

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 5

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 2 November 2005 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung
The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin
The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Public officers attending:

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration
The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary
The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice
The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands
Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP

Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Water Pollution Control (General) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	178/2005
2. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Kingdom of Thailand) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion) Order (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	179/2005
3. Air Pollution Control (Reduction of Fee for Permit for Open Burning) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	180/2005
4. Air Pollution Control (Specified Processes) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	181/2005
5. Ozone Layer Protection (Fee Reduction) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	182/2005
6. Noise Control (General) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	183/2005
7. Noise Control (Air Compressors) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	184/2005
8. Noise Control (Hand Held Percussive Breakers) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	185/2005
9. Dumping at Sea (Fees Adjustment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	186/2005
10. Building Management (Fee Revision) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	187/2005
11. Hotel and Guesthouse Accommodation (Revision of Licence Fees) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	188/2005
12. Preservatives in Food (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	189/2005
13. Dangerous Drugs Ordinance (Amendment of Second Schedule) Order 2005 (gazetted on 28.10.2005)	190/2005

14. Securities and Futures (Investor Compensation — Levy) (Amendment) Rules 2005 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 28.10.2005) 191/2005

Other Papers

- No.22 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Customs and Excise Service Welfare Fund and its Summary, together with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 25.10.2005)
- No.23 - The Government Minute in response to the Report No.44 of the Public Accounts Committee dated July 2005 (published on 2.11.2005)
- No.24 - The Government Minute in response to the Seventeenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2005 (published on 2.11.2005)
- No.25 - Hong Kong Science and Technology Parks Corporation Annual Report 2004/2005 (published on 31.10.2005)
- No.26 - Hong Kong Productivity Council Annual Report 2004/2005 (published on 31.10.2005)

Report of the Bills Committee on Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005 (published on 28.10.2005)

Addresses

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to Report No. 44 of the Public Accounts Committee dated July 2005.

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Seventeenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2005

Questions

1. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 1.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

2. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

3. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

6. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 11 May 2005 resumed.

Hon Miriam LAU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Dr Hon David LI spoke on the Bill. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:48 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another five Members and Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the Bill.

At 2:19 pm, while Hon CHAN Yuen-han was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

13 further Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 55 Members were present, 42 were in favour of the motion, 11 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1, 5, 11, 12 and 14 to 19 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 6 to 10 and 13 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 6 to 10 and 13, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the heading of Part 2, and clauses 3 and 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to the aforesaid heading and clauses and addressed the Committee.

Five Members spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 43 Members were present, 35 were in favour of the amendments and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

Question that the heading of Part 2, and clauses 3 and 4, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 1A, 3A, 3B, 3C, 3D, 3E, 3F, 3G, 3H, 3I, 3J, 3K, 3L, 8A, 9A, 9B, 9C, 9D, 9E, 12A, 15A and 20, new headings of Parts 3A, 3B and 6 and new subheadings before new clauses 9A and 9B read the first time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid new clauses, headings and subheadings and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid new clauses, headings and subheadings proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 1A, 3A, 3B, 3C, 3D, 3E, 3F, 3G, 3H, 3I, 3J, 3K, 3L, 8A, 9A, 9B, 9C, 9D, 9E, 12A, 15A and 20, new headings of Parts 3A, 3B and 6 and new subheadings before new clauses 9A and 9B read the second time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses, headings and subheadings to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Bill 2005

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 48 Members were present, 37 were in favour of the motion, nine against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Tung Chung Cable Car Ordinance

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Tung Chung Cable Car Bylaw, made by the MTR Corporation Limited on 17 October 2005, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Miriam LAU, Chairman of the Subcommittee on Proposed Resolution under Section 22 of the Tung Chung Cable Car Ordinance (Cap. 577), spoke on the motion.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Perfecting the food safety regulatory mechanism

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as a number of food safety incidents which occurred recently in Hong Kong have exposed the Government's shortcomings in the regulation of food safety, its slow reaction to emergencies and the inadequacies in the notification system between Hong Kong and the Mainland, and have also seriously affected the public's confidence in the Government's capability to perform the gate-keeping role, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) expeditiously implement the plan to re-organize the food safety regulatory framework after consulting this Council and the public at large, to ensure that the posts of frontline staff are not affected by the re-organization plan, and to enhance training for staff so that they can grasp the ever-changing food safety knowledge and meet the related new technological requirements;
- (b) strengthen and re-organize the existing consultative framework on food safety by including representatives from the agriculture and fisheries industries, catering industry, veterinary profession and consumer organizations, so that they can more comprehensively advise the Government on food safety matters;
- (c) step up Hong Kong's monitoring of foods at source at their places of origin;
- (d) conduct a comprehensive review of the existing standards and legislation on safe production of foods, including strictly regulating the use of drugs and chemicals and their residue contents in foods as well as the microbe counts in foods, etc, so as to ensure food safety;
- (e) perfect the food safety notification systems between Hong Kong and the Mainland as well as other places supplying food to Hong Kong, and to strengthen co-operation with the Mainland in combating food smuggling;
- (f) devote more resources to enhance the Government's capability in food testing and hygiene inspection;
- (g) study the establishment of a food tracking system and the implementation of food recall arrangements, so as to raise the Government's capability in handling food safety incidents;
- (h) study the establishment of a food safety certification mechanism whereby identification labels are awarded to safe, quality food products so as to help consumers make their choices; and

- (i) expedite the pace in promoting a quality production and management scheme for local agricultural and fishery products, and to establish a branding system for local products,

in order to fully enhance Hong Kong's capability in regulating food safety and safeguard public safety in food consumption.

While Hon WONG Yung-kan was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 6:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Tommy CHEUNG would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "devote more resources to" after "(f)" and substitute with "through streamlining of administrative work and suitable deployment of resources,"; and to delete "food testing and hygiene inspection" after "enhance the Government's capability in" and substitute with "sampling inspection and testing of food, and perfect the hygiene inspection system based on the existing risk assessment mechanism".

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

Two Members and Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:15 pm, while Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 13 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and eight abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Yung-kan replied.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion put and agreed to.

Comprehensively developing the border area

Hon WONG Ting-kwong moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Chief Executive has announced in his Policy Address the decision to significantly reduce the size of the closed area and to redraw the limits of the new closed area so as to release land for redevelopment, this Council urges the Government to expedite the completion of the realignment of the closed area and formulation of the planning proposals, and to devise an overall strategy on this basis to comprehensively develop the border area between Hong Kong and Shenzhen, so as to create new growth areas for Hong Kong's economy, promote co-operation between Hong Kong and Shenzhen, facilitate the development of Hong Kong's trade in services, industries and tourism, and create new employment opportunities.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon SIN Chung-kai would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion and addressed the Council:

To add “; but given the presence of many sites of ecological and conservation value, such as wetlands and streams within the closed area, the Government must, in considering the development of these sites, ensure that the development plan is in line with the principles of sustainable development and nature conservation, and should conduct a comprehensive ecological assessment of the plan and then formulate suitable conservation measures and conduct planning in a prudent manner; the Government should also allow stakeholders,

including green groups, to participate in the planning process with a view to ensuring that the policy of sustainable development can materialize” after “create new employment opportunities”.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai’s amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong’s motion proposed.

20 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai’s amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong’s motion put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong replied.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong’s motion as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 9 November 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 11:48 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 02/11/2005
 時間 TIME: 04:45:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年收入（取消遺產稅）條例草案》 - 二讀
 REVENUE (ABOLITION OF ESTATE DUTY) BILL 2005 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present :55
 投票 Vote :54
 贊成 Yes :42
 反對 No :11
 棄權 Abstain :1
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 02/11/2005
 時間 TIME: 05:28:37 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年收入（取消遺產稅）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第2部的標題，以及第3及4條
 REVENUE (ABOLITION OF ESTATE DUTY) BILL 2005 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO HEADING OF PART 2, AND CLAUSES 3 AND 4

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present :43
 投票 Vote :42
 贊成 Yes :35
 反對 No :7
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			譚香文	TAM Heung-man		

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 02/11/2005
 時間 TIME: 05:43:09 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2005年收入（取消遺產稅）條例草案》- 三讀
 REVENUE (ABOLITION OF ESTATE DUTY) BILL 2005 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present :48
 投票 Vote :47
 贊成 Yes :37
 反對 No :9
 棄權 Abstain :1
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉卓發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			譚香文	TAM Heung-man		

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 02/11/2005
 時間 TIME: 09:06:28 下午

動議 MOTION: 張宇人議員對黃容根議員就「完善食物安全監管機制」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON TOMMY CHEUNG TO HON WONG YUNG-KAN'S MOTION ON
 "PERFECTING THE FOOD SAFETY REGULATORY MECHANISM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張宇人Tommy CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	19	
投票 Vote	22	18	
贊成 Yes	12	2	
反對 No	6	8	
棄權 Abstain	4	8	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鎮泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO