai-sum said that despite reports that supply of freshwater fish had already resumed, no freshwater fish had been supplied to Yuen Long so far. He urged the Administration to assist the trade in arranging supply of freshwater fish as soon as possible, and grant rental waiver to affected traders.

11. Mr WONG expressed concern about the liability of live fish traders after the coming into operation of the Harmful Substances in Food (Amendment) Regulation 2005. He considered that the traders were innocent because they would not know whether the fish supplied contained malachite green or not.

Kwok Yuen Poultry and Fisheries Company Limited

12. Mr KWOK Chi-yau considered that the malachite green crisis should now be over. He said that the Administration had arranged an urgent meeting with freshwater fish traders on 1 September 2005 to better understand the trade's difficulties. Mr KWOK further said that fish supplied by fish farms in the Mainland operated by Hong Kong investors was safe for consumption, as malachite green was not used in these farms. The trade had provided a list of these farms to the Administration for onward transmission to the Mainland authorities, for consideration of including them in the list of registered fish farms. Mr KWOK added that the Administration should also assist in resuming the supply of fish fry and processed food fish products as soon as possible.

Discussion

Control and supply of freshwater fish

13. Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that while he was glad to learn about the resumption of import of freshwater fish, he was concerned whether there would be stable supply because the list of registered fish farms was doubtful. To restore public confidence in the consumption of fish, the Administration should ensure the reliability of health certificates attached to the freshwater fish supplied by registered fish farms in the Mainland. He considered that the most effective and efficient way to ensure the safety of fish imported from the Mainland was to conduct inspection at the Man Kam To Control Point.

14. Referring to the Administration's response to issues and proposals raised by members at previous meetings (LC Paper No. CB(2) 2523/04-05(01), Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked about the details of the arrangements worked out between the Administration and the Mainland in respect of the safety of freshwater fish and the timetable for implementing the arrangements.

15. SHWF responded that the Mainland authorities had stepped up the inspection of freshwater fish for supply to Hong Kong at three different levels, i.e. fish farms,

Action

provincial or city level and laboratories. Health certificates would be issued by the authorities to certify that the fish was fit for consumption. Hong Kong would also send officials to inspect the registered freshwater fish farms in the Mainland from time to time. SHWF said that given the strengthened inspections, he saw no strong reasons to suspend the import of freshwater fish from the Mainland. Import of freshwater fish from the Mainland was therefore resumed.

16. As regards importing freshwater fish via the Man Kam To Control Point, SHWF said that freshwater fish would be allowed to enter Hong Kong if the fish concerned was accompanied with health certificates certifying that such fish was free from malachite green. He added that the Administration would discuss with the trade and assist the operators in obtaining supply of freshwater fish from registered fish farms.

17. Assistant Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (AD/AFCD) said that the Administration and ACSIQ both agreed that the most effective measure to ensure the food safety of fish supplied to Hong Kong was to regulate at source. In addition, samples would be taken for testing at the import, wholesale and retail levels to ensure food safety at different levels. AD/AFCD further said that to ensure compliance of the food safety standards in Hong Kong after inspection and during transportation, the Administration would need to further discuss with the Mainland authorities to work out detailed arrangements.

18. Mr LEE Wing-tat said that the inaccurate information contained in the list of 18 registered fish farms had weakened public confidence in the food safety control in the Mainland. Given that the operational arrangements for freshwater fish supply had yet to be worked out, the Administration should take positive actions, for example, by increasing the sample tests of food fish, so as to restore public confidence in consuming freshwater fish. Mr LEE asked whether the registered fish farms would be disqualified for supplying fish to Hong Kong, if their fish was found to contain malachite green.

19. SHWF said that it was Government responsibility to ensure food safety of fish. He explained that to exercise control at source, the Administration would send staff to inspect each registered fish farm in the Mainland. In addition, it would take samples for testing at different levels of the food chain under the Food Surveillance Programme under a risk-based approach. The frequency of sample tests would be adjusted based on the level of risk. SHWF further explained that it would be for the Mainland authorities to decide whether a fish farm in the Mainland would be allowed to supply fish to Hong Kong. However, the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) would reflect to the Mainland authorities if problem was found in the fish supplied by any of the registered farms.

20. The Chairman asked why the information contained in the list of the 18 registered fish farms was incorrect.

Action

21. SHWF responded that the Administration received the list of 18 registered fish farms at late night of 29 August 2005. The Administration had not doubted the accuracy of the list as some farms on the list had been supplying fish to Hong Kong. The Administration therefore did not verify the information in the list, but released the list immediately in order that the freshwater fish traders could arrange for supply of fish as soon as possible. SHWF said that the Administration had subsequently asked the Mainland authorities to provide a complete list of registered fish farms including information such as the address and telephone number of the farm, and also the types and quantities of fish to be supplied. The complete list would be provided to the traders once it was available. SHWF stressed that FEHD would send staff to inspect each of the registered fish farms before approving import of fish from these farms.

Admin

22. The Chairman requested the Administration to inform the Panel of the results of inspection to the Mainland registered freshwater fish farms. SHWF agreed.

23. Mr Vincent FANG said that he agreed in principle to the immediate and long term measures to regulate aquatic food products as set out in the Administration's paper. Mr FANG further said that he understood that the Administration did not have time to verify the information in the list as the list was urgently required by fish traders. Mr FANG considered that the most pressing task at the moment was to arrange immediate resumption of fish supply via Man Kam To Control Point as strongly requested by the trade. Mr FANG suggested that as the freshwater fish traders and operators had confidence in the fish sourced from their suppliers in the Mainland, the Administration should obtain information of these suppliers from the traders for the purpose of compiling a reliable list of registered fish farms, to expedite the resumption of fish supply.

24. Mr FANG said that following the Administration's clarification on the risk of consuming freshwater fish that contained malachite green, the public had gradually restored confidence in consuming freshwater fish. Mr FANG added that some deputations had pointed out that the major problem faced by the trade was inadequate fish supply, because import of freshwater fish via Man Kam To Control Point had not been resumed. He urged the Administration to discuss the matter with the Mainland authorities. He also asked the Administration to inform the traders when supply of fish fry and processed fish products could resume.

25. SHWF responded that freshwater fish from registered fish farms in the Mainland and accompanied with health certificates were allowed to enter Hong Kong. The Administration would discuss with Shenzhen authorities the arrangement for supply of freshwater fish via Man Kam To Control Point. As for processed fish products, SHWF said that FEHD would conduct sample inspections on imported food products, and the suppliers should also have the responsibility to ensure the food safety of their products.

Action

26. Mr Tommy CHEUNG thanked the deputations for attending the meeting, and the Administration for the efforts made to arrange for the supply of freshwater fish. Mr CHEUNG considered that the regulatory control for live fish should model on that currently adopted for live poultry. Mr CHEUNG asked whether the Administration had plans to take water samples from the registered fish farms in the Mainland to test for the presence of malachite green. Mr CHEUNG expressed concern that if there was no such plan, the Administration would rely on the production of health certificates and sample inspections at import and wholesale levels. He wondered whether it was possible for traders to engage private laboratories to conduct sample tests for malachite green.

27. SHWF said that the method for testing malachite green was developed only two week ago, and the experts were examining ways to shorten the time for test results to be available. AD/AFCD added that testing freshwater fish would be more effective than taking water samples for testing. He explained that even if malachite green was not found in water samples, it was still necessary to test whether the fish kept in the water contained malachite green. AD/AFCD advised that when the Administration sent officials to inspect the fish farms in the Mainland, they would also examine the conditions of the water and the fish in such farms.

28. Responding to Mr Tommy CHEUNG, SHWF said that as a long-term policy of food safety, the Administration was actively considering the need for amending the legislation to require all operators in the trade to register; to require all aquatics products destined for Hong Kong to be accompanied by import and health certificates; to land at designated landing points and port of discharge; and to require suppliers to keep detailed sales records to facilitate source tracing.

29. In response to the Chairman, SHWF said that aquatic products meant freshwater fish, marine fish and all shellfish. Deputy Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (Food and Environmental Hygiene) added that the regulation of freshwater fish and cultured marine fish would be less complicated than that of marine fish. Consideration might be given to introducing different regulatory measures for different types of aquatic products.

30. Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that while Hong Kong relied heavily on the import of food from the Mainland, it was beyond the jurisdiction of Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to control and monitor the safety of food products before they were imported into Hong Kong. In her view, the safety of food products prior to export was a matter for the Mainland authorities, and the Administration should step up food inspection at import level. Miss CHAN asked about the timetable for introducing an inspection and quarantine mechanism for imported food. She considered that as far as food safety of freshwater fish was concerned, the Administration should discuss the matter with the inspection and quarantine authorities in Guangdong and Shenzhen in addition to discussion with AQSIQ.

Action

31. SHWF responded that AQSIQ was the authority on food safety matters in the Mainland. In view of the recent food incidents, the Administration would improve its communication with AQSIQ. In addition, the Administration had requested to discuss directly with the relevant inspection and quarantine authorities at provincial and city levels. SHWF pointed out that as there was presently no regulation of aquatic food products in Hong Kong, it would take some time to introduce a more stringent regulatory framework for aquatic food products, e.g. requiring suppliers to keep detailed sales records to facilitate source tracing. SHWF said that although the immediate measures introduced to regulate aquatic food products were not perfect, such measures had helped to ensure that the freshwater fish now sold at retail market was safer for consumption than before. SHWF further said that as a long-term measure, the Administration would set up the Centre for Food Safety in 2006-07. The proposed Centre for Food Safety would, as a first step, focus on the safety of high-risk food products.

32. Mr TAM Yiu-chung asked whether the Administration had adequate manpower and facilities to cope with the increased workload arising from the strengthened inspection and quarantine of imported freshwater fish, and whether it had plans to shorten the processing time for testing of malachite green.

33. SHWF said that the Government Laboratory currently conducted 30 to 40 fish safety tests in accordance with international practice round-the-clock every day. He believed that the time taken for conducting fish safety tests could be shortened after the technicians had gained more experience in conducting the tests. The Government Laboratory and FEHD had bidden for additional resources to procure facilities for conducting food sample tests. Additional manpower would also be required for conducting food tests and inspections at import and wholesale levels, and this would partly be met by internal staff deployment. SHWF further said that Government Laboratory would provide technical assistance to private laboratories to enable them to conduct tests on malachite green.

34. The Chairman asked whether freshwater fish not supplied by registered farms would still be allowed to enter Hong Kong, if they were accompanied with health certificates. The Chairman further asked whether the suspension of import of freshwater fish via Man Kam To Control Point was caused by problems in the registration of fish farms in the Mainland.

35. SHWF said that there was presently no restriction on the import of fish. To ensure food safety of imported fish, the traders were requested to import fish accompanied by health certificates. However, he pointed out that it would take some time for the suppliers to specify in the health certificates that the fish was free from

Action

malachite green. He assured members that the Administration would conduct inspection at all levels of the food supply chain.

36. On the import of freshwater fish via Man Kam To Control Point, SHWF said that to his understanding, the inspection and quarantine authorities in Man Kam To Control Point required that aquatics products destined for Hong Kong must be accompanied by import and health certificates. Exports without the prerequisite certificates would be held. AD/AFCD added that as the suppliers for freshwater fish transported via Man Kam To Control Points were currently not on the list of registered fish farms in the Mainland, they were not allowed to export fish to Hong Kong under the new arrangements. AD/AFCD said that if the freshwater fish traders wished to have their current suppliers included in the list of registered fish farms, the Administration could assist the trade by passing the relevant information to the Mainland authorities. As the Mainland authorities would need time to consider the applications, the freshwater fish traders had agreed that they would obtain freshwater fish supply from the registered fish farms first, pending the Mainland authorities' decision on the list of registered farms.

37. Dr KWOK Ka-ki urged the Administration to put in place long-term measures for food safety as early as possible. Dr KWOK asked whether there was any mechanism to "blacklist" a registered fish farm in the Mainland if malachite green was found in its fish produce. Dr KWOK considered that to enhance public confidence in consuming freshwater fish and better protect the long-term interests of the freshwater fish traders and operators, the Administration should expedite the setting up of a mandatory food recall system and the Accredited Fish Farm Scheme for local fish produce. He was disappointed with the slow progress made in these areas.

38. SHWF said that the Administration had already been discussing with the Department of Justice in respect of the preparation of the legislation to regulate the import and sale of live fish. The Administration planned to introduce the legislation into the Legislative Council in the second half of the 2006-07 session. SHWF further said that if the fish produce from a registered fish farm was repeatedly found to contain malachite green, the Administration could request the Mainland authorities not to allow the farm concerned to supply fish to Hong Kong. The Administration would, however, respect the regulatory system in the Mainland. SHWF pointed out that following the gazettal of the Harmful Substances in Food (Amendment) Regulation 2005, DFEH could require the batch of problematic fish to be destroyed. He believed that public health was adequately safeguarded under the present regulatory framework, and the Administration would have to be very careful in considering whether to implement a mandatory food recall system.

