

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 25

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 3 May 2006 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP

Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
Reserved Commodities Ordinance (Amendment of Schedules 1 and 2) Notice 2006 (gazetted on 28.4.2006)	72/2006

Other Papers

No.90 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Early Retirement Ex-gratia Payment Fund for Aided Primary School Teachers together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 August 2005 (published on 27.4.2006)

Report of the Bills Committee on Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2005 (published on 25.4.2006)

Questions

1. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon Miriam LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour and the Secretary for Security replied.

3. Hon Audrey EU asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

4. Hon CHAN Yuen-han asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Nine Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

6. Hon Martin LEE asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

St. Stephen's College Incorporation (Change of Name of the Council of St. Stephen's College and General Amendments) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 30 November 2005 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **St. Stephen's College Incorporation (Change of Name of the Council of St. Stephen's College and General Amendments) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1 to 5, 7, 8, 9 and 12 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 6, 10 and 11 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower moved amendments to clauses 6 and 10 and the deletion of clause 11 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the amendment to clause 11, which dealt with deletion, had been agreed, clause 11 was therefore deleted from the Bill.

Question that clauses 6 and 10, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 1A read the first time.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower moved the Second Reading of new clause 1A and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 1A proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 1A read the second time.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower moved the addition of new clause 1A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Education and Manpower reported that

the **St. Stephen's College Incorporation (Change of Name of the Council of St. Stephen's College and General Amendments) Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Births, Deaths and Marriages (Digital Image) Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 8 March 2006 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Births, Deaths and Marriages (Digital Image) Bill**.

Question that clauses 1 to 4, 6 to 47, 49 and 50 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 5 and 48 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 5 and 48, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 13A read the first time.

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading of new clause 13A and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 13A proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 13A read the second time.

The Secretary for Security moved the addition of new clause 13A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Security reported that

the **Births, Deaths and Marriages (Digital Image) Bill**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2005

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 4 May 2005 resumed.

Hon Fred LI, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2005, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill.

Two Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved amendments to clause 2 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food reported that

**the Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment)
Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China and the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the appointment of -

- (a) Mr Michael McHugh; and
- (b) the Right Honourable Thomas Munro Gault,

as judges of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal from other common law jurisdictions pursuant to section 9 of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance (Cap. 484) be endorsed.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Legal Aid Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved -

- (a) that the Legal Aid Ordinance (Cap. 91) be amended -
 - (i) in section 5(1), by repealing "\$155,800" and substituting "\$158,300";
 - (ii) in section 5A(b) -
 - (A) by repealing "\$155,800" and substituting "\$158,300";
 - (B) by repealing "\$432,900" and substituting "\$439,800"; and
- (b) that this Resolution shall come into operation on a day to be appointed by the Director of Administration by notice published in the Gazette.

Question on the motion proposed.

Six Members spoke on the motion.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

The 4 June incident

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges that: the 4 June incident be not forgotten and the 1989 pro-democracy movement be vindicated.

While Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:31 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Six Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 3:19 pm, the President resumed the chair and a quorum was then present.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 3:21 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 3:27 pm, the President resumed the chair and a quorum was then present.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 3:34 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The President's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 4:05 pm, the President resumed the chair and a quorum was then present.

Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the motion.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Emily LAU spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah spoke on the motion.

While Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah was speaking, Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah continued to speak on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Martin LEE spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert HO replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, seven against it and nine abstained;

while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion, seven against it and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Maintaining the competitive edge of Hong Kong

Hon TAM Heung-man moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as a report on the competitiveness of Chinese cities published earlier indicates that although Hong Kong's overall competitiveness still ranks first within China, its competitive edge is dwindling, this Council urges the Government to face up to this trend and to:

- (a) expeditiously enact a cross-sector fair competition law and set up an independent fair competition commission with real powers to enforce the law;
- (b) formulate a comprehensive manpower policy to attract overseas talents to Hong Kong; and to enhance the quality of education in such areas as tertiary education and language education, so as to train up more local professionals with a view to alleviating the pressure of shortage of talents in Hong Kong;
- (c) perfect the policy on pollution management with a view to improving the air quality and environment in the territory;
- (d) expedite the review of Hong Kong's taxation policy; and
- (e) endeavour to protect Hong Kong people's freedoms in various aspects and uphold the rule of law in Hong Kong,

so as to further enhance Hong Kong's competitiveness and maintain its competitive edge.

While Hon TAM Heung-man was speaking, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon TAM Heung-man continued to address the Council.

Question on Hon TAM Heung-man's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHAN Yuen-han, Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and Hon CHAN Kam-lam would move amendments to the motion and that Hon SIN Chung-kai would also

move an amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the four amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LAU Kong-wah drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Dr Hon YEUNG Sum was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:15 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon SIN Chung-kai, eight other Members and Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:33 pm, while Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 15 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Heung-man spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion:

To add "there are recent concerns that Hong Kong may be marginalized, and" after "That, as"; to add "formulate a multi-faceted strategy for the development of industries and, in addition to developing the financial, tourism and logistics industries, promote other industries that are suitable for development in Hong Kong, such as the manufacturing, agricultural and fisheries, and cultural and creative industries; (b) enhance various measures to encourage the industrial and commercial sectors to increase their investment in innovation and technology; (c) abandon the land policy that over-relies on real estate, so as to create an environment in which various industries can enjoy equal development opportunities in Hong Kong; (d)" after "(a)"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(e)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete the

original "(d)" and substitute with "(g)"; and to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(h)".

Question on Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Maintaining the competitive edge of Hong Kong", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion:

To delete "its competitive edge is dwindling" after "still ranks first within China," and substitute with "its capacity for economic growth is obviously inadequate among 200 cities in China, and the rapid development of mainland cities has also brought about a series of challenges to Hong Kong; to enhance competitiveness"; to delete "face up to this trend and to" after "this Council urges the Government to" and substitute with "adopt the following measures"; to delete "(a) expeditiously enact a cross-sector fair competition law and set up an independent fair competition commission with real powers to enforce the law;" and substitute with "(a) establishing a regional policy focusing on enhancing Hong Kong's competitiveness, and stepping up the studies on global and national competitiveness and the implementation of relevant policies; (b) strengthening the links and resources integration with the Pearl River Delta and the entire country,

including enhancing the division of work and coordination with neighbouring areas; (c) improving the air quality, and perfecting the environment as well as such services as medical, education, housing and transport, and related facilities;"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete "formulate" before "a comprehensive manpower policy" and substitute with "formulating"; to delete "overseas talents to" after "to attract" and substitute with "talents from outside"; to delete "to enhance" after "Hong Kong; and" and substitute with "enhancing"; to delete "(c) perfect the policy on pollution management with a view to improving the air quality and environment in the territory; (d) expedite the review of Hong Kong's taxation policy; and" and substitute with "(e) encouraging enterprises to develop creative industries as well as new and high technology, with a view to enhancing the competitiveness of the local manufacturing industry;"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete "endeavour to protect" before "Hong Kong people's freedoms" and substitute with "continuing to give play to Hong Kong's original competitive edge, including maintaining a clean and highly efficient government, protecting"; to delete "and uphold" after "in various aspects" and substitute with ", upholding"; and to add "and ensuring social harmony and stability; (g) endeavouring to maintain Hong Kong's simple and low tax regime; and (h) expeditiously enacting a civil fair competition law, and setting up an independent fair competition commission with real powers to enforce the law" after "the rule of law in Hong Kong".

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion proposed.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment:

To delete "civil" after "(h) expeditiously enacting a" and substitute with "cross-sector".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

Before the President directed the voting to stop, Hon Miriam LAU informed the President that she had voted in error. She was against the amendment, but she had pressed the "Yes" button.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and five abstained. (The Clerk subsequently rectified the voting record in accordance with Hon Miriam LAU's pronounced voting preference in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion put.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

Before the President directed the voting to stop, Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah informed the President that he had voted in error. He was against the amendment, but he had pressed the "Yes" button.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and five abstained. (The Clerk subsequently rectified the voting record in accordance with Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's pronounced voting preference in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion:

To add ", and according to the Growth Competitiveness Index rankings published by the World Economic Forum in September last year, Hong Kong's ranking has plunged from the 21st in 2004 to the 28th" after "its competitive edge is dwindling"; to add ", expeditiously implement small class teaching, integrate pre-school education into subsidized education with a view to improving the quality of basic education" after "overseas talents to Hong Kong" ; to add "high-quality" after "train up more"; to delete "and" after "taxation policy;"; and to add "; and (f) expeditiously introduce a democratic political system under which the Chief Executive and all Members of the Legislative Council are returned by universal

suffrage, in order to ensure that the Government will pay heed to public opinions and take forward the above policies, thereby creating a business environment that is fair and conducive to the overall development of the community" after "rule of law in Hong Kong".

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion:

To add "enhance Hong Kong's ability in autonomous innovation and draw up new industrial policies to guide and promote the development of new industries with good potentials, so as to cultivate new areas of growth for Hong Kong's economy; (b)" after "(a)"; to delete "enact" after "expeditiously" and substitute with "study the feasibility of enacting"; to delete "set" after "a cross-sector fair competition law and" and substitute with "setting"; to delete "to enforce the law" after "with real powers" and substitute with "based on extensive consultation with various sectors of the community"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to add "and green conservation" after "perfect the policy on pollution management"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(e)"; to add "with a view to improving the business environment in the territory" after "Hong Kong's taxation policy"; and to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(f)".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's motion proposed, put and negatived.

Hon TAM Heung-man replied.

Question on Hon TAM Heung-man's motion put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion, 13 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion, two against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 May 2006 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 11:01 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 03/05/2006
時間 TIME: 06:20:35 下午

動議 MOTION: 「六四事件」議案
MOTION "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	26	
投票 Vote	23	25	
贊成 Yes	7	16	
反對 No	7	7	
棄權 Abstain	9	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 03/05/2006
 時間 TIME: 10:45:08 下午

動議 MOTION: 陳婉嫻議員對譚香文議員就「保持香港競爭優勢」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHAN YUEN-HAN TO HON TAM HEUNG-MAN'S MOTION ON
 "MAINTAINING THE COMPETITIVE EDGE OF HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	10	16	
反對 No	13	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 03/05/2006
時間 TIME: 10:49:11 下午

動議 MOTION: 單仲偕議員就梁君彥議員對譚香文議員的「保持香港競爭優勢」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S AMENDMENT TO HON ANDREW LEUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON TAM HEUNG-MAN'S MOTION ON "MAINTAINING THE COMPETITIVE EDGE OF HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	11 10	16	
反對 No	12 13	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	棄權	ABSTAIN
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Patrick LAU	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 03/05/2006
時間 TIME: 10:52:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁君彥議員對譚香文議員就「保持香港競爭優勢」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ANDREW LEUNG TO HON TAM HEUNG-MAN'S MOTION ON
"MAINTAINING THE COMPETITIVE EDGE OF HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	13	3-2	
反對 No	9	15-16	
棄權 Abstain	2	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 03/05/2006
 時間 TIME: 10:54:54 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊森議員對譚香文議員就「保持香港競爭優勢」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON YEUNG SUM TO HON TAM HEUNG-MAN'S MOTION ON
 "MAINTAINING THE COMPETITIVE EDGE OF HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	10	16	
反對 No	13	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 03/05/2006
 時間 TIME: 11:00:40 下午

動議 MOTION: 「保持香港競爭優勢」議案
 MOTION "MAINTAINING THE COMPETITIVE EDGE OF HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚香文 TAM Heung-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	10	15	
反對 No	13	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK