

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 20

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 8 March 2006 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long  
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP

Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Road Tunnels (Government) (Amendment) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	33/2006
2. Road Tunnels (Government) Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	34/2006
3. Dutiable Commodities (Fee Revision) (No. 2) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	35/2006
4. Pawnbrokers (Fee Reduction) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	36/2006
5. Firearms and Ammunition (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	37/2006
6. Firearms and Ammunition (Revision of Storage Fees) Order 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	38/2006
7. Markets (Cessation of Application of the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance) Declaration 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	39/2006
8. Public Health and Municipal Services (Cessation of Designation as Public Markets) Order 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	40/2006
9. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Amendment of Tenth Schedule) Order 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	41/2006
10. Registration of Persons (Application for New Identity Cards) (Amendment) Order 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	42/2006
11. Statutes of the Chinese University of Hong Kong (Amendment) Statute 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	43/2006
12. Statutes of the University of Hong Kong (Amendment) Statute 2006 (gazetted on 3.3.2006)	44/2006

**Other Papers**

No.74 - The Lord Wilson Heritage Trust  
Annual Report 2004-2005 (published on 2.3.2006)

**Questions**

1. Hon Howard YOUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

2. Hon Fred LI asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

3. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

5. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

6. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## Bills

### First Reading

**Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election  
(Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2006**  
**Births, Deaths and Marriages (Digital Image) Bill**  
**Interception of Communications and Surveillance Bill**

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

**Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election  
(Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2006**

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

**Births, Deaths and Marriages (Digital Image) Bill**  
**Interception of Communications and Surveillance Bill**

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council on each of the above two Bills.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

## Motions

**Proposed resolution under the Motor Vehicles (First  
Registration Tax) Ordinance**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Resolution made and passed by the Legislative Council on 14 May 1997 and published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 237 of 1997, as amended by section 3 of the Revenue (No. 2) Ordinance 2000 (27 of 2000) and by the Resolution made and passed by the Legislative Council on 19 March 2003 and published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 77 of 2003, be amended by repealing "2006" and substituting "2009".

Question on the motion proposed.

Four Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Proposed resolutions under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

##### **1. Waste Disposal Ordinance (Amendment of Fourth Schedule) Notice 2006 and Public Health (Animals and Birds) (Licensing of Livestock Keeping) (Amendment) Regulation 2006**

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that in relation to the -

- (a) Waste Disposal Ordinance (Amendment of Fourth Schedule) Notice 2006, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 19 of 2006; and
- (b) Public Health (Animals and Birds) (Licensing of Livestock Keeping) (Amendment) Regulation 2006, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 20 of 2006,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 8 February 2006, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 29 March 2006.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

##### **2. Fugitive Offenders (Finland) Order**

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that in relation to the Fugitive Offenders (Finland) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 23 of 2006 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 22 February 2006, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 26 April 2006.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

### **Promoting health care reform and health care financing**

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Health, Welfare and Food Bureau will publish a consultation paper on health care financing this year, and the community is widely concerned about the direction of Hong Kong's health care reform and the changes in the financing models for public and private medical care services, this Council urges the Government to expeditiously examine the long-term difficulties faced by Hong Kong's health care system, and to put forward feasible options and measures to improve the current situation; such measures should include:

- (a) reviewing the existing framework for the provision of public and private medical care services; enhancing the transparency of the operation and decision-making process of the Hospital Authority; and regulating the operation of medical groups, with a view to facilitating the communication and cooperation between public and private medical organizations;
- (b) mapping out the direction of health care reform and clearly defining the objectives of public medical care services; disclosing to the public such information as the costing methodology of the services; seeking a consensus in society on the direction of health care reform; and drawing up a timetable for implementing such reform;
- (c) expediting the progress in setting up an electronic system for sharing patient records, thereby establishing a mechanism and procedures for referring patients between public and private health care systems;
- (d) comprehensively reviewing the supply and demand of as well as the planning for health care manpower; and enhancing the training for health care personnel, improving their remuneration packages and work environment as well as boosting their morale, so as to solve the problem of wastage of health care personnel and prevent the emergence of a succession gap; and

- (e) expeditiously formulating and implementing a health care financing plan that can sustain the development of health care services, so as to relieve the burden on the public and to ensure that the grassroots and the vulnerable receive appropriate health care services and that the middle-class is given fair opportunities to obtain medical treatment; in formulating the health care financing models, the Government should consider providing tax deductions for people who utilize private medical care services and take out medical insurance, and should also consider implementing the medical fee increase option by phases and should, at the same time, establish a proper safety net as a complementary measure while implementing the option.

While Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:50 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon LI Kwok-ying, Hon Andrew CHENG and Hon CHAN Yuen-han would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LI Kwok-ying, Hon Andrew CHENG, Hon CHAN Yuen-han and six other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring that he was a member of Hospital Authority, Hon Vincent FANG Kang spoke on the motion.

At 3:13 pm, while Hon Vincent FANG Kang was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 14 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LI Kwok-ying moved the following amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's motion:

To delete "Hong Kong's health care reform" after "concerned about the direction of" and substitute with "the reform of the Chinese and Western health care systems in Hong Kong"; to delete "Hong Kong's health care systems" after "the long-term difficulties faced by" and substitute with "the Chinese and Western health care systems in Hong Kong"; to delete "and" after "mapping out the direction of health care reform" and

substitute with "which includes the Chinese medicine profession, with emphasis on the importance of disease prevention and comprehensive primary medical care services,"; to add "Chinese and Western" after "the planning for"; to delete "problem" after "to solve the" and substitute with "problems"; and to add "as well as employment of and continuous training for Chinese medicine graduates," after "wastage of health care personnel"; and to delete ", and should also consider implementing the medical fee increase option by phases and should, at the same time, establish a proper safety net as a complementary measure while implementing the option" after "take out medical insurance".

Question on Hon LI Kwok-ying's amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon LI Kwok-ying's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon Andrew CHENG to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's motion as amended by Hon LI Kwok-ying and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "prevent the emergence of a succession gap;"; and to add "; in considering the provision of tax deductions, the Government should, at the same time, study the impact of developing a private health insurance system on the overall health care system, the regulation of private health insurance systems in overseas countries, as well as the feasibility of implementing a central health insurance system in Hong Kong; and (f) enhancing the regulation of the operation of private medical care services, including medical groups and private medical practitioners, etc.; and establishing an independent statutory body for handling complaints about public and private medical care services, so as to ensure that patients are provided with good medical care services and enhance their confidence in using private medical care services" after "take out medical insurance".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's motion as amended by Hon LI Kwok-ying proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon CHAN Yuen-han had indicated that she would withdraw her amendment if Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment was agreed. Hon CHAN Yuen-han had therefore withdrawn her amendment.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's motion as amended by Hon LI Kwok-ying and Hon Andrew CHENG put and agreed to.

**Domestic violence**

Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the serious problem of domestic violence, this Council urges the Government to expeditiously formulate effective measures to curb such violence.

Question on Hon Margaret NG's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHOY So-yuk, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit and Hon Albert HO would move amendments to the motion and that Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG would also move an amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the three amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHOY So-yuk, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, Hon Albert HO and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments and declared that she was the chairperson of Women's Commission.

Another 11 Members and Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:31 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Eight further Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Margaret NG spoke on the amendments.

At 8:28 pm, while Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion:

To delete "serious problem of domestic violence" after "in view of the" and substitute with "increasing number of domestic violence cases in recent years, which reflects the severity of the problem"; to add "implement in the whole territory the recommendations in the Report of the Review Panel on Family Services in Tin Shui Wai and the recommendations made by the Coroner's Court in respect of the

family tragedy that occurred in Tin Shui Wai in April 2004, to" after "urges the Government to"; and to add ", and to allocate additional resources to improve services and actively promote the development of the 'third sector', so as to optimize the social capital, promote community development services, encourage self-help and mutual support among the public, strengthen the community support network, enhance the capabilities of individuals and families in resolving their difficulties in life, for the purpose of cultivating the community spirit of mutual support, care and love among residents" after "to curb such violence".

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following further amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; the measures to be formulated by the Government to curb domestic violence should include: (a) extending the Domestic Violence Ordinance to cover more people, and enhance the protection for those under protection; (b) establishing a court dedicated to domestic violence cases; (c) allocating more resources to enable the victims of domestic violence to obtain the necessary legal services at an early stage; and (d) providing more resources that are required for the provision of training for front-line staff and the implementation of other complementary measures" after "care and love among residents".

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk proposed.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment:

To add "(a) establishing a central inter-departmental coordinating committee chaired by the Chief Secretary for Administration, with membership including representatives from community and self-help organizations which understand domestic violence;" after "including:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(b)"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to add "(d) establishing a 24-hour domestic violence hotline and round-the-clock support teams comprising social workers, police officers and professionals from various disciplines; (e) setting clear work indicators and plans under the Government's policy of 'zero tolerance' of

domestic violence; (f) establishing a review committee on serious injuries and deaths caused by domestic violence, with the responsibility to review the effectiveness of cross-sectoral coordination and collaboration regarding cases of serious domestic violence, in order to avoid the recurrence of similar cases; (g) establishing, under the central mechanism, a community-based coordinating mechanism with an operating structure modelled on that of the Fight Crime Committee, so as to promote awareness of domestic violence and educate people in the local communities, and to facilitate coordination of and communication in carrying out the work in the districts;" after "dedicated to domestic violence cases;"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(h)"; to delete "and (d)" after "at an early stage;" and substitute with "(i)"; and to add "; (j) establishing support groups composed of victims of domestic violence, and providing them with training to promote mutual support; and (k) establishing a domestic violence fund to provide financial support for organizations engaged in preventing domestic violence and providing domestic violence support, so as to demonstrate the Government's determination to combat domestic violence and truly implement its policy of 'zero tolerance' of such violence" after "other complementary measures".

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment as amended by Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG to Hon Margaret NG's motion, which had been amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment and Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment as amended by Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon Albert HO to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Albert HO moved the following further amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To delete "and" after "training to promote mutual support;"; and to add "; (l) making it mandatory for abusers to receive counselling and treatment; (m) studying making it mandatory for the relevant professionals to report domestic violence cases that they handle; and (n) offering compassionate housing assistance to victims of domestic" after "policy of 'zero tolerance' of such violence".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Margaret NG replied.

Question on Hon Margaret NG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon Albert HO put and agreed to.

**Expeditiously improving the traffic arrangements in the western and northwestern parts of the New Territories**

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, given the impending commissioning of the Hong Kong-Shenzhen Western Corridor at the end of this year, which will substantially increase the traffic load in the western and northwestern parts of the New Territories, this Council urges the Government to formulate as early as possible corresponding strategies, including buying out the ownership of Route 3 at a reasonable price and opening it up for use by motorists, as well as constructing the Easterly Link Road that connects the Deep Bay Link and Route 3, so as to divert the traffic flow from Tuen Mun Road, thereby alleviating the deteriorating traffic congestion in that district and avoiding causing great nuisance or inconvenience to local residents.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming and Hon Albert HO would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon Andrew CHENG would move an amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment while Hon Albert CHAN and Hon LEE Wing-tat each would move an amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the three amendments and the amendments to the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon Albert HO, Hon Andrew CHENG, Hon Albert CHAN, Hon LEE Wing-tat and 10 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Selina CHOW's motion:

To add ": (a)" after "including"; to add "; (b)" after "use by motorists" and to delete ", as well as" thereafter; and to add "; (c) expeditiously completing the extension of Tuen Mun Road; (d) implementing the Northern Link project as early as possible and expeditiously completing the Kowloon Southern Link project to perfect the railway network and encourage residents of the Northwest New Territories to make use of the railways for travelling to and from different districts, so as to alleviate the pressure on Tuen Mun Road and Route 3; and (e) setting reasonable fares that are acceptable to the public, so as to encourage them to use the railway transport system" after "traffic flow from Tuen Mun Road".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's motion proposed.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment:

To add ", including widening the whole expressway section of Tuen Mun Road to a four-lane carriageway" after "the extension of Tuen Mun Road".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Expeditiously improving the traffic arrangements in the western and northwestern parts of the New Territories", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's motion put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon Albert HO had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment if Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment was agreed. Hon Albert HO had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

The President also stated that as Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment had been agreed, she granted leave for Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following further amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; furthermore, the Government may also lower the existing tolls by such means as extending the franchise period of Route 3; and should expeditiously construct the Tuen Mun Western Bypass, the Tuen Mun to Chek Lap Kok Link, as well as the Tuen Mun Eastern Bypass, while the environmental impact of the alignment of the relevant roads must be adequately assessed, with a view to reducing undesirable effects on the local environment; and expedite the various traffic improvements to the Tuen Mun town centre section of Tuen Mun Road" after "causing great nuisance or inconvenience to local residents".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing proposed.

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment:

To delete ", " after "use by motorists"; and to delete "or lowering the existing tolls by such means as extending the franchise period of Route 3" before "; (b)".

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 12 against and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment:

To add "the Northern section of Route 10," after "expeditiously constructing"; and to delete "the Tuen Mun Eastern Bypass," after "Chek Lap Kok Link,".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, three against it and nine abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 10 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW replied.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 15 were in favour

of the motion, three against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion, three against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming was carried.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 22 March 2006 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 11:33 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 08/03/2006  
 時間 TIME: 11:19:44 下午

動議 MOTION: 鄭家富議員就王國興議員對周梁淑怡議員的「從速改善新界西及西北部的交通安排」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
 HON ANDREW CHENG'S AMENDMENT TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S AMENDMENT TO HON MRS SELINA CHOW'S MOTION ON "EXPEDITIOUSLY IMPROVING THE TRAFFIC ARRANGEMENTS IN THE WESTERN AND NORTHWESTERN PARTS OF THE NEW TERRITORIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	19	
投票 Vote	20	18	
贊成 Yes	10	15	
反對 No	3	1	
棄權 Abstain	7	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 08/03/2006  
 時間 TIME: 11:25:02 下午

動議 MOTION: 陳偉業議員就張學明議員對周梁淑怡議員（經王國興議員及梁家驊議員修正）的「從速改善新界西及西北部的交通安排」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
 HON ALBERT CHAN'S AMENDMENT TO HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S AMENDMENT TO HON MRS SELINA CHOW'S MOTION (AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING ~~AND HON ANDREW CHENG~~) ON "EXPEDITIOUSLY IMPROVING THE TRAFFIC ARRANGEMENTS IN THE WESTERN AND NORTHWESTERN PARTS OF THE NT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	20	
投票 Vote	19	19	
贊成 Yes	5	5	
反對 No	12	9	
棄權 Abstain	2	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 08/03/2006  
時間 TIME: 11:27:20 下午

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員就張學明議員對周梁淑怡議員的「從速改善新界西及西北部的交通安排」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON LEE WING-TAT'S AMENDMENT TO HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S AMENDMENT TO HON MRS SELINA CHOW'S MOTION ON "EXPEDITIOUSLY IMPROVING THE TRAFFIC ARRANGEMENTS IN THE WESTERN AND NORTHWESTERN PARTS OF THE NEW TERRITORIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	20	
投票 Vote	20	19	
贊成 Yes	8	8	
反對 No	3	1	
棄權 Abstain	9	10	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 08/03/2006  
 時間 TIME: 11:29:32 下午

動議 MOTION: 張學明議員對周梁淑怡議員就「從速改善新界西及西北部的交通安排」動議的議案，經王國興議員及鄭家富議員修正後，提出的修正案  
 HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S AMENDMENT TO HON MRS SELINA CHOW'S MOTION ON "EXPEDITIOUSLY IMPROVING THE TRAFFIC ARRANGEMENTS IN THE WESTERN AND NORTHWESTERN PARTS OF THE NEW TERRITORIES" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING AND HON ANDREW CHENG

動議人 MOVED BY: 張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	20	
投票 Vote	20	19	
贊成 Yes	14	11	
反對 No	3	3	
棄權 Abstain	3	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 08/03/2006  
時間 TIME: 11:32:35 下午

動議 MOTION: 由周梁淑怡議員動議，經王國興議員、~~及鄭家富議員~~及張學明議員、~~及陳偉業議員~~及李永達議員、~~及何俊仁議員~~修正的「從速改善新界西及西北部的交通安排」議案

MOTION MOVED BY HON MRS SELINA CHOW ON "EXPEDITIOUSLY IMPROVING THE TRAFFIC ARRANGEMENTS IN THE WESTERN AND NORTHWESTERN PARTS OF THE NEW TERRITORIES" AS AMENDED BY WONG KWOK-HING, ~~ANDREW CHENG, AND CHEUNG HOK-MING, ALBERT CHAN, LEE WING-TAT, ALBERT HO~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	20	
投票 Vote	20	19	
贊成 Yes	15	11	
反對 No	3	3	
棄權 Abstain	2	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO