

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 27

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 17 May 2006 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long

The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP

Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Broadcasting (Revision of Licence Fees) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 12.5.2006)	98/2006
2. Fire Service (Installation Contractors) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 12.5.2006)	99/2006
3. Fire Services Department (Reports and Certificates) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 12.5.2006)	100/2006
4. Dangerous Goods (General) (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 12.5.2006)	101/2006
5. Timber Stores (Fee Revision) Regulation 2006 (gazetted on 12.5.2006)	102/2006
6. Chief Executive Election and Legislative Council Election (Miscellaneous Amendments) Ordinance 2006 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 13.5.2006)	103/2006

### Other Papers

No.92 - Securities and Futures Commission  
Annual Report 2005-06 (published on 17.5.2006)

Report of the Bills Committee on Dentists Registration (Amendment) Bill 2005 (published on 12.5.2006)

### Questions

1. Hon Albert HO asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon James TO asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

3. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

4. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

6. Hon Fred LI asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **First Reading**

#### **Safety of United Nations and Associated Personnel Bill**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

## Second Reading

### **Safety of United Nations and Associated Personnel Bill**

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

### **Dentists Registration (Amendment) Bill 2005**

#### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 6 July 2005 resumed.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Dentists Registration (Amendment) Bill 2005, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

#### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Dentists Registration (Amendment) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 11, 13, 15, 16, 19, 20, 21, 23 to 33 and 35 to 39 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 6, 10, 12, 14, 17, 18, 22 and 34 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 6, 10, 12, 14, 17, 18, 22 and 34, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food reported that

the **Dentists Registration (Amendment) Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Motions**

#### **Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance**

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the following Regulations, made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 26 April 2006, be approved -

- (a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment)(No. 2) Regulation 2006; and
- (b) the Poisons List (Amendment)(No. 2) Regulation 2006.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Supporting the conclusions and recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee on the development of a site at Sai Wan Ho**

Dr Hon Philip WONG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as recently the community is widely concerned that the conclusions made by the Government-appointed Independent Committee of Inquiry on the Sai Wan Ho Development on Inland Lot No. 8955 in its report published on 9 May this year are not in total accord with those made by the Public Accounts



Committee ("PAC") in its report laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 15 February this year regarding the development of a site at Sai Wan Ho, this Council reaffirms its support for the conclusions and recommendations of PAC and urges the Government to fully implement the recommendations of PAC.

While Dr Hon Philip WONG was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:37 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration, five Members and Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the motion.

At 2:39 pm, while Hon LI Fung-ying was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 17 Members and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion.

Hon LAU Kong-wah sought elucidation on a remark made by the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands. The President stated that Hon LAU Kong-wah should have done so immediately after the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands had made that remark. She disallowed the request.

Dr Hon Philip WONG replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present and all were in favour of the motion; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present and 21 were in favour of the motion. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

**Financial assistance to patients of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome and their families**

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the ex-gratia nature and the anticipated shortfall of the Trust Fund for Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome ("the Trust Fund"), this Council urges the Government to implement the following measures to assist the patients of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome ("SARS") and/or their families:

- (a) relaxing the Trust Fund's \$500,000 ceiling on special ex-gratia financial assistance for each eligible recovered or "suspected" SARS patient;
- (b) extending the scope of the Trust Fund to cover also families of the deceased "suspected" SARS patients;
- (c) granting special ex-gratia relief payments to families with deceased elderly SARS patients irrespective of whether the affected families had been relying on the deceased for financial support; and
- (d) injecting additional funds into the Trust Fund.

Question on the motion proposed.

13 Members and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion.

The President allowed another Member who had not spoken to speak on the motion.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke again.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### **Review on Urban Renewal Strategy**

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following motion, declared his interest as a non-executive director of the Urban Renewal Authority, and addressed the Council:

That, as the vision and direction of urban renewal set out in the Urban Renewal Strategy ("the Strategy") often deviate greatly from the ideal when they are put in practice, which not only seriously jeopardizes the interests of the affected residents and shop operators who are deeply dissatisfied and frustrated due to their being deprived of their rights to choose and their misery, and even impedes the efficacy of the Hong Kong community as a whole in dealing with the problem of urban ageing; and as the Urban Renewal Authority ("URA") gives people the impression of focusing solely on commercial interests when launching redevelopment projects and also fails

to observe the principles set out in the Strategy, such as the "people-centred" approach, this Council urges the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands to face up to the deficiencies and shortcomings of the existing Strategy, to immediately discharge his statutory duty to review the Strategy which has been in force for five years, after conducting public consultation, and to create conditions for URA to play the role of a more forward-looking pioneer to more effectively address the problem of urban ageing; the issues to which special attention should be paid in conducting the review should include:

- (a) devising a comprehensive urban regeneration strategy, and adopting a more flexible and creative mindset that could better meet the needs of the local community, in order to replace the existing strategy which is led under a demolition and redevelopment mode;
- (b) implementing a community planning regime whereby relevant professionals are encouraged to participate in the early stage of consultation to help consolidate the views of different sectors on urban regeneration, so as to enable the relevant parties to participate effectively and truly implement universal planning through a bottom-up approach; and striving to retain the cultural and economic activities which have local characteristics, with a view to preserving the original planning layout, social network and living style in the local communities;
- (c) not adopting a separatist attitude when devising updated blueprints and formulating reform strategies for local communities, but rather promoting coordination among the communities and making concerted efforts together with neighbouring communities in pursuing overall developments, so as to achieve the best synergy;
- (d) elevating to the cross-bureaux level the planning and decision-making in urban regeneration; removing unnecessary bureaucratic restrictions so that different departments can all take part in planning new communities, thereby more effectively addressing the economic, social and cultural problems caused by changes in the local communities; and strengthening social impact assessments to fully reflect the implications of the projects on different groups in the local communities;
- (e) reviewing the legislation such as that which relates to buildings and town planning, etc, in order to better tie in with the different needs of the urban regeneration projects; and providing adequate choices for the affected residents; and

- (f) adopting more flexible financing and loan options to more effectively assist residents and shop operators in improving the community environment; and preventing URA from operating on a purely commercial model or even reducing itself to becoming a statutory real estate developer.

While Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:15 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon CHAN Yuen-han and Hon James TO would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon CHAN Yuen-han and Hon Hon James TO consecutively spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring his interest as a non-executive director of Urban Renewal Authority, Hon Howard YOUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Another two Members and Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:33 pm, while Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

After declaring his interest as a non-executive director of Urban Renewal Authority, Hon CHAN Kam-lam spoke on the motion and the amendments.

10 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring his interest as a non-executive director of Urban Renewal Authority, Hon Fred LI spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's motion:

To delete "greatly" after "often deviate"; to delete "ideal" before "when they are put in practice" and substitute with

"expectation of the affected residents and shop operators"; to delete "which not only seriously jeopardizes the interests of the affected residents and shop operators who are deeply dissatisfied and frustrated due to their being deprived of their rights to choose and their misery, and even impedes" after "put in practice," and substitute with "causing many social conflicts, thereby impeding"; to delete "; and as the Urban Renewal Authority ('URA') gives people the impression of focusing solely on commercial interests when launching redevelopment projects and also fails to observe the principles set out in the Strategy, such as the 'people-centred' approach" after "urban ageing", to delete "to face up to the deficiencies and shortcomings of the existing Strategy, to immediately discharge his statutory duty" after "Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands"; to delete "after conducting public consultation," after "five years,,"; to delete "URA" after "create conditions for" and substitute with "the Urban Renewal Authority"; to delete "replace the existing strategy which is led under a demolition and redevelopment mode" after "meet the needs of the local community, in order to" and substitute with "take forward fully the four major directions of urban regeneration, namely redevelopment, rehabilitation, preservation and revitalization"; to add ", on the premise of giving due consideration to social needs and the residents' interests," after "bottom-up approach; and"; to delete "elevating to the cross-bureaux level the planning and decision-making in urban regeneration;" after "(d)"; to delete "so that different departments can all take part in planning new communities" after "bureaucratic restrictions" and substitute with "when implementing urban regeneration programmes, and enhancing communication among various departments to take in different views"; to add "and policies" after "reviewing the legislation"; to delete "that which relates" before "to buildings" and substitute with "those which relate"; to delete "and" after "to buildings" and substitute with ","; to add "and land resumption" after "town planning"; to delete "and" after "affected residents,,"; and to delete "; and preventing URA from operating on a purely commercial model or even reducing itself to becoming a statutory real estate develop" after "improving the community environment" and substitute with "; and (g) actively preserving buildings of historical and cultural significance and ensuring the protection for old and valuable trees when implementing urban regeneration programmes".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 14 were in favour

of the amendment, six against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Review on Urban Renewal Strategy", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit motion:

To add "; furthermore, URA did not duly consult the district councils concerned when it planned and implemented the urban regeneration projects whereas the existing compensation mechanism for redevelopment fails to give the affected residents adequate protection" after " 'people-centred' approach"; to add "(b) on the premise of safeguarding the interests of residents in old districts as well as protecting buildings of historical value and cultural features, expediting by URA the demolition of buildings which are too dilapidated for rehabilitation so as to protect the personal safety and improve the living quality of the residents; (c) honouring by URA its undertakings to complete the unfinished redevelopment projects of the Land Development Corporation as soon as possible;" after "under a demolition and redevelopment mode;"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(d)"; to add "the statutory involvement of district councils is specified and" after "implementing a community planning regime whereby"; to add "to join hands" after "in the early stage of consultation"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(e)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(f)"; to add "(g) comprehensively reviewing the existing compensation mechanism for redevelopment, such as the enforcing and approving details etc, and duly consulting the affected residents for making relevant improvements, so as to plug the loopholes in the existing mechanism;" after "different groups in the local communities;"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(h)"; and to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(i)".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, four against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit motion:

To add "antiquities and monuments" after "which relates to buildings, town planning,"; to add "reserving space for sustainable development of the communities" after "etc,"; and to add "; and prior to amending legislation, adopting special measures to save those communities with cultural features from demolition" after "adequate choices for the affected residents".

Question on Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, four against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit motion:

To add "; and this Council considers that the substance of the above review should not affect the entitlement of the residents of the properties which are being purchased in respect of reasonable rehousing, which is aimed at in-situ rehousing as far as possible, and reasonable compensation, i.e. the amount payable to an owner-occupier should be no less than the value of a seven-year-old notional flat in the same locality, as stipulated in the law" after "a statutory real estate developer".

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, four against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit replied.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's motion put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the motion, four against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the motion and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 18 May 2006 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 10:50 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong



投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 17/05/2006  
時間 TIME: 05:04:25 下午

動議 MOTION: 「支持政府帳目委員會就西灣河土地發展項目所作的結論及建議」議案  
MOTION "SUPPORTING THE CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF A SITE AT SAI WAN HO"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	22	
投票 Vote	23	21	
贊成 Yes	23	21	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 17/05/2006  
 時間 TIME: 10:37:18 下午

動議 MOTION: 張學明議員對梁家傑議員就「市區重建策略檢討」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG HOK-MING TO HON ALAN LEONG'S MOTION ON  
 "REVIEW ON URBAN RENEWAL STRATEGY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	21	
投票 Vote	23	20	
贊成 Yes	14	9	
反對 No	6	10	
棄權 Abstain	3	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鑑泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 17/05/2006  
時間 TIME: 10:40:34 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對梁家傑議員就「市區重建策略檢討」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON ALAN LEONG'S MOTION ON  
"REVIEW ON URBAN RENEWAL STRATEGY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	21	
投票 Vote	23	20	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	4	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鎮泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 17/05/2006  
 時間 TIME: 10:43:02 下午

動議 MOTION: 陳婉嫻議員對梁家傑議員就「市區重建策略檢討」所提議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHAN YUEN-HAN TO HON ALAN LEONG'S MOTION ON "REVIEW ON URBAN RENEWAL STRATEGY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	21	
投票 Vote	23	20	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	4	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 17/05/2006  
時間 TIME: 10:45:18 下午

動議 MOTION: 涂謹申議員對梁家傑議員就「市區重建策略檢討」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TO TO HON ALAN LEONG'S MOTION ON "REVIEW ON URBAN RENEWAL STRATEGY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	21	
投票 Vote	23	20	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	4	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何耀泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 6  
 日期 DATE: 17/05/2006  
 時間 TIME: 10:49:35 下午

動議 MOTION: 「市區重建策略檢討」議案  
 MOTION "REVIEW ON URBAN RENEWAL STRATEGY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	21	
投票 Vote	23	20	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	4	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK