

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 34

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 5 July 2006 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

Other Papers

- No. 95 - Hong Kong Trade Development Council
Annual Report 2005/06 (published on 28.6.2006)
- No. 96 - Independent Commission Against Corruption
Complaints Committee
Annual Report 2005 (published on 5.7.2006)
- No. 97 - Independent Commission Against Corruption
Hong Kong Special Administrative Region
Annual Report 2005 (published on 5.7.2006)
- No. 98 - Airport Authority Hong Kong
Annual Report 2005/2006 (published on 5.7.2006)
- No. 99 - Report of the Independent Police Complaints
Council 2005 (published on 5.7.2006)
- No. 100 - The Eighteenth Annual Report of The Ombudsman,
Hong Kong (June 2006) (published on 5.7.2006)
- Report of the Panel on Manpower 2005/2006 (published on
3.7.2006)
- Report of the Panel on Home Affairs 2005/2006 (published on
3.7.2006)
- Report of the Panel on Security 2005/2006 (published on
3.7.2006)
- Report of the Panel on Constitutional Affairs 2005/2006
(published on 4.7.2006)
- Report of the Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene
2005/2006 (published on 3.7.2006)
- Report on Women in Poverty by the Subcommittee to Study the
Subject of Combating Poverty (published on 23.6.2006)

Addresses

Hon Tommy CHEUNG addressed the Council on the Independent Commission Against Corruption Complaints Committee Annual Report 2005.

Hon SIN Chung-kai addressed the Council on the Independent Commission Against Corruption Annual Report 2005.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit addressed the Council on the Report of the Independent Police Complaints Council 2005.

Hon LAU Chin-shek, Chairman of the Panel on Manpower, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2005/2006.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Chairman of the Panel on Home Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2005/2006.

Hon James TO, Chairman of the Panel on Security, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2005/2006.

Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, Chairman of the Panel on Constitutional Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2005/2006.

Hon Fred LI, Chairman of the Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2005/2006.

Questions

1. Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

10 Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

3. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Hon Audrey EU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

5. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

6. Hon CHAN Kam-lam asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food and the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Rail Merger Bill

Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (Amendment) Bill 2006

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Rail Merger Bill

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (Amendment) Bill 2006

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for Security moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Security and Guarding Services (Fees) (Amendment) Regulation 2006, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 104 of 2006 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 24 May 2006, be amended -

- (a) by repealing section 2;
- (b) in section 3(1), by adding "to the Security and Guarding Services (Fees) Regulation (Cap. 460 sub. leg. A)" after "Schedule 2".

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon KWONG Chi-kin, Chairman of the Subcommittee on Security and Guarding Services (Fees) (Amendment) Regulation 2006, spoke on the motion.

One Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG moved the motion in Appendix I and addressed the Council.

Question on the motion proposed.

One Member spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Women in poverty

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council endorses the Report on Women in Poverty by the Subcommittee to Study the Subject of Combating Poverty and urges the Government to implement the recommendations therein.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 2:17 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

11 Members and Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG spoke on the motion.

At 3:48 pm, while Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another five Members and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the motion.

With the President's permission, Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG elucidated on a point she had made earlier which had been misunderstood by Hon LEE Cheuk-yan.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 21 were in favour of the motion and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Fully conserving the "Government Hill"

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Government Secretariat on Lower Albert Road in Central District blends in with the surrounding cultural heritage and green areas to form a comprehensive "Government Hill" planning zone, and the open area outside the Main Wing of the Government Secretariat has also witnessed the development of social campaigns in Hong Kong, captured the collective memory of Hong Kong's civil society and bears great significance to Hong Kong in terms of history, architecture and the public's sentiments, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) conserve the existing Government Secretariat compound and undertake not to develop the compound for commercial use, so as to preserve the original environment and ambience of the "Government Hill" and its environs;
- (b) in keeping with the principle of heritage conservation, fully consult the public on the future use of the existing Government Secretariat;
- (c) conserve the trees and plants in the "Government Hill" and its vicinity so that the area will remain a city lung in Central District; and
- (d) conduct a study on converting some of the offices in the existing Government Secretariat into a government museum, to give effect to the function of conserving our heritage.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit and 16 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To delete "comprehensive" after "green areas to form a"; to delete "the open area outside the Main Wing of the Government Secretariat has also witnessed the development of social campaigns in Hong Kong, captured the collective memory of Hong Kong's civil society and bears great significance to Hong Kong in terms of history, architecture and the public's sentiments" after "'Government Hill' planning zone, and" and substitute with "there is wide public concern about the future development planning for the 'Government Hill' after the completion of the new government headquarters"; and to delete ": (a) conserve the existing Government Secretariat compound and undertake not to develop the compound for commercial use, so as to preserve the original environment and ambience of the 'Government Hill' and its environs; (b) in keeping with the principle of heritage conservation, fully consult the public on the future use of the existing Government Secretariat; (c) conserve the trees and plants in the 'Government Hill' and its vicinity so that the area will remain a city lung in Central District; and (d) conduct a study on converting some of the offices in the existing Government Secretariat into a government museum, to give effect to the function of conserving our heritage" after "this Council urges the Government to" and substitute with "expeditiously conduct extensive consultation on the matter, with a view to formulating a package of planning proposals which is supported by the community and in line with the principle of sustainable development".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed and put.

Hon Fred LI claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and six against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the

two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Fully conserving the 'Government Hill'", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present and 22 were in favour of the motion; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 21 were in favour of the motion and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To add "follow the best international practice in conserving sites of cultural value and expeditiously conduct a serious study on the historical and cultural values of the 'Government Hill', and to establish extensive consultation channels and structured public participation procedures with a view to affirming the historical and cultural values of the 'Government Hill'; at the same time, the Government should" after "this Council urges the Government to"; to add "expeditiously consider applying to the Town Planning Board for changing the land use of the 'Government Hill' and rezoning it as a 'cultural heritage area' under the category of 'other specified uses', and" after "(a)"; to delete "(b) in keeping with the principle of heritage conservation, fully consult the public on the future use of the existing Government Secretariat"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(b)"; and to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(c)".

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-kam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Fred LI replied.

With the President's permission, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW elucidated on a point she had made earlier which had been misunderstood by Hon Fred LI.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 12 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion, one against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

That this Council do now adjourn

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the following issue: Preventive and control measures adopted and emergency assistance provided to the trades by the Administration with regard to the repeated occurrence of human infection of avian influenza in the Mainland.

Question on the motion proposed.

10 Members and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion.

While the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food was speaking, Hon WONG Kwok-hing requested him to elucidate the meaning of a term in his speech.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food elucidated and continued with his speech.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 July 2006 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 8:41 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

BASIC LAW OF THE HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE
REGION OF THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA

RESOLUTION

(Under Article 75 of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special
Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China)

RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL OF THE
HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION

RESOLVED that the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong
Special Administrative Region be amended —

- (a) in Rule 73 —
 - (i) in subrule (1)(c), by repealing “and investigate”;
 - (ii) in subrule (1)(c), by adding “and, if it thinks fit after consideration, investigate such complaint” after “to do so”;
 - (iii) in subrule (1), by adding —
 - “(ca) to consider any complaint made in relation to the conduct of Members referred to in Rule 83AA (Claims for Reimbursement of Operating Expenses or Applications for Advance of Operating Funds) and, if it thinks fit after consideration, investigate such complaint;”;
 - (iv) in subrule (1)(e), by adding “, Operating Expenses or Operating Funds” after “Interests”;
 - (v) by adding —
 - “(1A) In considering or investigating a complaint referred to in subrule (1)(ca), the committee shall, in addition to any other matter that the committee may consider relevant, have regard to the provisions of A Guide for Reimbursement of Operating Expenses for Members of the Legislative Council.”;

- (b) by adding after Rule 83A —

“83AA. Claims for Reimbursement of Operating Expenses or Applications for Advance of Operating Funds

When making a claim for reimbursement of operating expenses or applying for advance of operating funds in accordance with A Guide for Reimbursement of Operating Expenses for Members of the Legislative Council, or acting for purposes related thereto, a Member shall -

- (a) ensure that any information provided or any declaration or certification made is true, accurate and complete; and
 - (b) act according to any undertaking that he has given.”;
- (c) in Rule 85 —
- (i) in the heading, by adding “, **Operating Expenses or Operating Funds**” after “**Interests**”;
 - (ii) by adding “, 83AA (Claims for Reimbursement of Operating Expenses or Applications for Advance of Operating Funds)” after “(Personal Pecuniary Interest to be Disclosed)”.

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 05/07/2006
 時間 TIME: 04:58:57 下午

動議 MOTION: 「婦女貧窮」議案
 MOTION "WOMEN IN POVERTY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	11	21	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	11	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 05/07/2006
 時間 TIME: 07:23:40 下午

動議 MOTION: 張學明議員對李華明議員就「全面保護「政府山」」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG HOK-MING TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "FULLY CONSERVING THE 'GOVERNMENT HILL' "

動議人 MOVED BY: 張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	24	
投票 Vote	23	23	
贊成 Yes	17	7	
反對 No	6	16	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Aibert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 05/07/2006
時間 TIME: 07:28:09 下午

動議 MOTION: 根據《議事規則》第 49 條第 (4) 款動議縮短表決鐘聲至一分鐘
MOTION IN ACCORDANCE WITH RULE 49(4) OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE TO
SHORTEN THE DIVISION BELL TO ONE MINUTE

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	23	
投票 Vote	22	22	
贊成 Yes	22	21	
反對 No	0	1	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 05/07/2006
時間 TIME: 07:30:31 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對李華明議員就「全面保護「政府山」」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "FULLY
CONSERVING THE 'GOVERNMENT HILL' "

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	6	16	
反對 No	12	1	
棄權 Abstain	4	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 Li Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 05/07/2006
 時間 TIME: 07:39:38 下午

動議 MOTION: 「全面保護『政府山』」議案
 MOTION "FULLY CONSERVING THE 'GOVERNMENT HILL' "

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	8	15	
反對 No	12	1	
棄權 Abstain	4	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Mau-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK