

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 13

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 11 January 2006 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP

Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Antiquities and Monuments (Declaration of Historical Building) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 30.12.2005)	236/2005
2. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 10) Notice 2005 (gazetted on 30.12.2005)	237/2005
3. Business Registration (Fee Reduction) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 6.1.2006)	1/2006
4. Dutiable Commodities (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 6.1.2006)	2/2006
5. Inland Revenue Ordinance (Amendment of Schedules 5 and 11 — Fee Revision) Order 2006 (gazetted on 6.1.2006)	3/2006
6. Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Fourth and Fifth Schedules) Order 2006 (gazetted on 6.1.2006)	4/2006
7. Statutes of the Chinese University of Hong Kong (Amendment) Statutes 2005 (gazetted on 6.1.2006)	5/2006
8. Statutes of the Chinese University of Hong Kong (Amendment) (No. 2) Statute 2005 (gazetted on 6.1.2006)	6/2006
9. Evidence (Miscellaneous Amendments) Ordinance 2003 (Commencement) Notice 2006 (gazetted on 6.1.2006)	7/2006

Other Papers

No.55 - Legal Aid Services Council
Annual Report 2004-2005 (published on 5.1.2006)

Report of the Bills Committee on Civil Aviation (Amendment)
Bill 2005 (published on 5.1.2006)

Questions

1. Hon SIN Chung-kai asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

3. Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

4. Hon Fred LI asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

10 Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

6. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Employment (Increase in Penalty for Offences under Section 63C) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 14 December 2005 resumed.

Nine Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Employment (Increase in Penalty for Offences under Section 63C) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour reported that

the **Employment (Increase in Penalty for Offences under Section 63C) Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Civil Aviation (Amendment) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 1 June 2005 resumed.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, a member of the Bills Committee on Civil Aviation (Amendment) Bill 2005, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill.

One Member spoke on the Bill.

After declaring his interest as an executive committee member of the Board of Airline Representatives Hong Kong and also an employee of the Cathay Pacific Airways, Hon Howard YOUNG spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Civil Aviation (Amendment) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved amendments to clause 2 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour reported that

the **Civil Aviation (Amendment) Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China

Hon TSANG Yok-sing moved the motion in Appendix I and addressed the Council.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Expediting the construction of the MTR South Island Line

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, given the successive completion of the Ocean Park's Redevelopment Plans from 2008 onwards and that works on the new tourism projects will be launched in Southern District, which are expected to further aggravate the already very heavy traffic in the district, to alleviate traffic congestion, complement tourism development and give impetus to the local economy, this Council urges the Government to expedite the construction of the MTR South Island Line, but should study in parallel how vicious competition of the new line with other public transport such as minibuses or buses can be avoided, thereby protecting the public's right to choose and their interests.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that Dr Hon YEUNG Sum would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's motion and addressed the Council:

To add "for commissioning in or before 2012" after "MTR South Island Line".

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's motion proposed.

One Member and Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee was speaking, the President left the chair at 3:06 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another three Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

After declaring his interest as a board member of Ocean Park Corporation, Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Seven more Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Howard YOUNG spoke on the amendment.

At 4:17 pm, while Hon Howard YOUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's motion put and agreed to.

Hon Howard YOUNG replied.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's motion as amended by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put and agreed to.

Comprehensive review of labour legislation

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the economic pattern and labour relations in Hong Kong have changed, the existing labour legislation cannot keep abreast of the times and fails to improve the protection of workers' rights and benefits, this Council urges the Administration to expeditiously conduct a comprehensive review of various legislation relating to labour matters.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon Andrew CHENG would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung, Hon Andrew CHENG, 15 Members and Hon Howard YOUNG consecutively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Howard YOUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:02 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another three Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the amendments.

At 7:32 pm, while WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add "which is full of flaws and loopholes" after "existing labour legislation"; and to add ", including: (a) abolishing the requirement in the definition of 'continuous employment' under the Employment Ordinance that an employee has to work for 18 hours or more in a week in order to be deemed to have been in continuous employment; (b) preventing employers from evading their statutory liability by employing employees under service contracts instead of employment contracts; (c) introducing legislative provisions to provide for employees' right to protection by collective agreement, and formulating a set of fair and objective procedures for recognizing trade unions in conducting collective bargaining; (d) introducing legislative provisions to provide for the right of citizens or employees to seek civil remedy from the Labour Tribunal should they be discriminated against by employers in appointment, remuneration, promotion, transfer or other areas of employment for their being members of trade unions or for participating in activities of trade unions; (e) introducing legislative provisions to protect citizens or employees against age discrimination by employers in appointment, remuneration, promotion, transfer, dismissal or other areas of employment, and to provide for the right of victims of age discrimination to seek civil remedy from the Labour Tribunal; (f) introducing legislative provisions to protect employees against unfair dismissal by employers, and to provide for the right of victims of unfair dismissal to seek civil remedy from the Labour Tribunal; (g) increasing the criminal penalties for offences of unlawful dismissal (i.e. offences under sections 15(1), 21B(2)(b), 33(4B) and 72B(1) of the Employment Ordinance, section 6 of the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance and section 48 of the Employees' Compensation Ordinance); (h) abolishing the provision that the court or the Labour Tribunal shall only make an order for reinstatement or re-engagement upon agreement by the employer under section 32N of the Employment Ordinance; (i) abolishing the provision that severance payments or terminal payments made to an employee under Part VIA of the Employment Ordinance

