

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 10

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 7 December 2005 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung
The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin
The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Public officers attending:

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP

Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Registered Designs Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 2.12.2005)	215/2005
2. Trade Marks Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 2.12.2005)	216/2005
3. Patents Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Order 2005 (gazetted on 2.12.2005)	217/2005
4. Layout-Design (Topography) of Integrated Circuits (Designation of Qualifying Countries, Territories or Areas) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 2.12.2005)	218/2005
5. Designation of Libraries (No. 2) Order 2005 (gazetted on 2.12.2005)	219/2005
6. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 9) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 2.12.2005)	220/2005

Other Papers

- No.36 - Emergency Relief Fund Trustee's Report on the Fund and Audited Statement of Accounts and Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 March 2005 (published on 30.11.2005)
- No.37 - Annual Report of The Prince Philip Dental Hospital by its Board of Governors, and Audited Statement of Accounts and Auditor's Report for the Hospital, for the period from 1 April 2004 to 31 March 2005 (published on 1.12.2005)

Questions

1. Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon CHAN Kam-lam asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

3. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Hon LI Kwok-ying asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

6. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Democratic political system

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as Hong Kong people have taken to the streets many times to strive for the dual elections by universal suffrage, this Council urges the Hong Kong SAR Government to seriously consider submitting a report to the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress to reflect to it Hong Kong people's strong aspirations for universal suffrage, and to propose in the report a timetable and a roadmap for universal suffrage that are acceptable to Hong Kong people, so that the Chief Executive and all Members of the Legislative Council can be elected by universal suffrage as soon as possible.

Question on the motion proposed.

Three Members and Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion.

While Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:22 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon TONG Ka-wah spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 1:25 pm, the President resumed the chair. At 1:34 pm, a quorum was present and Hon TONG Ka-wah continued to speak.

While Hon TONG Ka-wah was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:35 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another eight Members and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the motion.

At 2:35 pm, while Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum replied.

Question on the motion put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, 19 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Endeavouring to improve air quality

Hon James TIEN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, further to the passage of my motion on "Vigorously reducing air pollution" by this Council last year, I put forward a proposal on "Collaborating in tackling cross-border air pollution" jointly with 92 members of the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference at its meeting in March this year; the proposal received positive response from the State Environmental Protection Administration of China which has indicated that it will continue to take the lead and coordinate the work in this regard in order to enhance cooperation between Hong Kong and Guangdong on the environmental protection front; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to adopt the following complementary measures more positively with a view to curbing the trend of continuing deterioration of air quality in Hong Kong and the Pearl River Delta ("PRD") region:

On the cooperation between Hong Kong and Guangdong:

- (a) endeavouring to achieve as early as possible the emission reduction targets for 2010 regarding the four types of pollutants;
- (b) expediting the formal commissioning of the PRD regional air quality monitoring network and other effective measures, so as to expeditiously unify the emission standards and regulatory regimes between Hong Kong and Guangdong;
- (c) expeditiously implementing the emissions trading pilot scheme;

- (d) stepping up negotiations with the Mainland authorities to provide business operators who have installed air pollution control systems in their plants in the PRD region with tax relief on depreciation of the relevant systems;
- (e) maintaining close cooperation with the State Environmental Protection Administration of China to promote the prevention and control of regional air pollution;

On the local front:

- (f) introducing legislation to require motorists to switch off the engines of their vehicles while waiting, and according priority to regulating emissions from idling engines of private cars and government vehicles; and
- (g) on condition that there is no additional burden of electricity charges on the public or the industrial and commercial sectors, urging the two power companies to expedite various emission reduction projects and use more environmentally friendly fuels, so that the emission reduction targets originally set for 2010 can be achieved as early as possible.

Question on Hon James TIEN's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon SIN Chung-kai would move amendments to the motion and that Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung would also move an amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the two amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHOY So-yuk, Hon SIN Chung-kai, Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and 18 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TIEN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion:

To add ", as amended by other Members," after " 'Vigorously reducing air pollution' "; to add "and enhancing the transparency in the dissemination of the monitoring information," after "effective measures,"; to add "and the Guangdong Environmental Protection Bureau" after "State Environmental Protection Administration of China"; to add "as well as idling engines of vehicles in school and hospital premises" after "government vehicles"; to delete "and" before "(g)"; and to add "; (h) further promoting the incentive

scheme for liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) light buses and extending it to light goods vehicles; (i) considering the provision of additional sites for setting up LPG filling stations; (j) actively engaging in research and development regarding the utilization of renewable energy, formulating a policy on renewable energy, setting utilization targets for renewable energy, requesting the two power companies to follow such policy and targets, stipulating in the Scheme of Control Agreements with the power companies the proportion of renewable energy to be used in electricity generation, and providing economic incentives to encourage the power companies to use more renewable energy; at the same time, formulating measures to promote the incorporation of renewable energy equipment into the power supply network; (k) vigorously introducing other types of environmentally friendly vehicles and environmentally friendly fuels, and formulating related incentive measures; (l) actively studying the feasibility of increasing the fines for smoky vehicles; (m) formulating a comprehensive and effective policy on energy conservation, with the Government taking the lead in implementing energy conservation measures in various departments and setting higher energy conservation targets, with a view to promoting community-wide involvement in energy conservation; (n) expeditiously implementing the regulatory scheme for products containing volatile organic compounds on which the Government and the trades have reached a consensus; (o) stepping up the testing of emissions from vehicles to ensure their compliance with Hong Kong's emission standards; and (p) expediting the implementation of the 'Indoor Air Quality Management Programme' and joining hands with the industrial and commercial sectors in actively promoting the programme, thereby preventing poor indoor air quality from harming the public's health" after "environmentally friendly fuels".

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion proposed.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung moved the following amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment:

To delete "further promoting" after "(h)" and substitute with "prolonging"; to delete "extending it to" after "light buses and" and substitute with "promoting the switch of"; to add "to LPG" after "light goods vehicles"; to delete "considering" after "(i)" and substitute with "expediting"; to delete "other types of" after "vigorously introducing"; and to delete "and" after "environmentally friendly vehicles" and substitute with "which run on a combination of petrol and electricity, hydrogen or natural gas, etc, including heavy and medium goods vehicles as well as buses; offering tax concessions and introducing".

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Endeavouring to improve air quality", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment, as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, to Hon James TIEN's motion put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon SIN Chung-kai to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following further amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion, as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; furthermore, this Council also urges the Government to enhance cooperation between Hong Kong and Guangdong with a view to unifying the fuel standards and regulatory regimes between Hong Kong and Guangdong, set up a matching grant fund, which can accept donations from the business sector, with the objectives of encouraging and subsidizing business operators in the PRD region to develop and promote emission treatment equipment, and take forward projects that can help clean the air in the PRD region, while at the same time establish a dedicated committee to manage the fund" after "the public's health".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung proposed and put.

Hon CHOY So-yuk claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and four abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TIEN replied.

Question on Hon James TIEN's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 14 December 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:31 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 07/12/2005
 時間 TIME: 03:05:48 下午

動議 MOTION: 「民主政制」議案
 MOTION "DEMOCRATIC POLITICAL SYSTEM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	28	
投票 Vote	27	27	
贊成 Yes	7	16	
反對 No	19	11	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 07/12/2005
時間 TIME: 06:23:21 下午

動議 MOTION: 林健鋒議員就蔡素玉議員對田北俊議員的「致力改善空氣質素」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON JEFFREY LAM'S AMENDMENT TO HON CHOY SO-YUK'S AMENDMENT TO HON JAMES TIEN'S MOTION ON "ENDEAVOURING TO IMPROVE AIR QUALITY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	16	14	
反對 No	4	1	
棄權 Abstain	3	9	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 07/12/2005
時間 TIME: 06:28:38 下午

動議 MOTION: 單仲偕議員對田北俊議員就「致力改善空氣質素」所提，經蔡素玉議員（及林健鋒議員）修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON SIN CHUNG-KAI TO HON JAMES TIEN'S MOTION ON "ENDEAVOURING TO IMPROVE AIR QUALITY" AS AMENDED BY HON CHOY SO-YUK (AND HON JEFFREY LAM)

動議人 MOVED BY: 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	22	
投票 Vote	22	21	
贊成 Yes	5	9	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	1	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES