

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 26

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 10 May 2006 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long  
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP

Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Air Navigation (Hong Kong) Order 1995 (Amendment of Schedule 16) Order 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	74/2006
2. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) (Amendment) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	75/2006
3. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	76/2006
4. Dangerous Drugs (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	77/2006
5. Antibiotics (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	78/2006
6. Pharmacy and Poisons (Pharmacy and Poisons Appeal Tribunal) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	79/2006
7. Quarantine and Prevention of Disease (Scale of Charges) (Charges Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	80/2006
8. Dentists (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	81/2006
9. Ancillary Dental Workers (Dental Hygienists) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	82/2006
10. Medical Registration (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	83/2006
11. Midwives Registration (Fee Reduction) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)	84/2006

- |  |         |
|--|---------|
| 12. Nurses (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)                           | 85/2006 |
| 13. Enrolled Nurses (Enrolment and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)                     | 86/2006 |
| 14. Medical Laboratory Technologists (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006) | 87/2006 |
| 15. Occupational Therapists (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)          | 88/2006 |
| 16. Radiographers (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)                    | 89/2006 |
| 17. Optometrists (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)                     | 90/2006 |
| 18. Physiotherapists (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)                 | 91/2006 |
| 19. Chiropractors Registration (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)   | 92/2006 |
| 20. Chinese Medicine Practitioners (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)   | 93/2006 |
| 21. Chinese Medicine (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)   | 94/2006 |
| 22. Import and Export (Strategic Commodities) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule 1) Order 2006 (gazetted on 4.5.2006)                | 95/2006 |

**Other Papers**

No.91 - The Government Minute in response to the Report No.45 of the Public Accounts Committee dated February 2006 (published on 8.5.2006)

Report of the Bills Committee on Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2006 (published on 8.5.2006)

## **Addresses**

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to Report No. 45 of the Public Accounts Committee dated February 2006. While he was speaking, Hon LEE Wing-tat drew the President's attention to the fact that the Chief Secretary for Administration's address had deviated from the draft address tabled at the meeting. He said that Members would need to refer to the revised address for seeking elucidation on it later at the meeting.

As suggested by the President, the Chief Secretary for Administration provided a copy of his revised address for copies to be made available to Members and continued with his address.

As copies of the Chief Secretary for Administration's revised address were still being made when the Chief Secretary for Administration finished his address, the President suspended the meeting at 11:18 am.

The Council resumed at 11:25 am.

Eight Members sought elucidation on the Government Minute and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

## **Questions**

1. Hon Vincent FANG Kang asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

3. Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

4. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

5. Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2006**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 8 March 2006 resumed.



Hon Howard YOUNG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2006, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

While Hon Howard YOUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:00 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members and Hon Albert HO spoke on the Bill.

At 2:45 pm, while Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another nine Members spoke on the Bill.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Six other Members and Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG spoke on the Bill.

While he was speaking, Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG continued to speak on the Bill.

Four more Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 55 Members were present, 31 were in favour of the motion, 22 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2006**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 4 to 16, 18 to 33 and 35 to 48 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 17 and 34 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 17 and 34, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs reported that

the **Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2006**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 54 Members were present, 31 were in favour of the motion, 21 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

## Members' Motions

### Perfecting the framework of advisory and statutory bodies

As the Secretary for Home Affairs, who was the Public Officer to attend and speak in the debate on this motion, was not in the Chamber, the President suspended the meeting at 6:45 pm.

The Council resumed at 6:49 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, whereas the Chief Executive has earlier on candidly admitted in a radio programme that there is a difference in the closeness of his relationship with the political parties of the Legislative Council and he would maintain a particularly good relationship with the parties that support the Government, and there have been queries that the Government practises favouritism towards pro-government people and parties in the appointment of members of advisory and statutory bodies (ASBs), given that ASBs serve as a framework for the Government to extensively solicit public opinions and as an important channel for public participation in politics for more equitable distribution of social resources, this Council urges the Government to adopt measures to perfect the framework of ASBs; such measures should include:

- (a) strictly adhering to the "six-six principle", whereby no member of an ASB shall serve on the ASB for more than six years or serve on more than six ASBs at any one time;
- (b) upholding the principle of selection on merit, inviting the major stakeholder groups concerned to nominate representatives to ASBs, and reducing the appointments to ASBs ad personam, so as to enable ASBs to have a more representative and diversified composition;
- (c) enhancing the transparency of ASBs by uploading onto the internet the agenda, minutes and relevant documents of all their meetings, and disclosing the information on the members of the ASBs as well as their public service, political background and attendance rates at ASB meetings, etc;
- (d) disclosing the procedure for appointing ASB members, including uploading onto the internet information on the

vacancies in ASBs and the nominees, so as to facilitate members of the public in making nominations;

- (e) increasing the ratio of women on ASBs, and allowing more people of ethnic minorities and those with disabilities to service on ASBs, so that people from different walks of life have equal opportunities to participate in public affairs; and
- (f) introducing clear guidelines on the appointment of public officers, and actively studying the appointment of an independent commissioner to monitor the appointment of ASB members by the Government.

While Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:53 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon Frederick FUNG would move amendments to the motion and that Hon Albert HO would also move an amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the two amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Howard YOUNG, Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Albert HO, another four Members and Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:51 pm, while Hon CHOY So-yuk was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 11 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion:

To delete "whereas" after "That," and substitute with "as"; to delete "and there have been queries" after "support the Government," and substitute with "which has led to public queries"; to delete "and as an important channel for public participation in politics for more equitable distribution of social resources" after "solicit public opinions"; to delete "upholding" after "(b)" and substitute with "adhering to"; to delete ", inviting the major stakeholder groups concerned to nominate representatives to ASBs, and reducing the appointments to ASBs ad personam" after "the principle of

selection on merit" and substitute with "and, in inviting the major groups concerned to nominate persons to ASBs, at the same time disclosing information on the vacancies in ASBs; and strengthening the present self-nomination and nomination systems"; to delete "uploading onto the internet the agenda, minutes and relevant documents of all their meetings, and" after "transparency of ASBs by"; to add "to the public" before "the information on the members of the ASBs"; to add "and arranging post-meeting press briefings as far as practicable;" after "attendance rates at ASB meetings, etc;"; to delete "(d) disclosing the procedure for appointing ASB members, including uploading onto the internet information on the vacancies in ASBs and the nominees, so as to facilitate members of the public in making nominations;"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete "equal" after "different walks of life have" and substitute with "adequate"; to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(e)"; and to delete "actively studying the appointment of an independent commissioner to monitor the appointment of ASB members by the Government" after "appointment of public officers, and" and substitute with "enhancing the support to new appointees so that they can commence work as soon as possible and contribute their expertise".

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Perfecting the framework of advisory and statutory bodies", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion:

To add "without regard to closeness of relationship" after "the principle of selection on merit"; and to add "District Councils and other" after "inviting the".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion proposed.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment:

To add "avoiding conflict of interests, consulting the Legislative Council (LegCo) before appointing chairmen of important statutory bodies, accepting LegCo's nomination of its Members to be members of important statutory bodies," after "without regard to closeness of relationship,".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and nine abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and nine abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's motion put.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the motion and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 14 were in favour of the motion and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

**Strengthening the development of post-secondary education and upgrading the quality of sub-degree courses**

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, although the Government has announced that it has exceeded the policy objective of providing tertiary education for 60% of senior secondary school leavers, a series of problems have arisen as a result of the substantial increase in the number of self-financing sub-degree places over the past five years, this Council considers that the Government should, apart from meeting the quantitative objective, also strengthen the development of post-secondary education and upgrade the quality of post-secondary courses; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to allocate more resources and adopt measures to address such problems as the varied quality of sub-degree courses, inequality under various student financial assistance schemes, and difficulties encountered by students in pursuing further studies and securing employment; such measures should include:

- (a) setting up a quality assurance mechanism to ensure the quality of sub-degree courses and recognition of the qualifications conferred;
- (b) facing up to the situation of over-supply of sub-degree places, and preventing vicious competition among institutions;
- (c) combining the Local Student Finance Scheme and the Financial Assistance Scheme for Post-secondary Students, so that all full-time students are treated equally and provided with the same level of assistance according to their financial needs;

- (d) providing appropriate facilities and student development services to post-secondary students, having regard to their education needs within and outside schools; as well as providing institutions with an option to extend their loan repayment period, so as to relieve their financial pressure and enable them to utilize most of the tuition received for teaching purpose; and
- (e) gradually increasing the number of degree places in keeping with the needs arising from social development and the academic structure reform, so as to allow outstanding graduates of sub-degree courses to pursue subsidized degree courses, thereby eliminating the bottleneck in pursuing further studies.

Question on the motion proposed.

One Member spoke on the motion.

After declaring his interest as chairman of the Vocational Training Council, Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yeun spoke on the motion.

Another 12 Members and the Secretary for Education and Manpower spoke on the motion.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 17 May 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 11:54 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong



投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 10/05/2006  
時間 TIME: 06:35:46 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2006年行政長官選舉及立法會選舉（綜合修訂）條例草案》- 二讀  
CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION AND LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ELECTION (MISCELLANEOUS AMENDMENTS) BILL 2006 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

出席 Present :55  
投票 Vote :54  
贊成 Yes :31  
反對 No :22  
棄權 Abstain :1  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃谷根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 10/05/2006  
 時間 TIME: 06:44:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2006年行政長官選舉及立法會選舉（綜合修訂）條例草案》- 三讀  
 CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION AND LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ELECTION (MISCELLANEOUS AMENDMENTS) BILL 2006 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

出席 Present :54  
 投票 Vote :53  
     贊成 Yes :31  
     反對 No :21  
     棄權 Abstain :1  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震寰	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			Ronny TONG	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 10/05/2006  
時間 TIME: 09:36:34 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊孝華議員對張超雄議員就「完善諮詢及法定組織架構」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON HOWARD YOUNG TO DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG'S MOTION  
ON "PERFECTING THE FRAMEWORK OF ADVISORY AND STATUTORY BODIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊孝華Howard YOUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	12	3	
反對 No	6	13	
棄權 Abstain	6	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 10/05/2006  
時間 TIME: 09:40:00 下午

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員就馮檢基議員對張超雄議員的「完善諮詢及法定組織架構」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON ALBERT HO'S AMENDMENT TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S AMENDMENT TO DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "PERFECTING THE FRAMEWORK OF ADVISORY AND STATUTORY BODIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	8	13	
反對 No	7	8	
棄權 Abstain	9	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 10/05/2006  
 時間 TIME: 09:42:12 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對張超雄議員就「完善諮詢及法定組織架構」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG'S MOTION  
 ON "PERFECTING THE FRAMEWORK OF ADVISORY AND STATUTORY BODIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	8	13	
反對 No	7	8	
棄權 Abstain	9	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 10/05/2006  
時間 TIME: 09:47:29 下午

動議 MOTION: 「完善諮詢及法定組織架構」議案  
MOTION "PERFECTING THE FRAMEWORK OF ADVISORY AND STATUTORY BODIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	8	14	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Patrick LAU	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES