

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC 28/05-06
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 4th meeting
held in the Conference Room A of Legislative Council Building
on Wednesday, 21 December 2005, at 8:30 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

Members absent:

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP

Hon TAM Heung-man

Public officers attending:

Miss Amy TSE, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Mr Y C LO, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works)
Mr Robin IP, JP	Acting Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Planning and Lands)
Dr Mike CHIU, JP	Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (1)
Mr Davey CHUNG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Mr Patrick Y C FAN	Chief Estate Surveyor/Acquisition, Lands Department
Mr C H YUE, JP	Director of Architectural Services
Mr K K NG	Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services)
Mr C K WONG, JP	Director of Drainage Services
Mr John S V CHAI, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Dr Ellen Y L CHAN	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Environmental Infrastructure)
Mr MAK Chai-kwong, JP	Director of Highways
Ms Margaret HSIA, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Miss Mary F Y TSANG	Deputy Secretary-General (1), University Grants Committee
Ms Ernestina WONG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (Health) ²
Dr CHEUNG Man-yung	Deputy Director (Professional Services and Facilities Management), Hospital Authority
Mr LEE Kwok-sung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education and Manpower (School Development)
Miss CHAN Wai-yan	Acting Principal Assistant Secretary for Education and Manpower (Infrastructure and Research Support)
Mr LEE Kin-wang	Head of Estates, Health and Safety Division, Vocational Training Council
Mr Freely CHEUNG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (Family)
Miss Ann HON	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Subventions)
Mr William C G KO, JP	Director of Water Supplies
Mr LEUNG Mang-chiu, JP	Assistant Director of Water Supplies/New Works
Mr Raymond CHAN	Chief Systems Manager (E-government Policy and Development), Office of Government Chief Information Officer

Mr Martin K K CHEUNG	Chief Civil Engineer, Housing Department
Mr Patrick H I KWONG	Assistant Director of Civil Engineering and Development (Administration)
Miss WONG Yuet-wah	Principal Assistant Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Planning and Lands)2
Mr YEUNG Wing-tsan	Chief Engineer/Tseung Kwan O and Sai Kung, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Y T CHEUNG	Chief Engineer/Project Management, Drainage Services Department
Mr K K CHAN	Chief Engineer/Drainage Projects, Drainage Services Department
Mr Wilson FUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Economic Development and Labour (Economic Development)
Ms CHAN Wing-man, Manda	Principal Assistant Secretary for Security (A)
Mr Daniel CHEUNG Chi-kwong	Senior Staff Officer (Planning and Development), Customs and Excise Department
Dr Richard RUBIRA	Senior Veterinary Officer (Import and Export), Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department
Mr LEE Wai-ching	Senior Superintendent (Food Surveillance and Certification), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Clerk in attendance:

Mr Paul WOO	Senior Council Secretary (1)3
-------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr Anthony CHU	Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Caris CHAN	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1
Mr Frankie WOO	Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND BLOCK ALLOCATIONS

PWSC(2005-06)33

Block allocations for Heads 701 to 711 under the Capital Works Reserve Fund

The Chairman advised members that a paper covering the proposed block allocations had been circulated to the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works (PLW Panel) on 18 November 2005. The proposed block allocation under *Head 710* –

Computerization was discussed by the Panel on Information Technology and Broadcasting (ITB Panel) on 12 December 2005. Members of the ITB Panel had no objection to the funding proposal, but sought information on Government's procurement of Open Source Software and Linux products for the past few years. The Office of the Government Chief Information Officer had provided the requested information before the meeting.

2. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING

PWSC(2005-06)34 35CG Greening master plan for Kowloon West – studies and works

3. The Chairman advised members that the PLW Panel had discussed the two proposals relating to greening master plans (GMPs), namely the proposal under this item and the one under PWSC(2005-06)35, at its meetings on 13 July and 22 November 2005.

4. Mr Patrick LAU, Deputy Chairman of the PLW Panel, informed members that the Panel was in support of the development of GMPs. The Panel had urged the Administration to expedite the progress and accord priority to carrying out greening projects in districts where the degree of greening was low. Members of the Panel had also put forward a number of suggestions to the Administration in strengthening greening efforts:

- (a) Conduct strategic overall planning so that different greening themes would be adopted by different districts to project the local characteristics of individual districts;
- (b) Select theme trees/flowers to be planted in different districts so as to avoid overlapping and ensure the policies of different Government departments could complement such greening efforts;
- (c) Liaise with relevant District Planning Office in identifying greening opportunities in conjunction with the designation of pedestrian boulevards;
- (d) Examine how to reduce greening cost which presently stood at \$3,000 per square metre;
- (e) Ensure good maintenance of plants;
- (f) Devise measurable performance indicators to facilitate monitoring of the progress of greening efforts;
- (g) Liaise with Buildings Department to work out the technical

requirements of flower racks on buildings to facilitate greening efforts by individual households;

- (h) Amend the Buildings Ordinance to relax provisions regarding site coverage to encourage developers to leave more space for road construction so that roads would be wide enough to accommodate trees;
- (i) Encourage private developers to green slopes within the boundaries of their developments;
- (j) Maximize planting space by better organization of underground installations with proper records; and
- (k) Plant climbers on footbridges and slopes to enhance greening effect.

Admin 5. Mr Patrick LAU and Mr Abraham SHEK requested the Administration to give a written response to the views and suggestions of the PLW Panel highlighted in paragraph 4 above.

6. Noting that the Administration planned to start developing the GMPs for Mong Kok and Yau Ma Tei in January 2006 for completion in late 2006, and the GMPs for Sham Shui Po and Kowloon City in early 2007 for phased completion by end 2009, Mr Jasper TSANG enquired about the possibility of speeding up the greening projects in view of the rapid development of Kowloon West. He also asked how the Administration had sought local residents' views on the GMP for Tsim Sha Tsui under the present proposal.

7. The Director of Civil Engineering and Development (DCED) replied that the Administration had considered ways to expedite the projects as far as practicable. However, efforts to speed up the greening works had been limited by resources constraints of both the Government and the private sector, particularly the availability of landscape architects whose expertise was in keen demand. It was therefore necessary to prioritize the greening works among different districts and to implement the GMPs in phases. The timeframe for completion of the relevant projects outlined in the Administration's paper were thought to be the earliest possible so far as the existing practical constraints permitted. Regarding public consultation on the GMP for Tsim Sha Tsui, DCED and the Assistant Director of Civil Engineering and Development (Administration) (AD(Adm), CEDD) said that the Administration had briefed the Yau Tsim Mong District Council and the Town Planning Board on the GMP and the related greening themes. The Administration would continue to solicit inputs from stakeholder groups, including the local residents and shop operators and community bodies, when developing GMPs for selected areas.

8. Miss CHOY So-yuk supported more greening works to be done in Hong Kong but considered the progress too slow. She suggested that the Administration should engage one single consultant to take charge of the planning and design of GMPs on a territory-wide basis so as to speed up the projects and ensure continuity of efforts. The Home Affairs Department (HAD) could also offer advice and suggestions on greening works in individual districts. Miss CHOY further said that individual Government Departments such as the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department had undertaken their own greening initiatives and their in-house capacity could be more fully utilized in the development of GMPs.

9. Referring to the typical greening works illustrated at Enclosure 2 to the Administration's paper, Ms Miriam LAU and Mrs Selina CHOW criticized that the works designs had failed to deliver the desired visual impact and greening effect. Over-use of concrete had featured in most of the designs, rendering the planting works dull and dry and unable to portray a greening theme with impressive characteristics. They opined that in comparison with some Mainland cities e.g. Shenzhen and Zhuhai, and other places like Singapore, where the greening measures were well-planned with satisfactory results, the greening works in Hong Kong were apparently outclassed. Noting that the consultants' fees would amount to \$28.6 million vis-à-vis \$24.6 million for the greening works proposed for Tsim Sha Tsui, Ms Miriam LAU queried whether the high consultancy cost represented good value for money.

10. Mr Fred LI opined that much of the consultants' work such as conducting of public consultation on the GMPs could be undertaken by the HAD. He sought explanation from the Administration on the work of the consultants.

11. The Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works) (PS(W)) and DCED explained that the consultants' fees of \$28.6 million would be for developing the GMPs, which covered a large area including selected areas in Kowloon West other than Tsim Sha Tsui, as well as the detailed design of related greening works for such areas, whilst the \$24.6 million would be used for carrying out the shorter term greening works for Tsim Sha Tsui alone. The development of GMPs involved a wide spectrum of work to be done by the consultants, e.g. strategic theme planning for the districts, detailed planning on the thematic choice of plants to project the characteristics of the district, soil study for planting suitable species, examination of any site constraints and underground utilities installations to decide on the appropriate planting methods, conducting consultations on the greening plans, coordination with urban renewal programmes and other private development projects, as well as reviews on greening measures on a longer term perspective in the light of land planning objectives etc.

12. AD(Adm), CEDD supplemented that the photographs shown at Enclosure 2 of the Administration's paper only depicted some typical planting arrangement of the intended greening works. The more detailed and representative planting design had been shown to the PLW Panel at the relevant Panel meeting. Generally, public response to the GMP for both Tsim Sha Tsui and Central was favourable. He explained that trees and shrubs would be planted on

the ground with suitable landscaped designs. However, due to limited ground space and presence of underground installations, some plants would have to be planted in concrete planters. He said that the designs and the planting methods could be further reviewed to achieve better visual effect.

13. AD(Adm), CEDD further explained that in the past, greening measures were implemented by various Departments in a rather fragmented manner and the results were not entirely satisfactory. The present new approach was to achieve better coordination of the greening efforts through the implementation of GMPs under a centralized process and the steer of a special committee. Tsim Sha Tsui and Central were the first two districts for which GMPs had been developed. The Administration hoped that the GMPs could be given the opportunity for their effects to be tried out, which could then be reviewed and serve as useful reference for future greening plans for other districts.

14. In response to the Chairman's enquiry, PS(W) said that GMPs had to go through different channels of consultation, including the Steering Committee on Greening (SCG), the Town Planning Board, and the District Councils and Area Committees. Mrs Selina CHOW cautioned that excessive and cumbersome consultations might be counter productive in achieving the best greening results because it could end up in the adoption of a modified plan which drastically changed the originality of the initial design.

15. Mr Abraham SHEK also considered that the consultants' fees for developing GMPs in the present proposal were on the high side. In his view, the designs presented in the Administration's paper carried no appealing features and failed to depict any unique local characteristics of the district. He added that greening did not only mean planting trees and shrubs and making everything green, but also measures to beautify and add to the aesthetic value of the environment. He opined that the Administration should ensure that all the necessary requirements for the greening projects would be specified in detail in the works contracts. Mr Patrick LAU added that the Administration should explain in its proposals the criteria for engaging and selecting consultants for the greening works.

16. Mr Albert CHAN shared the view that the typical greening works as presented in the Administration's paper were in lack of unique characteristics, and the greening cost of \$3,000 per square metre was too high. He considered that the Government should develop the right concept and direction for its greening strategies and employ people with the requisite expert knowledge in the development of GMPs to achieve the desired greening objectives in a cost-effective manner.

17. Mr Patrick LAU said he understood that there were at present about 160 local landscape architects in Hong Kong. Their professionalism could be sought in the planning of GMPs. He added that improvements in greening works required sustained impetus and innovative ideas, and suggested that greening design competitions could be organized for participation by the public. Mr Abraham

SHEK also suggested that the Administration could seek assistance from the design schools of the universities and tertiary institutions in drawing up greening plans.

18. DCED responded that the Administration would engage professional assistance in developing GMPs with a view to best satisfying the public's aspiration to a greener environment. The SCG, which was chaired by the Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works), was set up to oversee the greening strategies for different districts and to co-ordinate the greening efforts of different Departments. Both the GMPs for Tsim Sha Tsui and Central had been developed to suit the respective designated themes for the two areas. He reiterated that the proposed GMPs were well received by the public during the consultations.

19. DCED further explained that the contracts for the greening works would be awarded by way of open tender. In the selection process, the Administration would ensure that cost-effectiveness and value for money would be achieved.

20. In response to Mr CHAN Kam-lam's enquiry on engagement of consultants for the two greening proposals under the item and the next proposal on the agenda, DCED advised that two separate consultants would be employed for the two projects in view of the distinct characteristics of the two districts. He added that the area covered in the present proposal i.e. Project **35CG**, was around 1 900 hectares and 1 400 hectares in the case of the next item i.e. **36CG**.

21. Mrs Selina CHOW remarked that past track record had shown that the greening works carried out by the Administration had failed to live up to public expectations. Having regard to the typical greening works in respect of proposal **35CG** as depicted in the Administration's paper, she had no confidence that they could produce the desirable greening effect. Mrs CHOW and Ms Miriam LAU said that while they supported greening initiatives to be undertaken by the Administration, they found the greening methods presented hardly acceptable. They expressed reservations about the funding proposal.

22. In response to the Chairman's enquiry, the Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)³ said that in view of members' concerns, the Administration was prepared to withdraw both PWSC(2005-06)³⁴ and PWSC(2005-06)³⁵. The Administration would refine the proposals in the light of members' views and re-submit them as appropriate.

23. In response to Mr Patrick LAU on whether PWSC could give support to a certain part of a proposal, the Chairman advised that it was not appropriate to do so. In this connection, Mr Abraham SHEK said that as the PLW Panel was in general support of implementing greening works in Tsim Sha Tsui and Central, greening measures which fell outside the scope of the relevant GMPs should not be delayed.

24. The item was withdrawn by the Administration.

PWSC(2005-06)35 36CG Greening master plan for Hong Kong Island – studies and works

25. The item was withdrawn by the Administration in view of the discussion under PWSC(2005-06)34.

Head 707 – NEW TOWN AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT

PWSC(2005-06)39 741TH Northern Access to Area 86, Tseung Kwan O

26. The Chairman advised members that information papers on the project had been circulated to the PLW Panel on 26 April and 22 November 2005.

27. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 704 – DRAINAGE

PWSC(2005-06)37 126CD Drainage improvement in East Kowloon – Package B

28. The Chairman advised members that an information paper on the project had been circulated to the PLW Panel on 15 November 2005.

29. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2005-06)38 127CD Drainage improvement in Northern Hong Kong Island – Sheung Wan stormwater pumping station and the associated intercepting drains

30. The Chairman advised members that an information paper on the project had been circulated to the PLW Panel on 15 November 2005.

31. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 703 – BUILDING

PWSC(2005-06)36 173IC Fitting out works for customs and quarantine facilities at the Asia Airfreight Terminal 2

32. The Chairman advised members that the Panel on Economic Services was consulted on this project at its meeting on 29 November 2005. Panel members

supported the Administration's proposal to upgrade this project to Category A. During the discussion, Panel members had examined the need for the Administration to deploy sufficient manpower to handle the customs and quarantine (CQ) work. The Panel also requested the Administration to take the opportunity to improve the mechanism for the inspection and quarantine of foods. On the financial aspect of the project, the Panel had sought explanation from the Administration on the proposal to use some \$4.2 million on building works such as internal partitioning and requested the Administration to provide more details for individual expenditure items.

33. In response to Mrs Selina CHOW's question on the financial arrangement between the Government and Asia Airfreight Terminal Company Limited (AAT) concerning the proposed works for the CQ facilities at the new ATT Terminal 2, the Deputy Secretary for Economic Development and Labour (Economic Development) explained that according to the established arrangement, AAT would provide rent-free accommodation for Government's use, while the Government would be responsible for the fitting out works. AAT had decided to invest and construct a new Terminal 2 at the Hong Kong International Airport in order to cope with the growth in air cargo volume. For this particular project, AAT had agreed to re-provision, at its own costs, the existing CQ facilities for the Customs and Excise Department, the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department from Terminal 1 to Terminal 2, and the Government would only need to bear the cost of fitting out the additional government accommodation to meet the expanded operation at Terminal 2. The actual fitting out works would be entrusted to AAT.

34. Mr Albert CHAN enquired about how expert advice had been obtained on designing the new inspection and quarantine facilities and whether such design complied with international standards.

35. The Senior Veterinary Officer (Import and Export), Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department explained that in designing the facilities for inspection and quarantine of goods with possible health risk, the Administration had solicited advice from AFCD and made reference to similar facilities in the United Kingdom and Australia. Under the design, additional space would be provided for segregating goods which might cause potential health risks whenever they were discovered. He added that the Administration was not aware of any international safety standard on inspection and quarantine facilities.

36. Mr Fred LI pointed out that the Administration was about to introduce new legislation for the regulation of imported aquatic food products. He asked whether the CQ facilities would be sufficient to cater for the anticipated increase in inspection and quarantine work. The Senior Superintendent (Food Surveillance and Certification), Food and Environmental Hygiene Department replied in the positive. He said that the scope of the project included CQ and other inspection/laboratory facilities which would be adequate to cope with the future increase in workload.

37. The item was voted on and endorsed.
38. The meeting ended at 10:05 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 January 2006