may be offset by the employer's contributions under the occupational retirement scheme or Mandatory Provident Fund Scheme ('MPFS'); (j) enacting law for stipulating a minimum wage and regulating employees' working hours; (k) reviewing the criminal liability of directors, managers, secretaries or other similar officers of body corporate in respect of offences relating to defaults on employees' wages; (l) amending section 43C of the Employment Ordinance to the effect that the liability of a principal contractor and its superior sub-contractor(s) to pay wages of employees of sub-contractor(s) be increased to the amount of wages due to such employees for four months; (m) introducing family commitment leave and training leave, and gradually converting all public holidays to paid statutory holidays; (n) extending the period of paid maternity leave to 12 weeks, and increasing the rate of maternity leave pay to 100% of the employee's normal wages; (o) abolishing the provision that an employee is entitled to sickness allowance only if the sick leave taken is not less than four consecutive days, and increasing the rate of sickness allowance to 100% of the employee's normal wages; and (p) extending the application of the MPFS to domestic employees, and abolishing the provision that housing allowance is not regarded as part of the relevant income" after "legislation relating to labour matters".

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Comprehensive review of labour legislation", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed.

One Member spoke on the motion.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add ", to enact law for protecting employees against unfair dismissal, and to expeditiously reintroduce into the Legislative Council the pieces of labour legislation that were repealed by the Provisional Legislative Council, so as to reinstate employees' right to collective bargaining" after "legislation relating to labour matters".

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add ", to promote five-day work week and to enact law for regulating the weekly standard working hours" after "legislation relating to labour matters".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority

of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing replied.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, seven were in favour of the motion and 13 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 24 were in favour of the motion and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 12 January 2006 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 8:07 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

BASIC LAW OF THE HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION OF
THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA

RESOLUTION

(Under Article 75 of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of
the People's Republic of China)

RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL OF THE
HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION

RESOLVED that the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong
Special Administrative Region be amended —

(a) in Rule 24 —

(i) in subrule (3), by repealing everything after “reply” and substituting
a full stop;

(ii) by adding —

“(3A) Notwithstanding the provision in subrule (3), the
President may, if in his opinion an additional question is an
important one of public concern, allow a Member to ask that
additional question.”;

(iii) by adding —

“(5) The reference to “questions” in subrule (3) shall not
include a question asked under Rule 26(6) or (6A) (Asking and
Answering of Questions).”;

(b) in Rule 26 —

(i) by repealing subrule (6) and substituting —

“(6) If a Member is not present to ask his question when that
question is reached on the Agenda, the question may with his
consent be asked by another Member.”;

(ii) by adding —

“(6A) If the President is satisfied that a Member is not present to ask his question and no other Member present has the consent of the Member to ask the question under subrule (6), the President shall call upon the chairman of the House Committee to ask the question.

(6B) In subrule (6A), “the chairman of the House Committee” shall mean –

- (a) “the deputy chairman of the House Committee” if the chairman of the House Committee is not present ; or
- (b) “the Member present who has the highest precedence in the order of precedence of Members as determined in accordance with Rule 1A (Precedence of Members)” if both the chairman and deputy chairman of the House Committee are not present.”;

(iii) by repealing subrule (8) and substituting —

“(8) No question of which notice has been given may be withdrawn, except —

- (a) where the question is a question for which a written answer has been sought, the Member who has given notice of such question may withdraw it by giving notice to the Clerk not less than one and a half hours before the meeting at which the question is to be asked; or
- (b) where a Member is called by the President to ask his question under subrule (3), he may, with leave of the Council, withdraw the question before the question is asked if there is no dissenting voice, and no debate may arise on the withdrawal of the question.”.

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 11/01/2006
 時間 TIME: 07:54:31 下午

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對王國興議員就「全面檢討勞工法例」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON
 "COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF LABOUR LEGISLATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	26	
投票 Vote	21	25	
贊成 Yes	6	17	
反對 No	14	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉卓發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 11/01/2006
時間 TIME: 07:59:14 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁耀忠議員對王國興議員就「全面檢討勞工法例」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG YIU-CHUNG TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON
"COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF LABOUR LEGISLATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	26	
投票 Vote	21	25	
贊成 Yes	7	17	
反對 No	14	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 11/01/2006
時間 TIME: 08:01:28 下午

動議 MOTION: 鄭家富議員對王國興議員就「全面檢討勞工法例」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ANDREW CHENG TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON
"COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF LABOUR LEGISLATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	26	
投票 Vote	21	25	
贊成 Yes	7	17	
反對 No	14	2	
棄權 Abstain	0	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 11/01/2006
時間 TIME: 08:05:49 下午

動議 MOTION: 「全面檢討勞工法例」議案
MOTION "COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF LABOUR LEGISLATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	27	
投票 Vote	20	26	
贊成 Yes	7	24	
反對 No	13	2	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES