

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1044/05-06  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/ED

**Panel on Education**

**Minutes of meeting**  
**held on Monday, 9 January 2006 at 4:30 pm**  
**in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Dr Hon YEUNG Sum (Chairman)  
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong  
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP  
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Member absent** : Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
- Public Officers attending** : Item IV  
Mrs Fanny LAW, GBS, JP  
Permanent Secretary for Education and Manpower  
  
Ms Bernadette HH LINN  
Deputy Secretary for Education and Manpower (2)  
  
Ms IP Ling-bik  
Principal Education Officer (Hong Kong)

Mrs Lily SK LAI  
Principal Education Officer (Education Commission and  
Planning)

Ms Betty SM LEUNG  
Chief School Development Officer (Language Learning  
Support)

**Attendance by  
invitation** : Item IV

Equal Opportunities Commission

Mr Raymond TANG Yee-bong  
Chairperson

Dr Ferrick CHU Chung-man  
Head, Policy & Research

Ms Esther CHAN Pui-shan  
Senior Policy & Research Officer

DAB Ethnic Minorities Committee

Mr Albert LAM Kwong-yu  
Chairman

Mrs TSO WONG Man-yin  
Vice-Chairlady

Pakistan Islamic Welfare Union Incorporated (HK) Ltd

Mr MALIK Khan Muhammad  
Chairman

Society for Cultural Integration

Miss SANDHU Karamjit K  
Chairperson

Miss RICHARD Julie  
Member

Christian Action

Mr Sam KWONG  
Assistant Director

Ms Panda CHEUNG  
Social Worker

Hong Kong Christian Service

Ms Yvonne CHAK Tung-ching  
Principal Coordinator

Ms Viola TSANG Yuen-kei  
Supervisor

Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor

Mr LAW Yuk-kai  
Director

Miss Valerie CHAN  
Project Officer

Ethnic Minority Concern Group

Mr AHMED Raheel  
Chairman

Ms MOK Miu-ying  
Treasurer

Unison Hong Kong

Ms CHOW Sau-fong  
Executive Director

Miss Fermi WONG Wai-fun  
Director

Hong Kong Integrated Nepalese Society

Mr THAPA Buddhi Bahadur  
Chairman

Mr Gahatras Ashok  
General Secretary

Hong Kong SKH Lady MacLehose Centre

Mr CHAN Ching-wa  
Service Co-ordinator

Ms Sakina Ghulam  
Teaching Assistant

Minhaj-Ul-Quran

Mr Mohamed I S Batcha  
President

Mr Niaz Mohamed Khan  
Vice-President

Islamic Kasim Tuet Memorial College

Mr SIT Wai-cheong  
Vice Principal

Mr Gul Rooz  
Parent

Federations of Minority Schools

Mr Pervez Akhter  
Supervisor & Principal

Mr Navez Akhter  
Representative

Yang Memorial Methodist Social Service

Miss Mandy WONG Sau-man  
Assistant Service Development Officer

Khalsa Diwan (Sikh Temple)

Mr Gulbir Singh Batra  
Executive Member

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Flora TAI  
Chief Council Secretary (2)2

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Stanley MA  
Senior Council Secretary (2)6  
  
Miss Sherman WOO  
Legislative Assistant (2)2

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes**

[LC Paper No. CB(2)783/05-06]

The minutes of the meeting held on 12 December 2005 were confirmed.

**II. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**

2. Members noted the following papers which were issued since the last meeting –

- (a) three school project proposals regarding a primary school at Kwun Tong, a primary school at Kowloon City and a private independent school at Discovery Bay respectively [LC Paper No. CB(2)686/05-06(01)];
- (b) paper provided by the Administration on “Start-up Loan for Post-secondary Education Providers” [LC Paper No. CB(2)763/05-06(01)]; and
- (c) paper on “Progress of the Second Matching Grant Scheme” provided by the University Grants Committee (UGC) [LC Paper No. CB(2)795/05-06(01)].

**III. Items for discussion at the next meeting**

[Appendices I and II to LC Paper No. CB(2)779/05-06]

Regular meeting on 13 February 2006

3. Members noted that as proposed by the Administration and agreed at the meeting on 12 December 2005, the Panel would discuss “Review of the post-secondary sector” at the next regular meeting scheduled for Monday, 13 February 2006. The Panel would receive deputations from the sector at the meeting.

Action

[*Post meeting note* : At the request of the Administration, discussion of the item was re-scheduled to the meeting on 27 March 2006.]

Special meeting on 26 January 2006

4. Members agreed that the Panel should hold a special meeting to discuss the following items on Thursday, 26 January 2006 from 2:30 pm to 5:30 pm –

- (a) Proposed sale and outsourcing of the funding and administration of student loans; and
- (b) Remuneration systems in UGC-funded institutions after deregulation of university salaries.

[*Post-meeting note* : An additional item on “Special provision of Capacity Enhancement Grant to relieve teachers’ workload” was subsequently added to the agenda.]

5. Members also agreed to invite members of the Panel on Financial Affairs and representatives of student associations/unions from the higher education sector to present views on the item in paragraph 4(a); and representatives of the governing bodies and staff associations of UGC-funded institutions to present views on the item in paragraph 4(b).

**IV. Education for children of ethnic minorities**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)779/05-06(01) and (02)]

Oral presentation by deputations

6. The following 16 deputations presented their views and suggestions as summarised in the **Appendix**.

- (a) Equal Opportunities Commission  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)774/05-06(01)]
- (b) DAB Ethnic Minorities Committee  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)806/05-06(01)]
- (c) Pakistan Islamic Welfare Union Incorporated (HK) Ltd  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)779/05-06(03)]
- (d) Society for Cultural Integration
- (e) Christian Action  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)839/05-06(01)]

Action

- (f) Hong Kong Christian Service  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)797/05-06(01)]
- (g) Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor
- (h) Ethnic Minority Concern Group  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)797/05-06(02)]
- (i) Unison Hong Kong  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)839/05-06(02)]
- (j) Hong Kong Integrated Nepalese Society  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)806/05-06(02)]
- (k) Hong Kong SKH Lady MacLehose Centre  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)821/05-06(01)]
- (l) Minhaj-Ul-Quran  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)806/05-06(03)]
- (m) Islamic Kasim Tuet Memorial College  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)806/05-06(04) and (05)]
- (n) Federations of Minority Schools  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)806/05-06(06)] (revised)
- (o) Yang Memorial Methodist Social Service
- (p) Khalsa Diwan (Sikh Temple)

Major concerns of deputations

7. The Chairman said that while deputations in general had no objection to the provision of integrated education for ethnic minority children in primary and secondary schools, they were concerned about implementation of mother-tongue teaching in schools adopting Chinese as the medium of instruction (CMI schools); the supply of places in schools adopting English as the medium of instruction (EMI schools); the provision of an alternative Chinese curriculum and support measures under the new Primary One Admission (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements; and the provision of vocational training and post-secondary education opportunities for ethnic minority students. He invited the Administration to respond to the views and concerns of deputations.

Action

8. In response, Permanent Secretary for Education and Manpower (PSEM) said that the support measures for implementing integrated education for ethnic minority students were detailed in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)779/05-06(01)]. She highlighted that similar to the provision of integrated education for students with special educational needs (SEN), the design of appropriate curriculum and the adoption of a whole-school approach would enhance teaching and learning of ethnic minority students, or collectively referred as non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students, in mainstream schools. Under the new POA and SSPA arrangements effective from the 2004-05 school year, some NCS students in primary one (P1) had managed to catch up with their Chinese peers at the end of the school year, and some NCS students in secondary one (S1) could write a Chinese essay after completion of S1.

9. PSEM further said that apart from the quality of teaching, the academic achievement of NCS students in mainstream schools would largely depend on their learning motivation and the support from parents. She pointed out that the Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB) had developed a web-page named "Education Services for NCS Children" at the EMB's website in August 2005. The webpage also provided an electronic platform for the teachers to share their experiences and good practices in teaching NCS students.

"Integration or Assimilation approach" to implement integrated education for ethnic minority children

10. PSEM said that she shared the view of Mr CHAN Ching-wah of the SKH Lady Maclehole Centre that the community should decide whether to adopt an "integration approach" or an "assimilation approach" to implement integrated education for NCS students in schools. She explained that based on the suggestions in the submission of the SKH Lady Maclehole Centre, the adoption of the "integration approach" would require NCS students to learn in English and study Chinese Language as an optional subject with an alternative curriculum. In contrast, the "assimilation approach" would require NCS students to study both the English Language and the Chinese Language in school. She added that in the past the Administration had adopted the "integration approach". Starting from 2004-05 school year, the Administration tried out the "assimilation approach" starting from Primary One.

11. PSEM pointed out that similar to the provision of integrated education for students with SEN such as students with physical disability or mental handicap in accordance with the Disability Discrimination Ordinance (DDO), substantial resources would be required to support schools in implementing the "assimilation approach". She pointed out that ethnic minority parents preferred to send their children to schools where there were a critical mass of such students. She cited figures on the POA exercises in 2004 and 2005 to illustrate that most ethnic minority children enrolled in primary schools with a small enrolment of NCS students had switched to study in schools traditionally admitting more NCS



Action

students. She added that at present, EMB provided support services to some 53 schools with NCS students.

12. Ms Audrey EU invited Mr CHAN Ching-wah of the SKH Lady Macle hose Centre to elaborate on his views as to whether the “integration approach” or the “assimilation approach” should be adopted for the implementation of integrated education for ethnic minority children.

13. Mr CHAN Ching-wah responded that he considered it more appropriate to adopt the “assimilation approach” and the “integration approach” for implementation of integrated education in primary and secondary schools respectively. He considered that Chinese Language was far more difficult to learn than English Language, and ethnic minority children should start learning Chinese language at their early ages so that they could integrate into the mainstream culture and the community. He stressed that substantial resources would have to be allocated to schools to support NCS students in learning to read and write Chinese at the same pace and level with their Chinese peers in primary schools.

14. Mr CHAN Ching-wah considered that the adoption of the “integration approach” would help NCS students currently in secondary schools to access higher education and attend job-related training. He pointed out that NCS students in secondary schools were now required to learn a second language such as French and German which contributed little to their further studies or career development. He added that ethnic minority youths engaged in labour-intensive work such as construction site or vehicle repair works would have to learn the work skills and communicate with their employers and clients in Cantonese.

Integrated education in selected or voluntary schools for NCS students

15. Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong cited a letter from a serving teacher teaching NCS students in a mainstream school in enrolment of a few NCS students to illustrate the difficulty encountered by teachers and NCS students in teaching and learning. He considered that while NCS students had the right to study in a school of their choice, they should be well informed of the actual teaching and learning situation in mainstream schools in enrolment of a few NCS students. He asked whether the provision of integrated education for NCS students in selective or voluntary schools was in conflict with the proposed legislation against racial discrimination.

16. PSEM responded that based on past statistics, there were less than 500 ethnic minority children enrolled in P1 in a school year. The Administration considered it more cost-effective and beneficial for NCS students to learn in selected or voluntary schools with a critical mass of NCS students, say some 6-7 NCS students in each P1 class. Assuming each of these schools operated five P1 classes, some 10 to 15 primary schools clustered on a regional basis would be

Action

sufficient for the enrolment of some 500 ethnic minority students in a school year. She added that it would be difficult to provide education for children of ethnic minority families also taking into account their religious belief.

17. The Chairperson of the Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC) said that similar to the provision under DDO, the Administration might consider specifying in the proposed legislation against racial discrimination the provision of reasonable measures in respect of the new POA and SSPA arrangements for ethnic minority children. He considered that the allocation of NCS students to a group of selected or voluntary schools with a view to enhancing support and quality of education for them should be acceptable. He added that the Administration should give priority consideration to integration of ethnic minorities into the community, and formulate appropriate policies and legislation to enhance social harmony and racial integration in the long term.

18. Ms Audrey EU asked whether the provision of integrated education to ethnic minority children in a number of voluntary schools selected on a regional basis would contravene the proposed legislation against racial discrimination.

19. The Chairman of EOC responded that from the perspective of EOC, NCS students should be given equal opportunities and choices of schools as Chinese-speaking students in education. However, given the small population of NCS students and their geographic distribution in Hong Kong, it might well be justified to provide integrated education for NCS students in a number of voluntary schools selected on a regional basis, in the light of the need to centralise resources for the provision of better support to the schools. He pointed out that under DDO, the Administration could adopt reasonable measures to address the needs of students with a disability in schools under certain circumstances. EOC would apply the same principle in considering the reasonable measures proposed by the Administration to accommodate the needs of NCS students in the implementation of integrated education such as the centralisation of resources to support voluntary schools in enrolment of a critical mass of NCS students.

Mother-tongue teaching and alternative curriculum in Chinese Language for NCS students in support of their access to post-secondary education

20. Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong expressed support for the provision of an alternative curriculum in the subject of Chinese Language for NCS students in school education to facilitate their access to vocational training and post-secondary education. He considered that the Institute of Vocational Education (IVE) and tertiary educational institutions should also consider exempting NCS students from the requirement of a qualification in Chinese Language for entrance to individual sub-degree or undergraduate programmes. Ms Audrey EU expressed support for Mr CHEUNG's suggestion.

Action

21. The Chairperson of EOC responded that the provision of an alternative curriculum in Chinese Language for NCS students in schools would not constitute discrimination against children of ethnic minorities. He, however, pointed out that an alternative curriculum in Chinese Language would mean a lower requirement, and ethnic minority students studying the alternative curriculum would be regarded as less proficient than their Chinese peers in the subject. He added that the provision of an alternative curriculum in Chinese Language might also affect the progress and extent of integration of ethnic minority into the community.

22. PSEM pointed out that starting from the 2007 Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examination, assessment of students' performance in Chinese and English Language would be done on the basis of standards-referencing. In other words, candidates would be assessed on the basis of their abilities to speak and write Chinese at different competence levels, instead of being awarded an overall pass or fail in the subject. In this way, employers could determine and select applicants with the appropriate level of competence in Chinese to match with the requirements of the jobs offered.

23. PSEM further said that last year, the Vocational Training Council (VTC) had planned to offer a range of programmes conducted in English for ethnic minority youths. However, a number of these programmes did not materialise because of insufficient enrolment. In the 2005-06 school year, VTC had also planned to offer six career-oriented studies with English as the medium of instruction to prepare senior secondary students to pursue vocational or sub-degree studies after secondary education. However, no secondary schools had enrolled their students for these programmes. She considered that ethnic minority students who could speak and understand Cantonese could join local students in attending vocational programmes conducted in Cantonese but with lecture notes being translated into English for them. She added that universities had full autonomy over student admission policies. Ethnic minority students without the required qualification in Chinese Language but meeting the other prescribed entrance requirements could be considered on individual merits.

24. Miss SANDHU Karamjit considered that the provision of an alternative curriculum in Chinese Language would not constitute discrimination against ethnic minority children, but would benefit them in learning Chinese language and pursuing post-secondary education and vocational training.

25. Ms MOK Miu-ying said that the Administration should conduct a survey on the population of ethnic minorities in different districts and formulate long-term education and housing policies to address their needs. She considered that mother-tongue teaching was discriminatory against ethnic minority students in learning. She suggested that ethnic minority children should be provided with opportunity to learn in their mother tongues in primary schools. She added that the Administration should employ qualified ethnic minorities to conduct

Action

vocational training for ethnic minority students. Mr LAW Yuk-kai suggested that the Government should consider introducing appropriate legislation to empower relevant departments including EMB, Housing Department, Department of Health and the Hospital Authority to collect demographic data of the ethnic minorities in Hong Kong.

26. PSEM asked whether the absence of opportunity to learn in their mother-tongue would constitute discrimination against NCS students. The Chairman of EOC responded that from the perspective of equal opportunities, local students were not provided with an opportunity to learn in the languages of the NCS students. Hence, there was no discrimination.

School location and choice

27. Ms Audrey EU said that some deputations had complained about the long travelling time for ethnic minority children to attend schools traditionally admitting a large number of NCS students. She pointed out that given the resources constraints, support measures for ethnic minority students in schools with more NCS students would be better than those in schools with only a few NCS students. She asked whether parents of ethnic minority students would prefer more choices of schools with lesser resources in support of NCS students in learning, or fewer choices of schools with more resources in support of NCS students in learning.

28. Miss SANDHU Karamjit responded that in the past two years, ethnic minority organizations had repeatedly requested for the provision of more EMI schools for ethnic minority children so that they could attend schools within the districts they lived in. The ethnic minority communities accepted the policy of integrated education as it helped their children to integrate into the community. She suggested that the Administration should conduct a survey on the population of ethnic minorities in different districts and plan the provision of school places for them accordingly.

29. Mr MALIK Muhammad said that ethnic minority children would like to learn both the English Language and the Chinese Language in primary schools. Referring to the location of the existing six primary schools traditionally admitting a large number of NCS students, he pointed out that the supply of places in EMI schools for ethnic minority students was inadequate. He requested the Administration to increase the number of EMI schools admitting a large number of ethnic minority children.

30. Mr LAW Yuk-kai shared the view of Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong that ethnic minority children should be given a choice to enrol in mainstream schools or schools traditionally admitting a large number of NCS students. He considered that the implementation of integrated education for ethnic minority students had wide implications on school operations, and mainstream schools in

Action

enrolment of ethnic minority students should be provided with additional resources. He added that schools sponsored by religious bodies would consider the religious belief of ethnic minority students in student enrolment, and some Chinese parents might not prefer to send their children to schools with a large intake of ethnic minority students.

Way forward

31. Referring to the submission of the Hong Kong SKH Maclehehose Centre, Dr Fernando CHEUNG pointed out that the proportion of ethnic minorities who were unemployed or recipients of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance were much higher than the average in Hong Kong. Furthermore, some 75-76% of ethnic minority workers were engaged in low-skill jobs and worked more than 50 hours a week. He suggested that the Government should include the provision of education for ethnic minority children under the new academic structure, and plan the implementation of integrated education for them in the long term.

32. PSEM responded that at present, some 20% ethnic minority children had not attended pre-school education. Among those who had attended pre-school education, many were taught in English only. As a result, most ethnic minority students in primary schools had difficulty to study Chinese Language and learn in Cantonese. The Administration considered it essential to encourage English kindergartens to reinforce teaching of Chinese language for NCS pupils. Based on the information provided by NCS students under the new POA and SSPA arrangements in the 2003-05 school years, the Administration had collected some general data of ethnic minority population in each district.

33. PSEM agreed that there should be more than six to seven primary schools admitting NCS students, but considered it impractical to expect all primary schools to be able to accommodate the needs of NCS students. She pointed out that the provision of more EMI schools for NCS students would not help their integration into the community. The Administration would collaborate with the primary school sector to work out the appropriate number of primary schools for enrolment of NCS students. She added that the availability of professional support and advice was also crucial to the successful integration of NCS students.

34. PSEM further said that with the adoption of standards-referencing for subject assessment in the Hong Kong Diploma of Education Examination under the new academic structure, both NCS students and local students would be assessed by their level of competence and achievement in individual subjects. The next round of consultation in respect of the new academic structure would focus on the curriculum design of career-oriented studies (COS) for students who were less inclined to academic pursuits. For NCS students in secondary schools, the provision of COS would serve as a bridge for them to access

Action

post-secondary education and vocational training in the long term.

35. Dr Fernando CHEUNG considered that the Administration should collaborate with UGC-funded institutions to waive the requirement of a qualification in Chinese Language in student enrolment. PSEM responded that UGC-funded institutions had autonomy on student enrolment matters. They would consider waiving the language requirement for programme entrance on individual merits.

36. Ms Emily LAU said that education for ethnic minority children had been an issue of concern among LegCo members for years. She considered that the Administration should collect more demographic and educational data of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong and plan the provision of education for their children in the long term. She suggested that the Panel should revisit the subject at a future meeting. Members agreed.

37. In summing up discussion, the Chairman said that members in general agreed to the following –

- (a) there should be an alternative curriculum in Chinese Language for NCS students in primary and secondary schools;
- (b) there should be sufficient primary and secondary schools for enrolment of NCS students in each of the five electoral constituencies; and
- (c) there should be adequate vocational training and post-secondary education opportunities for NCS students.

Admin

38. The Chairman requested the Administration to provide a written response to members' concerns. Ms Emily LAU and Mr CHEUNG Man-kyong added that the Administration should relay the views of members on the provision of post-secondary education opportunities to UGC-funded institutions for consideration. PSEM noted the requests.

#### **IV. Any other business**

39. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 7:20 pm.

**Legislative Council Panel on Education  
Meeting on 9 January 2006**

**Summary of views of deputations on education for children of ethnic minorities**

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
1.	Equal Opportunities Commission  [CB(2)774/05-06(01)]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Integrating NCS children into mainstream schools benefits both NCS and Chinese-speaking students in learning, including the creation of a bilingual school environment,</li> <li>- Cultural diversity should be respected in integrating NCS students into the mainstream education systems,</li> <li>- The concept of equal opportunities in education for NCS children in schools is essential for the development of values and culture against racial</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- An alternative Chinese curriculum with equal accreditation as the Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examination (HKCEE) should be developed, with reference to the General Certificate of Secondary Education (GCSE), for NCS students,</li> <li>- Subject to students' capacity and availability of resources, NCS students should be given the opportunity to learn their mother languages.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Adequate support should be provided in the school environment in order to provide NCS children with a level playing field,</li> <li>- Under the new POA and SSPA arrangements, NCS students allocated to individual schools might feel lonely and isolated, and the costs of providing accommodation and support measures are relatively high. Support measures such as language classes and counselling services within the same school net should be centralised for better rationalisation of</li> </ul>	

<b>Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]</b>	<b>Key area</b>	<b>Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements</b>	<b>Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations</b>	<b>Support measures</b>	<b>Post-secondary education and others</b>
		<p>discrimination,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Periodic research and evaluation on the effectiveness of the new POA and SSPA arrangements and the respective support measures should be conducted and the results of which should be made public.</li> </ul>		<p>resources, and peer sharing and mutual support,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Support should be given to cultivate a multicultural environment in schools so that children from different cultural background can enjoy a close-knit setting,</li> <li>- Schools with experience in serving NCS students could act as a resource point to provide support and advice to their professional counterparts,</li> <li>- Consultation with parents, teachers, students and concern groups on provision of support to NCS students are essential.</li> </ul>	



<b>Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]</b>	<b>Key area</b>	<b>Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements</b>	<b>Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations</b>	<b>Support measures</b>	<b>Post-secondary education and others</b>
2.	DAB Ethnic Minorities Committee  [CB(2)806/05-06(01)]		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- NCS students had difficulty to learn in schools adopting Chinese as the medium of instruction (CMI schools) as well as to enrol in schools adopting English as the medium of instruction (EMI schools), and should be provided with sufficient or appropriate Chinese and English language classes in schools, especially at Primary 1 (P1) to Primary 3 (P3) levels,</li> <li>- Review on the adequacy and location of schools in enrolment of NCS students should be conducted with a view to reducing their travelling time to school.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Government should introduce a vocational Chinese Learning Campaign similar to the vocational English Learning Campaign, with sufficient locations and incentives to encourage ethnic minorities to participate.</li> </ul>	

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
3.	Pakistan Islamic Welfare Union Incorporated (HK) Ltd  [CB(2)779/05-06(03)]	– Some Muslim parents have requested that the Islamic Kasim Tuet Memorial College sponsored by the Chinese Muslim Cultural and Fraternal Association should be included in the school list under the new SSPA arrangement for districts with Islamic families.	– One more Islamic secondary school should be established to accommodate NCS students residing in Kowloon.		– NCS students should enjoy concessionary fees in public transport as senior citizens enjoy,  – Schools should review their class schedules with a view to facilitating NCS students to complete homework assignments.
4.	Society for Cultural Integration	– The new POA and SSPA arrangements provide NCS students with more choice of schools, but has not improved the quality of education provided for them.	– NCS students should be provided with alternative Chinese curriculum from primary to secondary levels with supportive learning tools and video discs so that they can participate in HKCEE and GCSE.		– Government should provide more education opportunities for NCS students at post secondary level, in particular sub-degree and associate degree programmes in English.

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
5.	Christian Action [CB(2)839/05-06(01)]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The group supports the new POA and SSPA arrangements for NCS children,</li> <li>- A few primary schools in the five to six districts with more ethnic minority residents should be selected on a voluntary basis to enrol NCS students,</li> <li>- EMB should collaborate with NGOs and ethnic groups to keep parents aware of the new POA and SSPA arrangements,</li> <li>- A better matching of primary and secondary schools for NCS students is necessary.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB) should design a standard Chinese (or Han-yue) curriculum for NCS students at different primary and secondary levels,</li> <li>- EMB should collaborate with the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority to provide an internationally recognised examination equivalent to General Certificate of Secondary Education or Advanced Supplementary levels for assessing NCS students' abilities in Chinese language.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Existing initiation programme is effective for newly arrived NCS children to continue their studies in mainstream schools,</li> <li>- Additional resources should be provided for participating schools to design tailor-made programmes and teaching materials for NCS students,</li> <li>- Small class teaching of 15-25 students would benefit teaching and learning for NCS students.</li> </ul>	

<b>Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]</b>	<b>Key area</b>	<b>Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements</b>	<b>Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations</b>	<b>Support measures</b>	<b>Post-secondary education and others</b>
6.	Hong Kong Christian Service [CB(2)797/05-06(01)]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The new POA and SSPA arrangements provide NCS students with equal opportunity to attend mainstream schools,</li> <li>- EMB should collaborate with NGOs and ethnic groups to promote the benefits of the new POA and SSPA arrangements as well as the education policies among the ethnic minority communities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- EMB should collaborate with schools to provide tailor-made curriculum and adopt appropriate pedagogies for NCS students at primary and secondary levels, in particular for the subject of Chinese Language, under the existing and the new academic structure.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training for pre-service and in-service teachers under the existing and the new academic structure should include cultural characteristics and needs of NCS students,</li> <li>- Additional resources should be allocated to support schools in enrolment of NCS students,</li> <li>- The existing after-school support service in support of NCS students should continue.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- EMB should review policy on provision of post-secondary education for NCS students,</li> <li>- EMB should improve the general awareness of ethnic minority community on education reform and policies,</li> <li>- NCS students should be exempted from the required qualification in Chinese Language for enrolment to tertiary educational institutions,</li> <li>- Tertiary educational institutions should provide programmes conducted in English for NCS students.</li> </ul>

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
7.	Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ethnic minority children should enjoy equal opportunity to education,</li> <li>- EMB should improve communications with ethnic minority communities by way of printed materials and the Internet on the new POA and SSPA arrangements in their languages.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Use of the languages of the ethnic minorities to teach their children in school should be considered,</li> <li>- EMB should develop a curriculum framework on Chinese Language for schools with enrolment of NCS students to follow,</li> <li>- Apart from enrolment to mainstream schools of their choice, NCS children should be provided with a choice of the schools with a large enrolment of ethnic minority students.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- EMB should improve administrative arrangements and support for ethnic minority parents and children,</li> <li>- Like the allocation of funds to support the operation of English Foundation Schools, Government should consider allocation of resources for provision of education to ethnic minority children.</li> </ul>	

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
8.	Ethnic Minority Concern Group [CB(2)797/05-06(02)]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- NCS students should learn in English as their first language and learn their ethnic languages as second languages in school education,</li> <li>- Government should plan the provision of bridging courses in Chinese at all levels for NCS children in order to prepare them to receive integrated education.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should review the Chinese Language curriculum for NCS students in primary and secondary schools,</li> <li>- As mother-tongue teaching has a discriminatory effect against NCS students in learning, an alternative language policy should be introduced for NCS students,</li> <li>- Government should review the subject syllabus under HKCEE and accept ethnic minority languages and Chinese language as second language for NCS students in addition to French and German.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should provide expert support and training for teachers in teaching NCS students,</li> <li>- Government should provide additional resources for schools in enrolment of NCS students,</li> <li>- Government should provide language programmes to support NCS students in CMI schools,</li> <li>- Teachers and teaching assistants should be provided with training on the culture and languages of ethnic minorities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should conduct a survey in the languages of ethnic minorities to estimate the population of NCS students and their educational needs.</li> </ul>

<p><b>Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]</b></p>	<p><b>Key area</b></p>	<p><b>Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements</b></p>	<p><b>Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations</b></p>	<p><b>Support measures</b></p>	<p><b>Post-secondary education and others</b></p>
<p>9.</p>	<p>Unison Hong Kong [CB(2)839/05-06(02)]</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Group supports integrated education as it provides NCS students with access to mainstream schools and opportunity to study Chinese Language,</li> <li>- NCS children and their parents cannot speak Cantonese and find it difficult to communicate with teachers and local Chinese students,</li> <li>- In implementing integrated education, teachers in mainstream schools are required to teach NCS and students with special educational needs. They work under extreme pressure,</li> <li>- Teachers in mainstream schools should learn the</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- NCS students find it difficult to learn in Cantonese,</li> <li>- Government should develop a “Chinese as a second language” policy and assist schools in the development of their school-based curriculum of Chinese Language for NCS students,</li> <li>- NCS students should be provided with an alternative Chinese curriculum, in particular under the “3+3+4” new academic structure.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Many parents are hesitated to send their children to mainstream primary schools because of insufficient support in these schools,</li> <li>- Schools in enrolment of NCS students should be provided with additional resources,</li> <li>- After-school tutorials for NCS students should continue,</li> <li>- Native-speaking teaching assistants of different ethnic languages should be employed to assist teachers in teaching NCS students and communicating with their parents,</li> <li>- Teachers should be</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- NCS students have little opportunity to pursue further studies after secondary school because of the requirement of five passes in HKCEE including a pass in Chinese Language,</li> <li>- IVE should provide programmes conducted in English to meet the diverse learning interests of NCS students,</li> <li>- IVE should review its requirements for enrolment and abolish the Chinese language requirement,</li> <li>- Government should provide Spring Board Programmes in English for NCS youths to attain a qualification equivalent</li> </ul>

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
		cultural characteristics of different ethnic minorities.		trained on specific skills and knowledge for teaching NCS students,  – Small class teaching should be adopted for teaching NCS students.	to five passes in HKCEE.
10. Hong Kong Integrated Nepalese Society [CB(2)806/05-06(02)]	– The Group supports integrated education and integration of ethnic minority communities into the mainstream community,  – NCS children regardless of their race, colour, ethnicity and religion enjoy the same right to education.	– Sufficient EMI primary and secondary schools should be provided for children of ethnic minorities in different districts, in particular in Yuen Long where there is a Nepalese population of more than 4 000.	– Government should provide sufficient resources for the promotion of different culture and religion in the community,  – Government should support the operation of schools admitting NCS students in the same way as it supports the operation of English Foundation Schools.	– As ethnic minority students studying in educational institutions in the Mainland are treated as foreign students, Government should help relay the request of the Society to the Mainland Authorities that ethnic minority students from Hong Kong should be charged with the same level of tuition and accommodation fees for Chinese students from Hong Kong.	



Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
11.	Hong Kong SKH Lady MacLehose Centre  [CB(2)821/05-06(01)]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should decide whether to adopt an integration or an assimilation approach for implementing integrated education for NCS students,</li> <li>- An integration approach in Language would require NCS students to learn in English and learn Chinese as an optional second language with an alternative curriculum in schools, and their access to tertiary education would not be blocked by a requirement of Chinese Language,</li> <li>- An assimilative approach in Language would require NCS students to learn both English and Chinese at comparable</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- An alternative Chinese curriculum for NCS students should be provided for NCS students.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should provide sufficient support for NCS students in CMI schools such as the provision of after-school tutorial classes.</li> </ul>	

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
		levels with their Chinese peers in school, and access to tertiary education incorporates a requirement in both English and Chinese language.			
12. Minhaj-Ul-Quran [CB(2)806/05-06(03)]	– Government should provide education opportunities for children and adults of ethnic minorities in need.	– Government should provide English and Cantonese classes for children of ethnic minorities to prepare themselves for enrolment in public sector schools.	–	– Government should provide English and Cantonese classes for ethnic minority adults in community centres or schools after school hours at nominal fees.	
13. Islamic Kasim Tuet Memorial College [CB(2)806/05-06(04) and (05)]	– The provision of integrated education for NCS students is correct, but a set of supporting policies and strategies to facilitate implementation is needed.	– EMB should develop an alternative Chinese curriculum from pre-school to secondary education for NCS students with a recognised assessment mechanism,  – NCS students residing in	– Schools in enrolment of NCS students should be provided with additional resources and support.	– The requirement of a qualification in Chinese Language for NCS students to access tertiary education should be reviewed,  – Pre-vocational training and programmes for NCS students should be	

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
			<p>different districts should be provided with choice in CMI and EMI schools,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Islamic Kasim Tuet Memorial College should be opened to all Muslim students under SSPA,</li> <li>- Like NCS students with different religious beliefs, Muslim students should have more school choice.</li> </ul>		<p>conducted in English.</p>
14.	Yang Memorial Methodist Social Service				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should provide NCS students with more opportunities to receive vocational training and pursue tertiary education,</li> <li>- Children of ethnic minorities, in particular those from South Asian countries, have difficulties to pursue</li> </ul>

Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]	Key area	Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements	Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations	Support measures	Post-secondary education and others
					further education and employment after completion of secondary education.
15. Federation of Minority Schools  [CB(2)806/05-06(06)] (revised)				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should provide subsidy for the Federation to help needy ethnic minorities,</li> <li>- Government should consult registered minority organisations and formulate affirmative action programmes to support ethnic minorities in education.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Government should exempt members of the Federation from certain statutory requirements the implementation of which require substantial financial outlay.</li> </ul>
16. Khals Diwan (Sikh Temple)			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Children of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong are able to learn to speak and listen in Cantonese and Government should provide Chinese writing courses for them.</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- NCS students should be provided with more opportunities in vocational training and pathways to higher education. Many NCS youths are attracted by jobs with a monthly</li> </ul>

<b>Submission from deputations [LC Paper Nos.]</b>	<b>Key area</b>	<b>Integrated education for (Non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students and the new Primary One Allocation (POA) and Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) arrangements</b>	<b>Curriculum, medium of instruction, and school places and locations</b>	<b>Support measures</b>	<b>Post-secondary education and others</b>
					salary of around \$5000 to \$6000 after secondary school. Government should consider providing a cash subsidy of around \$2500 to encourage them to pursue further studies after completion of secondary education.