

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

### MINUTES

No. 17

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 15 February 2006 at 11:00 am

---

#### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long  
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP

Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP

Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP

Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Legal Aid (Assessment of Resources and Contributions) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 10.2.2006)	21/2006
2. Legal Aid (Charge on Property) (Rate of Interest) Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 10.2.2006)	22/2006

### **Other Papers**

No.66 - Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2005 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 45)  
(February 2006 - P.A.C. Report No. 45)  
(published on 15.2.2006)

Report on working poverty by the Subcommittee to Study the Subject of Combating Poverty (published on 14.2.2006)

### **Address**

Dr Hon Philip WONG, Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's report on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2005 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 45).

**Questions**

1. Hon James TO asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

2. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 2.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

3. Hon Tommy CHEUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

4. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

6. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## Motions

### Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the following Regulations, made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 19 January 2006, be approved -

- (a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment) Regulation 2006; and
- (b) the Poisons List (Amendment) Regulation 2006.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

## Members' Motions

### Implementing the recommendations in the Report on Working Poverty by the Subcommittee to Study the Subject of Combating Poverty

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council endorses the Report on Working Poverty by the Subcommittee to Study the Subject of Combating Poverty, and urges the Government to implement the recommendations therein.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:31 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

After declaring that she was a member of Subcommittee to Study the Subject of Combating Poverty and a member of the Commission on Poverty, Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the motion.

Another Member and Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long spoke on the motion.

At 2:34 pm, while Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another six Members spoke on the motion.

After declaring that she was a member of Subcommittee to Study the Subject of Combating Poverty, Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the motion.

Three more Members and the Financial Secretary spoke on the motion.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### **Opening up the electricity market**

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the electricity market in Hong Kong is currently monopolized by two power companies, prejudicing consumers' interests, this Council demands that the Government implement the following measures to ensure that Hong Kong's electricity market is free from monopoly, so that the people of Hong Kong can enjoy reasonable electricity supply services:

- (a) lowering the permitted return allowed to the power companies in respect of their electricity-related operations for each year from the current 13.5% of their average net fixed assets to 7% or below;
- (b) strengthening the regulation of power plants to ensure that their operations and emissions comply with the relevant environmental protection standards, and formulating practicable measures to ensure that the power companies actively develop renewable energy;
- (c) opening up the electricity market in the coming 10 years, so as to introduce competition and break the current monopoly of Hong Kong's electricity market by the two companies; and
- (d) requesting the CLP Power Hong Kong Limited to offer rebates to its customers by the year 2008 using funds from its Development Fund.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, Hon TAM Heung-man and Hon KWONG Chi-kin would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.



Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, Hon TAM Heung-man, Hon KWONG Chi-kin and 20 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion:

To delete ", as" after "That" and substitute with "this Council urges the Government to earnestly improve the current phenomenon of natural monopoly in"; to delete "is currently monopolized by two power companies" after "electricity market in Hong Kong"; to add "so as to avoid" before "prejudicing consumers' interests,"; to delete "this Council" after "prejudicing consumers' interests," and substitute with "and"; to delete "reasonable" after "Hong Kong can enjoy" and substitute with "reasonably-charged, safe and stable"; to add "re-setting electricity tariffs at a reasonable level by" after "(a)"; to delete "emissions" after "their operations and" and substitute with "the pollutants emitted"; to add "as well as providing proper incentives" after "formulating practicable measures"; to add "setting a timetable for" after "(c)"; to add "in Hong Kong and aiming for its implementation" after "opening up the electricity market"; to add "natural" after "break the current"; to delete "and" after "by the two companies,"; to add "in proportion to their electricity consumption" after "offer rebates to its customers"; and to add "; and (e) actively studying the full implementation of power interconnection" after "using funds from its Development Fund".

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 26 were in favour of the amendment and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Opening up the electricity market", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon TAM Heung-man to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon TAM Heung-man moved the following further amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "its Development Fund;"; and to add ", expeditiously discussing with the Guangdong Provincial Government the implementation of interconnection, and opening up the transmission network to new electricity suppliers; (f) formulating policy incentives to ensure that the power companies progressively relinquish coal-fired power generation, and actively develop emissions reduction facilities; and (g) conducting studies on the long-term development of those industries engaged in the unbundling of generation, transmission and distribution of electricity" after "full implementation of power interconnection".

Question on Hon TAM Heung-man's amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, one was in favour of the amendment, 20 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 23 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The President stated that as Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon KWONG Chi-kin to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon KWONG Chi-kin moved the following further amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "its Development Fund;"; and to add "; and (f) requesting that the two power companies shall ensure the stability of their workforce, and recruit their technical staff at all levels in a planned manner and provide them with continuing training, so as to secure a reliable and stable supply of electricity" after "implementation of power interconnection".

Question on Hon KWONG Chi-kin's amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Albert CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen and Hon KWONG Chi-kin put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and five against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present and 28 were in favour of the motion. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen and Hon KWONG Chi-kin was carried.

### **Reducing the salaries tax**

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the continuous recovery of Hong Kong's economy and the improved government finances, this Council urges the Government to make appropriate use of its resources to provide the grass-roots people with adequate services, and to reduce the salaries tax so as to alleviate the tax burden on the middle class and the grass-roots people, thereby stimulating consumer spending and creating jobs.

While Hon SIN Chung-kai was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 7:21 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon James TIEN, Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon TAM Heung-man would move amendments to the motion and that Hon James TO would also move an amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the five amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TIEN and Hon CHAN Kam-lam spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:47 pm, while Hon CHAN Kam-lam was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG, Hon TAM Heung-man, Hon James TO and 19 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TIEN moved the following amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion:

To delete "in view of" after "That," and substitute with "as the Treasury of the Government has benefited from"; to delete "and the improved government finances" after "Hong Kong's economy" and substitute with ", which has improved the Government's financial position and will likely advance the elimination of the fiscal deficit"; to add "rates of" after "and to reduce the"; and to add "by reverting them to at least the 2002-03 level," after "salaries tax".

Question on Hon James TIEN's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Reducing the salaries tax", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon James TIEN's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon CHAN Kam-lam to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following further amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon James TIEN and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; to revert the personal allowances and the marginal tax bands to the 2002-03 level; to raise the child allowance and the allowances for dependent parent/grandparent; to further increase the entitlement period and the amount of home loan interest deduction; and to introduce tax deduction for voluntary contributions to the Mandatory Provident Fund" after "2002-03 level".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon James TIEN proposed.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment:

To delete "introducing tax deduction for" after "(d)" and substitute with "studying allowing"; and to add "to be tax deductible up to a ceiling" after "Mandatory Provident Fund".

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment, as amended by Hon James TO, to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion which had been amended by Hon James TIEN, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment if Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment was agreed. Hon WONG Kwok-hing had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

The President stated that as the amendments moved by Hon James TIEN, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon James TO had been agreed, she granted leave for Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following further amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon James TIEN, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon James TO and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; the services provided by the Government to the grass-roots people should include: (a) increasing the medical waivers for the elderly, the vulnerable, the disabled, the chronically ill and the poor families; (b) reverting the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance rates for the elderly, the vulnerable, the disabled and the children to the levels prior to their reduction in 2003; (c) reverting the rates of Disability Allowance to the levels prior to their reduction in 2003; (d) freezing the charges for all livelihood-related items, including medical and educational fees; (e) increasing the financial commitments for medical services, education and social welfare; and (f) increasing the financial commitments for leisure and cultural facilities in new towns, e.g. libraries, swimming pools, sports centres and sportsgrounds" after "creating jobs".

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon James TIEN, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon James TO proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment and five against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The President stated that Hon TAM Heung-man had indicated that she would withdraw her amendment if any of the amendments to the motion was agreed. Hon TAM Heung-man had therefore withdrawn her amendment.

Hon SIN Chung-kai replied.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon James TIEN, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon James TO put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 14 were in favour of the motion, four against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion, five against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended by Hon James TIEN, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon James TO was carried.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 22 February 2006 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 10:54 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 15/02/2006  
 時間 TIME: 07:05:46 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁君彥議員對陳偉業議員就「開放電力市場」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON ANDREW LEUNG TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON  
 "OPENING UP THE ELECTRICITY MARKET"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	28	
投票 Vote	22	27	
贊成 Yes	17	26	
反對 No	4	0	
棄權 Abstain	1	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁繼忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 15/02/2006  
時間 TIME: 07:10:15 下午

動議 MOTION: 譚香文議員對陳偉業議員就「開放電力市場」所提，經梁君彥議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON TAM HEUNG-MAN TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON "OPENING UP THE ELECTRICITY MARKET" AS AMENDED BY HON ANDREW LEUNG

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚香文 TAM Heung-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	28	
投票 Vote	22	27	
贊成 Yes	1	3	
反對 No	20	23	
棄權 Abstain	1	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 15/02/2006  
時間 TIME: 07:19:36 下午

動議 MOTION: 由陳偉業議員動議，經梁君彥議員、／及／譚香文議員／及／鄭志堅議員修正的「開放電力市場」議案  
MOTION MOVED BY HON ALBERT CHAN ON "OPENING UP THE ELECTRICITY MARKET" AS AMENDED BY HON ANDREW LEUNG, /AND/ HON TAM HEUNG-MAN /AND/ HON KWONG CHI-KIN

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	29	
投票 Vote	21	28	
贊成 Yes	16	28	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 15/02/2006  
時間 TIME: 10:35:22 下午

動議 MOTION: 田北俊議員對單仲偕議員就「削減薪俸稅」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TIEN TO HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S MOTION ON "REDUCING THE SALARIES TAX"

動議人 MOVED BY: 田北俊 James TIEN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	24	
投票 Vote	21	23	
贊成 Yes	14	13	
反對 No	4	5	
棄權 Abstain	3	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 15/02/2006  
 時間 TIME: 10:45:53 下午

動議 MOTION: 張超雄議員對單仲偕議員就「削減薪俸稅」所提，經田北俊議員、~~及~~陳鑑林議員、~~及~~涂謹申議員、~~及~~王國興議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG TO HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S MOTION ON "REDUCING THE SALARIES TAX" AS AMENDED BY HON JAMES TIEN, ~~AND~~ HON CHAN KAM-LAM, ~~AND~~ HON JAMES TO, ~~AND~~ HON WONG KWOK-HING

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	8	18	
反對 No	12	5	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK 

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 15/02/2006  
時間 TIME: 10:51:41 下午

動議 MOTION: 由單仲偕議員動議，經田北俊議員、~~及~~陳鑑林議員~~及~~涂謹申議員~~及~~王國興議員~~及~~張超雄議員~~及~~譚香文議員修正的「削減薪俸稅」議案  
MOTION MOVED BY HON SIN CHUNG-KAI ON "REDUCING THE SALARIES TAX" AS AMENDED BY HON JAMES TIEN, ~~AND~~ HON CHAN KAM-LAM, ~~AND~~ HON JAMES TO ~~AND~~ HON WONG KWOK HING ~~AND~~ DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG ~~AND~~ HON TAM HEUNG-MAN

動議人 MOVED BY: 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	14	13	
反對 No	4	5	
棄權 Abstain	4	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK