LC Paper No. CB(3) 127/05-06

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 5

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 2 November 2005 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP The Hon Margaret NG The Hon James TO Kun-sun The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH The Hon LEE Wing-tat The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung The Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, BBS The Hon CHIM Pui-chung The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG The Hon KWONG Chi-kin The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Public officers attending:

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP

Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1) Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2) Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments L.N. No.

- 1. Water Pollution Control (General) (Amendment) 178/2005 Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 2. Specification of Arrangements (Government of 179/2005 the Kingdom of Thailand) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion) Order (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 3. Air Pollution Control (Reduction of Fee for 180/2005 Permit for Open Burning) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 4. Air Pollution Control (Specified Processes) 181/2005 (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 5. Ozone Layer Protection (Fee Reduction) 182/2005 Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 6. Noise Control (General) (Fee Revision) 183/2005 Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 7. Noise Control (Air Compressors) (Fee Revision) 184/2005 Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 8. Noise Control (Hand Held Percussive Breakers) 185/2005 (Fee Revision) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 9. Dumping at Sea (Fees Adjustment) Regulation 186/2005 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 10. Building Management (Fee Revision) Regulation 187/2005 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 11. Hotel and Guesthouse Accommodation (Revision 188/2005 of Licence Fees) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 12. Preservatives in Food (Amendment) Regulation 189/2005 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)
- 13. Dangerous Drugs Ordinance (Amendment of Second 190/2005 Schedule) Order 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)

Other Papers

- No.22 Audited Statement of Accounts of the Customs and Excise Service Welfare Fund and its Summary, together with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 25.10.2005)
- No.23 The Government Minute in response to the Report No.44 of the Public Accounts Committee dated July 2005 (published on 2.11.2005)
- No.24 The Government Minute in response to the Seventeenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2005 (published on 2.11.2005)
- No.25 Hong Kong Science and Technology Parks Corporation Annual Report 2004/2005 (published on 31.10.2005)
- No.26 Hong Kong Productivity Council Annual Report 2004/2005 (published on 31.10.2005)

Report of the Bills Committee on Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005 (published on 28.10.2005)

Addresses

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to Report No. 44 of the Public Accounts Committee dated July 2005.

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Seventeenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2005

Questions

1. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 1.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

2. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

3. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

6. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 11 May 2005 resumed.

Hon Miriam LAU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Dr Hon David LI spoke on the Bill. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:48 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another five Members and Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the Bill.

At 2:19 pm, while Hon CHAN Yuen-han was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

13 further Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 55 Members were present, 42 were in favour of the motion, 11 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Revenue** (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005.

Question that clauses 1, 5, 11, 12 and 14 to 19 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 6 to 10 and 13 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee. Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 6 to 10 and 13, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the heading of Part 2, and clauses 3 and 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to the aforesaid heading and clauses and addressed the Committee.

Five Members spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 43 Members were present, 35 were in favour of the amendments and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

Question that the heading of Part 2, and clauses 3 and 4, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 1A, 3A, 3B, 3C, 3D, 3E, 3F, 3G, 3H, 3I, 3J, 3K, 3L, 8A, 9A, 9B, 9C, 9D, 9E, 12A, 15A and 20, new headings of Parts 3A, 3B and 6 and new subheadings before new clauses 9A and 9B read the first time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid new clauses, headings and subheadings and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid new clauses, headings and subheadings proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 1A, 3A, 3B, 3C, 3D, 3E, 3F, 3G, 3H, 3I, 3J, 3K, 3L, 8A, 9A, 9B, 9C, 9D, 9E, 12A, 15A and 20, new headings of Parts 3A, 3B and 6 and new subheadings before new clauses 9A and 9B read the second time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses, headings and subheadings to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 48 Members were present, 37 were in favour of the motion, nine against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Tung Chung Cable Car Ordinance

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Tung Chung Cable Car Bylaw, made by the MTR Corporation Limited on 17 October 2005, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Miriam LAU, Chairman of the Subcommittee on Proposed Resolution under Section 22 of the Tung Chung Cable Car Ordinance (Cap. 577), spoke on the motion.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Perfecting the food safety regulatory mechanism

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as a number of food safety incidents which occurred recently in Hong Kong have exposed the Government's shortcomings in the regulation of food safety, its slow reaction to emergencies and the inadequacies in the notification system between Hong Kong and the Mainland, and have also seriously affected the public's confidence in the Government's capability to perform the gate-keeping role, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) expeditiously implement the plan to re-organize the food safety regulatory framework after consulting this Council and the public at large, to ensure that the posts of frontline staff are not affected by the re-organization plan, and to enhance training for staff so that they can grasp the ever-changing food safety knowledge and meet the related new technological requirements;
- (b) strengthen and re-organize the existing consultative framework on food safety by including representatives from the agriculture and fisheries industries, catering industry, veterinary profession and consumer organizations, so that they can more comprehensively advise the Government on food safety matters;
- (c) step up Hong Kong's monitoring of foods at source at their places of origin;
- (d) conduct a comprehensive review of the existing standards and legislation on safe production of foods, including strictly regulating the use of drugs and chemicals and their residue contents in foods as well as the microbe counts in foods, etc, so as to ensure food safety;
- (e) perfect the food safety notification systems between Hong Kong and the Mainland as well as other places supplying food to Hong Kong, and to strengthen co-operation with the Mainland in combating food smuggling;
- (f) devote more resources to enhance the Government's capability in food testing and hygiene inspection;
- (g) study the establishment of a food tracking system and the implementation of food recall arrangements, so as to raise the Government's capability in handling food safety incidents;
- (h) study the establishment of a food safety certification mechanism whereby identification labels are awarded to safe, quality food products so as to help consumers make their choices; and

 expedite the pace in promoting a quality production and management scheme for local agricultural and fishery products, and to establish a branding system for local products,

in order to fully enhance Hong Kong's capability in regulating food safety and safeguard public safety in food consumption.

While Hon WONG Yung-kan was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 6:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Tommy CHEUNG would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "devote more resources to" after "(f)" and substitute with "through streamlining of administrative work and suitable deployment of resources,"; and to delete "food testing and hygiene inspection" after "enhance the Government's capability in" and substitute with "sampling inspection and testing of food, and perfect the hygiene inspection system based on the existing risk assessment mechanism".

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Yungkan's motion proposed.

Two Members and Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:15 pm, while Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 13 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and eight abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Yung-kan replied.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion put and agreed to.

Comprehensively developing the border area

Hon WONG Ting-kwong moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Chief Executive has announced in his Policy Address the decision to significantly reduce the size of the closed area and to redraw the limits of the new closed area so as to release land for redevelopment, this Council urges the Government to expedite the completion of the realignment of the closed area and formulation of the planning proposals, and to devise an overall strategy on this basis to comprehensively develop the border area between Hong Kong and Shenzhen, so as to create new growth areas for Hong Kong's economy, promote cooperation between Hong Kong and Shenzhen, facilitate the development of Hong Kong's trade in services, industries and tourism, and create new employment opportunities.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon SIN Chung-kai would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion and addressed the Council:

To add "; but given the presence of many sites of ecological and conservation value, such as wetlands and streams within the closed area, the Government must, in considering the development of these sites, ensure that the development plan is in line with the principles of sustainable development and nature conservation, and should conduct a comprehensive ecological assessment of the plan and then formulate suitable conservation measures and conduct planning in a prudent manner; the Government should also allow stakeholders, including green groups, to participate in the planning process with a view to ensuring that the policy of sustainable development can materialize" after "create new employment opportunities".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon WONG Tingkwong's motion proposed.

20 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon WONG Tingkwong's motion put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong replied.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 9 November 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 11:48 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai) President

Council Chamber Hong Kong

投票 VOTE:	1
日期 DATE:	02/11/2005
時間 TIME:	04:45:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年收入(取消遺產稅)條例草案》-二讀 REVENUE (ABOLITION OF ESTATE DUTY) BILL 2005 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

:55
:54
:42
:11
:1
••
:通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊 成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊 成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李華明	Fred LI	賀成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊 成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳爾儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國與	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
涂護申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彦	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊 成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
黄宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	費成	YES	粱國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黄容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊 成	YES	黄定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿 英書工	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES

c 秘書 CLERK_

投票 VOTE:	2
日期 DATE:	02/11/2005
時間 TIME:	05:28:37 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年收入(取消遺產稅)條例草案》-全體委員會審議階段-修正第2部的標題,以及 第3及4條 REVENUE (ABOLITION OF ESTATE DUTY) BILL 2005 - COMMITTEE STAGE -AMENDMENTS TO HEADING OF PART 2, AND CLAUSES 3 AND 4

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present 投票 Vote 贊成 Yes 反對 No	:35 :7	:43 :42
棄權 Abstain	:0	
編果 Result	.0	:通過 Passed

~

個別表決如下

THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍麗霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	貧成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	541%	110
涂蓮申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	賀成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	費成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
凍鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	費成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
発耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彦	Andrew LEUNG	費成	YES
單仲借	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
實宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊 成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
青容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	賀成	YES
會鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	員成	115
易孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
易森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黄定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
列千石	LAU Chin-shek			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	員祝	1120
的江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
的皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU	貝因	(مل 1
的健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO
創慧卿	Emily LAU			廓志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	<i>D</i> € ≢]	
素玉	CHOY So-vuk			譚香文	TAM Heung-man		

 \boldsymbol{c} B 秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3 日期 DATE: 02/11/2005 時間 TIME: 05:43:09 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年收入(取消遺產稅)條例草案》-三讀 REVENUE (ABOLITION OF ESTATE DUTY) BILL 2005 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present		:48
投票 Vote		:47
贊成 Yes	:37	
反對 No	:9	
棄權 Abstain	:1	
結果 Result		:通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

溶除欄泰 Mas Rita FAN 出席 PRESENT 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG 赞成 YES 田北俊 James TTEN 赞成 YES 電纜電 Timothy FOK 何錢少 Albert HO 環欄葉 TAM Yiu-chung 「 何錢來 Dr Raymond HO 贊成 YES 石碗謙 Abraham SHEK 贊成 YES 李年段 LEE Cheuk-yan 李鳳英 Li Fung-ying 反對 NO 李年段 Martin LEE 贊成 YES 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG 赞成 YES 各開算 Dr David LI 丁amany CHEUNG 赞成 YES 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG 赞成 YES 日期準 Dr LUI Ming-wah 赞成 YES 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG 赞成 YES 周羅線 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方剛 Wincent FANG 赞成 YES 周羅線 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方剛 Vincent FANG 赞成 YES 調整線 Daniel LAM 賢成 YES 李永麗美 LEE Wing-tat 赞成 YES 調整線 CHAN Yue-han 反對 NO 李國美 Lik wok-ying 赞成 YES 調整線 CHAN Yue-han 愛成 YES 李永麗美 LEE Wing-tat	譏員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
何後仁 Albert HO 環線宗 TAM Yiu-chung 何後佐 Page Abarham SHEKK 寶成 YES 李卓人 LEB Cheuk-yan 李鳳英 Li Fung-ying 反對 NO 李柱銘 Matin LEE 寶成 YES 張夫 Tommy CHEUNG 寶成 YES 李輻明 Fred LI 寶成 YES 湯枝基 Frederick FUNG 寶成 YES 書帮明 Fred LI 寶成 YES 湯右被 Audrey EU 反對 NO 具鋼織 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方利 Vincent FANG 寶成 YES 具鋼織 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方利 Vincent FANG 寶成 YES 異霸線 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方利 Vincent FANG 寶成 YES 異編織 Margaret NG 反對 NO 李都要 LEB Wing-tat 寶成 YES 環線線 CHEUNG Man-kwong 寶成 YES 李樹蒙 Draie LAM 寶成 YES 環次光 CHEUNG Man-kwong 寶成 YES 本備錄 Draie LAM 寶成 YES <td>范徐麗泰</td> <td>Mrs Rita FAN</td> <td>出席</td> <td>PRESENT</td> <td>鄭家富</td> <td>Andrew CHENG</td> <td>贊成</td> <td>YES</td>	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
何鐘樂 季卓人 季年社 教師 季雨賀 季雨賀 中間 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 中目 	田北俊	James TIEN	賀成	YES		-		
李卓人LEE Cheuk-yan李鳳英LI Fung-ying反對NO李柱銘Matin LEE贊成YES張字人Tommy CHEUNG贊成YES李爾賀Dr David LI陳偉菜Albert CHAN棄權ABSTAIN李華明Fred LI贊成YES馮若薇Audrey EU反對NO具偶儀Margaret NG反對NO方剛Vincent FANG贊成YES周梁淑怡Mrs Selina CHOW王國興WONG Kwok-hing反對NO崇雄申James TO贊成YES李郝蓮LEE Wing-tat赞成YES愚女光CHEUNG Man-kwong贊成YES李函麟Dr loseph LEE贊成YES陳娘婉爛CHAN Yuen-han反對NO李國麟Dr loseph LEE贊成YES陳館Bernard CHAN贊成YES林偉爺Daniel LAM贊成YES陳耀點LEUNG Yu-chang反對NO梁國離Jeffrey LAM贊成YES梁尔都Mrs Sophie LEUNG贊成YES馬力MA Lik贊成YES梁耀志LEUNG Yue-kan贊成YES累約NOYESNO黃宣弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES聚都Alan LEONG反對NO黃官弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES聚約Tr Fernando CHEUNG愛成YES寶古成Dr Philip WONG贊成YES張絕JacketLEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃官弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES張絕JacketHEUNG愛成YES灣古成TSANG Yok-sing <td>何俊仁</td> <td>Albert HO</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>譚耀宗</td> <td>TAM Yiu-chung</td> <td></td> <td></td>	何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
李柱銘 Martin LEE 贊成 YES 張子人 Tommy CHEUNG 赞成 YES 李華明 Fred LI 贊成 YES 張子人 Tommy CHEUNG 赞成 YES 三明曄 Dr LUI Ming-wah 贊成 YES 宗若薇 Audrey EU 反對 NO 吳霜織 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方剛 Vincent FANG 贊成 YES 與霜織 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方剛 Wincent FANG 贊成 YES 開梁淑怡 Ms Selina CHOW 王圓興 WONG Kwok-hing 反對 NO 涂護申 James TO 贊成 YES 李永達 LEE Wing-tat 贊成 YES 愚文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong 贊成 YES 李國戰 Daiseph LEE 贊成 YES 陳鄭和 CHAN Yuen-han 反對 NO 李國戰 Daiseph LEE 贊成 YES 陳蜜都 CHAN Kam-lam 贊成 YES 林偉強 Jatifrey LAM 贊成 YES 陳劉素 Mrs Sophie LEUNG 贊成 YES 馬力 MA Lik 贊成 YES 梁劉素 Mrs Sophie LEUNG 贊成 YES 郭家離 Dr KWOK Ka-ki 赞res YES 學印告 SIN Chung-kai 贊成 YES </td <td></td> <td>Dr Raymond HO</td> <td>贊成</td> <td>YES</td> <td>石藏謙</td> <td>Abraham SHEK</td> <td>贊成</td> <td></td>		Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石藏謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	
李韬贾 李耀明Dr David LI陳康樂 梁成Albert CHAN棄權 案權 ABSTAIN李華明 月明華 月年 日川 月 只屬微 細露aret NG 所留 人工 原 人工資成 文 資成 文 支 方第合差 茶港 茶 方 和 中 中 中 NO 大 三 方 市 中 市 市 市 市 中 市 市 市 中 市 市 市 中 市 市 市 中 市 市 市 中 市 市 中 市 市 市 中 市 市 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 市 中 市 中 市 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 市 中 中 中 中 中 中 市 中 市 中 	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan				LI Fung-ying	反對	
李華明Fred LI贊成YES湯檢基Frederick FUNG贊成YES呂明華Dr LUI Ming-wah贊成YES佘若薇Audrey EU反對NO吳爾德Margaret NG反對NO方剛Vincent FANG贊成YES周梁漱怡Mirs Selina CHOW王敏與WONG Kwok-hing反對NO涂護申James TO贊成YES李郝達LEE Wing-tat赞成YES强文光CHEUNG Man-kwong贊成YES李國麟Dr Joseph LEE贊成YES陳娘嫻CHAN Yuen-han反對NO李國麟Dr Joseph LEE贊成YES陳全和CHAN Kam-lam贊成YES林偉強Daniel LAM贊成YES梁劉柔芬Mirs Sophie LEUNG贊成YES馬力MA Lik贊成YES梁如忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彥Andrew LEUNG愛財NO黃官弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES梁爾雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃官弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES張超維Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES尊容根Howard YOUNG贊成YES張超維Dr Fernando CHEUNGWONG黃音士成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超維Dr Fernando CHEUNGWES續在LAU Chin-shek贊成YES黃宠和Ronny TONGWES劉仁和LAU Kong-wah贊成YES邊家錦Ronny TONGWES劉星報LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patick LAU劉建翰Emily LAU贊成YES </td <td>李柱銘</td> <td>Martin LEE</td> <td>贊成</td> <td>YES</td> <td></td> <td>Tommy CHEUNG</td> <td>贊成</td> <td>YES</td>	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES		Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華 與釋機Dr LUI Ming-wah 敏成贊成 反對YES佘若薇 Audrey EU反對NO具寫機 Margaret NG 原梁淑怡反對NO方剛Vincent FANG TB國興贊成 YESYES周粱淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW贊成 文艺YES王國興 李家建WONG Kwok-hing FS反對 NONO涂蓮申 湯面es TO 環交光贊成 YESYES李家建 李國興 LEE Wing-tat Diseph LEE 贊成 YESYES現約期 原報思 保留思 保留思 保留思Enard CHAN 資成 文艺YESPoiseph LEE 費成 YESYES陳範報 保留思 保留思 LEUNG Yiu-chung 支官弘 方容根 文目 方容根 (NOR Yung-kai YANG YESYESNOYES算容 物子 資方容根 分子 習 方容 方容 第二YESNOYESYES小伯倍 方容 方容 第二 方容 第二 方容 第二 方方面YESNOYESYES湯香華 個分 小ONG 方面 方方面 文字 方方面 文字YESNOYESYES湯香森 方方面 方方面 方方面 第二 <td>李國寶</td> <td>Dr David LI</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>陳偉業</td> <td>Albert CHAN</td> <td>棄權</td> <td>ABSTAIN</td>	李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
異 <table-cell><table-cell> 異靏機 Margaret NG 反對 NO 方剛 Vincent FANG 贊成 YES 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing 反對 NO 涂藤中 James TO 贊成 YES 李永達 LEE Wing-tat 贊成 YES 頑大光 CHEUNG Man-kwong 贊成 YES 李國獎 LI Kwok-ying 贊成 YES 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han 反對 NO 李國數 Daniel LAM 赞成 YES 陳尔智思 Bernard CHAN 贊成 YES 馬力 MA Lik 赞成 YES 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG 贊成 YES 馬力 MA Lik 赞成 YES 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai 贊成 YES 累定 #家傑 Alan LEONG 反對 NO 黃宮弘 Dr Philip WONG 贊成 YES 課家健 LEUNG Kwok-hung 反對 NO 黃宮衣根 WONG Yung-kan 贊成 YES 鄭家龍 Dr KWOK Ka-ki 贊成 YES 實容稅</table-cell></table-cell>	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES		Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
開架設治Mrs Selina CHOW王國與WONG Kwok-hing反對NO涂護申James TO贊成YES李永達LEE Wing-tat贊成YES張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong贊成YES李國獎LI Kwok-ying贊成YES陳婉嫻CHAN Yuen-han反對NO李國麟Dr Joseph LEE贊成YES陳館點Bernard CHAN贊成YES林偉強Daniel LAM贊成YES陳盤林CHAN Kam-lam贊成YES林偉鋒Jeffrey LAM贊成YES梁劉末芬Mrs Sophie LEUNG贊成YES馬力MA Lik贊成YES梁尔總忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彥Andrew LEUNG贊成YES梁尔總忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彥Andrew LEUNG贊成YES掌瘤忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彥Andrew LEUNG贊成YES掌瘤忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彥Andrew LEUNG贊成YES掌倉弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES梁家健Alan LEONG反對NO黃官弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES郭家離Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES贊古式TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超維Dr Fernando CHEUNG樹春華Howard YOUNG贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Kong-wah贊成YES竇尔虎竇尔虎YES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健畿Miriam LAU <t< td=""><td>呂明華</td><td>Dr LUI Ming-wah</td><td>贊成</td><td>YES</td><td>余若薇</td><td>Audrey EU</td><td>反對</td><td>NO</td></t<>	呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
涂護申James TO贊成YES李永達LEE Wing-tat贊成YES張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong贊成YES李國獎LI Kwok-ying贊成YES陳婉嫻CHAN Yuen-han反對NO李國賺Dr Joseph LEE贊成YES陳智思Bernard CHAN贊成YES林偉強Daniel LAM贊成YES陳鑑林CHAN Kam-lam贊成YES林偉鋒Jeffrey LAM贊成YES梁劉柔芬Mrs Sophie LEUNG贊成YES馬力MA Lik贊成YES梁劉忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彥Andrew LEUNG贊成YES彈伸借SIN Chung-kai贊成YES梁閣雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃宮弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES梁閣雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃宮和WONG Yung-kan贊成YES梁超雄Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES竇容根WONG Yung-kan贊成YES張超雄Dr Fernando CHEUNG黃容老Howard YOUNG贊成YES張舉明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES響告式TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張多聯Ronny TONG劉千石LAU Kong-wah贊成YES邊家聯Ronny TONG劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAUYES劉禁卿Emily LAU第衣YES鄭志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	吳靍儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong 預成賀成YES李國英LI Kwok-ying贊成YES陳婉嫻CHAN Yuen-han反對NO李國麟Dr Joseph LEE贊成YES陳智思Benard CHAN贊成YES林偉強Daniel LAM贊成YES陳鑑林CHAN Kam-lam贊成YES林健鋒Jeffrey LAM贊成YES梁劉柔芬Mrs Sophie LEUNG贊成YES馬力MA Lik贊成YES梁耀忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彥Andrew LEUNG贊成YES單仲偕SIN Chung-kai贊成YES梁國雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃宮弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES郭家麒Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES曾玄成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超雄Dr Fernando CHEUNG樹孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張舉明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES湯家聯Ronny TONG劉仁華LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Minam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉禁卿Emily LAUmaina LAU鄭成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國與	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
陳婉娟CHAN Yuen-han反對NO李國麟Dr Joseph LEE贊成YES陳智思Bernard CHAN贊成YES林偉強Daniel LAM贊成YES陳鑑林CHAN Kam-lam贊成YES林健鋒Jeffrey LAM贊成YES梁劉柔芬Mrs Sophie LEUNG贊成YES馬力MA Lik贊成YES梁耀忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彦Andrew LEUNG贊成YES單仲偕SIN Chung-kai贊成YES梁圂雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃宮弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES梁圂雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃宮根WONG Yung-kan贊成YES郭家麒Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES曾鈺成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超雄Dr Fernando CHEUNG楊孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張舉明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES湯家聯Ronny TONG劉仁華LAU Kong-wah贊成YES湯家聯Ronny TONG劉星發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉懋卿Emily LAU鄭志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN 資成 YES 林偉強 Daniel LAM 資成 YES 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam 資成 YES 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM 資成 YES 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG 贊成 YES 馬力 MA Lik 贊 成 YES 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG 贊成 YES 馬力 MA Lik 贊 成 YES 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung 反對 NO 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG 贊 成 YES 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai 贊成 YES 梁爾雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung 反對 NO 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG 贊成 YES 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki 贊成 YES 首在和 TSANG Yok-sing 贊成 YES 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki 贊成 YES 曾鉅成 TSANG Yok-sing 贊成 YES 弗超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG 贊成 YES 弗 舉明 CHEUNG Hok-ming 贊成 YES 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum 贊成 YES 费 定光 WONG Ting-kwong 贊成 YES 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek 贊成 YES 着 定光 WONG Ting-kwong 贊成 YES 劉王華 LAU Kong-wah 贊成 YES 詹 培忠 CHIM Pui-chung 贊成 YES 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat 贊成 YES 約 秀成 Patrick LAU 劉健儀 Miriam LAU 贊成 YES 郑經翰 Albert CHENG 贊 成 YES 劉慧卿 Emily LAU	張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam 資成 YES 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM 資成 YES 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG 資成 YES 馬力 MA Lik 資成 YES 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung 反對 NO 梁君彦 Andrew LEUNG 資成 YES 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai 資成 YES 梁爾雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung 反對 NO 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG 贊成 YES 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki 贊成 YES 尊容根 WONG Yung-kan 贊成 YES 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki 贊成 YES 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing 贊成 YES 現超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG 贊成 YES 現舉明 CHEUNG Hok-ming 贊成 YES 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum 贊成 YES 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong 贊成 YES 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek 贊成 YES 劉星華 LAU Kong-wah 贊成 YES 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung 贊成 YES 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat 贊成 YES 劉秀成 Patrick LAU 劉健儀 Miriam LAU 贊成 YES 鄭枢翰 Albert CHENG 贊成 YES 劉慧卿 Emily LAU	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬Mrs Sophie LEUNG贊成YES馬力MA Lik贊成YES梁耀忠LEUNG Yiu-chung反對NO梁君彦Andrew LEUNG贊成YES單仲偕SIN Chung-kai贊成YES梁家傑Alan LEONG反對NO黃宜弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES梁國雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃容根WONG Yung-kan贊成YES郭家麒Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES曾銘成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超雄Dr Fernando CHEUNG楊孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES楊森Dr YEUNG Sum贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES邊家驊Ronny TONGYES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAUFind斯彩電KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung 反對 NO 梁君彦 Andrew LEUNG 贊成 YES 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai 贊成 YES 梁敏雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung 反對 NO 黄宜弘 Dr Philip WONG 贊成 YES 梁敏雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung 反對 NO 黄容根 WONG Yung-kan 贊成 YES 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki 贊成 YES 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing 贊成 YES 張舉明 CHEUNG Hok-ming 贊成 YES 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG 贊成 YES 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong 贊成 YES 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek 贊成 YES 邊家驊 Ronny TONG 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah 贊成 YES 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung 贊成 YES 劉建敏 LAU Wong-fat 贊成 YES 劉秀成 Patrick LAU 劉健儀 Miniam LAU 贊成 YES 鄭枢翰 Albert CHENG 贊成 YES 劉悲卿 Emily LAU 	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
單仲偕SIN Chung-kai贊成YES梁家傑Alan LEONG反對NO黃宜弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES梁國雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃容根WONG Yung-kan贊成YES郭家麒Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES曾鈺成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超雄Dr Fernando CHEUNG楊孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES楊森Dr YEUNG Sum贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES邊密聯Ronny TONGYES劉星發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAU斯志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
黄宜弘Dr Philip WONG贊成YES梁國雄LEUNG Kwok-hung反對NO黃容根WONG Yung-kan贊成YES郭家麒Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES曾鈺成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張穆明Dr Fernando CHEUNG楊孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES楊森Dr YEUNG Sum贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES邊密聯Ronny TONGYES劉主華LAU Kong-wah贊成YES詹培忠CHIM Pui-chung贊成YES劉建發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAUYES劉戀儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAUFund新志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
黃谷根WONG Yung-kan贊成YES郭家麒Dr KWOK Ka-ki贊成YES曾鈺成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超雄Dr Fernando CHEUNG楊孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES楊森Dr YEUNG Sum贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES邊家驊Ronny TONG劉江華LAU Kong-wah贊成YES詹培忠CHIM Pui-chung贊成YES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAU歐志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贒 成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
曾鈺成TSANG Yok-sing贊成YES張超雄Dr Fernando CHEUNG楊孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES楊森Dr YEUNG Sum贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES湯家驊Ronny TONG劉江華LAU Kong-wah贊成YES詹培忠CHIM Pui-chung贊成YES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAU鄧志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
楊孝華Howard YOUNG贊成YES張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming贊成YES楊森Dr YEUNG Sum贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES湯家驊Ronny TONG劉江華LAU Kong-wah贊成YES詹培忠CHIM Pui-chung贊成YES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAUF鄭志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
楊森Dr YEUNG Sum贊成YES黃定光WONG Ting-kwong贊成YES劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES湯家驊Ronny TONG劉江華LAU Kong-wah贊成YES詹培忠CHIM Pui-chung贊成YES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAU歐志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
劉千石LAU Chin-shek贊成YES湯家驊Ronny TONG劉江華LAU Kong-wah贊成YES詹培忠CHIM Pui-chung贊成YES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成YES劉慧卿Emily LAU歐志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對NO	楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
劉江華LAU Kong-wah贊成 YES詹培忠CHIM Pui-chung贊成 YES劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成 YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成 YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成 YES劉慧卿Emily LAU歐志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對 NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黄定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉皇發LAU Wong-fat贊成 YES劉秀成Patrick LAU劉健儀Miriam LAU贊成 YES鄭經翰Albert CHENG贊成 YES劉慧卿Emily LAU鄭志堅KWONG Chi-kin反對 NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉健儀 Miniam LAU 贊成 YES 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG 贊成 YES 劉慧卿 Emily LAU 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin 反對 NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉慧卿 Emily LAU 鋼志堅 KWONG Chi-kin 反對 NO	劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU		
劉慧卿 Emily LAU 鋼志堅 KWONG Chi-kin 反對 NO	劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk 譚香文 TAM Heung-man	劉慧卿	Emily LAU			酈志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO
	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			譚香文	TAM Heung-man		

秘書 CLERK_

投票 VOTE: 日期 DATE: 時間 TIME:

ı

4 02/11/2005 09:06:28 下午

動議 MOTION: 張宇人議員對黃容根議員就「完善食物安全監管機制」所提議案作出的修正案 AMENDMENT BY HON TOMMY CHEUNG TO HON WONG YUNG-KAN'S MOTION ON "PERFECTING THE FOOD SAFETY REGULATORY MECHANISM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張宇人Tommy CHEUNG

	功能團體	地方選區	最後結果
	Functional Constituencies	Geographical Constituencies	Final Result
出席 Present	22	19	
投票 Vote	22	18	
贊成 Yes	12	2	
反對 No	6	8	
棄權 Abstain	4	8	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE			411.78**	
	nctional Constituencies	仅示	VOIE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	棄權	ABSTAIN		ographical Constituencies		
李國寶	Dr David LI	釆惟	ADSTAIN	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
子國員名明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES
吳鶴儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對反對	NO	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	棄權		李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG		ABSTAIN	李華明	Fred LI		
来到朱 一里仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW		
黄宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	涂護申	James TO	反對	NO
黄谷根			4 DOM + D *	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO
與在10 楊孝華	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
個子平 劉皇發	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
	LAU Wong-fat	A.A. 12		曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	-		劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	棄權	ABSTAIN
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
梁君彦	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES	李永逵	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
黄定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
酈志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO
						(A.1.)	

2 - ch