

Panel on Planning, Lands and Works
Subcommittee to Review the Planning for the Central Waterfront (including the Tamar Site)

**Summary of views of deputations made at the meeting on 3 April 2006
and the Administration's response**

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Creation of job opportunities		
<p>Hong Kong Construction Industry Employees General Union</p>	<p>According to the General Union's survey results, the rate of unemployment in the construction sector is well above 20%, while the rate of under-employment is close to 30%. As the construction works of the Central Waterfront development and the Tamar development project will create employment opportunities for construction workers, we hope very much that these two projects can be finalized as soon as possible, so that the construction works can commence promptly.</p> <p>The Central Waterfront development, the Tamar development project and all other government projects and public works projects should give due consideration to providing the local construction workers with the first priority to the employment opportunities created, so as to further alleviate the employment problem of the construction sector. As such, all components that can be produced locally should be produced in Hong Kong. Besides, concessionary measures should be adopted to encourage pre-made components to be produced in Hong Kong, thereby creating more employment opportunities for local workers.</p>	<p>Early implementation of the project would enable timely provision of unemployment opportunities for the construction sector. According to the latest estimate, as stated in the paper submitted to the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works for meeting on 25 April 2006 (the 25 April 2006 Panel paper) (LC Paper No. CB(1)1319/05-06(01)), the Tamar project would create some 2 600 employment opportunities totally 70 000 man-months for the construction industry.</p> <p>The Administration is studying the proposal of prescribing use of concrete units/ segments precast in Hong Kong for the Tamar project. Our legal advisers and relevant bureaux and departments are examining the relevant considerations, including Hong Kong's obligation under the non-discrimination principle of the World Trade Organisation Agreement on Government Procurement, the receptiveness of the construction trade to the proposal and the possible impacts on the building prices of the public works projects. The Government would wish to establish its feasibility and seek to come to a final view before seeking funding approval from the Finance Committee within the current legislative session.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
<p>Ms Vicki LUKINS</p> <p>Mr Colin DAWSON</p>	<p>High unemployment rate in the construction sector is a structural issue which should be considered separately. It should not be a driving force for the Tamar development project.</p> <p>Creating job opportunities through the Tamar development project is only a short-term solution.</p>	<p>The LegCo PLW Panel and Public Works Subcommittee supported the Tamar development project in 2003. In re-launching the Tamar development project, we have taken into consideration our planning objective to develop the Tamar site as the prime civic core of Hong Kong, the improvement in economy and public finance, the acute office space shortage faced by the Government Secretariat and LegCo, and the physical constraints to upgrade the existing Central Government Offices into technologically advanced office provision. The timely creation of employment opportunities is only one of the considerations.</p>
<p>Friends of the Earth (HK)</p>	<p>Reviving the outstanding leisure and cultural services projects of the former municipal councils will bring more employment opportunities than carrying out the Tamar development project.</p>	<p>The Government does intend to press ahead with justifiable former municipal council projects, in parallel with the Tamar development. The two are not mutually exclusive.</p> <p>The Government conducts annual review with the District Councils on the implementation programme of the outstanding former municipal councils projects. Major considerations in prioritisation include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the need of the districts, the expectation of the districts and the community at large; (b) the increasing demands for leisure and cultural facilities of the new towns with a growing population; and (c) the distribution of leisure and cultural facilities throughout the territory and their utilisation rate. <p>The justifications for the Tamar project are recapitulated in our response to the views of Ms Vicki LUKINS and Mr Colin DAWSON above. The timely creation of job opportunities for the construction industry is one of the considerations.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
General planning concerns		
<p>The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors</p>	<p>HKIS supports the proposed Tamar development project. The development density or plot ratio of the Tamar site is only about half of most commercial developments in the Central Business District. There will be no significant environmental impacts arising from the proposed Central Government Complex (CGC) and Legislative Council Complex (LCC) which are office-type developments.</p> <p>Government should impose strict specification requirements on the tender documents to stipulate that the proposed CGC and LCC should be designed, constructed and operated in a sustainable and environmental friendly manner.</p> <p>Within the Central reclamation area, one specific concern is related to the planning of those sites zoned as “Comprehensive Development Area” and “Waterfront Related Commercial and Leisure Uses Only”. HKIS suggests that based on the sustainable and holistic approach, the Government should work out the detailed planning briefs and urban design framework for public consultation as soon as possible.</p>	<p>The development plot ratio of the Tamar project would be around 5.7, representing a reduction from the estimated 6.2 in 2003. The plot ratios of the surrounding buildings range from around 13 to 18.</p> <p>It is confirmed that there would be no long-term environmental implications of the Tamar development project in both the construction and operation stages. Please refer to the details at paragraphs 23 to 25 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper and its Annex E.</p> <p>To ensure the Tamar project can be environmentally-friendly and conducive to sustainable use, we will incorporate very detailed and specific requirements in the tender documents for more effective and energy-efficient electrical, mechanical and building services systems such as elevators of better performance, air-conditioning systems with better air quality control and filtering capacity as well as temperature control, etc. We will also require tenderers to propose designs that are efficient and effective in use of space, which is highly adaptive to meet future changes and advancement in technology</p> <p>The Planning Department (PlanD) will shortly undertake an urban design study to refine the existing urban design framework and to prepare planning/design briefs for key sites on the Central reclamation. The study will formulate more detailed guidelines for the future developments on the reclamation, including the “Comprehensive Development Area” (“CDA”) and “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Waterfront Related Commercial and Leisure Uses” (“OU(WRCLU)”) sites. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the study process.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers	<p>The HKIE in general agrees to the overall conceptual requirements and arrangements for the Tamar development project and CRIII. The proposed building heights are compatible with the surrounding buildings and the low plot ratio is reasonable.</p> <p>Car-parks could be built underground to enable the space above to be used by the public and there should be more greening.</p>	<p>The Government has tightened up the height restrictions for development on the Tamar site, from 180 mPD as stipulated under the relevant statutory Outline Zoning Plan (OZP), to 130–160 mPD, to ensue a “20% building-free zone” under the ridgeline. The Government is committed to minimising the development intensity of the Tamar site. The plot ratio of the Tamar development project is reduced from 6.2 in 2003 to around 5.7 at present, significantly lower than the plots ratios of the surrounding buildings ranging from around 13 to 18.</p> <p>As to the proposal to build underground car parks, we have spelt out in the Tamar development project Prequalification Document that we would encourage the applicants to explore the option of “underground car park”. We will also consider specifying in the tender document requirement for construction of car parks and other suitable facilities underground.</p> <p>As to greening, we will request the tenderers to propose special green features in the design of the two-hectare Civic Place such as fountains and landscaped garden to provide an open atmosphere and sense of spaciousness.</p> <p>Paragraphs 17 to 22 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper contain further details on these issues.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Action Group on Protection of The Harbour	<p>We once again request the Government to plan anew the development programme for the Central waterfront (including the Tamar site), concretely respond to the queries raised by concerned groups and the community regarding the relevant programme, and develop a Central waterfront which belongs to the people of Hong Kong as a whole.</p>	<p>The Central District (Extension) OZP, covering the reclaimed land under Central Reclamation Phase III (CRIII) and the Tamar site, was approved by the Chief Executive in Council in February 2000 after going through the statutory process of consideration of public views and objections under the Town Planning Ordinance (TPO). In considering a few rezoning requests/application in August 2005 and March 2006, the Town Planning Board (TPB) has re-examined the land use zonings on the OZP, including the zoning of the Tamar site, and reconfirmed that they are appropriate. The land use and development of the reclamation should continue to be guided by this statutory plan. Notwithstanding this, as requested by TPB, PlanD will shortly undertake an urban design study to refine the existing urban design framework and to prepare planning/design briefs for key sites on the Central reclamation.</p>
Citizen Envisioning @ Harbour	<p>Government should look at Central District as a whole, instead of just focusing on Central Reclamation Phase III (CRIII) or Tamar. For instance, the conservation of the Government Hill is very important for economic, social and environmental reasons. The current Government Hills is a history book written by “brick and mortar”.</p> <p>Developments on the Tamar site, the Groundscraper and festival markets in CRIII should be of smaller block size, preferably should look like an “organic and natural” extension of urban fabric in Central District with pedestrian friendly transportation network. Such an urban form would provide opportunities for multiple uses and multi-players to promote competition and prosperity, an essential element for economic sustainability.</p>	<p>The entire Central District is covered by the Central District OZP and Central District (Extension) OZP, which are statutory plans to guide the land use and development in the area. The Central Government Office (CGO) and Murray Building (MB) sites are currently zoned “Government, Institution or Community” (“G/IC”) on the approved Central District OZP No. S/H4/12 to reflect their existing uses as government offices. The future uses of these sites after relocation have not been decided yet. To properly determine the appropriate uses and scale of development of the two sites, the Government would carefully consider public needs and aspirations and the prevailing social and economic circumstances. The Government would carry out a comprehensive assessment of the future uses of the two sites, taking into account the land use needs; the traffic, environmental and infrastructural impacts; the historic value of the sites and their surroundings; tree preservation; protection of</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>For the Tamar project, more scientific data are needed, such as floor spaces required for government headquarters, market analysis for office spaces and retailing activities. Skyline in Tamar should be similar to that of the City Hall which is of a much more human scale.</p> <p>Should provide open and transparent opportunities to engage the general public in enhancing the planning and design of CRIII to create a sense of ownership and to build social trust and social capital in Hong Kong.</p>	<p>the ridgelines; and the urban design guidelines, etc. The relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the process. Should the future uses of the sites warrant an amendment to the OZP, the statutory planning procedures under the TPO will be followed.</p> <p>The proposed 'groundscraper' and waterfront related commercial and leisure uses will be guided by planning/design briefs to be prepared by PlanD. The views expressed by the deputations will be taken into consideration in the preparation of the planning/design briefs. PlanD will undertake an urban design study to refine the existing urban design framework for the Central reclamation and to prepare planning/design briefs for key development sites. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the study process.</p> <p>While the OZP has stipulated a building height restriction of 180 mPD for the Tamar development, the Government has further lowered the height restriction to 130-160 mPD to better preserve the view to the ridgeline and to the harbour.</p> <p>The Government has completed the updating exercise of the floor area requirements of the Tamar project and, as undertaken before, has provided Members with the details in paragraphs 3 to 11 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper and its Annexes A and B. The Government is committed to minimising the development intensity on the Tamar site. The development plot ratio of the Tamar project would be reduced to 5.7 from the estimated 6.2 in 2003, and is significantly lower than the plot ratios of the surrounding buildings range from around 13 to 18. Please see paragraph 22 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper for details.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>The Administration has been receptive to views expressed by LegCo, the Central and Western District Council, deputations to LegCo and many other interested parties in relation to the Tamar development project. Wide media coverage has also allowed the public ample opportunities to learn more about and express views on the project.</p>
<p>Designing Hong Kong Harbour District and The Experience Group, Limited</p>	<p>The Tamar site together with the immediate waterfront is very large. The planned use, however, only includes one Government/LegCo complex and a large open space. The current plan shifts existing Government jobs to the waterfront, rather than use the site to stimulate new business and job opportunities. There is a lack of vibrancy and street-level activities. Hong Kong culture and attractions are missing.</p> <p>The following is needed to ensure a competitive, attractive and accessible environment for both residents and tourists:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Breaking up Tamar and the water-front, ● Allowing a diverse mix of harbour and harbour-front dependent uses including culture, leisure, retail, hotel, F&B, and possibly small scale commercial and Government uses, ● Limiting the intensity of the developments, ● Human scale developments and pedestrian connectivity at ground/sea level, ● Providing rail-based services early, reducing size and impact of roads. 	<p>The Tamar site covers about 4.2 ha of land. The planning objective is to develop the Tamar site into a prime civic core, comprising the Central Government Complex (LCC), LegCo Complex (LCC) and Civic Place. As a whole, the design scheme of the Tamar project should be responsive to the urban fabric of the Central District and the natural context of the waterfront setting and the backdrop of the Victoria Peak. The civic place will be developed to cater for multi-purpose needs and easily accessible by the public. Please see paragraphs 12 to 14 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper.</p> <p>A mix of uses and diversity of functions and a comprehensive pedestrian network have been planned on the OZP to ensure an attractive and accessible waterfront for both Hong Kong residents and visitors. Only low to medium rise developments are proposed on the waterfront. A comprehensive and convenient network of pedestrian links comprising a combination of elevated walkways, at-grade and elevated pedestrian decks, and at-grade crossings has been planned to connect the waterfront and the hinterland. Marine access from the harbour will be facilitated by the provision of ferry piers and public landing steps along the waterfront. As regards the provision of rail-based transport, the OZP has already made land reservation for the possible eastward extension of the proposed North Island Line alignment.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Friends of the Harbour	The current planning for the Central waterfront will not provide vibrant activities, nor enhance the quality of life of citizens and attract tourists to stay in Hong Kong.	A mix of uses and diversity of functions have been planned on the OZP to bring life to the waterfront. To add vibrancy, areas have been designated for civic place, public gathering spaces, and waterfront related commercial and leisure uses such as restaurants, cafes and alfresco dining, etc. Planning/design briefs for key development sites on the reclamation area will be prepared to guide future development.
Dr Adrian RAPER	There are other alternatives proposed by various parties in addition to the Administration's planning for the Central waterfront. These possibilities should be explored and there should be a review of the planning for the Central waterfront.	The Central District (Extension) OZP, covering the Central waterfront, is an approved plan which has gone through the statutory process of consideration of public views and objections under the Town Planning Ordinance. In considering a few rezoning requests/application in August 2005 and March 2006, TPB has examined the land use zonings on the OZP as well as alternative proposals. TPB reconfirmed that the current land use zonings are appropriate. As requested by TPB, PlanD will shortly undertake an urban design study to refine the existing urban design framework and to prepare planning/design briefs for key sites on the Central reclamation. The study will formulate more detailed guidelines for the future developments on the reclamation, including the "CDA" and "OU(WRCLU)" sites. The relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the study process.

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Mr Winston CHU	<p>Even with the maximum height being reduced from 190 metres to 160 metres above principal datum, the new Government building will still be 525 ft. high and more than 40 storeys tall. This is as high as the Far East financial Centre and United Centre nearby and will block the scenic view of the harbour.</p>	<p>The OZP has stipulated a building height restriction of 180 mPD, instead of 190 mPD as stated by the deputation, for the Tamar development. The Government has tightened up the height restrictions for development on the Tamar site, from 180 meter PD as stipulated under the relevant statutory OZP to 130–160 mPD, to ensue a “20% building-free zone” under the ridgeline. The height restrictions define the highest permissible heights of the development on the Tamar site but the actual height of the buildings of the Tamar project could be lower, subject to the final design of the successful tenderer.</p>
Ms Vicki LUKINS	<p>Tamar should not be considered in isolation, but as an integral part of the waterfront.</p> <p>The Government should consider other alternatives such as re-development of CGO.</p>	<p>The Government announced intention to reserve the Tamar site for reprovisioning of headquarters in January 1998. The proposed development was considered in the context of the integral Central District (Extension) OZP, which covers both the Tamar site and the adjacent waterfront area. This OZP is an approved plan after going through a due process of consideration of public views under the provisions of the TPO. In drawing up the land use proposals for the sites on the OZP, there were comprehensive assessments on possible impacts on traffic, provision of infrastructure and environment on the adjacent hinterland in Central, etc. The OZP was approved in 2000 by the Chief Executive in Council after having gone through due planning procedures under the TPO, including the public consultation/objection process.</p> <p>The Executive Council (ExCo) decided that the Administration should proceed with the Tamar development project in April 2002. The major considerations as to why the Tamar development project is a preferred option to the in-situ redevelopment option have been set out in the Legislative Council brief issued on 30 April 2002 (at Annex 7 of Appendix I to our reply to the Subcommittee for the meeting on 7 March</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>(LC Paper No. CB(1)1014/05-06(01)) following the ExCo's decision. Please also refer to paragraphs 33 to 34 and 38 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper.</p>
Mr Colin DAWSON	<p>The Tamar site should be used for the construction of cultural facilities to attract tourists and local people.</p> <p>The Government may consider using vacant office space elsewhere, such as Cyberport, instead of using the Tamar site.</p>	<p>The Civic Place (about half of the Tamar site) would be developed to cater for multi-purpose needs and easily accessible by the public. Please refer to paragraphs 13 to 15 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper.</p> <p>Leisure and cultural activities could be accommodated in the waterfront promenade and areas of the CRIII site designated for waterfront related commercial and leisure uses to provide attraction to Hong Kong residents and visitors.</p> <p>A site to the north of CITIC Tower has also been reserved for possible cultural and recreational facilities.</p> <p>As to how the Government has reached the decision to proceed with the Tamar site option, please refer to the Legislative Council brief issued on 30 April 2002 (at Annex 7 of Appendix I to our reply to the Subcommittee for the meeting on 7 March (LC Paper No. CB(1)1014/05-06(01)) following the ExCo's decision. Please also refer to paragraphs 33 to 34 and 38 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper.</p>
WWF Hong Kong	<p>Apart from costing billions of dollars of taxpayers' money, the Tamar development project involves perhaps the most valuable piece of land, especially with regard to sentimental value for the public. There should not be massive developments there. The Tamar site should be put to other uses which will create on-going jobs.</p>	<p>The Tamar site was first zoned for "commercial" use in 1994 and then formed in 1997. In January 1998, the Government announced intention to reserve the site for reprovisioning of the Government headquarters and had since gone through the statutory planning procedures under the TPO, including the due public consultation/objection process, before the relevant OZP was approved in 2000 by the Chief Executive in Council.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>The Government is committed to minimising the development intensity of the Tamar site. The plot ratio of the Tamar development project is reduced from 6.2 in 2003 to around 5.7 at present, significantly lower than the plots ratios of the surrounding buildings ranging from around 13 to 18. For details, please refer to paragraph 22 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper.</p> <p>The Government considers Tamar the best site for Hong Kong's prime civic core comprising the Legislature, the Government headquarters and a public open space, given its strategic location. Please refer to paragraph 38 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper for more details.</p>
Central & Western District Council	<p>The areas along the Central waterfront should be revitalized and beautified.</p> <p>There should be more open space and greening at the Tamar site, and a Civic Place where citizens could hold gatherings and other activities freely. Consideration should be given to designating the whole Tamar site as open space. The ridgeline and the view of the harbour should be protected.</p> <p>The District Council has passed a motion to urge the Government to substantially reduce the amount of area for commercial uses under CRIII; prohibit the use of the reclaimed land for any commercial developments such as office premises and hotels and rezone the relevant sites to open space and designate all reclaimed land for public use.</p>	<p>The land uses in the Central waterfront have been drawn up in accordance with the statutory procedures under the Town Planning Ordinance. A mix of uses and diversity of functions have been planned for civic, leisure and commercial facilities to bring life to the waterfront. Studies have been undertaken with objectives to enhance the vibrancy and attractiveness of the existing waterfront.</p> <p>Only about 5.23 ha of land (or 11.2% of the planning scheme area) is zoned "CDA", which may be used for commercial or retail purposes, to help maintain the competitive status of our Central Business District (CBD) in meeting the demand for high quality office space at this central and prestigious location.</p> <p>Ample provision of open space has been planned on the Central District (Extension) OZP, especially along the waterfront, for public enjoyment. About 14.63 ha of land (or 31.33% of the planning scheme area or equivalent to about</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>three-quarters of the size of the Victoria Park) is zoned "Open Space" ("O") on the OZP. Out of this total, the waterfront promenade and the civic place at Tamar account for about 10.8 ha. About 2 ha of land at Tamar has been designated for open space use. There is also a surplus of about 14 ha of district open space in the Central and Western District. There is no strong justification to rezone the whole Tamar site and other development sites to open space. TPB has considered and rejected a few rezoning requests/application in August 2005 and March 2006 to rezone the Tamar site and other sites to "O".</p> <p>While the OZP has stipulated a building height restriction of 180 mPD for the Tamar development, the Government has further lowered the height restriction to 130-160 mPD to better preserve the view to the ridgeline and the harbour.</p>
Mr Winston CHU	<p>The new Government Headquarters will be dead after office hours. This hardly makes the harbourfront an attractive, vibrant, accessible and sustainable world-class asset. The Tamar project will also degrade the harbour and the harbourfront as a tourist attraction. It will deny the public and future generations enjoyment of the last sizable piece of the Central harbourfront for all times contrary to the principle of sustainable development.</p>	<p>The two-hectare Civic Place, taking up about half of the size of the Tamar site, would be developed to cater for multi-purpose needs and public enjoyment. It would be easily accessible by the public. Through an open deck of a width of 50-60 meters, the Civic Place would be kept open and pedestrian flow encouraged to/ from the adjoining waterfront promenade. The Civic Place and the waterfront promenade would in total provide 10.8 hectares of open space to the public. For details, please refer to paragraphs 12 to 14 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper.</p>
The Hong Kong Institute of Architects	<p>Supports the Tamar development project in principle. The site should not be used for large commercial developments such as commercial buildings and large shopping arcades. Designating the entire site as open space is also inappropriate. An integrated</p>	<p>The planning objective is to develop the Tamar site into an iconic prime civic core of Hong Kong, comprising the CGC, LCC and Civic Place as the core development components. The Government is committed to minimising the development intensity of the site. The plot ratio of the Tamar project would</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>design for CGC, LCC, Civic Place and Waterfront Promenade is very important.</p> <p>There should be visuals and three-dimensional models to allow the public to better understand the scale of the buildings under the current planning.</p>	<p>be around 5.7, reduced from the estimated 6.2 in 2003, and is significantly lower than the plot ratios of the surrounding buildings ranging from around 13 to 18. As a whole, the development on Tamar would be responsive to the urban fabric of the Central District as well as the natural context of the waterfront setting and the backdrop of the Victoria Peak.</p>
Implementation approach for the Tamar development project		
<p>The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers</p>	<p>The HKIE has reservation on the design and build approach because cost will become the predominant consideration. In view of the complexity and significance of the project, it is desirable to carry out the design and construction of the project in separate phases. There should be an initial planning/design phase covering the conceptual planning of the principal elements of the development and architectural designs of the Government buildings and main features in order to provide the framework and for subsequent detailed design. After deciding the detailed design, tendering may then be conducted. Tenderers should be required to follow the specifications in the detailed design.</p>	<p>The design and build approach can minimise the interface problems between the design and construction stages, as the designer architect and the building contractor can work hand-in-hand to make best use of the latest technical advancements available for the design of the project. On the other hand, given the unique nature of the Tamar project, the Government places emphasis on the design of the project and is committed to developing the site into an iconic landmark. As a whole, the tenderers would have to propose a design that is responsive to the urban fabric of the Central District as well as the natural context of the waterfront setting and the backdrop of Victoria Peak. The last prequalification exercise in 2003 proves that the project can attract participation of locally- and internationally-renowned architects. We are confident that the final design would achieve the objective of developing the Tamar site into an iconic prime civic core.</p>
<p>Mr Winston CHU</p>	<p>The proposed design and build contract the Government proposes to award cannot produce an outstanding building which can become Hong Kong's symbol of urban design excellence and Hong Kong's brand identity to the international community.</p>	<p>The design and build approach can minimise the interface problems between the design and construction stages, as the designer architect and the building contractor can work hand-in-hand to make best use of the latest technical advancements available for the design of the project. On the other hand, given the unique nature of the Tamar project, the Government places emphasis on the design of the project and is committed to developing the site into an iconic landmark.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>As a whole, the tenderers would have to propose a design that is responsive to the urban fabric of the Central District as well as the natural context of the waterfront setting and the backdrop of Victoria Peak. The last prequalification exercise in 2003 proves that the project can attract participation of locally- and internationally-renowned architects. We are confident that the final design would achieve the objective of developing the Tamar site into an iconic prime civic core.</p>
<p>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</p>	<p>There is reservation on adopting the design and build approach. An open international design competition should be held so that the community can have knowledge of the options available before deciding on an appropriate design. There should be planning principles which should be followed.</p>	<p>The design and build approach can minimise the interface problems between the design and construction stages, as the designer architect and the building contractor can work hand-in-hand to make best use of the latest technical advancements available for the design of the project. On the other hand, given the unique nature of the Tamar project, the Government places emphasis on the design of the project and is committed to developing the site into an iconic landmark. As a whole, the tenderers would have to propose a design that is responsive to the urban fabric of the Central District as well as the natural context of the waterfront setting and the backdrop of Victoria Peak. The last prequalification exercise in 2003 proves that the project can attract participation of locally- and internationally-renowned architects. We are confident that the final design would achieve the objective of developing the Tamar site into an iconic prime civic core. In addition, the tenderers would have to take into due account Urban Design Guidelines and Harbour Planning Principles, details of which are set out in paragraph 21 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper.</p>
Air quality		
<p>Ms Vicki LUKINS</p>	<p>Air pollution in Hong Kong is serious and affects quality of life significantly. Any development</p>	<p>The Tamar project is an office-type development within an urban environment. Such type of development has limited</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>should take account of the impact on air quality.</p>	<p>potential for environmental impacts provided standard pollution control measures are implemented.</p> <p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p>
<p>Mr Winston CHU</p>	<p>The Tamar development project will aggravate air pollution.</p>	<p>The Tamar project is an office-type development within an urban environment. Such type of development has limited potential for environmental impacts provided standard pollution control measures are implemented.</p> <p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p>
<p>Mr John BATTEN</p>	<p>What Central does need is more clean air and less air pollution.</p>	<p>The Tamar project is an office-type development within an urban environment. Such type of development has limited potential for environmental impacts provided standard pollution control measures are implemented.</p> <p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p>
<p>Mr Norman de BRACKINGHE</p>	<p>Vehicles make a big contribution to pollution, we all know that because you cannot avoid it. Traffic control and air pollution go hand in hand, what's the point of beautiful view if you cannot breathe the air outside.</p>	<p>The Tamar project is an office-type development within an urban environment. Such type of development has limited potential for environmental impacts provided standard pollution control measures are implemented.</p> <p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p>
<p>Friends of The Harbour</p>	<p>High density developments at the Central waterfront and the Tamar site will lead to increased traffic and air pollution. The Administration's policy in road and highway development is counter to measures in solving air quality problems. Air quality in Hong Kong cannot reach the required standards.</p>	<p>The Tamar project is an office-type development within an urban environment. Such type of development has limited potential for environmental impacts provided standard pollution control measures are implemented.</p> <p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p> <p>The CRIII environmental impact assessment (EIA) concluded that the predicted cumulative air quality impacts at the existing and planned air sensitive receivers including the Tamar</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		development would be within established standards.
Friends of the Earth (HK)	<p>There is grave concern about deterioration in air quality and visibility in Hong Kong. Visibility was low at Chek Lap Kok for 18% and 24% of the days in 2004 and 2005 respectively. In January 2005, the visibility there was low for 484 hours continuously. Pollutants from traffic are one of the major reasons for air pollution and low visibility. Choosing a heavily polluted site for CGC is not a wise move. Should adopt a scientific development perspective in choosing a site and planning for CGC.</p>	<p>The Tamar project is an office-type development within an urban environment. Such type of development has limited potential for environmental impacts provided standard pollution control measures are implemented.</p> <p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p>
Society for Protection of the Harbour	<p>The Central-Wan Chai Bypass is never the primary reason for reclamation. The real reason is to generate land for high density developments that will provide substantial revenue for the Government. The external costs for society will be very high. Needless to say, Hong Kong loses another chunk of Victoria Harbour, and environmental conditions, especially air and noise qualities will deteriorate, which will impact on our public health. The waterfront aesthetic experience will continue to be poor as people will still be too close to highways and roads.</p>	<p>The CRIII EIA concluded that the predicted cumulative air quality impacts at the existing and planned air sensitive receivers including the Tamar development would be within established standards.</p>
Mr Steve CHAN, Wan Chai District Council Member	<p>Should have a fundamental change in mindset and strategy in order to improve air quality. Experience from Korea indicates that adopting appropriate planning can increase wind speed by 50% and decrease temperature by 3.6 degrees Celsius.</p>	<p>The Tamar project is an office-type development within an urban environment. Such type of development has limited potential for environmental impacts provided standard pollution control measures are implemented.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p>
<p>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</p>	<p>Should ensure that the height and width of the buildings would not affect air flow.</p>	<p>The design of the new development at Tamar would be sustainable and environmentally friendly. Consideration will be given to include an air ventilation assessment as a design requirement to address the air ventilation aspect.</p>
<p>Dr Bill BARRON</p>	<p>The new buildings along the waterfront will block air flow and lead to a street canyon effect with heavier pollution build-up. Nitrogen Dioxide (NO₂) levels could easily double. NO₂ harms respiratory tract and lung development.</p> <p>Air quality at roadside in Central is already poor. If the government does not re-set its planning priorities, as can be seen from its insistence on the existing Central OZP, air quality in Central will get very much worse. The 24-hour average AQO for NO₂ at Central roadside was exceeded one in every six days in 2004.</p> <p>Planning needs to ensure public health and environmental considerations receive their proper attention, otherwise Hong Kong residents will suffer directly and visitors will continue to regard Hong Kong as smog city.</p>	<p>For the areas around the Tamar site, the major roads are intersected by other roads and abutted by open space allowing air to flow through. Hence, canyon effect should not be a concern.</p> <p>The design of the new development at Tamar would be sustainable and environmentally friendly. Consideration will be given to include an air ventilation assessment as a design requirement to address the air ventilation aspect.</p> <p>The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
<p>Save Our Shorelines</p>	<p>There will be a large bus terminal at ground-level sitting beneath the raised "Groundscraper", as well as a mini-bus terminal. The air pollution there will be severe.</p> <p>Government road plans show there will be many highways and roads converging at the Tamar and HKCEC end. Indeed, there are 13 lanes converging in one location! Thus, the immediate areas near Tamar will be not only aesthetically poor but people outdoors there will also be affected by bad air quality. While the Government says there will be open space at Tamar for public enjoyment, our concern is that the area will be unhealthy enough that the public will stay away.</p> <p>Not only will there be the canyon effect caused by trapped air pollution between buildings, but air quality will also be negatively impacted by sub-optimal urban design that traps pollution. These include the combination of raised walkways, the bus and mini-bus terminals at the "Groundscraper"; and the tunnel-like effect pollution traps created by walkways and buildings at the "Groundscraper". Where the highway coming from Western will join the Central-Wanchai Bypass and the roads/traffic arrangement near the IFC and the new Star Ferry, the air quality and aesthetic experience will most probably be poor.</p> <p>Should carry out a new EIA on air quality for the whole Central area. The existing assessments were based on outdated information and application of the wrong model. It would be irresponsible of the</p>	<p>The CRIII EIA concluded that the predicted cumulative air quality impacts at the existing and planned air sensitive receivers including Tamar site would be within established standards.</p> <p>For the areas around the Tamar site, the major roads are intersected by other roads and abutted by open space allowing air to flow through. Hence, canyon effect should not be a concern.</p> <p>The design of the new development at Tamar would be sustainable and environmentally friendly. Consideration will be given to include an air ventilation assessment as a design requirement to address the air ventilation aspect.</p> <p>Given that there is no change in the land use in CRIII, the findings of the CRIII EIA are still valid and no updating is required.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>government not to re-do the air quality EIA in view of the severity of the problem in Hong Kong.</p>	
<p>Civic Exchange</p>	<p>The Environmental Impact Assessment Report (July 2001) for CRIII did not take “street canyon effect” into account and underestimated the pollution levels. The highest predicted concentration of respirable suspended particles (RSP) at the Central roadside station was not expected to exceed an average concentration of 80 micrograms per cubic metre but in 2003 the highest figure was 257, more than triple of the predicted figure. The concentration of NO₂ was also underestimated.</p> <p>Over the past six years, the concentration of RSP exceeded the Air Quality Objective (AQO) standard both in one-year average and in 24-hour maximum. The AQO standard could be used as a reference indicator of the impact on the health of the citizens.</p> <p>Hong Kong measures roadside air quality at three stations, Causeway Bay, Central and Mongkok. At all of these roadside stations, levels of NO₂ and RSP (PM₁₀) regularly exceed the maximum hourly objectives; maximum daily (24hr) objectives; and maximum annual average objectives.</p> <p>Local studies from Causeway Bay indicate about 85% of NO₂ variations are traffic related, and perhaps 50% of the RSP (PM₁₀) are also traffic related. To work out a monetary value of what this means in public health terms with the road plans in/around the Tamar location, assuming 100 000 people would be exposed</p>	<p>The CALINE4 model used in the CRIII EIA is a well established and proven air quality model acceptable in Hong Kong and internationally for predicting vehicular emission impact. The model is applicable for modeling the air quality of urban areas and has a feature to calculate canyon and building effect. The model has also been applied overseas for modeling the air quality of densely built urban areas.</p> <p>The prediction in the CRIII EIA is the air quality at Year 2027 which is the worst case scenario from the commencement of operation of the proposed roads under the CRIII to Year 2027. Whereas, the records of the Central Roadside Air Quality Monitoring Station are historical data. The Hong Kong SAR Government and Guangdong Provincial Government have been working closely to implement a comprehensive Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to reduce the total air pollutant emission in the region. Due to the tightening of vehicle emissions in Hong Kong, the air quality conditions at roadside showed gradual improvement in recent years.</p> <p>Given that there is no change in the land use in CRIII, the findings of the CRIII EIA are still valid and no updating is required.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>and the correlation between NO₂ and RSP (PM₁₀) is 0.77, the cost estimate would be HK\$218.4 million per annum. If however, all the NO₂ and (RSP) PM₁₀ variations are traffic related the upper bound cost estimated would be HK\$227 million per annum.</p> <p>It must be stressed that the impact of vehicular pollution on the population is also influenced by town planning. How the authorities control land use, development density and traffic growth have a tremendous impact on air quality in the city, where people live and work. Thus, reducing the canyon effect would be helpful. Giving priority to public transport, especially rail in a city like Hong Kong, is essential.</p> <p>The Government should conduct a new EIA for air quality and use a proper model that includes the "street canyon effect" of buildings in trapping air pollutants due to traffic road emissions.</p>	
Clear The Air	<p>Every model used to create every report on air pollution has pretended that Central and Admiralty are flat surfaces. The reports, started in 1999 with data taken 18 metres off the ground, have never been accurate. Central is not flat. It is full of "canyons". An updated report is needed.</p> <p>If anything is built on Tamar, all the air pollution from the vehicle exhaust will be sucked down into the MTR trains. It will also be sucked into the buses because you have blocked the wind. Tamar is only one block from Queensway, one of the most</p>	<p>The CALINE4 model used in the CR_{III} EIA is a well established and proven air quality model acceptable in Hong Kong and internationally for predicting vehicular emission impact. The model is applicable for modeling the air quality of urban areas and has a feature to calculate canyon and building effect. The model has also been applied overseas for modeling the air quality of densely built urban areas.</p> <p>Given that there is no change in the land use in CR_{III}, the findings of the CR_{III} EIA are still valid and no updating is required.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>congested areas with most polluted bus routes in Hong Kong. The wind from Tamar blows through Harcourt Garden to help reduce the pollution in Queensway. If you block the wind here the pollution levels will shoot up. The plan to develop Tamar is guaranteed to make the air pollution much, much worse in Admiralty. Millions who now ride the MTR and the buses will have even more toxic gases forced into their air, and they cannot escape. Those who work in the Admiralty area will see the air quality, which already fails to meet even our very lax objectives, deteriorate even further and very quickly.</p> <p>All the buildings and people on the mountain-side of Connaught and Harcourt Roads desperately need the fresh air from the Harbour at ground level. Buildings on Tamar will block their air because the damage is done by even very short buildings.</p> <p>Unless and until there is an updated air pollution report using a model that includes the "canyon effect" of tall buildings, every funding request on the Tamar project should be rejected.</p>	<p>For the areas around the Tamar site, the major roads are intersected by other roads and abutted by open space allowing air to flow through. Hence, canyon effect should not be a concern.</p> <p>The design of the new development at Tamar would be sustainable and environmentally friendly. Consideration will be given to include an air ventilation assessment as a design requirement to address the air ventilation aspect.</p>
Traffic issues		
Central & Western District Council	There is concern on the traffic load in the future.	With the Central-Wan Chai Bypass (CWB) including its planned slip roads and Road P2, the overall transport infrastructure in Central and Wan Chai will still be operating within capacity (with volume to capacity (v/c) ratio of below 1) in 2016, even with the planned developments in CRIII and the Tamar development project. This indicates that the transport infrastructure will be able to cope with the traffic in future.

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Action Group on Protection of The Harbour	The Administration has no long-term planning to address the future traffic load in Central.	<p>We have studied the future traffic demand and consider that with the existing and planned transport infrastructure (the latter such as the CWB and Road P2), the overall transport infrastructure in Central and Wan Chai will operate within capacity (with v/c ratio of below 1) in 2016.</p> <p>There will be new rail services for the area and Government is also studying the feasibility of introducing congestion charging in Central for the longer term. We will also continue to implement and enhance other traffic management measures as necessary.</p>
Ir Prof William H K LAM	<p>When making a decision for the Central Waterfront and the Tamar development project, integration of land use and transport development should be considered within a comprehensive impact assessment. Urban development is not just a technical problem, it is also how to balance the interests of different groups of people.</p> <p>There should be no further development in Central and Wan Chai that would aggravate the congestion problem before completion of the Central-Wan Chai Bypass.</p>	<p>Better integration of transport and land use planning is already an established government policy. We will continue to enhance our efforts on this front.</p> <p>Road P2 within CRIII will be completed around 2008. It will serve as an important interim measure to meet the transport need of the Central reclamation area before CWB comes about.</p>
The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors	<p>The vehicular traffic generated from the proposed CGC and LCC developments will have no significant impact on the total traffic flow of the Central Business District.</p> <p>Although the proposed CGC and Legislative Council Complex developments are not a "designated project" subject to the environmental impact assessment under</p>	<p>We agree with this assessment. Based on the current development proposal, the CGC and LCC traffic will only account for less than 1% of the total traffic in the CBD in 2016.</p> <p>The Government has conducted a preliminary environmental review for the Tamar development project in 1998 and confirmed that there would be no significant environmental impacts in the construction and operation stages. We will</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO), the Government or the tenderers should conduct an environmental impact assessment on their proposed design and construction in order to address any public concern on its environmental impacts.</p> <p>In the short-term and medium-term, the proposed Central – Wan Chai Bypass would have sufficient capacity to cope with the forecasted vehicular traffic flow. However, in the long-term, the Government would need to consider other traffic management measures to tackle the increasing traffic volume.</p>	<p>adopt the pollution control measures at both stages to ensure minimum environmental impacts. For details, please refer to paragraph 24 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper and its Annex E.</p> <p>We have always been implementing a basket of measures to meet the transport need of the community. Other than providing the necessary transport infrastructure, we will continue to implement traffic management measures and enhance them where possible. In this connection, we are studying the feasibility of introducing congestion charging in Central for the longer term. A prerequisite for introducing congestion charging is the provision of CWB to serve as an alternative route for vehicles not destined for areas within the charging zone.</p>
<p>The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers</p>	<p>Should utilize mass transit systems to reduce the impact of traffic congestion. The public transportation system is the key to solving traffic congestion.</p> <p>Should consider using automatic people movers to connect the Tamar site with the waterfront and the transportation nodes.</p>	<p>At present, over 90% of trips made by the community are already by public transport. Central, Wan Chai and Tamar are already well served by the MTR Central, Wanchai and Admiralty Stations. Future rail links will provide the area with additional services.</p> <p>In the Tamar development project, a footbridge spanning across Harcourt Road will be provided to connect the Tamar site with the public transport interchange at Admiralty where MTR, buses, mini-buses and tram services are readily available. Moreover, the future Road P2 fronting the Tamar site will be built in the form of an underpass. There will be direct at-grade pedestrian access from the civic place of the Tamar site to the waterfront promenade of about 50m-60m wide to be built above the depressed section of Road P2. With the above, the Tamar site will be well connected to the waterfront as well as the public transport hub at Admiralty.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Mr Colin DAWSON	Should consider adjusting the fees for the cross harbour tunnels to bring about more balanced usage.	We are actively considering ways to balance the usage of cross harbour tunnel in conjunction with their operators.
Citizen Envisioning @ Harbour	Should consider sustainable transportation means especially tram (a unique character of Hong Kong).	While trams may not be an effective transportation means, we are open to all options that can enhance the sustainable transportation.
Designing Hong Kong Harbour District and The Experience Group, Limited	Limiting the density and mixing the land use will relieve the peak time traffic demand, lowering the need for vehicular capacity and surface road infrastructure. Providing rail-based services early will reduce size and impact of roads.	A balanced land-use approach has been adopted. Despite the good rail service, roads are required for non-rail commuters and delivery of goods.
Mr Winston CHU	The Tamar development project will aggravate traffic congestion.	Based on the current development proposal, the CGC and LCC traffic will only account for less than 1% of the total CBD traffic in 2016. With CWB including its planned slip roads and Road P2, the overall transport infrastructure in Central and Wan Chai will still be able to work within capacity (with v/c ratio of below 1) in 2016.
Dr Bill BARRON	<p>By the Government's own analyses, by adding more density at the Central waterfront, it will lead to almost as much (and under some conditions more) traffic than the Central-Wanchai Bypass is expected to handle. Government plans will have the effect of throwing away much (and possibly more than all) of the traffic gains from building the Central-Wanchai Bypass.</p> <p>The new land created at the Central waterfront is extremely valuable land. Approximately 1/3 of the area bordered by IFC II, HKECC, Connaught/Harcourt/Gloucester Roads, and the new</p>	<p>The CWB will operate at a v/c ratio of about 0.7 by 2016 even assuming that all the planned developments in CRIII and Tamar are completed and operating then, i.e. the CWB will have sufficient capacity to cope with the traffic demand of all the planned developments.</p> <p>The proposed CWB within CRIII will be built in the form of a tunnel and therefore will not occupy surface land or create an unacceptable noise problem. The construction of the CWB and Road P2 will follow the statutory requirements of the EIA Ordinance, including implementation of mitigation measures as required, for addressing environmental concerns.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>shoreline will be given over to highways and roads. In the future, if the Central OZP is allowed to proceed, the maximum distance from the waterfront to a major road will be about 125 metres. Our concern is that air pollution and road noise will be the waterfront visitor's constant companions.</p> <p>Peak period road traffic will go up by an average of 12% due to the Tamar project. This means giving up much (and possibly all) of spare surface road capacity created by the CWB.</p> <p>The government needs to retrace its steps by reviewing the Central OZP so that valuable land at the waterfront can be put to better uses than for highways and roads.</p>	<p>Based on the current development proposal, the CGC and LCC traffic will only account for less than 1% of the total CBD traffic in 2016. The CWB will operate at a v/c ratio of about 0.7 by 2016 when traffic from all the planned developments in CRIII and Tamar is taken into account, i.e. the CWB will have sufficient capacity to cope with the traffic demand.</p> <p>The approved Central District (Extension) OZP, covering the reclaimed land under CRIII, has gone through the statutory process of consideration of public views and objections under the TPO. In considering a few rezoning requests/application in August 2005 and March 2006, TPB has re-examined the land use zonings on the OZP and reconfirmed that they are appropriate. While CRIII will provide land for the essential transport infrastructure required in the area (including the proposed CWB, Road P2 and the extended overrun tunnel of the Airport Railway), with the CWB built underground, the greenfield sites formed by CRIII will provide an opportunity to create a vibrant waterfront promenade with leisure, tourism and related retail facilities. The land requirement for P2, which will provide ingress/egress for the developments along the road and is required for traffic circulation in the Central waterfront including CRIII, has been minimized as much as possible.</p>
Save Our Shorelines	A key problem in Hong Kong's planning process is that town planning is made subordinate to highways and roads planning. The planning process should be changed so that highways and roads planning would be made subordinate to the overall town planning process and not be given the priority that it has today.	Road planning and town planning are inter-related and they are equally important. It is our established policy to better integrate transport and land use planning. We would continue to enhance our efforts on this front.
Society for Protection of the Harbour	Substantial parts of the Central OZP, including Tamar, will be used for offices and commercial	Only about 5.23 ha of land (or 11.2% of the planning scheme area) on the Central District (Extension) OZP is zoned "CDA",

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>developments. This type of development generates the greatest peak time traffic. We are not satisfied that the Central OZP provides the best option on managing traffic by controlling land use and density wisely. Indeed, we are convinced the density as envisaged in the OZP needs to be substantially lowered.</p> <p>Since the Government says CRIII is the last piece of reclamation along the North Island shoreline, how will it accommodate more traffic in the future? We remain concerned that by pushing high density development in Central, the Government will want to reclaim more of Victoria Harbour again in the not too distant future.</p> <p>Sensitive planning would have given priority to rail development rather than highways. In the Government's Railway Development Study II, a North Island Line (NIL) has already been identified. Instead of actively planning to build it as part of CRIII and Wanchai Development II, it is not even being discussed. The NIL is estimated to cost between HK\$7-9 billion but it will cost more (perhaps another HK\$2-3 billion) if it is not done as part of CRIII and WDII. Moreover, building it after the Bypass and P2 are completed will mean a lot more disruptions. Building the NIL sooner rather than later will generate many construction jobs, and many more people will benefit than giving priority to highways. Moreover, rail has lower external costs than roads in terms of air and noise qualities and public health.</p>	<p>which may be used for commercial or retail purposes, to help maintain the competitive status of our CBD in meeting the demand for high quality office space at this central and prestigious location. Areas zoned for waterfront related commercial and leisure uses are not for office developments. The development intensity of the "CDA" site (i.e. a plot ratio of 3.6 based on the estimated total GFA) is much lower than those of other commercial office developments in Hong Kong.</p> <p>In planning the transport infrastructures in the Central District, all the proposed developments on the relevant approved OZPs have been taken into account, including the Tamar development. The planned road infrastructure, such as CWB and Road P2, will be able to cope with the traffic generated from the planned developments within Central Reclamation areas, including the new Government Headquarters at the Tamar site.</p> <p>The CWB and the overall transport infrastructure in Central and Wan Chai will operate within capacity (with v/c ratio of below 1) in 2016 even when traffic from all planned developments in CRIII and Tamar are taken into account. In Hong Kong Island, apart from the CRIII and Wan Chai Development Phase II (WDII), the Government has pledged that there will be no more harbour reclamation.</p> <p>Due to the reduction in forecast employment in Western District and changes in land use in Central reclamation, Government has decided to defer to the completion of the NIL to beyond 2016. The alignment of the NIL is now being protected administratively. Government will keep in view any changes in planning parameters that may affect its implementation.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>There is an imminent and present need for CWB and Road P2 and they should be implemented as soon as possible.</p>
<p>Mr John BATTEN</p>	<p>The plans for the Tamar development cannot claim that it will help a majority of the people – the roads planned for Tamar actually only assist a minority of the population that have private vehicles.</p> <p>What Central does need is less traffic, less roads and less noise pollution.</p>	<p>Apart from the provision of roads to serve point-to-point traffic demand, the Tamar site will be well served by the public transport interchange at Admiralty where MTR, bus, tram and mini-bus services are readily available. A footbridge across Harcourt Road will be provided to facilitate pedestrians commuting between the public transport interchange and the Tamar site.</p> <p>The planned road network in Central reclamation area will be considered adequate.</p>
<p>Mr Norman de BRACKINGHE</p>	<p>The building of a government secretariat whatever its ultimate size on the Tamar site will inevitably bring traffic into and through the area. The new roads planned will, if predictions are correct, not even see out the next decade before they are saturated. Vehicles make a big contribution to pollution. Traffic control and air pollution go hand in hand. What's the point of beautiful view if you cannot breathe the air outside?</p> <p>Tamar should be put on hold until a comprehensive plan for the waterfront emerges that encompasses, traffic, pollution and the movement of people (like an MTR line).</p>	<p>Based on the current development proposal, the CGC and LCC traffic will only account for less than 1% of the total CBD traffic in 2016. The CWB and the overall transport infrastructure in Central and Wan Chai will operate within capacity (with v/c ratio of below 1) in 2016 even when traffic from all planned developments in CRIII and Tamar are taken into account.</p> <p>The Government announced the intention to reserve the Tamar site for reprovisioning the government headquarters in January 1998. The proposed development was considered in the context of the integral Central District (Extension) OZP, which covers both the Tamar site and the adjacent waterfront area. In drawing up the land use proposals for the sites on the OZP, there were comprehensive assessments on possible impacts on traffic, provision of infrastructure and environment on the adjacent hinterland in Central. The OZP was approved in 2000 by the Chief Executive in Council after having gone</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>through due planning procedures under the TPO, including the public consultation/objection process.</p> <p>As to the traffic and environmental implications of the Tamar development project, please refer to paragraphs 23 to 25 of the 25 April 2006 Panel paper and its Annexes E and F.</p>
Friends of The Harbour	<p>High density developments at the Central waterfront and the Tamar site would lead to increases in pedestrian and vehicular traffic.</p> <p>There should be comprehensive planning of the Central waterfront and a review of the planned road network in the area.</p>	<p>The Central waterfront is planned for low to medium density developments, instead of high density developments.</p> <p>In preparing the land use proposals for the Central reclamation area on the OZP, comprehensive planning has been undertaken with assessments on the traffic, infrastructure and environmental aspects related to the new reclamation and the adjacent hinterland. The OZP covering the Central waterfront area is an approved plan which has undergone a due process of consideration of public views under the provisions of the TPO.</p> <p>Based on the current development proposal, the CGC and LCC traffic will only account for less than 1% of the total CBD traffic in 2016. That generated by the planned developments in CRIII will be around 1%.</p> <p>The road network in Central waterfront has been carefully planned. The CWB and the overall transport infrastructure in Central and Wan Chai will operate within capacity (with v/c ratio of below 1) in 2016 even when traffic from all planned developments in CRIII and Tamar are taken into account.</p>
Mr Steve CHAN, Wan Chai District Council Member	Should have a fundamental change in mindset and strategy in order to reduce traffic problems. Need a comprehensive review of the future development of Hong Kong. Korea even demolished structures such	Our established policy is to integrate the transport and land use planning.

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<p>as roads or flyovers in order to improve the environment of an area.</p>	
<p>The Hong Kong Construction Association Limited</p>	<p>We fully support the construction of the Central-Wanchai Bypass which would provide a traffic bypass to relief the traffic congestion problem we are facing everyday.</p> <p>We urge also that the portion of Central-Wanchai Bypass within the CRIII reclamation area to be constructed as soon as practical.</p> <p>Mass transportation has proven to be an effective and sustainable means of transportation of great efficiency. Priority should be given to the early construction of the Shatin-Central Link, Airport Railway extension and West Island Line. Improved connectivity among various rails will further enhance the efficiency. A further advantage is the electricity driven powertrain is more environmental friendly with less pollutants emitted as compared with the fuel burnt driven vehicles.</p> <p>We consider sustainable transportation planning should be adopted and the social, economic and environmental factors are of equal importance in the development of policies. Best practices could be adopted in the construction and maintenance of the transportation facilities to enhance environmental protection. Appropriate decision and action to resolve the present intolerable traffic condition need to be taken before the traffic network becomes paralysed.</p>	<p>The need for CWB is imminent and present. Government is actively planning for its early construction and completion.</p> <p>It is our policy objective to make railways the backbone of the public transport system in Hong Kong. Despite the good rail service, roads are required for non-rail commuters and delivery of goods.</p> <p>It is our goal to achieve a sustainable transportation planning and we consider that the construction of CWB is an essential step to achieve a sustainable transport system.</p> <p>We are actively planning for the early construction and completion of CWB.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Pedestrian access		
<p>Citizen Envisioning @ Harbour</p>	<p>There should be pedestrian friendly transportation network. Ground level vitality is very important. Should aim at designing transit-pedestrian oriented places with a variety of land uses at the ground level nested within a lush green and open space network. For instance, turn the landscaped deck into an at grade landscaped area serviced by shops on either side; and turn Road P2 into a boulevard (a road lined with trees).</p> <p>There should be connectivity between waterfront and hinterland. It is very important to have connections at different levels especially at grade and underground levels.</p>	<p>On the Central District (Extension) OZP, easy access to the waterfront has been planned to bring people to the harbour. A comprehensive and convenient network of pedestrian links has been planned to connect the waterfront and the hinterland. A pedestrian network comprising a combination of elevated walkways, at-grade and elevated pedestrian decks and at-grade crossings will be provided. Open space and landscaped links have been planned along the landscaped deck in the Statue Square Corridor, near the civic place at Tamar, and on the east-west running waterfront promenade. Greening along the roads will be considered. The planning and design framework of the OZP will be further refined to ensure good integration between the waterfront and the hinterland.</p>
<p>Ms Vicki LUKINS</p>	<p>There should be easy access to the waterfront, especially for physically disabled persons, the elderly and children.</p>	<p>In the detailed design of the pedestrian links, due consideration will be given to facilitating accessibility of the physically disabled, the elderly and children in accordance with the relevant standards and guidelines.</p>
<p>The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers</p>	<p>Should consider using automatic people movers to connect the Tamar site with the waterfront and the transportation nodes.</p>	<p>In the tender design of the Tamar site, consideration will be given to providing adequate pedestrian connection to the waterfront (including north-south pedestrian walkways) and convenient linkage to the transportation nodes such as the MTR stations.</p>
<p>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</p>	<p>Should provide north-south pedestrian walkways to the waterfront, ensure a good connection with the Admiralty Mass Transit Railway Station and reduce vehicular traffic to the Tamar area.</p>	<p>In the tender design of the Tamar site, consideration will be given to providing adequate pedestrian connection to the waterfront (including north-south pedestrian walkways) and convenient linkage to the transportation nodes such as the MTR stations.</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Save Our Shorelines	<p>In the case of Road P2, which is a high-capacity highway, there will be no pedestrian crossings possible. Pedestrians will be forced to go to the waterfront by means of raised walkways at the Wanchai-end, and through the "Groundscraper" at the IFC-end.</p> <p>The elimination of at grade walking for pedestrians represents a unique Hong Kong planning solution that is a direct result of giving priority to roads over town planning. This methods runs counter to planning in other world cities where planning provides for as much at grade pedestrian experience as possible. Without a review of the entire Central OZP, it would be impossible to revise all the problems related to the plan.</p>	<p>A comprehensive pedestrian network with links at different levels has been planned. In addition to signal control at-grade crossings along Road P2, there will be an elevated landscaped deck along the Statue Square Corridor, an at-grade open space deck near the civic place at Tamar to provide grade separated traffic-free pedestrian connections to the waterfront.</p> <p>The OZP covering the Central waterfront is an approved plan which has gone through the statutory process of consideration of public views and objections under the TPO. In considering a few rezoning requests/application in August 2005 and March 2006, TPB has re-examined the land use zonings on the OZP and reconfirmed that they are appropriate. As requested by TPB, PlanD will undertake a study to further refine the urban design framework of the OZP and to prepare planning/design briefs for the key sites on the Central reclamation to guide the future developments.</p>
Designing Hong Kong Harbour District and The Experience Group, Limited	<p>There should be pedestrian connectivity at ground/sea level. The current planning is dominated by roads and infrastructure, and provides limited modes of transport, pedestrian access, connections and land/water interface.</p>	<p>On the Central District (Extension) OZP, easy access to the waterfront has been planned to bring people to the harbour. A comprehensive and convenient network of at-grade or grade separated pedestrian links has been planned to connect the waterfront and the hinterland. Marine access from the harbour will be facilitated by the provision of ferry piers and public landing steps along the waterfront.</p>
Mr Winston CHU	<p>The planned road network will sterilize the Central harbourfront and make the harbourfront inaccessible to the public.</p>	<p>A comprehensive and convenient network of pedestrian links has been planned to connect the waterfront and the hinterland. A pedestrian network comprising a combination of elevated walkways, at-grade and elevated pedestrian decks and at-grade crossings will be provided. Open space and landscaped links have been planned along an elevated landscaped deck in the Statue Square Corridor, an at-grade open space deck near the</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		civic place at Tamar, and the east-west running waterfront promenade. The planning and design framework of the OZP will be further refined to ensure good integration between the waterfront and the hinterland.
Mr John BATTEN	What Central does need is access to the waterfront at ground and sea level.	On the Central District (Extension) OZP, easy access to the waterfront has been planned to bring people to the harbour. A comprehensive and convenient network of at-grade or grade separated pedestrian links has been planned to connect the waterfront and the hinterland. Marine access from the harbour will be facilitated by the provision of ferry piers and public landing steps along the waterfront.
Dr Adrian RAPER	The planned road network and the use of footbridges far apart would prevent uninterrupted connection with the waterfront. There should be traditional pedestrian connection and street-level activities found in old districts such as Wan Chai.	In addition to signal control at-grade crossings, there will be an elevated landscaped deck along the Statue Square Corridor and an at-grade open space deck near the civic place at Tamar to provide grade separated traffic-free pedestrian connections.
The Hong Kong Construction Association Limited	It is important to provide decent pedestrian access to facilitate the public going to the harbour-front. Pedestrian accessibility planning should be considered as an integral part of the overall sustainable transport planning with the prime objective of convenient and ease of use by the general public.	A comprehensive and convenient network of pedestrian links has been planned to connect the waterfront and the hinterland. A pedestrian network comprising a combination of elevated walkways, at-grade and elevated pedestrian decks and at-grade crossings will be provided. Open space and landscaped links have been planned along an elevated landscaped deck in the Statue Square Corridor, an at-grade open space deck near the civic place at Tamar, and the east-west running waterfront promenade. The planning and design framework of the OZP will be further refined to ensure good integration between the waterfront and the hinterland.
Central & Western District Council	There should be easy access to the waterfront. The new CGC may block the public's access to the	The OZP has provided for a comprehensive and uninterrupted pedestrian network to facilitate easy access to and from the

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	waterfront.	new waterfront, bringing people to the harbour. Along the Civic Corridor, the CGC, LCC and civic place at Tamar will be well connected to the hinterland through a network of elevated walkways leading from Admiralty to the CGC and LCC at Tamar, and there will be convenient linkage with the waterfront promenade through the civic place and an at-grade open space deck of 50m–60m wide.
Concerns relating to the future uses of the sites of CGOs and Murray Building		
Central and Western District Council	There is concern about the future use of the existing sites of CGO and Murray Building. Consideration should be given to preserve the heritage buildings near CGO.	The CGO and MB sites are currently zoned “G/IC” on the approved Central District OZP No. S/H4/12 to reflect their existing uses as government offices. The future uses of these sites after relocation have not been decided yet. To properly determine the appropriate uses and scale of development of the two sites, the Government would carefully consider public needs and aspirations and the prevailing social and economic circumstances. The Government would carry out a comprehensive assessment of the future uses of the two sites, taking into account the land use needs; the traffic, environmental and infrastructural impacts; the historic value of the sites and their surroundings; tree preservation; protection of the ridgelines; and the urban design guidelines, etc. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the process. Should the future uses of the sites warrant an amendment to the OZP, the statutory planning procedures under the TPO will be followed.
WWF Hong Kong	There is also concern about the future use of the current CGO site. It is doubtful whether the Administration has made the case to the satisfaction of members.	The CGO site is currently zoned “G/IC” on the approved Central District OZP No. S/H4/12 to reflect the existing uses as government offices. The future uses of the site after relocation have not been decided yet. To properly determine the appropriate uses and scale of development of the site, the Government would carefully consider public needs and

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>aspirations and the prevailing social and economic circumstances. The Government would carry out a comprehensive assessment of the future uses of the site, taking into account the land use needs; the traffic, environmental and infrastructural impacts; the historic value of the sites and their surroundings; tree preservation; protection of the ridgelines; and the urban design guidelines, etc. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the process. Should the future uses of the sites warrant an amendment to the OZP, the statutory planning procedures under the TPO will be followed.</p>
Dr Bill Barron	<p>If government later sells the land for private developers to redevelop the Central Government Offices and Murray Building, the new developments will almost certainly be of much greater density than they are today and will add even more traffic to Central. The sale of the land could happen in just a few years (4-5 years). How will government deal with added traffic needs? It has made public no projections beyond the coming 10 years. Will it lead to further reclamation despite denials today?</p>	<p>The CGO and MB sites are currently zoned "G/IC" on the approved Central District OZP No. S/H4/12 to reflect their existing uses as government offices. The future uses of these sites after relocation have not been decided yet. To properly determine the appropriate uses and scale of development of the two sites, the Government would carefully consider public needs and aspirations and the prevailing social and economic circumstances. The Government would carry out a comprehensive assessment of the future uses of the two sites, taking into account the land use needs; the traffic, environmental and infrastructural impacts; the historic value of the sites and their surroundings; tree preservation; protection of the ridgelines; and the urban design guidelines, etc. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the process. Should the future uses of the sites warrant an amendment to the OZP, the statutory planning procedures under the TPO will be followed. At this moment, the future uses of these sites after relocation of the existing government offices have not been decided yet.</p> <p>In Hong Kong Island, apart from the CRIII and WDII, the</p>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		Government has pledged that there will be no more harbour reclamation.
Society for Protection of the Harbour	Beyond the new developments envisaged in the Central OZP, there will be other high density developments in Central. These include the land at CGO and Murray Building when the Government sells the land for commercial uses, which will add traffic in Central overall.	The CGO and MB sites are currently zoned "G/IC" on the approved Central District OZP No. S/H4/12 to reflect their existing uses as government offices. The future uses of these sites after relocation have not been decided yet. To properly determine the appropriate uses and scale of development of the two sites, the Government would carefully consider public needs and aspirations and the prevailing social and economic circumstances. The Government would carry out a comprehensive assessment of the future uses of the two sites, taking into account the land use needs; the traffic, environmental and infrastructural impacts; the historic value of the sites and their surroundings; tree preservation; protection of the ridgelines; and the urban design guidelines, etc. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the process. Should the future uses of the sites warrant an amendment to the OZP, the statutory planning procedures under the TPO will be followed. At this moment, the future uses of these sites after relocation of the existing government offices have not been decided yet.
Friends of the Harbour	If the existing sites of CGO and Murray Building are used for commercial development in the future, the plot ratio will increase sharply, adding traffic load.	The CGO and MB sites are currently zoned "G/IC" on the approved Central District OZP No. S/H4/12 to reflect their existing uses as government offices. The future uses of these sites after relocation have not been decided yet. To properly determine the appropriate uses and scale of development of the two sites, the Government would carefully consider public needs and aspirations and the prevailing social and economic circumstances. The Government would carry out a comprehensive assessment of the future uses of the two sites, taking into account the land use needs; the traffic,

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		<p>environmental and infrastructural impacts; the historic value of the sites and their surroundings; tree preservation; protection of the ridgelines; and the urban design guidelines, etc. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the process. Should the future uses of the sites warrant an amendment to the OZP, the statutory planning procedures under the TPO will be followed. At this moment, the future uses of these sites after relocation of the existing government offices have not been decided yet.</p>
<p>Ir Prof William H K LAM</p>	<p>If the existing site of CGO is re-developed, the development intensity should be controlled to avoid traffic congestion.</p>	<p>The CGO and MB sites are currently zoned "G/IC" on the approved Central District OZP No. S/H4/12 to reflect their existing uses as government offices. The future uses of these sites after relocation have not been decided yet. To properly determine the appropriate uses and scale of development of the two sites, the Government would carefully consider public needs and aspirations and the prevailing social and economic circumstances. The Government would carry out a comprehensive assessment of the future uses of the two sites, taking into account the land use needs; the traffic, environmental and infrastructural impacts; the historic value of the sites and their surroundings; tree preservation; protection of the ridgelines; and the urban design guidelines, etc. All relevant stakeholders in the community will be engaged in the process. Should the future uses of the sites warrant an amendment to the OZP, the statutory planning procedures under the TPO will be followed.</p>