39. On the Accredited Fish Farm Scheme, Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (DAFC) said that it was a voluntary scheme launched on a trial basis. He pointed out that the condition of some local fish farms had yet to meet the standards for joining the scheme, while some other farmers did not consider it

Action

necessary to join the scheme. AFCD would promote the scheme if there was support from local fish farmers. DAFC further said that with the implementation of the long-term policy of seafood safety, there would be a mandatory registration system for all operators. SHWF added that if only registered fish farms in the Mainland would be allowed to supply fish to Hong Kong, the same requirement should also apply to local fish farms and they would have to be registered in the long run.

40. Mr Vincent FANG said that it would take time for the Mainland authorities to consider applications for registered fish farms. The Administration should therefore discuss with the Mainland to allow supply of freshwater fish from fish farms not yet registered, if the fish was tested free from malachite green, in order to expedite the import of fish via Man Kam To Control Point. SHWF responded that the Administration would assist the trade in arranging import of freshwater fish via Man Kam To Control Point.

41. Mr Tommy CHEUNG pointed out that most of the freshwater fish sold at local market was sourced from fish farms operated by Hong Kong investors in the Mainland, and these operators had said that they did not use malachite green in fish rearing. He urged the Administration to assist the trade to pass the relevant information to the Mainland authorities for registration of these fish farms. If these farms could not be registered, the Administration should also find out the reasons and convey the information to the operators concerned. Mr CHEUNG further said that the Administration should speed up the implementation of the Accredited Fish Farm Scheme for local fish farms and for eel farms in the Mainland, in order to ensure stable and reliable supply of fish and eels to local market.

42. SHWF said that the Administration would seek further information and help the trade to apply for inclusion in the list of registered fish farms in the Mainland. He added that registration of eel farms and freshwater fish farms would be subject to the same requirements in the Mainland, and Hong Kong would also apply the same standards to local fish farms under the Accredited Fish Farm Scheme.

Financial assistance and compensation for freshwater fish traders

43. Mr Vincent FANG urged that in view of the difficulties faced by the trade in the past fortnight, the Administration should seriously consider granting financial assistance to the traders, such as rental waiver to fish traders operating in markets managed by FEHD and Housing Department, and interest-free loans to other traders.

44. SHWF responded that the Administration considered that there was insufficient justification to use public money to grant ex-gratia payment and rent reduction/waiver. As for the loan proposal, the Administration would need to study further the difficulties faced by the trade.

Action

45. Mr TAM Yiu-chung strongly urged the Administration to reconsider the request for providing financial assistance to members of the freshwater trade.

46. SHWF reiterated that he had discussed the matter with the Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau. Having considered the circumstances in the present case, the Administration did not consider there were justifications to use public money to grant ex-gratia payment and rental reduction/waiver.

47. Mr Vincent FANG said that as there would still be food incidents and crisis in future, the traders and operators would suffer financial loss each time. As Hong Kong relied heavily on food imported from many countries/places, it was impossible to exercise control at source for all food products. He suggested that the Administration should consider setting up an emergency relief fund to assist the trade to tide over food crises.

48. SHWF said that the Administration would have to be careful about the proposal of setting up a fund to assist the trade. To facilitate the Administration's consideration, the trade might wish to provide more details of the proposal, for example, the beneficiaries of the fund and the eligibility criteria.

49. Mr Tommy CHEUNG asked whether the Administration would assist the trade to claim compensation from the Mainland suppliers and traders for their loss as a result of the discovery of malachite green in the fish supplied.

50. SHWF said that the traders should study the terms in the sales contract and seek compensation according to the Mainland law.

Identification of malachite green in marine fish

51. Noting that malachite green was found in one sample of green grouper, Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that the Administration should adopt the same inspection and quarantine standard for freshwater and marine fish, irrespective of their places of origin.

52. Mr Tommy CHEUNG asked whether the problematic green grouper was sourced from Taiwan; if so, whether green grouper sourced from other places was safe for consumption.

53. SHWF said that six samples of marine fish were taken for testing of malachite green, and the presence of malachite green was confirmed in one sample taken from a green grouper. According to the supplier, the green grouper was most likely sourced from Taiwan. Taiwan had already withheld the sale of cultured green grouper until they were tested free from malachite green.

Action

54. In response to the Chairman, SHWF said that samples would be taken from cultured marine fish for testing under the Food Surveillance Programme under a risk-based approach. A systematic sampling test mechanism had yet to be devised in the longer term.

55. In concluding the discussion, the Chairman urged that the Administration should follow up with the Mainland authorities on the supply of freshwater fish via Man Kam To Control Point as early as possible.

56. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:35 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
18 April 2006