

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

### MINUTES

#### No. 4

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 26 October 2005 at 11:00 am,  
Thursday 27 October 2005 at 9:00 am and Friday 28 October 2005 at 9:00 am

---

#### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan (absent on 26.10.2005 & 27.10.2005)

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP (absent on 28.10.2005)

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP (absent on 26.10.2005 &  
27.10.2005)

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP (absent on 28.10.2005)

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP (absent on 26.10.2005)

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP (absent on 27.10.2005)  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP  
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP  
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS  
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung  
The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG (absent on 26.10.2005)  
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin  
The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Public officers attending:**

On 26.10.2005, 27.10.2005 and 28.10.2005

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

On 26.10.2005 and 28.10.2005

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, S.C., JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

On 27.10.2005 and 28.10.2005

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

On 28.10.2005

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP  
Head, Central Policy Unit

**Clerks in attendance:**

On 26.10.2005, 27.10.2005 and 28.10.2005

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

On 26.10.2005 and 27.10.2005

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

On 26.10.2005 and 28.10.2005

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 27.10.2005 and 28.10.2005

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

**Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Road Traffic (Driving Licences) (Fee Reduction) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 21.10.2005)	170/2005
2. Road Traffic (Registration and Licensing of Vehicles) (Fee Reduction) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 21.10.2005)	171/2005
3. Road Traffic (Village Vehicles) (Fee Reduction) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 21.10.2005)	172/2005
4. Road Traffic Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 5 — Charge Revision) Order 2005 (gazetted on 21.10.2005)	173/2005
5. Road Traffic (Reduction of Fee for Designation of Driving School) Order 2005 (gazetted on 21.10.2005)	174/2005
6. Hong Kong Science and Technology Parks Corporation Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 21.10.2005)	175/2005

**Other Papers**

- No.14 - Audited Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report for the Fish Marketing Organization for the year ended 31 March 2005 (published on 19.10.2005)
- No.15 - Audited Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report for the Vegetable Marketing Organization for the year ended 31 March 2005 (published on 19.10.2005)
- No.16 - Marine Fish Scholarship Fund Trustee's Report and Audited Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report on the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2005 (published on 19.10.2005)
- No.17 - Agricultural Products Scholarship Fund Trustee's Report and Audited Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report on the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2005 (published on 19.10.2005)
- No.18 - Urban Renewal Authority Annual Report 2004-2005 (published on 20.10.2005)

- No.19 - Office of the Telecommunications Authority  
Trading Fund Report 2004/05 (published on  
20.10.2005)
- No.20 - Hong Kong Council on Smoking and Health  
Annual Report 2004-2005 (published on 21.10.2005)
- No.21 - Hongkong Post  
Annual Report 2004/05 (published on 21.10.2005)

### **Questions**

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Motion of Thanks**

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council thanks the Chief Executive for his address.

Question on the motion proposed. The President stated that Hon LEE Wing-tat and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG would move amendments to the motion and that Hon TAM Heung-man would also move an amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the two amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

The President announced the commencement of the first debate session, which covered the following policy areas: administration of justice and legal services, constitutional affairs, public service and security.

Nine Members and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke.

While Dr Hon YEUNG Sum was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:32 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another four Members and Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke.

At 2:27 pm, while Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

22 further Members spoke.

At 7:15 pm, the President suspended the meeting for ten minutes.

The Council resumed at 7:25 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs and the Secretary for the Civil Service spoke.

At 8:04 pm, while the Secretary for the Civil Service was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Justice spoke.

The President announced the end of the first debate session and suspended the meeting at 8:34 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 27 October 2005 to continue to debate the Motion of Thanks.

The President announced the commencement of the second debate session, which covered the following policy areas: commerce and industry, economic services, financial affairs, information technology and broadcasting and labour.

15 Members and Hon TAM Heung-man spoke.

While Hon TAM Heung-man was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:38 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another two Members and Dr Hon Philip WONG spoke.

At 1:30 pm, while Dr Hon Philip WONG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

12 further Members spoke.

At 3:51 pm, the President suspended the meeting for ten minutes.

The Council resumed at 4:01 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Financial Secretary, the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury, the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology, the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke.

The President announced the end of the second debate session and the commencement of the third debate session, which covered the following policy areas: education, home affairs and manpower planning.

Five Members spoke.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG declared his interest as an appointed Member of Eastern District Council and spoke.

Another three Members and Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kwok-long spoke.

While Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kwok-long was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another five Members spoke.

At 6:59 pm, the President's Deputy suspended the meeting for ten minutes.

The Council resumed at 7:09 pm and the President resumed the chair.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke.

The President announced the end of the third debate session and the commencement of the fourth debate session, which covered the following policy areas: housing, planning, lands and works, environmental affairs and transport.

14 Members spoke.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:27 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*



The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 28 October 2005 to continue to debate the Motion of Thanks.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Another 18 Members spoke.

At 11:21 am, the President suspended the meeting for ten minutes.

The Council resumed at 11:31 am.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke.

The President announced the end of the fourth debate session and the commencement of the fifth debate session, which covered the following policy areas: food safety and environmental hygiene, health services and welfare services.

Two Members and Hon Andrew CHENG spoke.

While Hon Andrew CHENG was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another four Members and Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke.

At 1:47 pm, while Hon WONG Yung-kan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

17 more Members spoke.

At 4:16 pm, the President suspended the meeting for ten minutes.

The Council resumed at 4:26 pm.

The Financial Secretary and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke.

The President announced the end of the fifth debate session.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add "and, at the same time, urges the Chief Executive and the Government to expeditiously propose a timetable for the election of the Chief Executive and all members of the Legislative Council by universal suffrage, and to put forward concrete proposals on the relevant democratization processes including the abolition of the appointed and ex-officio seats in district councils, cancelling corporate votes in functional constituencies of the Legislative Council as well as expanding the electorate base and democratic elements in the Election Committee, so as to respond to the public's strong aspirations for democratic elections by universal suffrage and the establishment of an accountable government" after "his address".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

Hon TAM Heung-man moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment:

To delete "and, at the same time" after "the Chief Executive for his address"; to add "but as the proposed methods regarding constitutional development set out in the Fifth Report of the Constitutional Development Task Force, which the Chief Executive called on the community and this Council to support, fail to take democracy forward to meet the public's aspirations for elections by universal suffrage, this Council will not support them and" before "urges the Chief Executive"; and to add "and a roadmap" after "propose a timetable".

Question on Hon TAM Heung-man's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 19 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Motion of Thanks", the

Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed.

A Member spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 19 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 30 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add ", but as the address is inadequate regarding the effort to help the poor and fails to respond to the aspirations of the public, this Council expresses deep regret and urges the Chief Executive to expeditiously formulate a comprehensive policy on poverty alleviation so as to narrow the gap between the rich and the poor" after "his address".

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 22 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion, seven against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 30 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion and 18 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 2 November 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 5:22 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 28/10/2005  
 時間 TIME: 05:12:30 下午

動議 MOTION: 譚香文議員就李永達議員對劉健儀議員的「致謝議案」所提修正案，作出的修正案  
 HON TAM HEUNG-MAN'S AMENDMENT TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S AMENDMENT TO  
 HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚香文 TAM Heung-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	30	
投票 Vote	28	29	
贊成 Yes	7	15	
反對 No	19	14	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	陳偉業 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 28/10/2005  
 時間 TIME: 05:16:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員對劉健儀議員所提的「致謝議案」作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE WING-TAT TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達 LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	30	
投票 Vote	28	29	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	19	14	
棄權 Abstain	2	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 28/10/2005  
時間 TIME: 05:18:32 下午

動議 MOTION: 張超雄議員對劉健儀議員所提的「致謝議案」作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	30	
投票 Vote	28	29	
贊成 Yes	5	16	
反對 No	22	12	
棄權 Abstain	1	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謙申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shck	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 28/10/2005  
 時間 TIME: 05:21:25 下午

動議 MOTION: 「致謝議案」  
 "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	30	
投票 Vote	28	29	
贊成 Yes	20	11	
反對 No	7	18	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK