

B. Study Process

Key Issues

Some commenters considered that the planning context and planning process are not clear. Some were of the view that more information on the basis of the Concept Plan proposals should be provided. For the scope of the study, some considered that the adjoining outlying islands and some related projects under study should also be covered in the Concept Plan.

As mentioned in the Consultation Digest, a number of factors have been taken into account in preparing the Concept Plan, such as the Hong Kong 2030: Planning Vision and Strategy (HK2030 Study), the South West New Territories Recommended Development Strategy (SWNT RDS), other studies and projects related to Lantau, new land use needs for Hong Kong, local aspirations and development opportunities and constraints of Lantau, etc. The strategic and local planning considerations have been taken into account in formulating the vision and planning concept for Lantau, the four development themes and various proposals. To facilitate informed discussions by members of the public, it is necessary for the Task Force to undertake initial analysis and formulate certain proposals on the future development of Lantau prior to public consultation. The current consultation exercise is to engage the public at the early stage of planning. The focus of the Concept Plan is on Lantau. Nevertheless, the planning intentions for the outlying islands set out in the SWNT RDS endorsed by the Government in 2001 are still valid.

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
Study Approach and Process			
B-1	It is positive that Government has prepared a catalogue of possible developments for Lantau in the Concept Plan. There are a great many details in the plan and there appears to be provision for much forward thinking.	Dr Glenn Frommer (86)	Noted.
B-2	The overall planning process is not reported in detail. How the Concept Plan proposals were formulated and co-ordinated with other initiatives such as HK2030 Study, Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge (HZMB) and Study on the Hong Kong Port - Master Plan 2020 (HKP2020 Study)?	HK Democratic Foundation (442) A CMPB Member (CMPB) A TPB Member (TPB)	The background and salient planning considerations have been included in the Consultation Digest. In the formulation of the Concept Plan, a number of factors have been taken into account which include the HK2030 Study, SWNT RDS, latest developments on Lantau, other studies and projects related to Lantau, new land uses needs, local aspirations and development opportunities and constraints of Lantau. Having examined the above, the Task Force has formulated the overall

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
			<p>vision and planning concept for Lantau and developed four development themes and various proposals in the form of the Concept Plan. A preliminary sustainability assessment has been conducted for the Concept Plan. Feasibility studies will need to be undertaken for projects selected to be taken forward.</p> <p>The planning principle of the Concept Plan in achieving sustainable development by balancing social, environmental and economic needs is in line with the general planning objectives for the future development of Hong Kong adopted in the on-going HK 2030 Study. The HZMB is included as a planned project. Findings of the HKP2020 Study are not included as alternative future port locations are under examination.</p>
B-3	Proposals should be need-based and demand-driven and compatible with the natural setting.	Business Environment Council Ltd. (383) J Green (406)	The Concept Plan aims to provide a coherent framework to meet a diversity of land use needs. As set out in the Consultation Digest, in formulating the Concept Plan, reference has been made to a number of relevant studies, such as the South Lantau and Mui Wo Development Feasibility Study, Study on Revitalization of Tai O, the Northshore Lantau Development Feasibility Study, Comprehensive Feasibility Study on Remaining Development in Tung Chung and Tai Ho, the studies to enhance Hong Kong's competitiveness as a logistics hub and scoping study of Lantau Logistics Park (LLP), Consultancy Study on the Development of New Tourism Infrastructures - Spa and Resort, Northwest New Territories Traffic and

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
			Infrastructure Review, the HZMB related studies, etc. in identifying the land use needs, proposals and possible locations. A list of the relevant references could be provided on request.
B-4	Minimize Lantau development, only the essential projects such as LLP and cross-boundary transport hub for HZMB be undertaken. Other proposals such as theme park, resorts, golf course should be stopped. These proposals could be developed in the New Territories.	Ho Kwan-chung & Ma Pui-tak (100)	See responses in B-3. The need and demand aspects are covered in the individual studies.
B-5	Provide the basis (e.g. tourism study, transport study, economic development study or other relevant studies or forecasts) that formulates the Concept Plan proposals.	Green Power (3) (440) B To (184) HK Discovery (227) Nick Shaw (263) Earthcare (282) HKIA (445) Conservancy Assoc. (444) Joint Statement on Sustainable Development for Lantau (541) 30 Standard Letters A*	See responses in B-3.
B-6	The Plan could have been a good one if the involved officials and departments had really done their research.	Cathy Tsang-Feign (358)	See responses in B-3.
B-7	Whether there is need analysis for the proposals, e.g. LLP, HZMB, golf course and resorts and whether there is site selection exercise.	Dr Hung Wing-tat & Albert Lai of CA (ECG)	See responses in B-3. The need and demand aspects are covered in the individual studies.
B-8	What are the needs, cost, benefits and site selection for the proposals?	Green Power (440) Friends of Tai Long Wan (209)	See responses in B-3. The needs, cost, benefits and site selection aspects are covered in the individual studies.

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
B-9	There is no idea on what Lantau or Hong Kong really needs.	Charles Frew (48)	In the formulation of the Concept Plan, a number of factors have been taken into account which include the HK2030 Study, SWNT RDS, the latest developments on Lantau, other studies and projects related to Lantau, new land uses needs, local aspirations and development opportunities and constraints of Lantau. The strategic and local planning needs have been reckoned in the Concept Plan.
B-10	The Concept Plan is lack of research, particularly in the understanding of economic development and urban-rural planning.	Earthcare (282)	See responses in B-9.
B-11	Abandon the entire proposal and the entire 'public consultation' and start again from the very needed.	Larry Feign (348)	See responses in B-9.
B-12	Whether the previous studies conducted for the proposals can be released for public information.	Adrian Churn of GLA (ECG) Albert Lai of CA (ECG)	Recommendations and related information of some of the studies are available for public information on relevant websites. A list of relevant references has been provided to the Conservancy Association.
B-13	Information should be provided for the public to give an informed opinion.	Jo Clark (382) Kevin Manuel (376) Undisclosed (33)	Recommendations and related information of some of the reference studies are available for public information on relevant websites. A list of the relevant references could be provided on request.
B-14	References to official studies for the various development proposals and the status of these proposals.	Green Lantau Assoc. (274)	See responses in B-13.
B-15	There are a lot of top-down initiatives because otherwise nothing will ever happen in the period of 50 years.	South Lantau Liaison Group (360)	The purpose of the current consultation exercise is to engage the public at the early stage of planning. The proposals in the Concept Plan are conceptual in nature for community discussion.

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
B-16	The plan was prepared closed door by the Government. This top-down approach is inappropriate. The public should be allowed to contribute in the preparation of the Concept Plan and widely consulted before launching any proposals.	Clear The Air (35) (178) Green Lantau Assoc. (65) Marcus Tancock (182) Cathy Tsang-Feign (358) Larry Feign (348) Living Islands Movement (378) Jo Clark (382) Serge Berthier (235) Rob Bunker of LIM (PCF) 30 Standard Letters A	The Task Force has prepared a Concept Plan with a view to soliciting views from the public at the early stage of planning of the future development of Lantau. To facilitate informed discussions by members of the public, it is necessary for the Task Force to undertake certain initial analysis and formulate certain propositions on the future development of Lantau before putting out the Concept Plan for public consultation. The proposals in the Concept Plan are conceptual for community discussion. Views from the public have been widely canvassed in the public consultation.
B-17	The approach has to be "bottom-up"; the public should be involved in formulating the Concept Plan at the early stage.	Clear The Air (35) (178) Living Islands Movement (42) Clive Noffke of GLA & Rob Bunker of LIM (ECG)	The purpose of the current consultation exercise is to engage the public at the early stage of planning. The proposals in the Concept Plan are conceptual in nature for community discussion. Comments on the Concept Plan as well as suggestions of new proposals from the public will be carefully analyzed.
B-18	The plan bypasses the formal planning process and without going through various stages of consultation. Planning studies related to Lantau, such as SWNT RDS and HK 2030 Study, are still in progress. Many proposals in the Plan have never been mentioned during the consultation on these studies.	Conservancy Assoc. (318)	Whilst the HK2030 Study is still on-going, the SWNT RDS was completed and endorsed by the Government in 2001. In formulating the Concept Plan, the Task Force has adopted the principle of achieving sustainable development by balancing social, environmental and economic needs of Hong Kong which is also adopted by the HK2030 Study. Apart from the conservation value, the contribution that Lantau could make to the logistics and tourism development in Hong Kong and enhancing the cross-boundary connection was recognized in the HK2030 Study. The Task Force has also followed

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
			the broad planning concept and development pattern set out in the SWNT RDS.
B-19	A true “sustainable development” plan would include broader issues, as well as neighbouring areas.	Dr Martin Williams (352)	The focus of the Concept Plan is on Lantau Island. The planning intentions for the outlying islands set out in the SWNT RDS endorsed by Government in 2001 are still valid. Majority of outlying islands have been covered by relevant town plans with the aim to preserve their unique attractiveness while providing for development of appropriate scale to enhance their visitors appeal.
B-20	The Concept Plan should provide generalized framework instead of arbitrary proposals.	Living Islands Movement (132) Dr Martin Williams (352)	The Concept Plan is a planning framework for Lantau providing the overall vision and planning themes for different parts of Lantau. The proposals under individual themes are conceptual for community discussion. The purpose of the public consultation is to gather public views on the proposals at the conceptual stage of planning. At the moment, priority is given to the proposed LLP. The Concept Plan will be revised where appropriate to take into account public views collected during the public consultation. The projects to be taken forward will be subject to feasibility studies including environmental impact assessments, etc. Public views will be further solicited in the study process.
B-21	Although it was packaged as a “Concept Plan”, it appears to be a list of pet projects by various Government departments with no coherence and no connection to one another. It is not a coordinated plan, rather a wish list.	Serge Berthier (235)	See responses in B-20.

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
B-22	The inclusion of a number of tourism proposals in detail gives the proposals a status that is not warranted; comments and ideas of Lantau population should have been collected as a list and shown as possibilities for further discussion that would then form the basis of the formulation of a future executive plan.	Living Islands Movement (378)	See responses in B-20.
B-23	Several projects are not merely conceptual, but their planning is well advanced. No alternative overall approach to developing Lantau is given. Gives the Hong Kong public no real choices.	Dr Martin Williams (352)	See responses in B-20.
B-24	The Concept Plan is misnamed. It is not about concepts but about site specific development projects.	Green Lantau Assoc. (274)	See responses in B-20.
B-25	The Concept Plan is a "try-on" to see how much pain the public would take and there would be "add-ons" like a casino and a motor racing track.	Living Islands Movement (27)	See responses in B-20. The casino and motor racing tracks are not proposals of the Concept Plan, but are suggestions raised by some members of the public. These suggestions would be assessed together with all others received during the public consultation. There would be further public engagement on the revised Concept Plan.
B-26	The Administration has independently conducted its own studies on various development proposals that a number of these appear to be 'hard coded' and proceeding without any public consultation.	Living Islands Movement (378)	See responses in B-20. Projects not falling within the scope of the Concept Plan are subject to individual studies and separate consultation process.

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
B-27	It is confusing and misleading that some projects included as 'concept' while some appear to be going ahead, such as the new Logistics Park.	P F Lih et al. (384)	See responses in B-20.
B-28	Whether the proposals in the Concept Plan could be revised/changed or already been decided.	Living Islands Movement (42) (378) Clear The Air (178) HK Democratic Foundation (442) Rob Bunker of LIM (ECG) (PCF)	See responses in B-20.
Study Area			
B-29	The Concept Plan focuses solely on Lantau Island. Outlying islands were identified for conservation in the SWNT RDS 2001 and should be included in the Concept Plan.	Green Lantau Assoc. (65) (274) Living Islands Movement (378) Friends of the Earth HK (385) Nigel Easterbrook (11) Clive Noffke of GLA (PCF)	See responses in B-19.
B-30	A coherent plan should be drawn up for Lantau, its surrounding waters and the adjacent islands.	Keep Lantau Beautiful Alliance (544)	See responses in B-19.
B-31	The interdependence of the outlying islands from the tourism perspective is crucial for Lantau's sustainable development.	Business Environment Council Ltd. (383)	See responses in B-19.
B-32	To cover also Peng Chau and Discovery Bay. For Discovery Bay, a lot of tourists, especially mainlanders, will like to visit and purchase properties. For Peng Chau, it is strategically located between Mui Wo, Discovery Bay and Disneyland.	Stanley (133) Chau-chau (134)	See responses in B-19. Discovery Bay is included in the Concept Plan.

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
B-33	According to the findings of a survey, 76% of the respondents is of the view that Peng Chau, Hei Ling Chau and Cheung Chau should be included in the Concept Plan.	Joint Office of 5 Sham Shui Po DC Members & HK Ching Fai Assoc. Ltd. (331)	See responses in B-19.
B-34	To include Cheung Chau which could provide other possible activities (visits to well-planned and artistic fishing village on Cheung Chau). Linked by leisure boats to and from Southern Lantau, people can enjoy both the varieties of services on one island while savoring the natural spirit on the other island.	M C Tang (22)	See responses in B-19.
B-35	The offshore islands comprising Sokos, Hei Ling Chau, Shek Kwu Chau, and Sunshine Island should be included in the Concept Plan.	Green Lantau Assoc. (274)	See responses in B-19.
B-36	Please consider Tsing Yi Island development.	Clarence Chou (97)	Tsing Yi is outside the Islands District.
Omission of Some Major Projects			
B-37	The Concept Plan is incomplete/misleading. The container terminal and the liquefied natural gas (LNG) terminal have been omitted from the Concept Plan. It should be included in the Concept Plan for consultation.	Living Islands Movement (42) (132) (378) Nick Shaw (263) Green Lantau Assoc. (274) P F Lih et al. (384) Dr Martin Williams (352) 50 Standard Letters B*	HKP2020 Study has identified two possible locations for Container Terminal 10 (CT10), namely, Northwest Lantau and Southwest Tsing Yi. Both sites have their pros and cons. As no decision has been made on the location for CT10, it is not appropriate to include the Northwest Lantau option in the Concept Plan. Nevertheless, the Northwest Lantau site option of CT10 has been referred to on Page 3 of the Concept Plan consultation digest and mentioned in various consultation meetings.

No.	Summary of Comments	Raised By	Responses
			<p>The LNG terminal is a proposal from the CLP Power/Castle Peak Power Company Limited (CAPCO). To date, the CLP Power/CAPCO has not made a formal submission to the Economic Development and Labour Bureau (EDLB) for a LNG terminal in Hong Kong. The land use compatibility, environmental feasibility and other issues are yet to be resolved. It is not appropriate to include it in the Concept Plan.</p>
B-38	<p>All possible land uses identified in the report should be shown on the Concept Plan. Both CT10 and LNG terminal should be shown as options on the Concept Plan.</p>	<p>Swire Properties Ltd. (186)</p>	<p>See responses in B-37.</p>
B-39	<p>The casino proposal has not been incorporated in the Concept Plan.</p>	<p>Clive Noffke of GLA (ECG)</p>	<p>The casino is not a proposal under the Concept Plan, but a suggestion raised by some members of the public. This suggestion would be assessed together with all other proposals received during the public consultation.</p>
B-40	<p>The Concept Plan does not mention the development of primary and secondary schools.</p>	<p>Tsang Wan-fu (ACRC)</p>	<p>The provision of primary and secondary schools is to meet local requirements which would be addressed in the district planning level. It is not appropriate to feature in the Concept Plan, which is a broad planning framework.</p>

* Please refer to Annex 2 – List of Written Submissions for the details of commenters signed for Standard Letters A, B, C or D.

Abbreviations

AAHK	Airport Authority, Hong Kong
AC	Area Committee
Assoc.	Association
CA	The Conservancy Association
CILTHK	The Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport in Hong Kong
CMPB	Country and Marine Parks Board
Co.	Company
Corp.	Corporation
Ctr	Centre
CUHK	The Chinese University of Hong Kong
DAB	Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong
DC	District Council
GLA	Green Lantau Association
HK	Hong Kong
HKCA	The Hong Kong Construction Association
HKIA	The Hong Kong Institute of Architects
HKIE	The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers
HKIP	Hong Kong Institute of Planners
HKIS	The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors
HKU	The University of Hong Kong
HKUSU	Hong Kong University Students' Union
In. Rep	Indigenous Inhabitant Representative
KFBG	Kadoorie Farm & Botanic Garden Corporation
KTCRSAA	Kwun Tong Culture, Recreation, Sports and Arts Association
LIM	Living Islands Movement
Ltd.	Limited
MTRCL	MTR Corporation Limited
NT	The New Territories
OC	The Owners' Committee
RC	Rural Committee
Reg.	Registered
Res. Rep	Resident Representative
Soc.	Society
WWF HK	World Wide Fund for Nature Hong Kong
(AAA)	Abbreviation in brackets indicates the respective consultative sessions (Please refer to Annex 1 – List of Consultative Sessions for details).
(000)	Number in brackets indicates the number of submission (Please refer to Annex 2 – List of Written Submissions for details).